Asian Journal of Business Research	Volume 2	Number 1	2012
Asian Journal of Business Research	Volume 2	Number 1	2012

An Update of the Vox Populi Approach to Academic Journal Rankings: 2011 in Review

James E. Richard Victoria University of Wellington

Kim-Shyan Fam Victoria University of Wellington

Geoff Plimmer Victoria University of Wellington

Stephan Gerschewski Hankuk University of Foreign Studies

Abstract

The ranking of academic journals continues to be a contentious issue in the tertiary education environment. Academics dependency on journal ranking for tenure and promotion, based on perceived quality and prestige of journals, ensures debate over what constitutes a 'good' journal publication. This study utilises the *vox populi* MAG score established in previous research in order to continue the assessment of journal ranking and impact in the field of marketing. The current findings are consistent with the previous 2009 study; the top six journals remain the same, there is little variation within the top 30 journal rankings, although regional differences are apparent. The ranking results from a broad range of academics continue to provide a comprehensive measure of journal impact from the perspective of academics.

Keywords: Journal ranking, impact factor, *vox populi*, marketing, ranking criteria

Introduction

Journal rankings and academic quality continues to attract attention from social science academics, education management and policy makers (Lee, 2011). Publishing in "A" journals have become synonymous for academic quality, reflecting the research value of academics, and representing institutional excellence. Fortunately (or unfortunately), a number of "quality" journal lists exist (e.g., Scopus, SSCI, UTD,

RAE/REF, ABDC) which have been used to influence academic hiring, tenure, promotion decisions, and individual evaluation (Saunders and Wong, 2011).

This study is the second in a planned series of triennial longitudinal studies examining the ranking of journals by academics around the world, including the personal and career impact on academics of publishing in ranked journals. The current paper only presents the journal ranking data for discussion. As in the previous study (Fam et al., 2011), the research attempts to understand the effect of journal ranking from the 'contributor' perspective, using the *vox populi* approach; that any judgment based on the intelligence of the masses will be free of passion and uninfluenced by rhetoric (Galton, 1907). More recently, research on the "wisdom of crowds" has found public opinion to be an effective predictive tool because of the capacity to synthesise large amounts of information and improve their judgement (Hastie and Kameda, 2005; Mannes, 2009; Soll and Larrick, 2009; Surowiecki, 2004). This approach attempts to address the direction suggested by Steward and Lewis (2010) that "...efforts aimed at creating new perspectives on appraising the quality of journals in Marketing should be encouraged".

Educational institutions continue to use publishing metrics to measure their influence, progress and research merit. There are a number of ostensibly objective methods used to rank or rate academic journals; however, there is no one 'correct' ranking methodology which supersedes all others. It is to the benefit of the Marketing discipline that alternative perspectives are considered and validated (Steward and Lewis, 2010).

The study contributes to the ongoing discourse on business research quality assessment and journal ranking by examining marketing academic publication ranking across a representative academic spectrum (e.g., from lecturers to professors), not solely based on leading business schools or the academic elite (Theoharakis and Hirst, 2002; Van Fleet et al., 2000). In addition the study considers the relative impact of a number of journal ranking criteria, the journals in which academics actually publish, and differences between regions. The *vox populi* approach, considering views from a wide range of academics from around the world provides a more balanced view of journal quality. Finally, the study compares the results against two other generally accepted impact factor based journal ranking lists.

Methodology

Academics were asked to freely recall and nominate up to ten journals. This unaided "top-of-the-mind" method is used extensively in measuring advertisement effectiveness and brand recall as it accesses schema and long term memory without cues (Bagozzi and Silk, 1983; Finn, 1992; Krugman, 1986; Shapiro and Krishnan, 2001; Stapel, 1998; Till and Baack, 2005). In the current case, this method was used to assess academics awareness of 'A" grade journals.

Sampling

To implement the *vox populi* sampling approach, this study developed a sampling frame of academics by scanning marketing, tourism, and international business departmental web sites of universities across the five continents. In total, 8,355 potential respondents were identified from Shanghai Jiao Tong University Ranking 2010 List, Times Supplement University Ranking 2010 List (excluding academics not listed on the Shanghai Jiao Tong List), ANZMAC Conference Directory of Academics, and a further 300 universities located in South Africa, Asia/South Pacific, Australia, New Zealand, USA, Middle East, South America and Europe that were not present on any of the above lists. Respondents included academics from all levels (lecturers, senior lecturers, assistant professors, associate professors, professors, and chair professors). Two weeks following the initial email invitation, a follow-up email was sent.

Survey Instrument

The survey instrument consisted of three sections. The first section asked respondents to recall up to ten A-grade journals, and to indicate which of these journals respondents had published in since 2006. In addition the respondents were asked to list any other journals they had published in. The second section addressed career, life-balance, family and health considerations with respect to publishing, while the third section collected demographic information.

Result

Of the 8,355 potential respondents contacted by email, 825 returned out-of office auto-generated messages, 982 had "undeliverable" e-mails (e.g., invalid e-mail addresses), 87 others declined to participate and 4,641 provided no response to either email. In total 1,820 usable responses were collected giving an overall response rate of 21.8%. Following data cleaning and verification, the final sample size was 1,005 cases (12.0%). This number of respondents was a significant (186%) increase from the previous study (Fam et al., 2011). The respondents were full-time academics from marketing, tourism or international business.

The file was examined visually for appropriate journal names, standard journal names (from the journal site) were adopted and the data reviewed and journal names changed to reflect the standard names. Formulas were created to sort journals and the different ranking methods were calculated.

The cleaned and verified data was then input into SPSS, where CFA and EFA were completed for each of the constructs.

Survey data Analysis

Table 1 indicates that the single highest numbers of respondents were mid-career, aged 35 to 44 (22%), while 10% (101) were in their early career. The majority of the respondents 34.4% (aged 45 to 64) were well established in their academic career. There were 471 males (46.9%) and 210 females (20.9%), 324 respondents did not report their gender.

