Sensing the City – Mapping the Beat

A rhythmanalysis of music-making
in Wellington and Copenhagen

By Katie Rochow

A thesis submitted to Victoria University of Wellington in fulfilment of the
requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Victoria University of Wellington
(2017)

Abstract

The idea of rhythm has figured as a key conceptual and empirical motif in current research on (urban) space, place and everyday life. Urban spaces are considered polyrhythmic fields, a compound of varied everyday life and spatial rhythms, which produce a particular, but ever-changing, complex mix of heterogeneous social interactions, mobilities, imaginaries and materialities (Edensor 2010). Music-making in the city therefore constitutes and is constituted by a plurality of urban rhythms including the movement between different locations as well as regular temporal patterns of events, activities, experiences and practices as well as energies, objects, flora and fauna which shape the music-maker's mundane 'pathways' through the city. Based on current ethnographic fieldwork in the urban spaces of Wellington (Aotearoa/New Zealand), and Copenhagen (Denmark) this project proposes a way of capturing, understanding and interpreting the multi-faceted rhythmical layout of urban spaces. It will do so by introducing a rhythm analytical methodology, which draws on interviews, participant generated photographs and mental maps as analytical tools for capturing the interwovenness of socialities, atmospheres, object, texts and images in people's everyday lives and in this way affords opportunities for attending to the multiple rhythms underlying music-making in the city. The use of cartographic and photographic means of representing these rhythmical dimensions allows us to better attend to an affective register that is often overlooked in studies of music-making. It makes visible some of the ways in which places, from the home to the studio to the performance venue and points in-between form a connective tissue, which anchors the music-makers to the city as well as lends the city its ambience, and, more importantly, its affective charge. As such, the manner in which mood, feeling, a "sense of place," is evoked through the visual representation of music-makers' everyday life suggests how the scenic aspects of the city work to simultaneously frame, mediate and facilitate meaningful experiences of place. Consequently, this study documents, through a unique medley of research methods, the way in which music-making serves as a vehicle for the social production of place and the creation of an affective attachment to that place both individual and collective.

Acknowledgements

Many people, from various parts of the world have inspired, encouraged and assisted me during the course of this project, and this is the place to thank them.

First and foremost I would like to extend my gratitude to Geoff Stahl, whose guidance and patience were a huge support from beginning to end. I also extend my thanks to David Cosper, who offered thoughtful advice and helpful comments during the final stages of completing the thesis. Thank you also to my friend and colleague Miriam Ross, who encouraged me to apply for a PhD scholarship in the first place.

This research project would not have been possible without the generous financial support of Victoria University and the School of English, Film, Theatre and Media Studies as well as the collaboration of the School of Performance Design at Roskilde University which provided me with an office space, free coffee, fruit, and most importantly, with an inspiring research community. A very warm Tak to Anja Mølle Lindelof who made me feel welcome from the very first day.

Thank you also to the many musicians from Copenhagen and Wellington who agreed to be part of this project. I am heavily indebted to their contributions, which reach from the pictorial insight into bedrooms, kitchens and rehearsal spaces to the sharing of personal anecdotes and drawings to coffees and bike rides through the city. I hope to have rendered all of their words, images, thoughts and feelings justly.

But most of all I would like to say Tak, Danke and Thank You to my family and friends, here in New Zealand, Germany and Denmark who have been there for me all along the way. In particular Grace, Inge, Edith, Nikita, Amy, Victor, Ian, Wayne and Lolo for kindly listening through the ‘ups and downs’ of the PhD process; Evelyn for endless ‘Skype pep talks’; my sister Melanie for her patience, encouragement and the regular supply of German chocolates; and lastly, to my parents, who always inspired and supported my studies, travels and love for music.

Table of Contents

Abstract.....	ii
Acknowledgements.....	iii
Table of Contents.....	iv
Figures	vi
Notes on the text	viii
Introduction.....	1
Part I – Space, Place and the (urban) Rhythms of music-making.....	11
Chapter 1 - Places (for the analysis) of music	11
1.1 (human) geographies of music.....	12
1.2 Music in the city	15
1.3 Music and Identity	22
Chapter 2 - Making Sense of Place.....	29
2.1 An attunement of the senses	30
2.2 A social construct.....	36
Chapter 3 - City Rhythms	43
3.1 Everyday life and Spatial Rhythms	44
3.2 Affective Rhythms	50
3.2.1 Approaching Affect	51
3.2.2. (Ordinary) Urban Affects.....	57
3.3 Categorizing City Rhythms	62
Part II – The Rhythmanalytic Lens – A Framework for Analysis.....	67
Chapter 4 - Methodology	67
4.1 Doing Rhythmanalysis.....	68
4.2 A Rhythmanalytical Framework.....	71
4.3 (Performing) ethnography in popular music studies.....	75
Chapter 5 - The Four Methods.....	80
5.1 (Participant-) observation	80
5.2 Interviews.....	84
5.3 Photo-elicitation.....	85
5.4 Mapping	95

5.5 Rhythmanalysis in the Field	102
Part III – From South to North and back again – Analysing City Rhythms.	106
Chapter 6 - Two Cities.....	106
6.1 Wellington's Rhythms	106
6.2 Copenhagen's Rhythms	112
Chapter 7 - Mapping Rhythms.....	121
7.1 General procedure.....	121
7.2 Drawing Rhythms	123
7.2.1 Spatial Rhythms	123
7.2.2. Social Rhythms	134
7.2.3 Affective Rhythms	139
7.3 Summary: Mapping atmospheric attunements	148
Chapter 8 - Picturing Rhythms	150
8.1 General procedure.....	150
8.2 Home and Away	152
8.3 Nature meets Culture	162
8.4 Objects and Objectives	170
8.5 People and Places.....	176
8.6 Summary: Picturing the everyday - inside and out.....	186
Chapter 9 - Talking Rhythms	189
9.1 General procedure.....	189
9.2 The Tall Poppy Community	191
9.3 Creating Space – Creating Rhythms	196
9.4 Synchronizing Rhythms – The Visual and the Verbal	203
9.5 Summary: Talking (Ar-)Rhythmias.....	207
Conclusion	209
Bibliography	218

Figures

Figure 1 Categorization of City Rhythms	64
Figure 2 Rhythmanalytical Framework	73
Figure 3 Map capturing Wellington's dominant natural rhythms	125
Figure 4 Gerard's map of Wellington	125
Figure 5 Tom's map of Wellington based on Māori mythology	128
Figure 6 Map illustrating roads and pathways in Copenhagen.....	130
Figure 7 Map illustrating the musician's pathways through Copenhagen	131
Figure 8 Symbols of social rhythms in Copenhagen	135
Figure 9 Visualization of people on the Wellington maps	135
Figure 10 Halla's symbolic map of Copenhagen	138
Figure 11 Rikke's symbolic map of Copenhagen	140
Figure 12 Nick's colourful map of Wellington	142
Figure 13 Richard's experimental and affective map of Wellington	144
Figure 14 Photographs of the musicians' use of domestic space in Wellington	152
Figure 15 Picture of Scott's flat.....	153
Figure 16 Garrett Street, a famous Wellington flat	155
Figure 17 Photos of the musicians' domestic space in Copenhagen.....	156
Figure 18 Nanna captures the home as a safe haven and space for relaxation	157
Figure 19 Photos depicting the view from the musicians' apartments in Copenhagen	158
Figure 20 Photos illustrating the link to global rhythms in Copenhagen	160
Figure 21 Anna's pinboard with collected items from all over the world.....	161
Figure 22 Picturing natural rhythms in Copenhagen	164
Figure 23 Picturing natural rhythms in Wellington	164
Figure 24 Fusing natural and socio-cultural rhythms in Wellington	165
Figure 25 Outdoor festivals illustrating the fusion of socio-cultural and natural rhythms in Wellington	166
Figure 26 Fusion of natural and cultural rhythms in Copenhagen	167
Figure 27 The Assistens Cemetery in Copenhagen	168
Figure 28 Photograph of a church in Copenhagen	169
Figure 29 Mobile devices on Copenhagen's photographs	172

Figure 30 Suitcases, bags, and boxes in Copenhagen.....	173
Figure 31 Media devices appear accidentally on photographs in Wellington	175
Figure 32 Multiple photos of bicycling in Copenhagen taken by the same participant	178
Figure 33 Different photos of bicycles/bicycling in Copenhagen	180
Figure 34 Photos of various streets in Copenhagen.....	181
Figure 35 Family portraits picturing Wellington's musical community	182
Figure 36 Photo of a pillar figure in Wellington	183
Figure 37 Musicians taking selfies in Copenhagen	184

Notes on the text

Due to the use of different paper during the mapping process in Wellington and Copenhagen the colour of the scanned images differs slightly, depending on the city. Maps from Copenhagen appear with a yellow tinge whereas maps from Wellington have a white background. For the purpose of representing the drawings in this thesis, the maps were scanned and scaled-down, yet content and colours remain unaltered. The original format of the maps is A3.

All the maps and two short videos based on the musicians' photographs can be found under: <https://urbansoundspace.wordpress.com>

This blog was created as a personal research diary, a way of digitally mapping my thoughts, experiences, ideas and feelings during the fieldwork in Wellington and Copenhagen. It is, however, not intended as an academic resource.

Introduction

Prelude

The first seed of this research project was planted in 2008, when I first set foot on New Zealand soil. I was an undergraduate student taking advantage of the three months holiday period from January till March to visit a "kiwi-boy" whom I met in Stuttgart during the previous summer term. He was a writer, musician and bohemian and I was a music enthusiast, globetrotter and curious ethnographer, eager to explore the roots and sources of his inspiration. Most of my time in New Zealand was spent in Wellington, his hometown, mingling with the bohemian and artist community, experiencing my first casual jam sessions, house parties with live music, mini festivals in people's backyards as well as plenty of art and music performances in different venues across the city. I was fascinated by the sheer amount of creativity, community spirit and musical vitality that transformed the rather small city into a vibrant cultural space. There was something very special about the way those artists created, performed and interacted with their environment and the people around them. Their movement, gestures, words, sounds, desires and dreams came together in a fascinating matrix of forces and feelings, conjuring up a certain rhythmic 'beat' which lent the city its unique atmosphere and texture.

What was it about the city that motivated and directed the musicians in their everyday lives? What created this unique atmosphere? What exactly was different to music-making in my hometown? Was it New Zealand's remoteness, its impressive natural features and sometimes rather rough weather conditions? Was it the city's layout, with its steep hills, Victorian houses, myriad cafés, bars and restaurants, shops, ateliers, and music venues? After three months I left Wellington with a heavy heart and a mind full of questions. At that moment I was not aware that in five years' time I would return to the city in order to search for some answers to those very questions.

In the meantime I started my postgraduate studies in Uppsala, a small university town in Sweden where I was soon challenged by another assemblage of rhythmic phenomena including long summer days and dark, cold winters. Scandinavia became

my home for the following two years and thanks to the good transport connections I was able to explore some fascinating Nordic cities such as Stockholm, Gothenburg, Helsinki and Copenhagen. Drawing from a diverse repertoire of urban settings, experiences and lifestyles, Copenhagen was the most fascinating Scandinavian city for me. With its wide variety of cosy cafés, bars and music venues, its second hand shops and flea-markets, beautiful canals and the coastline it often reminded me of Wellington's creative city life. But why was it that Copenhagen felt similar and not Helsinki, Stockholm or Gothenburg? In some way Copenhagen appeared less posh than Stockholm, more edgy than Helsinki and more vibrant than Gothenburg. Its numerous open-mic nights, lo-fi gigs and jam sessions evoked the 'feel' of an eclectic and active music culture, which was elevated by a multitude of creative and artistic events of all sorts. It was the city's particular ambience, forming a 'structure of feeling', as Raymond Williams (1977) might suggest, which seemed to resonate most clearly with what I experienced in Wellington. But what exactly was it about those cities that created this specific 'feel' and how did it affect the way local musicians created, participated and engaged in musical practice? How did the city shape the everyday life of musicians and why did music-making take the social shape it did in those two cities? Located at the heart of those questions seemed to be what Tim Edensor (2012) refers to as the city's unique 'rhythmic beat' – the tempo and tenor as borne out by the interplay of different types of movement and action in and across space stitched together in a matrix of forces and feelings that give shape to a meaningful urban choreography, guiding the music-makers through their everyday life in the city. After my graduation in Uppsala I decided to return to Wellington in order to start a PhD at Victoria University. There I was again, (still) a curious ethnographer, globetrotter and music enthusiast, eager to search for some answers and to continue sensing the city and mapping the beat in Copenhagen and in Wellington.

In this thesis I have set myself the task of detailing, theorizing and analysing this process of sensing the city and mapping the beat. Independent music-making in Copenhagen and Wellington are the chosen case studies and are used as a way to work through a set of conceptual frameworks and research methods, which can more adequately describe how a sense of place is created. Music-making serves here as a

social medium, which affects the way people interact, connect, move about as well as direct their activity in the city. The particular nature of music-making in the city is such that it provides valuable details about the connections between a specific mode of cultural production and the complex make-up of urban social space. In the city, music-making takes on a specific rhythmicality, based on the interplay between social, spatial and affective dimensions, all of which define and inform one another and the spaces in which they unfold. As such, it is not so much ‘the sound’ that matters, but the particular rhythms, dynamics and atmospheres associated with music-making in the city.