Table 1: Age demographics

Age	Frequency	Percent
25 to 34	101	10.0
35 to 44	221	22.0
45 to 54	173	17.2
55 to 64	173	17.2
65 to 70	35	3.5
71 or over	16	1.6
Missing	286	28.5
	1005	100

The majority of respondents are from the United States of America (31.7%), followed by the United Kingdom (9.4%) Australia (7.9%), Canada (4.3%) and New Zealand (3.7%), see Table 2. This compares favourably with the previous survey, although 285 (28.3%) respondents did not provide their country of residence, with 222 (41.3%) respondents from the United States and Canada, 142 (26.3%) from UK and Europe, 114 (21.2%) from Australia and New Zealand, and 60 (11.2%) from Asia and Africa.

Table 2: Respondents by country

Country	Frequency	Percent	Country	Frequency	Percent
United States of America	319	31.7	Greece	2	0.2
United Kingdom	94	9.4	Israel	2	0.2
Australia	79	7.9	Japan	2	0.2
Canada	43	4.3	Portugal	2	0.2
New Zealand	37	3.7	Saudi Arabia	2	0.2
Hong Kong	15	1.5	Singapore	2	0.2
France	14	1.4	Turkey	2	0.2
Netherlands	14	1.4	Viet Nam	2	0.2
Sweden	10	1.0	Bangladesh	1	0.1
Austria	9	0.9	Belgium	1	0.1
China	9	0.9	Brazil	1	0.1
Malaysia	9	0.9	Egypt	1	0.1
Norway	9	0.9	Hungary	1	0.1
South Africa	7	0.7	Indonesia	1	0.1
Denmark	5	0.5	Poland	1	0.1
India	5	0.5	Republic of Korea	1	0.1
Ireland	4	0.4	Spain	1	0.1
Finland	3	0.3	Switzerland	1	0.1
Germany	3	0.3	United Arab Emirates	1	0.1
Thailand	3	0.3	United Republic of	1	0.1
Illaliallu		0.5	Tanzania	1	0.1
			Missing	286	28.5
			Total	1005	100.0

Journal Ranking

The six A* journals included *Journal of Marketing* with the highest number of unaided recalls, 714 (9.9%), followed by *Journal of Marketing Research* with 659 (9.2%) unaided recalls, *Journal of Consumer Research* with 598 (8.3%), *Marketing Science* with 470 (6.5%), *Journal of Academy of Marketing Science* with 389 (5.4%), and the *Journal of Retailing* with 282 (3.9%).

Overall, the academics who responded indicated that they had published 1,444 articles in 501 journals. Of these articles, 688 (47.6%) were published in the top ten journals with 93 (6.4%) papers published in the *Journal of Marketing*, 82 (5.7%) papers in the *Journal of Marketing Research*, 86 (6.0%) papers in the *Journal of Consumer Research*, 45 (3.1%) papers in *Marketing Science*, 74 (5.1%) papers in the *Journal of Academy of Marketing Science* and 37 (2.6%) papers in the *Journal of Retailing*. A total of 417 papers were published in the six top-ranked journals, see Table 3.

Table 3: A* Publications by region

A* Journals	Overall	NA	UK	ANZ	Asia	Europe	ROW
Journal of Marketing	93	49	2	2	3	11	1
Journal of Marketing Research	82	40	1	2	3	8	0
Journal of Consumer Research	86	55	0	2	3	4	1
Marketing Science	45	21	1	4	2	6	0
Journal of Academy of Marketing Science	74	44	1	6	7	4	0
Journal of Retailing	37	20	1	2	2	4	0
Total	417	229	6	18	20	37	2

Note: See Appendix A for the list of countries included in each region. ROW = Rest of the World.

Regionally, US academics reported the highest number of publications in the *Journal of Marketing* (43, Canada with 6), and the highest number of A* publications overall with 202, (Canada had 27 A* publications).

Table 4 shows that although the top ten rankings are similar, there are some significant regional differences. Outside North America international and European related journals are ranked higher, especially by the UK respondents. The Journal of Service Research is ranked highest by Australia and New Zealand, which may represent an academic focus on service in the area, while the UK respondents rank European Journal of Marketing, Journal of Marketing Management, and Industrial Marketing Management altogether higher than most other regions. Acta Commercii is a an obvious outlier, it is a South African management journal ranked within the top ten by those respondents designated in the rest of the world, due to the small number of respondents (15) overall.

Table 4: Top ten journals as ranked by regions

		Journ	nal Ra	nk by	Regio	n
Journal	NA	ANZ	UK	Eur	Asia	ROW
Journal of Marketing	1	1	1	1	1	1
Journal of Marketing Research	2	2	2	2	1	2
Journal of Consumer Research	3	2	3	3	3	3
Marketing Science	4	7	6	4	5	3
Journal of Academy of Marketing Science	5	4	4	6	4	5
Journal of Retailing	6	8	5	7	6	10
Journal of Consumer Psychology	7	29	14	9	8	14
Journal of Advertising	8	11	26	20	22	14
Management Science	8	31	37	9	14	14
Journal of Business Research	10	6	10	19	10	8
Academy of Management Journal	11	23	12	8	10	14
Journal of International Business Studies	11	16	10	11	6	14
International Journal of Research in Marketing	15	9	12	5	8	6
Journal of Service Research	17	10	26	14	22	14
Industrial Marketing Management	26	13	9	26	17	8
European Journal of Marketing	31	5	7	18	10	6
Journal of Marketing Management	52	11	8	34	-	14
Acta Commercii	-	-	-	-	-	10

Note: the relative position of journals outside of other region's top ten are shown in small italicised font.

To explore whether the large number of US respondents biased the journal rankings, the data was analysed without the US data (n=400), see Appendix D for details of the top 100 journals. There were no significant differences in the top six rankings without the US data. However, it is evident that the non-US data shows a more international flavour, with *European Journal of Marketing* and *International Journal of Research in Marketing* moving to 7th and 8th place and an overall increase in the number of international journals below the top 30, including more eclectic journals. The US and non-US data appear similar through the top 29 rankings; however the US data includes more classically (quantitative and US) focused journals.

Ranking criteria

In addition to the journal ranking exercise, each respondent was also asked to indicate the relative importance (weighting) of seven factors in ranking journals, see Table 5. In order to ensure relative weighting was considered, each respondent provided a weighting for each of the seven factors which had to total to 100%.

Table 5: Journal ranking criteria as perceived by respondents

Criteria	Weight	Rank
Impact factor	24.64	1
Perceptive studies	18.84	2
Contribution to knowledge	18.48	3
Contribution to career	10.87	4
Rejection rate	9.59	5
Useful for research students	8.90	6
Esteem factors	8.68	7

The results showed that overall impact factor provided the greatest impact on ranking, with a weighting of 24.6, but was not the only criteria considered important. The use of perceptive studies to rank the journals and contribution to knowledge were also major contributors to journal ranking.

MAG Score

MAG Scholar is the abbreviation for the Marketing in Asia Group (www.magscholar.com) which initiated and supports the ongoing study. The study designed a formula to capture the relative standing of these journals. Since each journal has its own features and merits, the first unaided recalled journal was allocated more weight than the second, third, fourth, and so on, until the tenth position. The sum of each journal's value was labelled the MAG score, and this score was used to rank the journal relative to the others, see Appendix B for example.

MAG score = $\sum_{i} ((\mathbf{R}_{ij} / \sum \mathbf{T}_{j})) / (\mathbf{R}_{ij} + \mathbf{T}_{ij})$

Note: R_{ij} is the number of unaided recalls for the i^{th} journal (i = 1 - 632) with j^{th} rank (j = 1, 2, 3, ..., 10), and T is the total number of unaided recalls for all journals with rank j. Rank_j represents the rank of the journal.

In addition, a MAG index was computed where a value of "100" was attributed to the number 1 journal. The indices for the remaining journals were calculated based on their respective MAG scores relative to the number 1 journal. Table 6 contains the top 50 MAG journals based on the number of journal recalls; the MAG scores combined with the MAG index was used to guide the rank separations. For comparative purposes, the table also shows the 2009 MAG journal ranking. The complete list of journal rankings can be found at www.magscholar.com.