This project takes those rhythms, dynamics and atmospheres as its rationale and examines the (affective) relationship of music-makers to their local urban space. It considers how the musicians’ experiences and relation to the city affect the way they participate and engage in local musical activity. Hence, it is concerned with the ways in which the musicians’ relation or ‘sense’ of place is evoked through a complex range of multiscale temporalities including the movement of people, objects, ideas and materialities as well as ordinary affects and atmospheres (Stewart 2011). The regular patterns of flow make up a concatenation of City Rhythms, which in their varied ratios serve to bind the music-makers to their urban space as well as lend the city its shape and substance.

In order to capture, analyse and understand the multiple rhythms underlying the musicians’ sense of place in Wellington and Copenhagen I have developed a rhythm analytical methodology which seeks to recognise the interwovenness of socialities, atmospheres, objects, texts and images in people’s everyday lives and in this way affords opportunities for attending to the concrete, physical reality of urban spaces as well as other less tangible, less readily apparent but no less significant aspects of the temporal, spatial and, more importantly, affective dimensions associated with music-making in the city.

The rhythm analytical methodology developed for this project draws on various terms and concepts that offer useful provocations to think differently about how to approach music-making in the city. Key among these is Henri Lefebvre’s (1991;

2004) notion of social space and his concept of rhythmanalysis, which have both as of late been applied to a number of different urban phenomena (see for example Johansson 2013; Simpson 2012). For Lefebvre, social space is a social product and therefore the locus of lived experience. He divides the production of space into three dialectically interconnected dimensions: representations of space, spatial practice and spaces of representation. Combining those different modalities of space allows for a rapprochement between physical, mental and social space, yet fails to account for the affective force fields which are a crucial element of people's everyday social world. Building on this, Lefebvre's rhythmanalysis provides an analytic lens through which to examine the interrelation of space and time by means of linear and cyclical rhythms. While cyclical rhythms stand for the cosmic, worldly or natural, linear rhythms are imposed structures, originating from human activity or social practice. Again, this rhythmical divide neglects the less visible, affective rhythms and intensities, which present themselves in urban spaces without actually being present. However, those rhythms are crucial to the way in which attachment (or detachment) to a place gains its affective charge.

The way in which the music-makers attachment or 'sense of place' is discussed here draws on various theories, ideas and notions. It considers the individual's sensuous, imaginative and affective experiences of place, which are anchored in the sensibilities and possibilities of the lived body. (Merleau-Ponty 1962; Heidegger 1971; Relph 1976; Stewart 2011; Tuan 1977; 1974). As such, sense of place is an embodied, fluid and dynamic phenomenon, which is attuned to the complex rhythmical unfolding of the city.

Besides Lefebvre, a number of scholars have analysed and discussed the rhythmic structuring of everyday social life. Two perspectives are particularly relevant for a deeper understanding of the links between time and space and its effects on the sociomusical experience of the city. Filipa Wunderlich (2008a) proposes a categorization of urban rhythms into spatial, and everyday life rhythms, including cultural, natural, sound, smell, dynamic, and spatial rhythms. Wunderlich draws on Eviatar Zerubavel (1981), who focuses particularly on the sociology of time arguing that everyday social life is rhythmically structured into sociotemporal,

physiotemporal and biotemporal regularities. Similar to Lefebvre, those approaches focus on social, spatial, and natural regularities, yet they fail to account for the affective aspects of urban life, which contribute significantly to the city's ambience and texture.

The present research project takes those shortcomings as its rationale for creating a tripartite categorization of City Rhythms, which consists of social, spatial as well as affective rhythms. This 'rhythmical triad' complements Lefebvre's triadic notion of social space, as it recognizes the polyrhythmic environments, energies, affective affinities, and atmospheres surrounding the musicians in their everyday life in the city. The amalgamation of the two triads provides an encompassing rhythmanalytical framework that allows situating the study of music-making in Wellington and Copenhagen as one, which takes up questions about the social, spatial, and affective relation of music-making to the city.

As a way of getting attuned to, capturing, examining and understanding the musicians' polyrhythmic environments in Wellington and Copenhagen, each rhythmical dimension (social, spatial, affective) was given explicit attention using an alternative set of qualitative methods, including participant observation, mental mapping, photo-elicitation and interviews. I briefly want to take up the usefulness of each method as a way of exploring the multiple narratives of place. Participant observation reveals a first insight into the musicians' routines and pathways through the city, creating a valuable foundation for a more detailed and accurate analysis of the music-makers sense of place. Mental mapping as an analytic mode provides a schematic view of the city, graphically representing major sites and locations associated with music-making. Besides the concrete urban materiality, the musicians' maps are also indicators of subjective experiences, as the activity of drawing allows the participants to reflect about the issue being explored, providing opportunities to elicit different kinds of knowledge including embodied experiences, affects and sensations, which cannot easily put into words. Alongside this mapping exercise, photo-elicitation serves as a tool for capturing the multiple urban rhythms surrounding the musicians in their urban environment. As a participatory research method conducted 'in the field', photo-elicitation motivates the musicians to actively

engage with their surroundings which facilitates the capturing of any moment, atmosphere or ambience in a snapshot without the need to fully understand and articulate the particular affects at play. Finally semi-structured interviews provide insight into the musicians' experiences, understandings and interpretations of their everyday urban rhythms and allow them to tell their story in their own particular way.

Approaching music-making through a rhythmanalysis in each city provides opportunities to capture what Kathleen Stewart (2011) has called "atmospheric attunements" in the form of "descriptive detours," a way to account for some of the more elusive aspects of the sociomusical experience of music-makers in each city (Stewart 2011, 445). Getting at these "detours" using a visually based methodology provides opportunities to get at the more ineffable, affective rhythms that shape music-making in the city.

The rhythmanalytical methodology developed here serves therefore as an analytic lens for sensing the city and mapping the beat in Wellington and Copenhagen. The unique medley of research methods can be utilized in order to answer the following questions: How does music-making facilitate and frame particular experiences of place and how do place experiences affect music-making in return? What does the nature of music-making tell us about the relationship of certain modes of artistic practice to urban spaces like Copenhagen or Wellington? What are the underlying rhythms that lend the city its atmosphere and texture? How do those rhythms affect the way local musicians create, participate and engage in musical practice? How do those rhythms shape the way the musicians relate, experience and 'make sense' of the city? The value of these questions resides in their ability to frame a discussion of urban music-making according to its social, spatial and affective dimensions and they inform much of the discussion about the musicians' sense of place in Wellington and Copenhagen.

By exploring these questions, this research project engages with a number of wider debates around the study of music-making and place. It responds to discussions regarding the geographies of music, considering the significance of music-making as

an essential constituent of everyday life, and a way of locating and identifying with a sense of place (Connell and Gibson 2003; Kong 1995; Smith 1994; 1997). It further engages with debates on music-making in the city more specifically, including the works of Andy Bennett, Sara Cohen, Ruth Finnegan and Geoff Stahl who offer rich ethnographic studies on the effects of material, symbolic, social, economic, and political factors of city life on local music practice. Yet music-making is not only considered to be a medium through which people convey everyday experiences of (urban) space and place but it also remains an important tool for the musician's identity construction. Various scholars have discussed the role of music as a 'technology of self' (DeNora 2000), a means for self-recognition (Frith 1996) or emotional self-management (Hesmondhalgh 2013), providing valuable insight into music's embodied spatial qualities. Each of these scholars offers important contributions to the field of popular music studies and has inspired this project in a large part. However, what remains striking about these studies is the peculiar absence of discussions that link the individuals' embodied, musical experience to the process of constructing (a sense of) urban space. As such, this project offers a rhythmanalytical approach, which knits together discourses of identity, embodiment, space and (urban) place in a way that offers an alternative perspective towards music-making in the city.

Furthermore, much of the current research on music-making and (urban) space has adopted a narrative approach, drawing on interviews, oral histories and personal accounts in outlining the significance of music-making to a given city. However, as these various narrative-based accounts of musical practice in cities around the world have proliferated and accumulated over time, they have also helped to formulate a kind of de facto orthodoxy in terms of methodological approaches to music-making, one which privileges the ethnographic as the preferred, and ostensibly more accurate, means to document sociomusical experience. While acknowledging the importance and value of this approach, this thesis proposes an alternative set of methods, photographic and cartographic, which, while they complement the ethnographic study of (urban) music-making, also allow us to apprehend other less tangible, less readily apparent but no less significant aspects of the temporal, spatial and, more importantly, affective dimensions associated with music-making in the city.

Chapter outline

Part I *Space, Place and the (urban) Rhythms of music-making* addresses some key concepts and debates around music space and place. **Chapter One** begins with the question of how music contributes to the formation and articulation of (human) geographical imaginations. This is followed by a discussion of music-making in the urban realm, emphasizing the interplay of social, material and affective elements in the city, which constitute the breeding ground for local music practice. The chapter continues to elaborate on music's role in the creation and formation of spatialised identities and argues that existing literature focuses either on music-making as a tool for the production and experience of (urban) *social space* or music-making as a vehicle for the formation of a *social self* (in social space). Thus it points out the need for further research that knits together theories of social space, affect and the body, combining the imaginary and the sensory, the abstract and the concrete, the static and the rhythmic as they all form a connective tissue anchoring the musicians to their urban space.

Chapter Two explores the concept of *Sense of Place*. It discusses the duality of the term, referring to 'meaning' or 'sense making' on the one hand and to sensation and 'the senses' on the other. Drawing on ideas such as Tuan's topophilia, Relph's place and placelessness, Heidegger's work on dwelling, Merleau-Ponty's phenomenology of the body and Stewart's concept of atmospheric attunements, the chapter proposes a definition of *Sense of Place* as a sensuous, dynamic mode of 'being-in-the-world' anchored in embodied movements, affective intensities, sensibilities, relationality and performativity. Subsequently the chapter continues to clarify the meaning and use of the term *place*, as it is introduced by Henri Lefebvre. It discusses Lefebvre's dialectical triad, which allows for a rapprochement between physical mental and social space, before it introduces his concept of rhythmanalysis, which serves as an analytic lens for extracting and analysing the bodies, rhythms and atmospheres that come together in the complex unfolding of the city. The chapter concludes with the argument that Lefebvre's conception of social space as a social construct is vital for the analysis of the musician's sense of place, yet it lacks a clear consideration of the less visible, affective aspects constituting everyday life in (urban) spaces.

Chapter Three focuses on the complex array of changing rhythmic processes that characterise everyday life in the city and therefore shape the music-makers sense of place in Wellington and Copenhagen. Drawing on diverse scholars such as Zerubavel, Wunderlich and Lefebvre, the chapter argues that the analysis of urban rhythms offers a new mode of observing and understating urban places as it considers the dynamic, complex interaction between people, nature, space and time. Besides everyday life and spatial rhythms, the chapter proposes the consideration of affective rhythms, which direct and propel the pulse and life of urban spaces without actually being visible. After a profound discussion of different theories and approaches towards affect the chapter proposes a categorization of City Rhythms consisting of social, spatial and affective rhythms. This categorization provides an analytic technique and mode of representation of (urban) rhythms, which allows for a better understanding of the spatial, temporal and affective unfolding of the musician's everyday life in the city.

The central focus of **Part II** *The Rhythmanalytic Lens – A Framework for Analysis* lies on the creation of a rhythmanalytical methodology. **Chapter Four** provides an overview of existing research engaging with Lefebvre's rhythmanalysis, before introducing a rhythmanalytical framework, which is uniquely suited to this specific project. This multisensory methodology creatively combines participant observation, interviews, photo-elicitation and mapping. After reviewing existing ethnographic research in the field of popular music studies, **Chapter Five** elaborates on each method in more detail. The chapter concludes with the argument that this unique medley of research methods makes possible a thicker description of the polyrhythmic environments and atmospheres surrounding the musicians in their everyday life in the city.

In **Part III** - *From South to North and back again – Analysing City Rhythms*, I examine the musicians' maps, photographs and interviews and reveal the findings of my ethnographic research. **Chapter Six** begins with an introduction to Wellington's and Copenhagen's rhythmical layout revealing demographic, economic, political social and cultural details of each city. The musicians' mental maps are analysed in **Chapter Seven**, focussing particularly on the visualization of spatial, social and

affective rhythms in the drawings. In **Chapter Eight**, the musicians' photographs are examined and divided into four groups based on dominant rhythms constituting the photo's motif and content. The final chapter Talking Rhythms discusses the findings drawn from the music-makers' verbal narrative. Besides rhythmical dissonances and moments of disharmony the interviews revealed rhythmic synchronicities, which comprise recurring moments and experiences previously discussed during mapping or photo-elicitation. Consequently the chapter suggests that visual and verbal narrative appear to enrich one another, which allows for a holistic insight into the musicians' everyday (urban) rhythms.

The **Conclusion** draws together the main arguments of each part and considers the findings in relation to previous theorisations of City Rhythms and the concept of sense of place, before outlining areas for future research.

The following chapters explore patterns of sociability, mobility, interaction and belonging, animated and connected by creative possibilities, social atmospheres, moods and energies, which create a distinctive 'urban feel' and shape the way an affective place attachment is created. As this discussion will demonstrate, these are all aspects of music-making in Wellington and Copenhagen which are deeply enmeshed in reticular circuits of rhythms, which will gradually be disentangled during the course of this project.