Table 6: Top 50 Marketing journals and MAG scores

2009 1 2 3 4 5 6 114 7 116 9 111 223 8 15 10 13	Journal Journal of Marketing Journal of Marketing Research Journal of Consumer Research Marketing Science Journal of Academy of Marketing Science Journal of Retailing Academy of Management Journal Journal of International Business Studies Journal of Consumer Psychology Journal of Business Research Management Science Strategic Management Journal European Journal of Marketing	Total Recalls 714 659 598 470 389 282 139 137 184 166 148	0.536 0.330 0.272 0.161 0.109 0.080 0.067 0.059 0.057	MAG Index 100.00 61.50 50.74 29.94 20.35 14.88 12.47 10.98	206.43 57.72 111.51 51.40 29.35 12.91 8.00	A* A* A* A* A* A*
2 3 4 5 6 114 7 116 9 111 223 8 115	Journal of Marketing Research Journal of Consumer Research Marketing Science Journal of Academy of Marketing Science Journal of Retailing Academy of Management Journal Journal of International Business Studies Journal of Consumer Psychology Journal of Business Research Management Science Strategic Management Journal	714 659 598 470 389 282 139 137 184	0.536 0.330 0.272 0.161 0.109 0.080 0.067 0.059 0.057	100.00 61.50 50.74 29.94 20.35 14.88 12.47 10.98	57.72 111.51 51.40 29.35 12.91 8.00	A* A* A* A* A*
2 3 4 5 6 114 7 116 9 111 223 8 115	Journal of Marketing Research Journal of Consumer Research Marketing Science Journal of Academy of Marketing Science Journal of Retailing Academy of Management Journal Journal of International Business Studies Journal of Consumer Psychology Journal of Business Research Management Science Strategic Management Journal	659 598 470 389 282 139 137 184	0.330 0.272 0.161 0.109 0.080 0.067 0.059 0.057	61.50 50.74 29.94 20.35 14.88 12.47 10.98	57.72 111.51 51.40 29.35 12.91 8.00	A* A* A* A* A*
3 4 5 6 14 7 116 9 11 23 8 115	Journal of Consumer Research Marketing Science Journal of Academy of Marketing Science Journal of Retailing Academy of Management Journal Journal of International Business Studies Journal of Consumer Psychology Journal of Business Research Management Science Strategic Management Journal	598 470 389 282 139 137 184 166	0.272 0.161 0.109 0.080 0.067 0.059 0.057	50.74 29.94 20.35 14.88 12.47 10.98	111.51 51.40 29.35 12.91 8.00	A* A* A* A*
4 5 6 114 7 116 9 111 223 8 115	Marketing Science Journal of Academy of Marketing Science Journal of Retailing Academy of Management Journal Journal of International Business Studies Journal of Consumer Psychology Journal of Business Research Management Science Strategic Management Journal	470 389 282 139 137 184 166	0.161 0.109 0.080 0.067 0.059 0.057	29.94 20.35 14.88 12.47 10.98	51.40 29.35 12.91 8.00	A* A* A*
5 6 14 7 16 9 11 23 8 11 10	Journal of Academy of Marketing Science Journal of Retailing Academy of Management Journal Journal of International Business Studies Journal of Consumer Psychology Journal of Business Research Management Science Strategic Management Journal	389 282 139 137 184 166	0.109 0.080 0.067 0.059 0.057	20.35 14.88 12.47 10.98	29.35 12.91 8.00	A* A*
6 14 7 16 9 11 23 8 15	Journal of Retailing Academy of Management Journal Journal of International Business Studies Journal of Consumer Psychology Journal of Business Research Management Science Strategic Management Journal	282 139 137 184 166	0.080 0.067 0.059 0.057	14.88 12.47 10.98	12.91 8.00	A*
14 7 16 9 11 23 8 15	Academy of Management Journal Journal of International Business Studies Journal of Consumer Psychology Journal of Business Research Management Science Strategic Management Journal	139 137 184 166	0.067 0.059 0.057	12.47 10.98	8.00	
7 16 9 11 23 8 15	Journal of International Business Studies Journal of Consumer Psychology Journal of Business Research Management Science Strategic Management Journal	137 184 166	0.059 0.057	10.98		
16 9 11 23 8 15	Journal of Consumer Psychology Journal of Business Research Management Science Strategic Management Journal	184 166	0.057		1.61	A
9 11 23 8 15 10	Journal of Business Research Management Science Strategic Management Journal	166		10.68	6.35	A
11 23 8 15 10	Management Science Strategic Management Journal		0.051	9.50	1.32	A
23 8 15 10	Strategic Management Journal		0.051	9.25	4.93	A
8 15 10		119	0.049	9.11	4.20	A
15 10	Laropean Journal of Marketing	130	0.045	8.33	1.15	A
10	Academy of Management Review	99	0.043	8.12	3.43	A
	International Journal of Research in Marketing	148	0.044	7.48	0.22	A
13	Journal of Advertising	118	0.040	6.83	9.79	A
12	Annals of Tourism Research	49	0.037	5.01	0.49	A
26	Administrative Science Quarterly	67	0.027	4.92	1.34	A
20 27	Journal of Service Research	79	0.025	4.67	1.74	A
				_		A
				_		A
	-			_		A
						A
						A
						-
						B B
	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			_		В
						В
				_		В
				_		_
	-			_		B B
						В
						В
						В
						В
	<u> </u>					В
						В
	÷					В
						В
						В
	9					В
	ū					В
						В
						В
113 77	American Economic Review	15		1.61	0.18	_
77 79		24	0.009			В
, 4	Journal of World Business Lournal of Sorving Marketing		0.008	1.56	0.46	В
	Journal of Services Marketing Journal of Sustainable Tourism	26 21	0.008	1.47	0.05	В
22	TROUGHAL OF VICEALDADIE LOUGISM	⊥ Z. I		1 46	0.20	D
	Quantitative Marketing and Economics	29	0.008	1.46	0.38	B B
	225 21 18 33 28 20 30 24 41 229 36 40 46 109 45 505 128 61 34 60 62 101 37 38 113	Journal of Advertising Research Tourism Management Journal of Public Policy and Marketing Journal of Public Policy and Marketing Journal of Marketing Management Journal of International Marketing Harvard Business Review Journal of Travel Research Journal of Product Innovation Management Journal of Business Ethics Organization Science Journal of Personality and Social Psychology Journal of Business Venturing Journal of Operations Management Journal of Business Logistics Journal of Applied Psychology Journal of Applied Psychology Journal of Personal Selling and Sales Management Journal of Macromarketing Journal of Management Journal of Management Journal of Management Journal of Management	Journal of Advertising Research Tourism Management Journal of Public Policy and Marketing Journal of Public Policy and Marketing Marketing Management Marketing Letters Journal of International Marketing Harvard Business Review Harvard Business Review Psychology & Marketing Journal of Travel Research Journal of Product Innovation Management Journal of Business Ethics Organization Science Companization Science Entrepreneurship, Theory and Practice Journal of Personality and Social Psychology Journal of Business Venturing Journal of Departions Management Journal of Business Logistics Journal of Applied Psychology Journal of Applied Psychology Journal of Consumer Behavior Journal of Marcomarketing Journal of Management Journal of Management Studies	Journal of Advertising Research 10	Journal of Advertising Research 66 0.022 4.18	Journal of Advertising Research 66 0.022 4.18 1.09

Note: Δ = difference between JM MAG score multiplied by 1000. NR = not ranked

Validation

To further validate the MAG score, correlation analysis of the top 100 MAG score journals was undertaken against the SSCI and Scopus indices (Fam et al., 2011; Steward and Lewis, 2010), see Appendix C. In total 89 of the top 100 MAG Scholar journals are included in the SCOPUS index, while 66 are included in the SSCI database. As shown in Table 7, the correlation between the MAG scholar ranked journals and the Scopus, r(87) = .40, p < .01, and SSCI, r(64) = .34, p < .05, rankings are positive and significant. This indicates that the MAG Scholar list is broadly similar to both the Scopus and SSCI indices.

Table 7: Correlation Matrix: MAG, Scopus and SSCI ranking

	MAG	Scopus	SSCI
MAG	1		
Scopus	.40**	1	
SSCI	.34*	.81**	1

^{**.} Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

Conclusion

In an educational environment that considers performance on the basis of objective measures, publishing in highly ranked journals are an important indicator of perceived quality. The key questions are not; are the rankings valid or without bias?, but "are there other valid measures of journals rankings?" and "do the rankings indicate quality?" (Lee, 2011). This study used the *vox populi* approach in order to introduce an element of 'crowd sourcing' from which to enhance and augment the spectrum of academically ranked journals in the marketing domain (Mannes, 2009). As Steward and Lewis (2010) suggest, Marketing journals are ultimately appraised by members of the Marketing research community, and investigating a variety of validated ranking measures will only "...strengthen the scientific integrity of the Marketing discipline ..."

The top six journals, regardless of region, are: Journal of Marketing, Journal of Marketing Research, Journal of Consumer Research, Marketing Science, Journal of Academy of Marketing Science, and the Journal of Retailing. These results are similar to other studies identified in the literature (Steward and Lewis, 2010). The contribution from this study is the use of a wide spectrum of academics across multiple countries to gather the ranking data; thus the ranking provides an international perspective by design. In addition, the high correlation results with Scopus and SSCI provides evidence that the MAG rankings are reliable when compared against other ranking indices (Steward and Lewis).

The results also demonstrate that the six top ranked journals remain the most highly ranked even when the US data is removed. This implies a uniform recognition of quality and a consistency of quality perception internationally. More interestingly is the divergence of journal rankings, below the top six. The data set without US data

^{*.} Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).

indicates an emphasis on international marketing journals, while the data set including US data rank general management journals higher.

Although there are strong correlations between the MAG method, Scopus and SSCI, there are large differences in philosophy and in statistical variance. Both Scopus and SSCI are actuarial counting of citation rates, and are based on the logical inference that the more often a journal's articles are cited, the more prestigious that journal is. In contrast, the *vox populi* method used here may have captured the broader range of the uses to which published articles are used – such as teaching, consultancy and contributions to public issues. A case could be made that a focus on research citations too narrowly represents the usefulness of research. A sole focus on high citation rates risks becoming a self-fulfilling prophecy, where publication in top journals is pursued as an outcome in itself rather than as a marker for practical usefulness or genuine contribution to knowledge. As universities are often subject to publish or perish cultures, and are also sometimes accused of failing to do research that is relevant, a broader means of valuing journals might help nudge university life in positive directions.

The current study showed that impact factors are critical, but account for less than 25% of a journal's perceived ranking. The other six factors vary widely in the extent to which they are valued, and probably still only account for some of the factors (such as its topics) that make a journal useful or not. The diversity of ways that a journal can be useful, and the diversity of academics, suggest that a MAG scholar approach fits Surowiecki's (2004) four important elements for outlining a wise crowd: (1) diversity of opinion, (2) independence, (identified though the range of tertiary institutions and anonymous design) (3) decentralization, and (4) aggregation.

The publication results support the findings of Saunders and Wong (2011), that UK academics (and to a lesser extent UK influenced academics such as found in Australia and New Zealand) are falling behind in A* journal publications compared to the USA, Asia and Europe. As a percentage of respondents UK academics have a 6.4% publication rate in A* journals, while Australia and New Zealand have a15.5% publication rate, Asia has a 40.0% rate and Europe has a 45.1% publication rate. Given that the top six journals remain relatively stable across regions and over time this should be a concern to UK, Australian and New Zealand researchers and institutions.

Future research should investigate regional differences more fully, including examining the influence of career duration, age and family-life balance. The determination of journal quality, outside of citation and impact continues to come under scrutiny (Lee, 2011), it is therefore important that additional research explore quality criteria from both a wider academic perspective, and a business impact perspective.

Limitations

The sample consisted of 1,005 self-selected respondents, which may not be representative of all academics, however the sample has increased significantly from the 2009 study, where 538 academics responded. Surveys in which respondents are

self-selected will contain an element of bias, especially when the data collected have potential personal and career impact; the results from this survey are no different. However, utilising the *vox populi* approach and continuing to conduct the survey every three years should build a substantial longitudinal data set.

One concern commonly voiced is that importance of emerging journals and attempting to rank them (Fam et al., 2011). A second concern is finding an acceptable method to capture the dynamic nature of journal rankings, as marketing priorities and activities move forward (Steward and Lewis, 2010).

Acknowledgement:

The authors would like to thank the National Natural Science Foundation of China (70902011) and Victoria University of Wellington FCA Small Grant (114945) for financial support.

References

- Bagozzi, R. P. & Silk, A. J. (1983), "Recall, recognition, and the measurement of memory for print advertisement". *Marketing Science*, vol. 2, no. 2, pp. 95.
- Fam, K.-S., Shukla, P., Sinha, A., Parackel, M. & Chai, J. C. Y. (2011), "Rankings in the Eyes of the Beholder: A Vox Populi Approach to Academic Journal Ranking". *Asian Journal of Business Research*, vol. 1, no. 1, pp. 1-17.
- Finn, A. (1992), "Recall, Recognition and the Measurement of Memory for Print Advertisements: A Reassessment". *Marketing Science*, vol. 11, no. 1, pp. 95-95. Galton, F. (1907), "Vox populi". *Nature*, vol. 75, no. 450-451.
- Hastie, R. & Kameda, T. (2005), "The Robust Beauty of Majority Rules in Group Decisions". *Psychological Review*, vol. 112, no. 2, pp. 494-508.
- Krugman, H. E. (1986), "Low Recall and High Recognition of Advertising". *Journal of Advertising Research*, vol. 26, no. 1, pp. 79-79.
- Lee, N. (2011), "Reflections on assessing academic quality in marketing, and the UK REF". *European Journal of Marketing*, vol. 45, no. 4, pp. 477-483.
- Mannes, A. E. (2009), "Are We Wise About the Wisdom of Crowds? The Use of Group Judgments in Belief Revision". *Management Science*, vol. 55, no. 8, pp. 1267-1279.
- Saunders, J. & Wong, V. (2011), "Manoeuvring towards research decline". *European Journal of Marketing*, vol. 45, no. 4, pp. 484-512.
- Shapiro, S. & Krishnan, H. S. (2001), "Memory-based measures for assessing advertising effects: A comparison of explicit and implicit memory effects". *Journal of Advertising*, vol. 30, no. 3, pp. 1-13.

- Soll, J. B. & Larrick, R. P. (2009), "Strategies for revising judgment: How (and how well) people use others' opinions". *Journal of Experimental Psychology: Learning, Memory, and Cognition*, vol. 35, no. 3, pp. 780-805.
- Stapel, J. (1998), "Recall and Recognition: A Very Close Relationship". *Journal of Advertising Research*, vol. 38, no. 4, pp. 41-45.
- Steward, M. D. & Lewis, B. R. (2010), "A Comprehensive Analysis of Marketing Journal Rankings". *Journal of Marketing Education*, vol. 32, no. 1, pp. 75-92.
- Surowiecki, J. (2004), The Wisdom of Crowds: Why the many are smarter than the few and how collective wisdom shapes business, economies, societies, and nations, Doubleday, New York, NY.
- Theoharakis, V. & Hirst, A. (2002), "Perceptual differences of marketing journals: A worldwide perspective". *Marketing Letters*, vol. 13, no. 4, pp. 389-402.
- Till, B. D. & Baack, D. W. (2005), "Recall and persuasion". *Journal of Advertising*, vol. 34, no. 3, pp. 47-57.
- Van Fleet, D. D., McWilliams, A. & Siegel, D. S. (2000), "A Theoretical and Empirical Analysis of Journal Rankings: The Case of Formal Lists". *Journal of Management*, vol. 26, no. 5, pp. 839-861.