Part I – Space, Place and the (urban) Rhythms of music-making

Chapter 1 - Places (for the analysis) of music

There are a variety of ways in which the places of music can be conceptualized in modern society. Instead of referring to music as an object to be analysed, this research project conceives of music as a medium, which constitutes and is constituted by the everyday social world. Music, in this way, is an active agent contributing to the production of everyday life and social space. It is a means by which people compose identities and characterize place including the boundaries that separate them (Stokes 1994). Music is therefore a “unique form of symbolic expression” which

[...] can exist alone as a cultural event or product (concert, street performance, private singing and playing, records, tapes, compact discs, digital audio tape, and so on); serve as the content focus for another medium (radio, music video, some movies); or contribute to the overall aesthetics and meaning of another content display (background music for television and film, accompaniment for rituals such as church services, weddings, funeral ceremonies, sporting events, and so on). It is the soundtrack for shopping, driving, studying, and partying, among other activities. Music is sometimes accompanied by extreme physical movement (for instance, dance, aerobics) and is also often experienced in pensive, inactive moments (Lull 1987, 141).

In other words, music “contains a theory of society as it is and as it aspires to be. And this theory of society is also a theory of space” (Smith 1997, 524). It is a socio-cultural text, which is capable of being analysed for representations of space, place and identity. Yet music is more than mere representation. Music is an ‘embodied cultural pursuit’, contributing to the “material, embodied, fleshy, emotional, technological and tactile experience of place” (Gibson 2009, 61). The spaces of music are therefore produced and consumed in many different ways. They are nestled within a complex set of material, affective, social, cultural, political and economic forces, governed by changing technology and commercialism and mediated by ideologies and aesthetic strategies. Thus, in order to gain a deeper

understanding of the place of music we have to fully engage with “the complex matrices of our everyday lives” (Kong 1995, 195).

This chapter sets out to provide an overview of the key debates germane to the study of music-making and (urban) space. As such, it locates this project within the larger context of musical geographies and identities, highlighting the impact of “the local”, or locality, to the unfolding of particular cultural and material practices such as music-making in the city. While the first part discusses the complex ways in which music-making impacts on geographical interpretations of space and place more generally, the second part addresses relations of music-making and urban space in particular. It draws on a number of engaging studies that discuss musical cultures in the city (Cohen 1995; 1998; Finnegan 1989; Cohen, Lashua, and Schofield 2010; Stahl 2003; 2011) and explores how music-making is a tool for the social production of urban space. The final part maps out music’s role in the construction and maintenance of the social self, pointing towards the absences and limitations of that literature, which lays the groundwork for this rhythmanalytical study that seeks to recognize the interwovenness of temporal, spatial and, more importantly, affective dimensions associated with music-making in the city.

1.1 (human) geographies of music

The closer one looks at the geography of Western culture and at music's place in it, the more compromised, the more socially involved and active music seems (Said 1991, 58).

Music has always been strongly associated with notions of space and place. Yet it was not until the “cultural turn” in the late 1980s that studies of music and its relation to place have proliferated in the social sciences generally, and in human geography in particular¹. The main reasons for the relative neglect of music-making in human geography until that point was on the one hand the depreciation of popular culture as “mere entertainment, trivial and ephemeral” (Kong 1995, 183–184) and their focus

¹ The increasing attention on culture created a place for the geographical analysis of music. Some of the early contributions in the field have emphasized the spatial diffusion of music (Carney 1974; Ford 1971; Meyer 1976); the traditions of ‘folk geography’ (Lornell and Meador 1983); recording soundscapes of the past (Lowenthal 1976), or the role of pop music in geographical education (Paterson 1991). For more examples on earlier geographical research on music see Kong 1995 and Smith 1994.

on the 'ideology of the visual' on the other. This 'pre-occupation with the visual' gave an epistemological privilege to seeing over smelling, touching, tasting and hearing. Susan Smith (1994) criticized this visual bias in (human) geographical thinking and argued for a "better balance between the visual and the aural" (232). She points out that music is essential to the geographical imagination as it "structures space and characterises place" and is therefore inseparable from the social landscape (232). By introducing the concept of 'soundscapes,' Smith draws on the symbolism of place and highlights the inherently spatial aspects of auditory environments. The spaces of music are embedded in a social context, driven by political forces and determined by commercialism and changing technologies. For Smith, music is not only an aesthetic experience but a cultural product that can be analysed "in the same way as painting, film, dance, drama, literature, and so on" (Smith 2000, 618). Music can evoke a sense of space and society, which differs and yet complements the horizon of the visual world. Hence, the heard environment has to be analysed critically and space has to be imagined as a listening in order to "recognise that ways of hearing are ways of being and becoming" (617).

Several scholars have contributed to a better balance between the visual and the aural within the field of human geography in the last decade, emphasizing the importance of sound and music for geographical interpretations of the social world (Leyshon, Matless, and Revill 1998; Smith 1994; 1997; Kong 1995; Ingham, Purvis, and Clarke 1999). By identifying the links between music-making and the production and conceptualization of place, scholars have increasingly shown interest in "how music as a cultural and aesthetic form may function and have material affect within various social settings, creating both real and imagined social spaces" (Leyshon 2004, 230).

In their introduction to *The Place of Music* (1998), Leyshon et al. argue that

to consider the place of music is not to reduce music to its location, to ground it down to some geographical baseline, but to allow purchase on the rich aesthetic, cultural, economic, and political geographies of musical language (425).

They emphasize the spatiality of music by presenting space and place not only as sites "where or about which music happens to be made" but as locales shaping the sounding and resounding of music (4). They explore the role of music in the formation and articulation of geographical imaginations from a complex political, economic and cultural context, emphasizing the significance of understanding

geographical place not merely as “visible points in physical space, but as the product of diverse and complex forces” (130). In this way, the authors adopt a relational perspective, emphasizing the interplay between music and geography while critiquing studies following the ‘cartographic tradition’ which focused mainly on important sites or iconic figures while ignoring the “social and political contexts in which music is produced” (Kong 1995, 186) including the “socially constructed nature of human understandings of place and space” (Connell and Gibson 2003, 13)². Connell and Gibson (2003) argue that such ‘cartographies of music’ need to be situated “just like printed maps [...] in networks of economic, social and political relationships” (13). In their book *Soundtracks* (2003), Connell and Gibson analyse the impact of political, economical, cultural and technological shifts on the “changing structure and geographies of music at local and global levels” (x). The authors emphasize the invisibility and ephemeral nature of music despite its evidently close relationship to place. They stress the dual and dynamic nature of music as cultural expression and commodity, as fixed phenomenon and fluid cultural form existing in both, local and global space. In exploring this, the authors demonstrate how music “is an essential constituent of everyday worlds, a medium of social life, and, importantly, a way of locating and identifying with a sense of place” (Leyshon 2004, 232).

Against this backdrop, it follows that the practice of music-making can be described as an amalgam of people, material, and symbolic resources, congregating in a certain space of possibility, all of which is provided in the complex make-up of urban social spaces. As Geoff Stahl suggests: “music-making’s unique forms of cultural expression, its dense infrastructure and the informal nature of its social organization are by definition ‘urban’” (Stahl 2003, xii). Music-making in this sense could be said to revolve therefore around the various forms of social reality in the city, which are entangled in a dense network of local and global flows of goods, images, ideas, people and energies. As Kloosterman has put it:

² Examples of studies in the ‘cartographic traditions’ are Aldskogius (1993) and Waterman (1998) examining the absence or presence of specific regional music traditions at music festivals in Sweden and Israel, while Lomax and Erickson (1971) and Nash (1968) map out certain world musical styles. Henderson (1974); Lehr (1983) explore how the images of place are evoked through music lyrics; Woods and Gritzner (1990) analyse depictions of sacred and profane places in country music; Bell (1998), Curtis and Rose (1987), Gill (1993) explore regional sounds.

The virtuous circle of a city making music and music making a city shows how places and their particular histories still matter in an era where (digitalized) music seems to be first and foremost a part of the global space of flows (2005, 182).

Music-making in this sense opens up questions regarding forms of sociality and materiality in the city. As a way to approach the various arrays of social, temporal and spatial relationships in which cultural activity in the city unfolds, Will Straw (1991; 2004) introduced the concept of scenes as a vital cultural hub, and important incubator and insulator for creative activity in the city. For Straw, cultural activities such as music-making “work upon the social and institutional foundations of cities so as to produce distinctive complexes of knowledge and behaviour” (2004, 421). Music-making as such reveals social and institutional structures, patterns of interaction and movement as well as the more ephemeral, hidden meanings, imaginaries and animate forms of attachment. It serves as “a vehicle through which the meaningfulness of the city can be enunciated in various ways (Stahl 2007, 157). In other words, music-making is a unique tool for ‘sounding out cities’, providing insights “into otherwise unmapped urban spaces and overlooked social relations” (Lashua, Spracklen, and Wagg 2014, 2).

1.2 Music in the city

The relations of music-making and urban spaces are certainly not the preserve of (human) geography. In recent years, the study of music-making in the city has become an object of fascination for a wide range of disciplines including popular music studies (Cohen 1991; 1998; 2012; Stokes 1994), anthropology (Finnegan 1989), musicology (Krimms 2007; 2000; Holt and Wergin 2013), cultural studies (Bennett 2000; 2002; Mitchell 1997; Lashua, Spracklen, and Wagg 2014; Shank 1994) or media and communication studies (Straw 1991; 2004; Stahl 2003; 2004; 2007; 2011) among others. Despite the diverse nature of their methodological and theoretical approaches, these scholars have been either directly or indirectly engaged in the material and symbolic dimensions of city life, generating “place-bound theories and regional ethnographies of music scenes, audiences cultures and experiences of place” (Connell and Gibson 2003, 11).

Among these studies of music-making, an early and significant contribution is Ruth Finnegan's (1989) ethnographic study on amateur music-making in the English town of Milton Keynes. Through an anthropological lens, Finnegan examines "the structures of the often unrecognised practices of local music-making" which are embedded in place, yet remain flexible and dynamic (Finnegan 1989, xi). Local musical activity, as she describes it, is composed of a set of practices and social relations, dependent on individual connections as well as a series of "known and regular routes which people chose – or were led into – and which they both kept open and extended through their actions" (305). Finnegan calls these habitual routes musical "pathways" which provide not only the established routines of musical practice but also deep-seated personal values and meaning for personal action and identity. Those pathways are abiding routes, which various people might have taken, yet they are of part-time nature as they are constantly being re-formed and re-developed. They overlap and intersect, creating an "invisible structure" which is part of the existing cultural forms and hence the breeding ground for local urban music-making.

Although Finnegan underlines the flexible and voluntary nature of musical paths, emphasizing the myriad reasons that draw people into their particular pathways, she elaborates only on a few chief influences such as gender, age, one's stage of life, family background and existing social connections that lead people toward or away from certain paths. Besides those social factors there is, however, the materiality of the city, providing concrete spaces of musical creativity "from the bedroom, garage or home studio, to community and youth centres, to street corners and clubs (Watson, Hoyler, and Mager 2009, 856). As such, cities provide concrete networks that foster and support musical creativity. Those concrete networks of creativity are further shaped by less tangible, more abstract components of city life such as various relations and durations of movement, mobilities, speed and slowness, as well as patterns of natural regularities such as day and night, season and annual cycles, sensuous experiences including sounds and smells which encompass the materiality of the human body. Natural, material and imagined aspects of the city are therefore essential mediating factors in the creation and consumption of music. In this way, music-making in urban spaces involves interactions between people, and interaction

between people and their urban environment. It entails a complex array of non-human rhythms entangled and intertwined with economic, cultural and social aspects which are all part of the city's networks of musical creativity and production.

Besides the concrete materiality and sociality of urban spaces, there are however, the less tangible, affective aspects that shape music-making in the city. Amin and Thrift (2002) remind us that the materiality of the city is based upon the idea that “affective economies are as important as political and symbolic economies” which brings into focus the force of affect in the urban realm (Latham and McCormack 2004, 706). Despite the social and emotional experiences associated with urban spaces, there are its affective intensities, which is to speak of the “relations that are always more than personal and are always playing out before the reflective event of thought kicks in” (706). As such, the body registers certain affects before they are fully processed by the brain, as Massumi illustrates:

Walking down a dark street at night in a dangerous part of town, your lungs throw a spasm before you consciously see and can recognize as human the shadow thrown across your path. As you cross a busy noonday street, your stomach turns somersaults before you consciously hear and identify the sound of screeching brakes that careen towards you. Having survived the danger, you enter your building (2002, 60).

Musical pathways are thus embedded in an “affective force field”, an urban atmosphere which is tangible and sensory, yet “imaginary and uncontained, material yet abstract” (Stewart 2011, 445). Drawing on cultural geographer Mike Crang (1998), Tony Mitchell (2009) suggests that music might be traced in ‘spaces of affect’ (92). It is through the shared reactions to music in a certain (urban) space that people create “affective and emotional communities”, which in turn affect the way that music-making shapes those (urban) spaces for the people (92). As a result, Mitchell argues for an “open, poetic way of reading place, community and identity through music”, situating music-making as “embedded in a locale” (2009, 146).³⁴

³ This idea is derived from the concept of psychogeography as it was introduced by geographer William G. Niederland and Guy Debord, and the Situationists in the 1950s as a means of reading urban identity through the emotional overtones of place.