Appendix A: List of countries included in each region

North America (NA, 362) includes USA (319) and Canada (43). UK (94).

ANZ (116) includes Australia (79) and New Zealand (37).

Asia (50) includes Bangladesh (1), China (9), Hong Kong (15), India (5), Indonesia (1), Japan (2), Malaysia (9), Republic of Korea (1), Singapore (2), Thailand (3), and Vietnam (2).

Europe (82) includes Austria (9), Belgium (1), Denmark (5), Finland (3), France (14), Germany (3), Greece (2), Hungary (1), Ireland (4), Netherlands (14), Norway (9), Poland (1), Portugal (2), Spain (1), Sweden (10), Switzerland (1), and Turkey (2).

Rest of the world (ROW, 15) includes Brazil (1), Egypt (1), Israel (2), Saudi Arabia (2), South Africa (7), United Republic of Tanzania (1), and the United Arab Emirates (1).

Appendix B: Example of the MAG score calculation

Journal MAG score = $\sum_{i} ((\mathbf{R}_{ij} / \sum \mathbf{T}_{i})) / (\mathbf{R}_{in} \mathbf{R}_{i})$

Note: = R_{ij} is the number of unaided recalls for the i^{th} journal (i = 1 - 632) with j^{th} rank (j = 1, 2, 3, ..., 10), and T is the total number of unaided recalls for all journals with rank j. Rank_j represents the rank of the journal.

Example: MAG score for Journal of Marketing $(426/993/1) + (114/989/2) + (75/983/3) + \dots (1/236/10) = 0.536$

Appendix C: MAG scholar journal ranking compared to Scopus and SSCI rankings

MA			Scopus	Scopus	SSCI	SSCI	MAG
	Cat	Journal	IF	Rank	IF	Rank	Score
1	A*	Journal of Marketing	4.71	13	3.78	12	0.536
2	A*	Journal of Marketing Research	3.60	15	3.1	17	0.330
3	A*	Journal of Consumer Research	2.68	7	3.02	18	0.272
4	A*	Marketing Science	2.03	61	2.19	35	0.161
5	A*	Journal of Academy of Marketing Science	2.48	74	1.58	61	0.109
6	A*	Journal of Retailing	5.06	45	4.57	4	0.080
7	Α	Academy of Management Journal	6.02	11	6.48	2	0.067
8	A	Journal of International Business Studies	3.91	48	3.77	13	0.059
9	A	Journal of Consumer Psychology	4.06	Z	5.35	3	0.057
10	A	Journal of Business Research	1.51	128	1.29	74	0.051
11	A	Management Science	2.52	20	2.23	33	0.050
12	Α	Strategic Management Journal	4.20	30	4.46	6	0.049
13	A	European Journal of Marketing	1.29	180	0.76	115	0.045
14	A	Academy of Management Review	7.90	4	7.87	1	0.044
15	A	International Journal of Research in Marketing	2.21	56	1.87	48	0.040
16	A	Journal of Advertising	1.36	121	1.17	83	0.037
17	A	Annals of Tourism Research	1.40	134	1.17	Z	0.027
18	A	Journal of Service Research	2.92	57	1.67	53	0.026
19	A	Administrative Science Quarterly	3.51	2	3.84	11	0.025
20	A	Industrial Marketing Management	1.88	136	1.33	73	0.023
21	A	Journal of Advertising Research	0.70	221	0.8	111	0.022
22	A	Tourism Management	2.53	90	1.88	46	0.021
23	A	Journal of Public Policy and Marketing	1.85	47	N/A	X	0.020
24	A	Journal of Marketing Management	N/A	X	N/A	X	0.019
25	В	Marketing Letters	0.91	95	0.56	130	0.017
26	В	Journal of International Marketing	2.18	190	1.59	59	0.016
27	В	Harvard Business Review	1.70	33	1.66	55	0.016
28	В	Psychology & Marketing	N/A	X	1.34	72	0.016
29	В	Journal of Travel Research	1.73	Z	N/A	X	0.015
30	В	Journal of Product Innovation Management	2.09	73	1.52	63	0.015
31	В	Journal of Business Ethics	1.18	245	1.09	89	0.015
32	В	Organization Science	3.32	46	3.13	15	0.014
33	В	Entrepreneurship, Theory and Practice	N/A	X	N/A	X	0.014
34	В	Journal of Personality and Social Psychology	4.82	Z	4.73	Z	0.013
35	В	Journal of Business Venturing	2.92	52	2.26	31	0.013
36	В	Journal of Operations Management	4.60	24	3.24	14	0.012
37	В	Journal of Business Logistics	N/A	X	N/A	X	0.012
38	В	Journal of Applied Psychology	4.33	Z	3.84	Z	0.011
39	В	Journal of Consumer Behavior	N/A	X	N/A	X	0.010
40	В	Journal of Personal Selling and Sales Management	1.54	182	N/A	X	0.010
41	В	Journal of Macromarketing	1.20	214	N/A	X	0.010
42	В	Journal of Management	4.87	22	4.43	7	0.010
43	В	Journal of Management Studies	3.13	39	2.81	19	0.010
44	В	Organization Studies	2.47	70	2.12	38	0.009
45	В	American Economic Review	2.65	Z	2.53	Z	0.009
46	В	Journal of World Business	2.79	137	2.63	20	0.008
47	В	Journal of Services Marketing	1.02	218	N/A	X	0.008
48	В	Journal of Sustainable Tourism	1.08	162	N/A	X	0.008
49	В	Quantitative Marketing and Economics	1.19	119	N/A	X	0.008
50	В	Research Policy	N/A	X	2.26	30	0.007
51	В	Management International Review	1.83	224	N/A	X	0.007

52	В	Devahalagiaal Cajanaa	4.87	Z	5.09	Z	0.006
$\frac{32}{53}$	В	Psychological Science Consumption, Markets & Culture	N/A	X	N/A	X	0.006
54	В	MIS Quarterly	5.65	12	4.49	5	0.006
		Organizational Behavior and Human Decision	nn				
55	В	Processes	2.22	6	2.55	23	0.006
56	В	Journal of Interactive Marketing	3.91	69	2.6	21	0.006
57	В	International Marketing Review	1.46	194	1.16	84	0.006
58	В	Journal of Finance	4.07	5	3.76	Z	0.006
59	В	International Journal of Market Research	1.27	166	0.99	96	0.006
60	В	Marketing Theory	0.00	672	N/A	X	0.006
61	В	British Journal of Management	1.53	110	1.45	66	0.005
62	В	Journal of Supply Chain Management	2.35	113	N/A	X	0.005
63	В	Environment and Planning	2.04	Z	N/A	X	0.005
64	В	International Business Review	1.48	230	1.06	92	0.005
65	В	Journal of Marketing Theory and Practice	1.31	248	N/A	X	0.004
66	В	Transportation Research	2.28	79	N/A	X	0.004
67	В	Journal of Business and Industrial Marketing	1.03	309	N/A	X	0.004
68	В	Decision Sciences	2.81	54	2.38	26	0.004
69	В	Journal of Travel and Tourism Marketing	0.64	393	N/A	X	0.004
70	В	Sloan Management Review	1.24	122	N/A	X	0.004
$\frac{70}{71}$	В	Journal of Consumer Affairs	2.06	72	2.18	36	0.004
		International Journal of Physical Distribution	Q.				
72	В	Logistics Management	^{&} N/A	X	N/A	X	0.004
73	В	Organization	1.47	160	1.35	70	0.003
74	В	Tourism Analysis	N/A	X	N/A	X	0.003
75	В	Journal of International Management	2.08	172	1.85	49	0.003
76	В	Journal of Small Business Management	1.38	215	1.09	89	0.003
77	В	Human Resource Management Journal	1.35	124	N/A	X	0.003
78	В	Operations Research	1.70	Z	1.58	62	0.003
79	В	Information Systems Research	2.21	Z	1.79	50	0.003
80	В	Journal of Marketing Education	0.72	238	N/A	X	0.003
81	В	Public Opinion Quarterly	1.48	Z	N/A	X	0.003
82	В	California Management Review	2.60	71	1.98	44	0.003
83	В	Journal of Political Economy	4.00	Z	3.84	Z	0.003
		International Review of Retail Distribution ar	nd				
84	В	Consumer Research	N/A	X	N/A	X	0.003
85	В	Industrial and Corporate Change	1.92	Z	1.51	64	0.003
86	В	Journal of Experimental Social Psychology	2.24	Z	2.24	Z	0.003
87	В	Quarterly Journal of Economics	5.78	Z	5.65	Z	0.003
88	В	Current Issues in Tourism	0.70	340	N/A	X	0.003
89	В	Business History Review	0.36	516	0.35	144	0.003
90	В	Science	24.19	Z	N/A	X	0.002
91	В	International Journal of Advertising	1.40	159	1.09	88	0.002
92	В	Journal of Consumer Culture	1.46	Z	N/A	X	0.002
93	В	IEEE Transactions on Engineering Management	1.90	91	1.25	75	0.002
94	В	American Journal of Sociology	3.49	Z	3.48	Z	0.002
95	В	Small Business Economics	1.44	Z	1.38	69	0.002
96	В	Journal of Experimental Psychology	4.67	Z	N/A	X	0.002
97	В	Accounting, Organizations and Society	2.58	105	N/A	X	0.002
98	В	Journal of Financial Economics	4.43	10	4.02	Z	0.002
99	В	European Journal of Operational Research	2.51	Z	N/A	X	0.002
100		Human Relations	1.84	84	1.64	56	0.002
			-			-	

Notes: SSCI: Business, Management; Scopus: Business, Management and Accounting.

Z: Not in Business, Management or Business, Management and Accounting category X: Not in SSCI or Scopus database

Appendix D: MAG scholar journal ranking comparing with and without US data

aata				
	Journal with US data	Total	Journal without US data	Total
1 .	Journal of Marketing	714	Journal of Marketing	265
2 .	Journal of Marketing Research	659	Journal of Marketing Research	232
3	Journal of Consumer Research	598	Journal of Consumer Research	208
4	Marketing Science	470	Marketing Science	160
5 .	Journal of Academy of Marketing Science	389	Journal of Academy of Marketing Science	155
6 .	Journal of Retailing	282	Journal of Retailing	115
7 .	Journal of Consumer Psychology	184	European Journal of Marketing	91
8 .	Journal of Business Research	166	International Journal of Research in Marketing	91
9	Management Science	148	Journal of Business Research	79
10	International Journal of Research in Marketing	148	Journal of International Business Studies	64
11 .	Academy of Management Journal	139	Academy of Management Journal	62
12 .	Journal of International Business Studies	137	Journal of Consumer Psychology	52
13	European Journal of Marketing	130	Industrial Marketing Management	45
14	Strategic Management Journal	119	Academy of Management Review	43
15 .	Journal of Advertising	118	Journal of Marketing Management	42
16 .	Academy of Management Review	99	Journal of Service Research	41
17 .	Journal of Service Research	79	Management Science	37
18	Industrial Marketing Management	71	Journal of Advertising	36
19 .	Administrative Science Quarterly	67	Annals of Tourism Research	35
20 .	Journal of Advertising Research	66	Strategic Management Journal	33
21 .	Journal of Public Policy and Marketing	63	Administrative Science Quarterly	32
22 .	Journal of Marketing Management	58	Journal of International Marketing	27
23 .	Journal of International Marketing	56	Tourism Management	26
24	Marketing Letters	56	Organization Science	25
25	Annals of Tourism Research	49	Marketing Letters	24
26	Psychology & Marketing	48	Journal of Product Innovation Management	23
27	Harvard Business Review	47	Psychology & Marketing	22
28	Organization Science	46	Journal of Advertising Research	21
29	Tourism Management	41	Journal of Business Ethics	18
30 .	Journal of Product Innovation Management	40	Journal of Management Studies	17
31 .	Journal of Personality and Social Psychology	40	Journal of Travel Research	17
32 .	Journal of Business Ethics	39	Journal of Consumer Behavior	15
33 .	Journal of Management	35	Journal of Sustainable Tourism	15
	Journal of Consumer Behavior	34	Organization Studies	15
35 .	Journal of Travel Research	31	Harvard Business Review	14
36	Entrepreneurship, Theory and Practice	30	International Marketing Review	13
37	Journal of Personal Selling and Sales Management	3 30	Journal of Business Venturing	13
38 .	Journal of Management Studies	30	Journal of Management	13
39 .	Journal of Business Venturing	29	Journal of World Business	13