⁴ In *New Zealand Glimpsed through Iceland: Music, Place and Psychogeography*, Mitchell (2013) delves deeper into the ‘emotional geography’ of certain places exploring the analogous geographical aspects of New Zealand and Icelandic music. He argues that in both countries geographic, geomorphic and topographical features predominantly in the national psyche with the result that the “affective attachments to landscape are particularly strong” (42). Again, he applies the concept of psychogeography in order to capture “a sense of the aura or sacredness of geographical locations”, where music is a tool facilitating the “mediation between local knowledge and the imagination”(42). As a way of reading landscape and place, music can “evoke or recreate places, spaces,

The meaning of music-making in the city therefore extends beyond the palpable, the social and the symbolic. It oscillates between the tempos, valences and moods of the city, is affected by the rhythms of our bodies, smells, colours, sounds, seasons, weather and the built environment as well as social and cultural rhythms. The affective materiality of the urban is part of the city's diversity of powers (Bridge and Watson 2010). It manifests itself in the everyday life and resonates with local urban music practice. It is for this reason that Gibson argues for a "relational" understanding of creative urban spaces, taking into account "physical form, acoustic properties, technologies and landscapes" as they interact in complex and dialectical ways (Gibson 2005, 193). This relational epistemology follows the ideas of actor-network theory, the sociology of science and human geography in order to explain

the affective capacities of various objects, humans, animals and landscapes – the potential of different human and non-human actors to affect one another, and how these capacities are enacted in particular ways through webs of action (193).

According to Gibson, music-making in the city is thus made up of "multiple, simultaneously enabled chains of causality" between various human as well as non-human actors which are all in some way connected through affective relations (193).

Thus, what Finnegan's study lacks is a more nuanced examination of how certain urban spaces develop their affective qualities, charged atmospheres and imaginaries. Finnegan's work is more concerned with the social and cultural activities and movements that spur local music practice and propel the musicians through urban space. However, her study tells us little about how a city's identity or atmosphere comes into being or how the interplay of social, material and affective elements shape the everyday experience of place or how non-human matters including energies, objects, flora and fauna impose upon, exist separately from and/or intermingle with human activity. Yet Finnegan's study remains a valuable example of ethnographic research on local urban music practice. However, it can be expanded to consider the profound consequences of how affective intensities and a city's materiality impact on local urban music-making.

localities, events and occasions, as well as provide imagined or biographical cartographies and metaphorical orientation guides, along with affective embodiments of identity, home and belonging" (42).

Following the example of Finnegan is Sara Cohen's work on indie rock in Liverpool (1991), which has contributed to the field of popular music studies in invigorating ways. Similar to Finnegan, Cohen's goal is to put forward a micro-sociological study on urban music-making; in her case however, it is the city of Liverpool. While Finnegan covered a wide variety of genres, including church choirs, brass bands, jazz, rock and folk music, Cohen's study is largely restricted to rock and 'alternative' or 'pop' bands that navigate "on the margins of the industry" (1991, 5). Based on the case study of two particular bands from Liverpool, The Jactars and Crikey It's the Cromptons! Cohen examines the way in which those bands face the tension between creativity and the commercial pressure of the music industry that prevails in their urban social space. While musicians struggle to 'make it' in a period of "economic decline, unemployment, dwindling audiences and performance venues" (3), music-making serves as a 'way out', while it is at the same time inextricably tied up with the "alienation of commerce and of modern industrial capitalism in general" (195).

Cohen reinforces Finnegan's argument that local urban music-making constitutes a large field of cultural activity in England and states that "the labor of those involved tends to be hidden and overlooked" (Cohen 2007a, 20). While her work on rock culture in Liverpool mainly discusses economic, social and cultural factors shaping local music practice, later works also emphasizes the built urban environment "as a setting for everyday social relations, practices and interactions" (1995, 434). Based on the analysis of an urban regeneration project that took place in Liverpool in the end of 2005 describing the conversion of a local recording studio into private residences, Cohen argues that music-making is not only bound up with the socio-economical dynamics of a certain city but also with its material environment. She illustrates the way in which music-makers socially, ideologically and emotionally engage with their material surroundings by creating musical land- and soundscapes, which characterize urban space in "largely hidden and intangible ways" (2007a, 20). Besides, by providing spaces of creative activity, the built urban environment facilitates social interaction and musical collaborations, shaping the unique sociomusical experience of the city. Hence, music-making reflects as well as affects everyday social relations, interactions, practices and the material environment through which it is made (Cohen 1995).

In a later ethnographic project, Cohen et. al (2010) explore the relationship of music-making and the built urban environment by highlighting “what cities tell us about popular music [...] but also how music-making helps to produce and shape the city” (Cohen, Lashua, and Schofield 2010, 127). While comparing different mappings of Liverpool’s popular music history and heritage, Cohen et al. draw the conclusion that the city’s “material fabric” is “branded” by a dominant master narrative emphasizing only certain histories or places⁵ while overlooking others (130). They conclude that those “hidden” or alternative mappings are, however, part of the city’s music-making cultures and need to be considered in order to fully capture a city’s musical heritage and provide a profound characterization of the unique sociomusical experiences permeating that urban space⁶⁷.

Speaking to a set of more locally relevant issues, a number of scholars have explored some of these issues as they unfold in Wellington. In his ethnographic study on independent music-making in Wellington, Geoff Stahl (2011) argues that the city’s sociomusical experience is caught up in “two different, but related, regimes: neoliberalism and the creative city” (149). Those notions are manifest in the city’s cultural policy, which enforces the representation of Wellington as the nation’s ‘cultural capital’ – an idea closely related to the more global concept of the ‘creative city’. Both terms are reflections of a neoliberal discourse, emphasizing entrepreneurialism and creativity, in order to allow the city to “adequately jockey for position within a global symbolic economy that underpins competitive market trading in seductive images of place that are ripe with the promise of cultural production and consumption” (155). As another “echo of a neoliberal,

⁵ Cohen et. al refer here to the “Three Graces—the Liver Building, the Cunard Building and the Port of Liverpool Building. These stand along the River Mersey as part of the iconic signifying architecture, landscape, and urban culture of Liverpool. Highly recognizable, images of the Three Graces are widely used to signify Liverpool and the wider Merseyside region. The Three Graces are thus readily identified and identifiable as having something to do with ‘Liverpool-ness’” (Cohen, Lashua, and Schofield 2010, 127).

⁶ Further relevant studies of music-making as an aspect of cultural heritage, civic identity and urban policy are Cohen 2007; Bennett 2009; Homan 2003. Those studies explore the recent changes in heritage policies from the exclusive domain of the experts to wider public accessibility allowing for popular music to affect popular heritage. This includes the development of various ‘music cities’ around the world such as Liverpool, Sheffield, Cleveland, New Orleans and Memphis, which have attempted to reimage and regenerate their urban identities and distinctiveness via cultural quarters, heritage- and popular music museums and a thriving heritage tourism industry (Lashua, Spracklen, and Wagg 2014, 4).

⁷ Another valuable contribution to the study of cultural heritage, ecology and sustainability in music is Schipper and Grant’s (2016) *Sustainable Futures of Music Cultures: An Ecological Approach*, which is situated in the expanding field of applied ethnomusicology and identifies tools and strategies that empower communities to revitalize and sustain their music heritage on their terms.

entrepreneurial discourse” Stahl refers to the catchphrase ‘Do-It-Yourself’ (DIY), which is a deep-seated concept in New Zealand’s sociocultural imaginary as well as a part of the city’s unique sociomusical experience. According to Stahl, indie musicians in Wellington are guided by two sets of practices: a distinct lo-fi entrepreneurialism (DIY) which propels the creation of local and translocal networks for independent music distribution and consumption – accompanied by profound social relationships referred to as the ‘Do-It-Together’ (DIT) ethic, which manifests itself in the sharing of resources, expertise and stories reinforcing a “collective will to make the city matter as a cultural space” (151–152). This collaborative spirit also resonates within the local roots/reggae/rock scene prompting musicians to “perform and jam together, play on each other’s albums, and share equipment and sometimes rehearsal space” (Meehan 2011, 140). According to Meehan, this kind of collaboration is amplified by the “confined geography of the city” which allows for a dense musical network to flourish. As Meehan states:

many of the musicians lived or at least rehearsed and recorded within a reasonably small area south of the city centre. The jazz school, a focal point and meeting place for many of these musicians is also located there (2011, 141).

Meehan argues further that Wellington’s compact musical infrastructure and its strong collaborative drive facilitate a distinct “democratic style of music making” which is based on the concept of ‘social authorship’ (Toynbee 2000) which implies that “the ideas for songs may be sketched out by individuals, but the arrangement, form and choice of the final sounds is generally arrived at collectively” (Meehan 2011, 141). In this way, the collaborative effort affects the social as well as the musical idiosyncrasy constituting Wellington’s roots/reggae/rock scene.

A further example of collaboration and collective action in Wellington’s music scene is discussed by Brunt (2011) who examines the construction of local identity and sense of place during Wellington’s Cuba Street Carnival.⁸ The community-based event showcased a variety of multicultural performances, which rely upon “personal drive and investment” as well as “genuine social cooperation” and the collaboration of all participants, which according to Brunt, are “an encapsulation of the DIY (do-it-yourself) aesthetic [...] intrinsic in every New Zealander” (165–172). For Stahl

⁸ Due to a lack of funding, the Cuba Street Carnival had to be canceled in 2009. In 2015 the festival was held again under the name Cuba Dupa.

(2011), the entrepreneurial and communal impulses permeating Wellington's creative scenes are rather linked to the city's political economy, creating tensions "between complacency and engagement" as the musicians have to face an increasing pressure to be 'creative' and entrepreneurial in exchange for a certain kind of cultural experience and a "highly sociable cultural space" (154–155). In this way, local musicians remain "ineluctably caught up in the spectre of neoliberalism," which purports to mobilize 'the social' while simultaneously enforcing urban policies and agendas to market the entrepreneurial 'creative city' in order to celebrate Wellington as New Zealand's 'cultural capital' (154–155). Stahl's analysis is grounded in the distinctive dynamics of Wellington's political economy providing valuable insight into the effects of power differentials and the dynamic range of social, economic and institutional forces in a certain cultural field – such as the Wellington indie music scene. Yet he only sparsely touches upon natural, material and affective rhythms underlying music-making in New Zealand's capital city. Even though he acknowledges that Wellington's many scenes function "partly as an affective vehicle for relating to the city", he fails to elaborate on those (bodily) affects, atmospheres and intensities of feeling which shape the discursive envelope within which local music-making takes place. The city's 'urban ethos', as Stahl describes it, foregrounds "issues regarding attachments, affiliations, affinities and belongings" – embodied experiences, which help to "map out degrees and kinds of commitment to other music makers as well as the city", however, the author does not examine those in further detail (146).

1.3 Music and Identity

In today's world, deciding what music to listen to is a significant part of deciding and announcing to people not just who you 'want to be' but who you are (Cook 1998, 5).

Over the last two decades, there has been an increasing interest in (urban) music-making and the processes of individual identity formation as well as local, musical communities (Bennett 2000; DeNora 2000; Frith 1996; Hargreaves, MacDonald, and Miell 2002; Mitchell 1996; Shank 1994; Stokes 1994). In a world of intensified globalization, music is not only considered a medium through which people convey everyday experiences of space and place, it also remains an "important cultural

sphere in which identities are affirmed, challenged, taken apart and reconstructed” (Connell and Gibson 2003, 117). Simon Frith (1996) argues that our experience of music-making equals the experience of a self-in-process. Identity for Frith is not a static thing but rather an experiential, mobile process, a movement or flux “which is most vividly grasped as music” (110). Music as an aesthetic practice is like identity “both performance and story, describes the social in the individual and the individual in the social the mind in the body and the body in the mind” (109). By offering direct experiences of the body, time and sociability, music provides a sense of self and others and in this way, constructs one’s sense of identity. Although, for Frith, music functions as a metaphor for identity, he also emphasizes that the self can only be imagined “as a particular organization of social, physical and material forces” (109–110).

Similarly, Tia DeNora (2000) argues that music can facilitate diverse “world-making activities” as it functions as “a resource for doing, being, and naming the aspects of social reality, including the realities of subjectivity and self” (40). DeNora develops a kind of “grounded theory of music”, (D. T. Cook 2001, 1484) which is based on an ethnographic study of four different settings with the aim to illustrate,

some of the many uses to which music is and can be put, and to describe a range of strategies through which music is mobilized as a resource for producing the scenes, routines, assumptions and occasions that constitute ‘social life’ (DeNora 2000, xi).

For DeNora, music is therefore “more than decorative art” (Frith 2002, 45). It is a reflexive part of the (emotional) construction of the social self and/or others, a fundamental feature of social situations, relations and interactions as well as a powerful medium of social order. As with Finnegan, music for DeNora acts as a resource “for modulating and structuring the parameters of aesthetic agency – feeling, motivation desire, comportment, action style, energy” (2000, 53). Music, in this sense, reflexively constitutes one’s emotional state. It is an enriching experience that can be used for maintaining and attaining certain moods, feelings and memories and in this way “remembering/constructing who one is” (63). Frith suggests DeNora limits musical meaning to its emotional function and thereby neglecting its importance as a “means of communication and a form of sociability” (Frith 2002, 46). Frith points towards the diverse ways people experience music or musical activities, arguing that “music making is less about managing one’s own emotional

life than about enjoying being together in groups, real and imagined” (46). In this sense, the way people experience music, the use they have for it and the meanings they construct around it is bound up within specific social contexts, specific times and networks of social relationships, which need to be considered in the study of local music-making in order to make sense of music’s power in everyday life (Cohen 1993).