40	Journal of Applied Psychology	29	Entrepreneurship, Theory and Practice	12
41	Quantitative Marketing and Economics	29	Journal of Public Policy and Marketing	12
42	Journal of Macromarketing	28	British Journal of Management	11
43	Journal of Services Marketing	26	Environment and Planning	11
44	Journal of World Business	24	Journal of Macromarketing	11
45	Organization Studies	22	Marketing Theory	11
	Organizational Behavior and Human Decision			
46	Processes	22	Consumption, Markets & Culture	10
47	Journal of Operations Management	21	Journal of Applied Psychology	10
48	Journal of Sustainable Tourism	21	International Business Review	9
49	Psychological Science	21	Journal of Interactive Marketing	9
50	International Marketing Review	21	International Journal of Market Research	8
51	Research Policy	19	Journal of Consumer Marketing	8
52	Management International Review	19	Advances in Consumer Research	5
53	Journal of Interactive Marketing	19	Current Issues in Tourism	5
54	Journal of Business Logistics	17	Industrial and Corporate Change	5
55	Marketing Theory	17	Journal of Advertising and Marketing	5
	interior of the state of the st	-,	Communications	-
56	British Journal of Management	17	Journal of Business and Industrial Marketing	5
57	Consumption, Markets & Culture	16	American Economic Review	4
58	International Business Review	16	ASQ	4
59	American Economic Review	15	California Management Review	4
60	International Journal of Market Research	15	Human Relations	4
61	Environment and Planning	15	International Journal of Hospitality Management	4
62	Sloan Management Review	15	Accounting, Organizations and Society	3
63	MIS Quarterly	13	Australian Journal of Management	3
64	Decision Sciences	13	Economic Journal	3
65	Journal of Supply Chain Management	12	European Journal of Operational Research	3
66	Journal of Marketing Theory and Practice	12	Information Systems Research	3
67	Journal of Business and Industrial Marketing	12	International Journal of Advertising	3
68	Journal of Travel and Tourism Marketing	12	International Journal of Human Resource Management	3
69	Tourism Analysis	12	International Journal of Tourism Research	3
70	Journal of International Management	12	International Review of Retail Distribution and Consumer Research	3
71	Journal of Small Business Management	10	International Small Business Journal	3
72	Journal of Marketing Education	10	Journal of Consumer Culture	3
73	California Management Review	9	Academy of Marketing Science Quarterly	2
74	Journal of Political Economy	9	Acta Commercii	2
75	Industrial and Corporate Change	9	Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing	2
76	Journal of Experimental Social Psychology	9	Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics	2
77	Journal of Finance	8	Asia Pacific Journal of Tourism Research	2
78	International Journal of Physical Distribution & Logistics Management	8	Asian Journal of Business Research	2
79	Operations Research	8	Asian Survey	2
, ,	Operations resoured	9	I IDIGII DUI TOJ	_

80	Current Issues in Tourism	8	Business Ethics Quarterly 2
81	Quarterly Journal of Economics	8	Business Horizons 2
82	Journal of Consumer Culture	8	Decision Sciences 2
83	Small Business Economics	8	Department of Management Studies 2
84	Science	8	Entrepreneurship and Regional 2 Development
85	International Journal of Hospitality Management	8	Environmental Politics 2
86	Journal of Experimental Psychology	8	European Economic Review 2
87	Human Relations	8	European Management Journal 2
88	Journal of Organizational Behavior	8	Human Resource Management Journal 2
89	Journal of Consumer Affairs	7	International Journal of Bank Marketing 2
90	Human Resource Management Journal	7	International Journal of Contemporary 2 Hospitality Management
91	Information Systems Research	7	International Journal of Cross Cultural 2 Management
92	International Journal of Advertising	7	International Journal of Retail & 2 Distribution Management
93	International Journal of Logistics Management	7	Journal of Brand Management 2
94	Tourism Geographies	7	Journal of Business 2
95	Transportation Research	6	Journal of Business Accounting and 2 Finance
96	Journal of Marketing Communications	6	Journal of Business Logistics 2
97	Accounting, Organizations and Society	6	Journal of Business to Business Marketing 2
98	Journal of Consumer Marketing	6	Journal of Common Market Studies 2
99	Journal of Strategic Marketing	6	Journal of Contemporary Management 2
100	International Journal of Human Resource Management	6	Journal of Economic Geography 2

Note: The highlighted listings indicate journals either ranked outside the top 50, or not ranked within the 100 journal listed, (e.g., Journal of Personality and Social Psychology is ranked #31 with US data included, but is not ranked in the top 100 when US data is not included).