David Hesmondhalgh (2013) acknowledges DeNora and Finnegan’s work on music and identity, yet reminds us that these approaches overestimate people’s freedom to act as “self-realization is deeply compromised by certain conditions of capitalist modernity” (41). In a capitalist society, he argues, self-realization is bound up with institutionalized expectations where the self becomes “an individual enterprise” forced to take responsibility “even though that self is borne down upon by all kinds of social pressures” (43). Hesmondhalgh points out that emotional self-management can be appropriated in problematic ways by hegemonic interest in capitalist modernity and music may in this way, become implicated in “less pleasant and even disturbing features of modern life” (41). Hesmondhalgh suggests therefore, that positive depictions of music’s role as a resource for self-making should be supplemented by a historical dimension as well as critical perspective on consumption and self-identity.

Both, Hesmondhalgh and DeNora emphasize music’s ability to create aesthetic experiences regarding one’s mood, sensation and emotions as well as more somatic aesthetic experiences involving kinaesthesia and engagement of the body that go beyond the contemplative self. According to DeNora (2000), music affects the physical body in its physiological, micro-behavioral and motivational processes as it provides “a ground for self-perception of the body” (77). She suggests moving beyond a semiotic understanding of bodily matters to the deeper exploration of body-culture interaction. This social constructionist perspective conceives of the body as a socialized entity emphasizing the reflexive relationship between music and embodiment. In this way DeNora includes bodily features such as energy, co-ordination, motivation, endurance, timing, arousal, breathing, heart rate and blood pressure in her analysis in order to develop an interdisciplinary perspective of the

ways in which “the body may be understood to be ‘musically composed’” (xi). As an example of ‘musical entrainment’⁹ in relation to the body DeNora refers to “synchronizing bodily movement” such as marching, skipping rope, dancing or aerobics. The rhythmic movements and processes of the body unfold (mostly unconsciously) in relation to musical impulses and elicit “normally imperceptible micro movement, such as how one holds one’s eyebrows, cheekbones, or shoulders, the tension of one’s muscles” (78). In addition to those micro movements, DeNora highlights the ways in which musical entrainment may modify physiological states such as oxygen level or heart rate and it can affect “temporal parameters of mood and feeling” as well as social roles and interaction (78). In this regard, musical entrainment clearly exemplifies how “environmental materials and their properties may be said to afford resources for particular kinds of bodies and bodily states” (79). Hence, music is not only a ‘technology of self’ but also a ‘technology of the body’. It is for this reason, Arun Saldanha (2005) argues, that “corporeal difference needs to frame the analysis of music and space” (707). Discussing the racial differences in Goa’s rave scene, he focuses on the ‘sensuous specificity of music’ by analyzing the embodied experiences of music and space and its effects on the emergence of gender, race and class distinctions. For Saldanha it is necessary in order to grasp the affects of bodies through music that one acknowledges “music’s rich relationship to all of the body’s senses” (719). He points out that the body’s various senses are interrelated in ‘inner’ time and ‘outer’ space. Hence music is experienced “non-linearly through the guts and the legs, through posture, smell, touch and sight” (712) Furthermore he argues that “music is not a representation or a formal system” but “music is force, intervening in the rhythms of the body without the mediation of signs” (717). Music, for Saldanha is therefore a physical force, affecting the human body directly without any symbolic mediation or translation. Frith (1998) refutes this idea of musical immediacy, arguing that there isn’t a direct relationship of musical sound and human experience since musical meaning can only be understood against the background of a certain kind of musical organization, meaning “rhythmic, metric, timbric, tonal,

⁹ In order to explore the body-culture interaction DeNora refers to neonatology “and the recent turn, within that area, to music as a therapeutic medium” (Hicks 1992 quoted in DeNora 2000). She aims at illuminating “music’s role as a device of corporeal ordering” by investigating music’s active role “in the promotion of neonatal ‘state integrity (that is, the normalization and regularization of bodily processes)’” (DeNora 2000, 77). The ability of an infant to regularize “physical and behavioural processes such as breathing, blood pressure, heartbeat and sleep” is linked to environmental factors. One of the “key mechanisms” for this process is “musical entrainment” which is “the alignment or integration of bodily features with some recurrent features in the environment” (77-78).

melodic, instrumental or harmonic organization” which, in turn, requires social organization and cultural context in order to be created and understood correctly (102).

As a way of theorizing the interplay of music, embodiment and space, Saldanha turns towards non-representational theory as proposed by Nigel Thrift (1996). Non-representational theory focuses on material processes and practice instead of semiotics and cognition in order to analyze “how the human body actively expresses the unrepresentable relationalities of social space” (Saldanha 2005, 716). Regarding the study of music-making and place, non-representational theory shifts the focus from the symbolic to the practical, emphasizing the corporality of musical experience “the impact of rhythm, timbre and melody on the body, highlighting the ways in which the physical practice of music shapes its aesthetic forms and its social spaces” (Revill 2004, 202). This enables the recognition and appreciation of the multiple ways in which music can be consumed, experienced, produced and reproduced (202). However, it is not only music’s sensuous specificity that Saldanha and Revill are highlighting here also the richness of musical materiality, which needs to be considered in the study of music-making and social space, for music “mobilizes bodies, objects, flows, entire landscapes by unhinging potentialities that no one knew were even there” (Saldanha 2005a, 717). To underline this point, Saldanha draws on the work of Gilles Deleuze and Felix Guattari (1988), particularly their concept of ‘the refrain’, whereby they refer to music metaphorically as a means to connect to certain places:

[...] music is not the privilege of human beings: the universe, the cosmos, is made of refrains; the question in music is that of a power of deterritorialization permeating nature, the elements, and deserts as much as human beings. The question is more what is not musical in human beings, and what already is musical in nature (309).

The ‘refrain’ mirrors the “polyrhythms of matter” that constitute and define certain ‘territories’ or spaces. It is through a “stitching together” of those “material assemblages of interaction” including “bodies, feelings, money, nostalgia and futurism” that sounds become music (Saldanha 2005, 718).

Also drawing from Deleuze and Guattari, Michelle Duffy (2005) argues that it is music’s performative and embodied spatial qualities that constitute it as a non-

representational medium. As such it enables a ‘becoming expressive’ as it is “in the *doing* of music that being and becoming occurs” (689). These expressive qualities forge ‘body-space relationships’ and facilitate the creation and formation of spatialised identities. Duffy argues further that music, in this way draws attention to our corporeal capacities as it “penetrates in and through the body” and reminds us that “we are very much connected to others and to the places we inhabit (Duffy and Boyd 2012, 5). For Duffy, repetitive, bodily rhythms such as “pulse, heartbeat, breath, talking, gesturing, walking, eating, digesting and a myriad of other sequences” structure space-time and affect our body-space relationship (1). Bodily rhythms are in turn triggered by the rhythmic qualities of sounds, which inhabit bodies and in this way enable us to inhabit space:

with our ears open we can be transported to other places and times, but this means more than simply listening through our ears. The porosity of our bodies means we also feel sound waves that we then comprehend and (re)constitute as a pulse, as a rhythm (Duffy et al. 2011, 18)

This embodied sense of rhythm allows for the experience of a variety of rhythmic attunements, which result not only in immediate physiological responses but cause certain embodied responses that shape the creation of social space and affect “our sense of being in the world and the body’s capacity to act” (18).

As a way of considering, examining and locating the places (for the analysis of) music, the preceding discussion lays out a theoretical framework for debate, which draws together a variety of approaches from different academic disciplines such as human geography, popular music studies, sociology and anthropology. Those studies constitute the basis and motivation from which the present rhythm analytical project is derived. The (human) geographies of music identify the links between music-making and the production and conceptualization of place, emphasizing the spatiality of music as it is always embedded in a social, political and economic context. As such, music is a medium of social life and a way of locating and identifying with a sense of place (Leyshon 2004, 232). The practice of music-making can therefore be described as an amalgam of people, material, and symbolic resources all of which is provided in the complex make-up of urban social spaces. While studies on music-making in the city are theoretically and methodologically divergent, they are similar in their approach to identifying and analyzing the complex layering of temporalities,

socialities and materialities constituting musical life in urban spaces. Following from Finnegan, Cohen, Bennett and Stahl it can be said that urban music-making produces a dense agglomeration of attitudes and practices which feed off of the city's many amenities. At the same time, music-making serves as a "compensatory function, helping to mitigate the city's atomizing potential" (Stahl 2003, 68). However, those theories have a tendency to focus on social, cultural and material elements, while neglecting affective intensities and atmospheres, the ambient by-products, which are always part of the cumulative textures vital to the social production of (urban) space. Besides music-making's significance as a medium through which people convey their everyday experiences in the city, various scholars emphasize its powerful role in the construction of the social self (Frith 1996; DeNora 2000; Hesmondhalgh 2013). Music-making affects and is affected by the physical body, creating 'body-space relationships' which facilitate the formation of spatialised identities (Duffy). Those theories acknowledge the sociospatial dimensions of music-making and its effects on the body's various emotional states, moods, memories and senses, yet there is no clear link to how those embodied musical experiences impact on the way an affective attachment or 'sense of place' is evoked. Existing literature focuses either on music-making as a tool for the production and experience of (urban) *social space* or music-making as a vehicle for the formation of a *social self* (in social space), yet there is a peculiar absence of discussions that knit the two fields together. As such, in the discussion that follows, theories of social space, sociality and materiality coincide with sensuous and affective geographies combining the imaginary and the sensory, the abstract and the concrete, the static and the rhythmic as they all form a connective tissue anchoring the music-makers to their urban space. The following chapter provides a first step towards this amalgamation of spatial concepts, sensuous and affective theories in order to better understand the ways in which Wellington's and Copenhagen's musicians 'sensing out' and 'making sense' of their everyday urban space.

Chapter 2 - Making Sense of Place

All places are small worlds: the sense of a world, however, may be called forth by art (the jar placed on the hill) as much as by the intangible net of human relations. Places may be public symbols or fields of care, but the power of the symbol to create place depends ultimately on the human emotions that vibrate in a field of care (Tuan 1979, 421)

The term *sense of place* has been dealt with in many different ways. It has become “an ubiquitous piece of phraseology” that is common currency amongst a broad spectrum of disciplines including the arts, anthropology, education, history, law, sociology, psychology, religion and geography (Spittles 2005, 1). Despite its diversity, or perhaps precisely because of it, there is no clear consensus of how a true sense of place should be defined. The concept remains more of an abstract idea than a well defined construct based on philosophically, rather than empirically, orientated descriptions (Kaltenborn 1998). Kaltenborn argues that sense of place is an approach that attempts to capture a range of place meanings in a holistic fashion including emotional, spiritual and symbolic aspects, as well as the natural and cultural environment, family and social activities, traditions and history (1998, 172). The concept resists any simple definition, however, and is frequently used as an umbrella term including other place-related concepts such as place identity, place image, place attachment, spirit of place, or *genius loci*, which are often used synonymously and interchangeably despite significant differences in their meaning (Cighi 2008). Even though those concepts essentially address people’s individual relationship to place, the exact connection between them remains unclear (Manzo 2003). As Barker states: “obviously, sense of place is one of the most abstract and illusive concepts [...] understanding what creates a true sense of place [...] is a complex task” (164).

In order to clarify use and meaning of the concept and illustrate its significance for the analysis of music-making in Wellington and Copenhagen, this chapter will have a closer look at each word component separately: *Sense (of) Place*. It will discuss the duality of the term, referring to ‘meaning’ or ‘sense making’ on the one hand and to sensation and ‘the senses’ on the other. The works of Tuan, Relph, Heidegger, Merleau-Ponty, and Stewart provide compelling contributions to the discussion of (affective) place attachment and allow for a more nuanced and clear definition of the

term ‘sense of place’. The second part of the chapter elaborates on the concept of (social) space as it is introduced by Henri Lefebvre, particularly his dialectical triad, and his idea of rhythmanalysis, which are both crucial in order to understand how music-making simultaneously facilitates and frames particular experiences of place.

2.1 An attunement of the senses

The term *sense* has an important duality or ambiguity, referring to ‘meaning’ or ‘sense making’ on the one hand and to sensation and ‘the senses’ such as touch, smell, taste, sight and hearing on the other (Rodaway 2011). In this way, *sense* is biologically anchored as it refers to specific sense organs (sensation) and it relates to a broader mental construct (meaning) at the same time. Both aspects are interconnected and frequently implied by each other. As Rodaway states: “the sense(s) is (are) both a reaching out to the world as a source of information and understanding of that world so gathered” (5). Furthermore, Rodaway borrows terms from McLuhan, arguing that each sense, touch, smell, sight and hearing is both a medium and a message (25). As such, a sense can be seen as a medium through which ‘information’ about the environment is collected. Different sense organs receive specific types of environmental information: air vibrations, chemical compounds or material surfaces. On the other hand, a sense equals some kind of message or distinct perspective on the world – the ‘medium’ equates with sensation and ‘message’ with meaning (25). In this way, the senses collect various kinds of information and contribute to the definition of that information at the same time.

Hence, sensual and sensory capacities as well as educational training and cultural conditioning affect the sensuous experience and understanding of place, modified by previous experiences and expectations (5). This ambiguity of the term *sense* referring to sensation and meaning simultaneously illustrates the “relationship between the immediate experience and metaphorical extrapolation” (5). According to Rodaway this metaphorical use of the senses “lies, in part, in the multisensual nature of everyday geographical experience and the complex and ambiguous relationship between the individual senses” (6). As a consequence, the term *sense* leads to fundamental questions about sense and reality including “questions about the nature of person-environment relationships and what constitutes a geographical reality for a

given society (or culture) at a given moment in time and space” (6).

The humanist tradition or, more precisely, the humanistic geography of the 1970s, advocated “a unity of experience and meaning, that is sense(s) is (are) both sensation and meaning” (7). It is therefore an important starting point for understanding people’s sensuous relationship to places. One of the key proponents of humanistic geography is Yi-Fu Tuan who defines the approach as “the geographical study of human beings’ experience and understandings of space, place and the natural world” (Seamon 2016 forthcoming). It is the notion of experience that lies at the heart of the humanistic approach as it allows for a dynamic relationship between people and place that incorporates bodily, sensory, emotional, cognitive and transpersonal dimensions (Seamon 2016). Much of this work is grounded in a phenomenological approach, which considers the world and human beings not in the abstract, but rather “emphasizes the “human-being-in-the-world” as it incorporates environmental, geographical, and place aspects” (Seamon 2016). Tuan writes

[t]he given cannot be known in itself. What can be known is a reality that is a construct of experience, a creation of feeling and thought (1977, 9).

As such, it is human experience that transforms undifferentiated ‘space’ into ‘place’ “as we get to know it better and endow it with meaning” (6). Place, for Tuan is “a centre of meaning constructed by experience” (1974, 37). In order to understand how people feel about a certain place, it is therefore crucial “to take into account the different modes of experience (sensorimotor, tactile, visual, conceptual)” (37). In 1974, Tuan introduced the term ‘topophilia’, derived from the Greek words *topos* ‘place’ and *-philia* ‘love of/for,’ and refers to the complex ways in which people attach meaning to certain places. Tuan drew on the work of French physicist and phenomenologist Gaston Bachelard who explored the “images and pleasant reveries that are prompted by certain types of space, especially enclosed space [...]” (Tuan 1961, 30). Unlike Bachelard, Tuan’s approach is not limited to feelings towards enclosed spaces but incorporates a much broader range of emotions and experiences, defining topophilia as “the affective bond between people and place” including “all emotional connections between physical environment and human beings” (Tuan 1974, 2). These ties can vary in intensity and meaning, as each person’s collection of environmental experiences are unique. “Both ‘ends’ of the topophilic bond – people

and place – can be approached at different levels of generalization in different temporal, spatial, and cultural frames” which makes a person’s individual attachment or sense of place rather hard to grasp (Fleming 1975, 315). As Tuan notes:

[...] what I had thought was a narrow and manageable topic is in fact quite broad, that in trying to understand sense of place, I am also trying to understand what it means to be human [...] Sense of place can be a passing emotion, like a fragrance: and it can be rich, deep and enduring with as many elements and layers and those that constitute a human personality (2004, 45–46).

In this way, Tuan admits, that the concept is quite diffuse but as personal experience it is both vivid and concrete (4).

Another scholar who was fascinated by the nature of place and its significance as an inescapable dimension of human life and experience was geographer Edward Relph. Relph interprets place experience in terms of the dialectics of *insideness* and *outsideness*. The most intimate sense of place experience can occur through existential insideness, a situation without deliberate or self-conscious reflection yet it is “permeated with cognitive, sensory, and affective meaning” (Seamon 2016). The experiential opposite of this position is existential outsideness in which the individual experiences a sense of alienation or separation from a place. Relph distinguishes between seven different degrees of ‘outsideness’ and ‘insideness’ which are anchored in different levels of experiential involvement reaching from ‘alienation’, ‘homelessness’ and ‘not belonging’ on the one extreme to “belonging to a place and [...] deep and complete identity with a place” on the other (Relph 1976, 55). To be able to create a sense and attachment to place requires therefore a “long and deep experience of a place, and preferably involvement in the place” (Shamai 1991, 348) which is intensified by rituals, myths and symbols (Relph). Datel and Dingemans (1984) define sense of place therefore as “the complex bundle of meanings, symbols, and qualities that a person or group associates (consciously and unconsciously) with a particular locality or region” (135).

For some scholars the humanistic conception of place is too concrete, fixed, and rooted. The more clearly the world is ordered into fixed places with clear boundaries and stable, established identities the more place becomes the locus of exclusionary practices as people and things that exist outside of these areas are likely to be

labelled as disorder. As a result, people link a place with a certain identity and tend to defend it against the threatening outside with its different identities (Cresswell 2009). Doreen Massey (1994) argues against this clearly bounded, rooted conception of place, and proposes a 'progressive' or 'global sense of place', which is not static or fixed but actively constituted by mobility – the movement of people, commodities and ideas. Places are therefore not bound to single homogeneous identities but constructed through the multiple routes and connections people develop locally and globally. This sense of place has no boundaries, no clear 'inside' and 'outside' and therefore “includes a consciousness of its links with the wider world, which integrates in a positive way the global and the local” (Massey 1994, 155).

A considerable amount of literature on the notion of *sense of place* during the 1970s and 1980s reflects a strong influence from Martin Heidegger's work on 'dwelling' (1971). Heidegger challenges the Cartesian split of mind from body by emphasizing the embodied experience of the world. Dwelling, for Heidegger, is a way of considering how humans are always embedded in the world (Crang 1998) – a perspective where “any act of building, living, or even thinking, is formed in the context of already being-in-the-world which, in turn, affects that forming” (Cloe and Jones 2001, 651). A dwelling perspective approaches places as fluid, dynamic and multidimensional, yet those places “somehow still have binding and sometimes haunting identities and familiarities running through them, as threads of imaginative and material narrative are woven with threads of 'having become' and 'becoming' (652). This philosophy of 'being-in-the-world' is a contextualized, lived practice, which creates spaces that are “not so much the object of our thoughts as the homeland[s] to our thoughts” (Merleau-Ponty 1962, 24).

For Maurice Merleau-Ponty, the locus for 'being-in-the-world' is the living human body. It is through the body that one accesses and experiences the world and in this way evokes and engages meanings: “My body is the fabric into which all objects are woven, and it is, at least in relation to the perceived world, the general instrument of my “comprehension”” (Merleau-Ponty 1962, 235). Lived experiences and corporeal awareness of the world is therefore not “the sum of isolated sensory inputs or qualities but a dynamic commingling of sensory possibilities” (Seamon 2015, 2).

David Seamon illustrates this vividly:

As I walk home caught in a sudden spring rainstorm, for example, my eyes pay attention to water puddles that my feet jump over as my hand adroitly repositions my umbrella at the angle most effective for deflecting the pelting rain. I feel wetness as water splatters on my ankles and hear and smell the rain as it strikes the earth (3).

In this way, all senses intermingle and mutually resonate, creating a synergy of experience, which is anchored in the sensibilities and possibilities of the lived body (3). By giving the body a central place in his phenomenological approach, Merleau-Ponty “rejects dualistic theories of the body and soul and takes as his task the articulation of the prediscursive structures of existence...[locating]...subjectivity not in the consciousness or in the mind, but in the body” (Longhurst 1997, 488). The body exceeds, in this way, the ontological categories of subjectivity versus objectivity as it appears neither as a biological object nor merely as a vehicle of subjectivity (Diprose and Reynolds 2008, 113). Consequently, the body is not merely “in space, or in time” but “inhabits space and time” (162). For Merleau-Ponty, the existential structure of the human subject can therefore only be characterized as ‘being-in-the-world’, as in this structure the individual “exists not in an unilateral, detached or purely external relationship, but in a reciprocal, communicative relationship with his world” (Liu 2009, 133).

Building on this intimate, compositional process of dwelling in space is Kathleen Stewart’s concept of *atmospheric attunements*. According to Stewart, atmospheric attunements are an activity of sensual world-making that approach everyday life not as the “dead or reeling effects of distant systems” but as an “affective force field” comprising “lived affects with tempos, sensory knowledges, orientations [...] and habits” (Stewart 2011, 446). They are forms of “attending to what’s happening, sensing out, accreting attachments and detachments, differences and indifferences, losses and proliferating possibilities” (Stewart 2010, 4). Atmospherics can take many forms – they can be “family or friendship or love or collapse or laughing or telling stories or violence or place” (4). They are circulating forces that have rhythms, valences, sensations and moods, framing the background of the everyday while proposing ways of “living-in and living through things”:

A living through that shows up in the generative precarity of ordinary sensibilities of not knowing what compels, not being able to sit still, being exhausted, being left behind or being ahead of the curve, being in love with some form or life that comes

along, being ready for something – anything – to happen, or orienting yourself to the sole goal of making sure that nothing (more) will happen (Stewart 2011, 452).

This process of world-making is always sensory and affective. It requires the body to always be on alert, readily engaged “gathering the eccentricity of characters, exercising the capacity to affect and to be affected” (447). Atmospheric attunements are therefore abstract and concrete at the same time: “ephemeral and consequential, fully sensory and lodged in prolific imaginaries” (447). To attend to the charged atmospheres of everyday life is to take a “curious pause to wonder what analytic object might matter in the singularity of a situation” (Stewart 2010, 4). It requires not only the ability to affect and to be affected but the entanglement of affect, attention, the senses and matter in order to understand how “incommensurate elements hang together” and the expressivity of a moment comes into existence. As Stewart suggests, attending to atmospheric attunements requires a “clearing of space in which to clear the opposition between representation and reality, or the mind-numbing summary evaluations of objects as essentially good or bad, or the effort to pin something to a social construction as if this were an end in itself” (452). This process is aligned with nonrepresentational ideas that emphasize rhythms of living, the body and its intensities of feeling, practical skills, and non-human agency, indicating that the world unfolds as these embodied practices take place.

In this way, Tuan argues, “we may say that deeply-loved places are not necessarily visible, either to ourselves or to others” (Tuan 1977, 178). This does not imply however, that a ‘deeply-loved place’ has no physical presence. Similarly to Stewart, this statement reminds us that there is always the sensory and the imaginary, the material and the abstract, resonating in synergy or discord creating a compositional present, intimate force fields and modes of living. As Tuan notes: “what can be known is a reality that is a construct of experience, a creation of feeling and thought” (9).

‘Sense of place’ as it is employed in the course of this research is therefore an amalgam of varying theories, ideas and notions. It draws on phenomenology’s focus on individuals’ sensuous, imaginative and practically oriented actions, and mirrors a ‘feel of place’ which is comprised of different sights, sounds and smells that yield a

unique harmony of natural and artificial rhythms (Tuan 1977). It is a sensuous mode of ‘being-in-the-world’, which is anchored to the sensibilities and possibilities of the lived body. It is an attunement of the senses, highlighting affective intensities, embodied movements, relationality and performativity and reveals an understanding of spatiality, which is fluid, dynamic and multidimensional (Stewart 2011). Yet no inquiry into a *sense of place* can be fully complete without clarifying the meaning and use of the term *place*.

2.2 A social construct

As with the concept of sense of place, there exists no singular definition for the term place. In fact, as Dolores Hayden points out “place is one of the trickiest words in the English language, a suitcase so overfilled that one can never shut the lid” (Hayden 1997, 112). Against this backdrop I would like to note that it is beyond the scope of this project to provide an extensive synthesis on the wide-ranging literature of space and place; rather, I want to focus on Henri Lefebvre’s notion of social space which is particularly valuable in order to develop an understanding of the notion of sense of place and its relation to music-making in the city (more will be said about this below).

Until the early 1970s the spatial was considered as an autonomous sphere, an abstract container of experiences that separates the material (external) world and the (internal) world of human consciousness. This dichotomy emerged through the philosophical inquiries of Descartes in the seventeenth century and became later known as the Cartesian division or dualistic thinking. The Cartesian world-view assumes a duality between body and mind creating a polarity between subjective and objective realms of place. One of the pioneering scholars to transcend this widespread understanding of place as an independent material reality, which exists ‘in itself’ was the Marxist philosopher and sociologist Henry Lefebvre. In his seminal text *The Production of Space* (1974) Lefebvre proposes an approach to place that moves away from the realm of the abstract and mental to an alternate notion of space that is “organic and fluid and alive; it has a pulse, it palpitates, it flows and collides with other spaces” (Merrifield 2000, 171). For Lefebvre, (social) space is a (social) product, permeated with social relations and therefore fundamentally bound

up with social reality (Schmid 2008, 28). In this way, no place – be it historical, societal, mental, or natural can claim to be socially neutral. Place is a social construct and the “primary locus of lived experience in the world” (Watkins 2005, 211). Lefebvre’s approach is strongly political as he regards the various uses of space in the Western world as obscuring the performance of hegemony in managing social relations in space itself. He argues, that “space is the ultimate locus and medium of struggle, and is therefore a crucial political issue” (Elden 2004, 183). For this reason, Lefebvre advocates an approach “that seeks to understand the dialectical interaction between spatial arrangements and social organization itself” (Shields 1999, 157). Rather than being an abstract container of experiences, space for Lefebvre constitutes a specific historically situated and lived construct. The critique of capitalism needed therefore to incorporate a notion of space that embraced “a multitude of intersections” which he theorized and illustrated in his dialectical triad (Lefebvre 1991, 33). Within this conceptual framework, the production of space is divided into three dialectically interconnected dimensions: representations of space, spatial practice and spaces of representation.

Representations of space constitute the dominant discourses of space in any society. It is the conceived, mental space, which is cognitively constructed by professionals and technocrats – scientists, planners and urbanists and mediated through systems of specific codes, signs and symbols. Representations of space produce an image and define a space (Schmid 2008). Lefebvre contrasts this with *spatial practice* or ‘lived’ space, which is characterized as the perceived space that takes place as physical form and is created and used in everyday life. It is the “material dimension of social activity and interaction” (Schmid 2008, 36) including rationalized institutions and urban networks as well as daily routines and habits that “ensure continuity and some degree of cohesion in social configurations” (Simonsen 2005, 6). Here space is experienced not as a geometric grid, but in a “lived, experiential manner” (Elden 2004, 188). The third dimension of the trilectic is *spaces of representation*. This concerns space as “directly lived though its associated images and symbols” (Lefebvre 1991, 39). As such, it is “the space of inhabitants and users as well as of some artists and writers, the space they incessantly seek to create through appropriation of the environment” (Simonsen 2005, 7). It is the dominated and

therefore passively experienced space which overlays physical space “making symbolic use of its objects” (Lefebvre 1991, 39). Here, the imagination “seeks to change and appropriate”, it is space “rather more felt than thought...[it] is the experiential realm that conceived and ordered space will try to intervene in, rationalize, and ultimately usurp” (Merrifield 2000, 174).

The three dimensions of the triad operate together dialectically and must therefore be considered as a whole as it is only “in considering the three triadic elements together that it is possible to surface the true potentiality” of the theory (Watkins 2005, 214). In an effort to summarize the role of these three conceptions more clearly, Lefebvre suggests “that the system of space is not just spatial practice, in the sense of its social construction, but equally the representations of it and discourses about it, and it is also equally its reflexive effects, promoting here, limiting there” (Shields 1999, 154).

Lefebvre’s production of space refers therefore to both the process as well as its outcome (materiality). Unlike Manuel Castells, who separates the space of places and the space of flows, Lefebvre’s production of space does not create this binary opposition but acknowledges that space is both, flow and place – “it is simultaneously a process and a thing” (Merrifield 2000, 521). In this way, Lefebvre provides a “unity theory of space” which allows for a “rapprochement between physical space (nature), mental space (formal abstractions about space) and social space (the space occupied by sensory phenomena [...])” (523). His spatial triad combines those different modalities of space and can therefore be seen as an “innovative and powerful tool with which to explore the social world” (Watkins 2005, 211). Lefebvre’s theory of the production of space is therefore not about space in itself or the ordering of (material) objects and artefacts in space but about the active process of (re)producing social relations. In this way, his approach includes individual and social processes at the same time: “it is not only constitutive for the self-production of man but for the self-production of society” (Schmid 2008, 39).

Building on Lefebvre’s concept of social space is his discussion of rhythmanalysis, which “may be expected to put the finishing touches to the exposition of the production of space” (Lefebvre 1991, 405). The origins of his ‘Rhythmanalytical

Project' can be traced back to his multi-volume work on the '*Critique of Everyday Life*' (1947). For Lefebvre, the everyday life of individuals is organized and shaped by numerous temporal rhythms "found in the workings of our towns and cities, in urban life and movement through space" (Elden 2004, viii). As such, rhythms occupy space but also indicate how space is occupied (Lefebvre 1991). In order to uncover the diverse ways in which societies organize the everyday lives of individuals through structuring and measuring time, Lefebvre compares and analyses natural, corporeal and mechanistic rhythms. Through the study of everyday life routinization, Lefebvre aims to explore how the motion of capitalism has altered the structures of temporality and the rhythms of everyday life. In this way, rhythms are a mode of analysis – "a tool of analysis rather than just an object of it" (Elden 2004, xii). Lefebvre makes it explicit that "everywhere where there is interaction between a place, a time and an expenditure of energy, there is a rhythm" (Lefebvre 2004, 15). Those rhythms are inextricably bound up with a certain place and a time:

Now, concrete times have rhythms, or rather are rhythms – and all rhythms imply the relation of a time to a space, a localised time, or if one prefers, a temporalised space. Rhythm is always linked to such and such a place, to its place, be that the heart, the fluttering of the eyelids, the movement of a street or the tempo of a waltz (31).

Rhythms for Lefebvre are in a state of constant movement and repetition, yet they never remain the same as there is "always something new and unforeseen that introduces itself into the repetitive: difference" (6). Essentially, Lefebvre contrasts two different modalities of repetition: linear rhythms and cyclical rhythms. While cyclical rhythms stand for the cosmic, worldly or natural including alternating recurrences with short intervals such as day and night, seasons, tides or solar rhythms – linear rhythms are imposed structures, originating from human activity or social practice. They can be institutionally inscribed, locally organised or congregate in synchronised collective habits such as working, sleeping, eating or playing together (Edensor and Holloway 2008, 484). Even though those two conceptions are clearly distinct kinds of rhythms, they do not stand apart. Linear and cyclical rhythms exist in a dialectical relation as they "enter into perpetual interaction [...] to an extent that one serves as the measure of the other" (Lefebvre 2004, 90). Those rhythms have different durations, pulses and scales, yet they intersect, may clash or harmonise "producing reliable moments of regularity or less consistent variance" (Edensor and Holloway 2008, 484).

Rhythmanalysis for Lefebvre, was an attempt to understand the pulse and life of the city “combining the strengths of the overview of the urban choreography as seen from a window with the intense experiences of living down in the streets” (Koch and Sand 2010, 61). Amin and Thrift (2002) argue, that despite the city’s polyrhythmicity, it is rarely subject to rhythmic chaos. For Lefebvre it is through the diffuse workings of ‘juridical’ power or a power from above that rhythmic conformity is achieved, creating normative ways of understanding and interpreting rhythmic experiences (Shields 1999, 156). He points towards the tension between linear and cyclical forms of temporality in capitalist societies as linear time gets quantified and homogenized into standardized units promising novelty and progress on the one hand but delivering monotony and tedium at the same time (Moore 2013, 73). Lefebvre critiques bureaucratic, industrial and capitalist rhythms, arguing that “political power knows how to utilise and manipulate time, dates, time-tables” and examines how “rational, numerical, quantitative and qualitative rhythms superimpose themselves on the multiple natural rhythms of the body” (Lefebvre 2004, 9–68).

As such, the point of contact for those social and biological rhythms is the human body. Lefebvre argues that the rhythmanalyst uses the body as a metronome – a central tool for the analysis of the rhythmic orderings of everyday life. It is through the body that one senses the rhythms of different surroundings. In this way, the body becomes a “site through which rhythms are realised and centred” (Edensor and Holloway 2008, 485). However, the body is not merely a tool but also an object of analysis, as the rhythmanalyst “draws on his breathing, the circulation of his blood the beatings of his heart and the delivery of his speech as landmarks” (Lefebvre 2004, 21). Here the body becomes an example of polyrhythmia – a composition of diverse social and biological rhythms. If those rhythms are in a harmonic and symbiotic relation they allow for positive interactions, or ‘eurhythmia’ to occur. However, in case of conflict and dissonances, rhythmic fields suffer disruptions, creating what Lefebvre refers to as ‘arrhythmia’. As such, the body is central to the undertaking of rhythmanalysis, as Lefebvre reminds us: “[a]t no moment have the analysis of rhythm and the rhythmanalytical project lost sight of the body” (2004, 67).

However, Lefebvre's view of the body seems to be predominantly concerned with the effects of social rhythms on the individual; as such material and affective dynamics appear secondary to his approach. In an effort to rewrite the body into discussion, Lefebvre "leans too much towards embodiment" (Simpson 2008, 815) with the consequence that he underappreciates the richness of (musical) materiality and its affective value. In response to this the following chapter will return to this issue and propose a categorization of rhythms, which pays attention not only to the social, but also the spatial/material and the affective rhythms of (urban) space.

So, what does Lefebvre's rhythmanalysis contribute to the understanding of the concept of sense of place? Perhaps most evidently it emphasizes the dynamic, rhythmic character of (urban) spaces as it highlights the "organizational and choreographic rhythmizings" (Simpson 2008, 817) taking place in the musicians' everyday life such as rehearsal and performance timetables, shop opening hours, the movement of people, animals and objects as well as day and night time. It emphasizes how music-making in the city can be understood as a (social) space-making practice permeated by a complex assemblage of rhythms – spatio-temporal patterns that shape the diurnal, weekly and annual experience of place and impact on the formation of an individual's sense of place. In order to grasp and understand the fluid character of the music-maker's sense of place, it is therefore necessary to consider the complex, dynamic texture of the city they perform and live in. However, underlying this theory of rhythms is Lefebvre's conception of (social) space as a social construct, which acknowledges spatiality not as an objective or subjective structure but as a social experience. The music-maker's urban environment is in this way produced and productive. It is a product of the musician's social relations, rhythms and movements but also affects how those rhythms and social relations play out (Shields 1999). What matters for the analysis of local urban music-making is therefore "not the prism of the activities one undertakes but their sequence, not their sum but their rhythm" (Zayani 1999, 4).

This chapter has addressed the concept of sense of place, which involves first and foremost a geographical location – a material setting including physical things, objects and structures that give (urban) space its shape and substance. This

undifferentiated (urban) space evolves into ‘place’ as people get to know it and endow it with meaning (Tuan 1977). A further step in the process of developing a sense of place is therefore the individual’s concrete, mental concept of a certain place including their values, ideas and knowledge about that environment. It is a way of ‘making sense’ of a place by creating a cognitive construct that is both deeply subjective and volatile. Sense of place involves, furthermore, an individual’s sensuous experiences, combining tactile, optical, auditory and olfactory dimensions creating an embodied experience of the world that is anchored in the lived human body (Merleau-Ponty 1962). As Boyd and Duffy remind us “our bodily and cognitive response serve to interpellate the human body into place, a rhythmic attunement that helps in ‘forging body-space-relationships’” (Boyd and Duffy 2012, 1). In addition to the mental and sensuous experiences, sense of place implies moreover an attunement of the senses to the charged atmospheres and affective force fields of everyday life – an ability of the individual to affect and to be affected in order to fully understand how the expressivity of a moment comes into existence (Stewart 2011).

Here Lefebvre’s concept of *rhythmanalysis* serves as an analytic lens for extracting and analysing the bodies, rhythms and atmospheres that come together in the complex unfolding of urban spaces and shape the way local music-makers ‘sense out’ and ‘make sense of’ their urban environment. As Amin and Thrift (2002) remind us, cities are ceaselessly (re)constituted out of their connections, “the twist and fluxes of interrelation” (30) but usually “stabilized by regular patterns of flow that possess specific rhythmic qualities whether steady, intermittent, volatile or surging” (Edensor 2012, 3). As such, the music-maker’s sense of place constitutes and is constituted by the city’s unique rhythms – everyday life regularities that involve interactions between people, and interaction between people and their urban environment – any kind of movement that evolves from physical space, people, nature and time (Wunderlich 2008a). In order to understand how music-making operates as a (social) space-making practice, shaping the way attachment (or detachment) to a place gains its affective charge, it is necessary to extract and analyse the musician’s everyday routes and routines – the mundane (urban) rhythms that influence how the musicians understand, perceive and ‘make sense’ of their everyday life in the city, which will be addressed in the succeeding chapters.

Chapter 3 - City Rhythms

By city rhythms, we mean anything from the regular comings and goings of people about the city to the vast range of repetitive activities, sounds and even smells that punctuate life in the city and which give many of those who live there a sense of time and location. This sense has nothing to do with any overall orchestration of effort or any mass coordination of routines across a city. Rather it arises out of the teeming mix of city life as people move in and around the city at different times of the day or night, in what appears to be a constant renewal process week in, week out, season after season (Allen 1999, 56).

The previous chapter discussed different ideas and theories underlying the concept of ‘sense of place’. It emphasized the individual’s sensuous, imaginative and affective experiences of place and suggested an understanding of spatiality, which is fluid, dynamic and multidimensional. Lefebvre’s concept of social space (as a social product) and his rhythmanalysis were introduced as a foundation from which to explore some of the ways in which (regular) temporal patterns of events, activities, experiences and practices pervade everyday life and shape the way humans ‘make sense’ of their (urban) environment. It was argued that music-making can be understood as one of the primary vehicles through which an (affective) attachment, or ‘sense of place’ is experienced and articulated. In order to understand the music-makers (affective) ties to a particular place it is necessary to extract and analyse the complex array of everyday life rhythms underlying their unique sense of place. The previous chapter pointed out Lefebvre’s bias towards the social and suggested a more holistic approach, which considers social, spatial and affective rhythms equally. What follows is a detailed exploration of the notion of City Rhythms¹⁰ including affective intensities and atmospheres which are an important aspect in the (re)makings of everyday life in urban spaces. To this end, the following chapter will introduce a categorization of City Rhythms, which allows us to account for the multiple ways in which the personal is articulated to the social, the spatial, and the affective, creating a meaningful sort of urban choreography, which guides the music-makers through their everyday life in the city.

¹⁰ The term City Rhythms is capitalized in order to emphasize its distinct meaning and definition (see 3.3 Categorizing City Rhythms), which was established in the course of this research project and will be discussed in the following sections.

3.1 Everyday life and Spatial Rhythms

Urban spaces are in an ongoing process of becoming, ceaselessly (re)-constituting their connections through “multiple networked mobilities of capital, persons, objects, signs and information” (Sheller and Urry 2004, 6) which are intertwined and connected creating a “particular, but ever-changing, complex mix of heterogeneous social interactions, materialities, mobilities, imaginaries and social effects” (Edensor 2012, 3). This mix of temporal matter and events includes the regular comings and goings of people, the movement of bodies, objects, ideas and materialities, the sounds, smells and atmospheres as well as the cosmic time of day and night, seasonal and annual cycles. Those regular patterns of flow are the concrete forms of *City Rhythms* that shape, influence and characterise everyday life in urban spaces.

City Rhythms reveal themselves in the walking patterns of schoolchildren, the rush hour of commuters, the slow pace of unemployment and homelessness, the lifestyle of students, artists and hedonists, the activities of flâneurs, tourists and travellers, the crowds of shoppers or evening clubbers, opening and closing hours of commercial enterprises, “the flows of postal deliveries, bank deposits and coffee breaks” to name but a few (LaBelle 2008, 192). According to Michel de Certeau (1988), urban spaces are composed of certain “vectors of direction”, an “ensemble of movement deployed within it” (117). It is through certain everyday practices such as the physical act of walking that “the street geometrically defined by urban planning is transformed into a space by walkers” (117). As such, pedestrians are *bricoleurs*, as they actively create individual pathways and “reappropriate the space organised by techniques of sociocultural production” (xiv). The multitude of intertwined pathways, routines, and rhythms weave together a certain urban fabric. Hence, there is never just one singular rhythm that describes or defines a city’s texture. Rather, different rhythms interact and mingle with each other, shaping the “diurnal, weekly and annual experience of place and influence the ongoing formation of its materiality” (Edensor 2012, 3). Those rhythmic mixes create, what David Seamon (1980) calls ‘place ballets’, an accumulation of repetitive events expressed through everyday life regularities that involve interactions between people, and interaction between people and their urban environment - any kind of movement that evolves from physical space, people, nature and time. As Stewart Elden suggests:

[Rhythm] is found in the workings of our towns and cities, in urban life and movement through space. Equally in the collision of natural biological and social timescales, the rhythms of our bodies and society [...] (2004, viii).

In this sense, urban spaces are polyrhythmic fields, a “compound of varied everyday life and spatial rhythms” (Wunderlich 2008a, 91). Like polyrhythms within music, a combination of individually simple rhythms is woven together to a complex whole, which might harmonise (eurhythmia) or form tensions (arrhythmia). Those rhythms drive human activity and affect the formation of urban environments. In this way, cities are often known and negotiated through their unique rhythmical layout. They provide an “everyday stage for conflicts and relations” between social, spatial and natural rhythms forming “polyrhythmic ensembles” (Crang 2001, 190), which create a sense of time and influence the sense of place (Aboutorabi and Wesener 2010, 62).

It is this direct connection between rhythms and the city, which makes the ‘rhythm-metaphor’ particularly valuable for the purpose of this research. It provides the opportunity to analyse and discuss a city’s urban texture in a unique way: without excluding nature, privileging human beings or abiding by static structures. For instance, the concept of nature and the natural might initially suggest something diametrically opposed to the urban: “if the former conjures up a vision of untrammelled, primal wilderness untouched by human agency, the latter connotes all that is modern, artificial, and socio-technically constructed” (Latham et al. 2009, 54). This strict opposition neglects, however, the interplay of humans and the natural world indicating that “cities are shaped by processes analogous to those observable in nature” (55). As such, the concept of rhythm offers a more flexible and open approach that allows for an inclusive and more extensive understanding of the complex interaction between nature, time, space and the activities of daily life in the city (Koch and Sand 2010). In this way, the experience of rhythms is not limited to the body or the individual but extends through other rhythms into social space. One’s own rhythms are therefore part of a larger machinery of work, nature and culture.

In order to navigate and orchestrate everyday life in the city, each individual develops his or her own “rhythmic beat” which allows for a certain level of structuredness that lends to it an ontological predictability and security (Edensor 2012, 8). These habitual procedures and schedules are what Finnegan refers to as

(musical) ‘pathways’, linking routes to routines and as such providing “important – if often unstated – frameworks for people’s participation in urban life” (Finnegan 1989, 323). Those pathways are not merely individual but collective and contribute greatly to what Raymond Williams referred to as a ‘structure of feeling’ – a “communal way of seeing the world in consistent terms, sharing a host of reference points which provide the basis for shared discursive and practical habits” (Edensor 2012, 8)¹¹. The rhythmic lineaments of everyday life in the city are in this way largely controlled by invisible codes – normative rules and conventions that regularize behaviour and create an intuitive sense of synchronization – such as standing on the right side of the escalator to avoid interrupting the flow of people. These ‘forms of common sense’, as Stuart Hall puts it, are firmly located within broader social structures. They are shared forms of ‘habitus’ (Bourdieu 1986), linking routes to routines, facilitating the “ongoing mapping of space through repetitive, collective choreographies of congregation, interaction, rest and relaxation” (Edensor 2012, 8). Tim Edensor (2012) argues that it is precisely this saturation of the everyday with particular prescribed rhythms that lends them an aspect of power:

[...] diffuse forms of power often seek rhythmic conformity and spatio-temporal consistency through the maintenance of normative rules and conventions about when particular practices should take place at particular times [...]. (11).

For Lefebvre, these dominant rhythms have emerged as an expression of the logics of capitalism, commodifying everyday life experiences by “setting down the beats through which work and leisure proceed, and thus rendering the everyday banal and meaningless, an alienated realm” (Edensor 2012, 13). Social rhythms for Lefebvre are therefore part of our socialization into a specific routine which is detached from authentic forms of being in the world and thus clearly an effect of a top-down form of power (Simpson 2012).

In order to enter into a society, group or nationality, an individual has to accept certain values, habits and rules, a process Lefebvre refers to as ‘dressage’. The

¹¹ For Williams ‘structure of feeling’ is a concept that characterizes the lived experience of the quality of life at a particular time and place. As such, it is the culture of a particular historical moment which suggests a common set of values and perceptions which are shared by a certain generation and is clearly articulated in particular and artistic forms and conventions (1977, 132–133).

rhythmic conformity of dressage is a common and convenient structuring device and forms the basis of many institutions and establishments in the city. The regulations about commercial opening hours, restrictions of the serving and sale of alcohol, the rigour of school and business hours besides various other rhythms facilitate the development of ‘good habits’ which are often legally consolidated by the state (Frykman and Lofgren 1996). Mattias Kärrholm (2009) argues that ‘spatial commercialisation’ is one form of how rhythms are imposed onto public urban spaces, creating a sense of security on the one hand, yet slowing down the evolution of diversity, new experience and cultures on the other (436). In order to maximise commercial profit, those rhythms need to be synchronised “turning the material world into a predictable, frictionless, scheduled environment by way of territoriality” (Foucault 1993 [1994] quoted in Kärrholm 2009, 424). In this way, businesses turn the polyrhythmic landscape of the city into isorhythmic ones, orchestrating various rhythms in order to coincide with the rhythms of shopping (Edensor 2012)¹². However, Edensor (2012) reminds us that despite the imposition of capitalist and state rhythms upon individuals everyday urban life, it is important to “avoid the inference that the quotidian is thus a sphere of entrapment and stasis” (13). Rather, as Lefebvre (1996b) asserts, every rhythm involves “an aspect of movement and becoming” (230). In this way, “there is always something new and unforeseen that introduces itself into the repetitive: difference” (Lefebvre 2004, 6). Hence, there is an inherent potential for new possibilities of life in the enactment of the world, for the everyday is “polydimensional: fluid, ambivalent and labile” (Gardiner 2000, 6). It is therefore important, as Edensor states, to “avoid assumptions that managed normative rhythms possess an overarching force that compels individuals to march to their beat” (2012, 15). Instead, people are “apt to attune themselves to the rhythmicity of the moment through breathing, gesture, pace of movement and speech” (15).

The definition of City Rhythms is therefore a pluralistic one. It involves a tension between human activities and biological cycles, an interaction between the individual

¹² An exemplary place to observe this synchronization of commercial rhythms in the city is the ordinary shopping mall. Kärrholm notes that “the artificial black box of the mall” could be described as “a kind of rhythm machine” or ‘tabula rasa’ that keeps climate, seasonal change, and daylight outside allowing “commercial rhythms [to] rein free and set the order of the day producing their own time” (2009, 426). Kärrholm argues further that contemporary retail planners “have become more skilled and powerful in the art of capitalising City Rhythms” (2009, 426).

and society including a clear aspect of power. The combination of social, natural and physiological/biological regularities in the city is what Filipa Wunderlich (2008a) explicitly refers to as urban rhythms. She states that:

In contrast to rhythm in general, urban rhythms are specific to urban context. 'Urban' offers specificity and location to rhythms; it is frame, condition and context. 'Urban' entails urban life concentrated in a spatial context. Urban life is intense and inter-related social and human activity (society and being), and urban spaces are dense and complex man-made/artificial spaces (98).

For Wunderlich, urban rhythms are a compound of two different kinds of rhythm: spatial rhythms and everyday life rhythms. The former can be either dynamic, involving objects that move in space with a certain speed, frequency and regularity, or they can be static, such as surface patterns and objects displayed in space that are still, "yet evolve as rhythms from the perspective of the moving observer" (98). Everyday life rhythms can be distinguished between social, natural and physiological/biological rhythms. Social rhythms are linear sequences of socio-spatial practices that structure social time and are in continuous dialogue with external natural, physiological patterns, cyclical regularities that comprise the biological, internal rhythms of bodies. Furthermore, under these categories Wunderlich divides urban rhythms into social, cultural, natural, sound, smell, dynamic and static spatial rhythms, which all interact and mingle in space, creating a particular 'structure of feeling' which in turn shapes the city's unique sociomusical experience.

In her attempt to define the notions of everyday life and spatial rhythms as urban rhythms, Wunderlich draws on the work of Lefebvre and Eviatar Zerubavel. Whereas the former discusses the temporal regularity of everyday life more generally (see Chapter Two), the latter focuses particularly on the sociology of time arguing that everyday social life is rhythmically structured into "fairly rigid temporal patterns" which can be categorized into sociotemporal, physiotemporal and biotemporal orders (Zerubavel 1981, xii). Underlying those temporal orders are temporal regularities (rhythms) such as the "sequential relations among the stages of being a larva, a cocoon, and a mature insect: the fixed duration of pregnancy periods [...] puberty [...] uniform circadian rhythms" which are all part of the biotemporal patterns (biorhythms) (2). The physiotemporal order (physiorhythms) includes "the

predictable time of day at which the sun raises [...] the period during which a particular planet completes a revolution around the sun or a rotation around its own axis” (2). These regularities “lie in the domain of the physicist and astronomer” whereas sociotemporal regularities (sociorhythms) “clearly lie in the research domain of the sociologist” as they involve “the rigidification of social situations, activities and events” (2). Sociotemporal regularities act as “binding normative prescriptions” (Wunderlich 2008a, 100), regulating the dynamics and structure of social life (Zerubavel 1981), which shape the layout and use of urban space.

Similar to Lefebvre’s rhythmanalysis, Zerubavel’s approach provides a ‘rhythmical lens’ through which urban space can be analysed. All three categories – sociorhythms, biorhythms and physiorhythms constitute “binding normative prescriptions” as they are part of the complex rhythmical structure of the city (Wunderlich 2008a, 100). Lefebvre’s cyclical and linear rhythms are also contributing to the clarification and interpretation of City Rhythms, as they offer strong guidelines for the identification of movements, gestures, bodies and events, sounds, colours and smells, seasons, weather, light and darkness as well as the built urban environment.

Despite the comprehensive range of City Rhythms provided by Lefebvre, Zerubavel and Wunderlich, those concepts seem to ignore the less visible, intangible, ethereal rhythms, which present themselves in cities without actually being present. Those are the affective tonalities and sensibilities that come to matter in certain moments and places. The unique rhythmic composition of “properties, competencies, modalities, energies, attunements, arrangements and intensities of differing texture, temporality, velocity and spatiality, that act on bodies, are produced through bodies and transmitted by bodies (Lorimer 2008, 552). According to geographer Nigel Thrift (2004), cities are in fact “roiling maelstroms of affect” and sites of “intensities of feeling” as they are increasingly “expected to have a ‘buzz’, to be ‘creative’ and to generally bring forth powers of invention and intuition” (57). Thrift notes:

Particular affects such as anger, fear, happiness and joy are continually on the boil, rising here, subsiding there, and these affects continually manifest themselves in events which can take place either at a grand scale or simply as a part of continuing everyday life (57).

Affects circulate through city sites, events and situations and are thus an integral part of the everyday urban environment as they shape the way urban spaces are experienced and understood. Against this backdrop I want to complement Wunderlich, Lefebvre, and Zerubavel's rhythmical dimensions by adding *affective rhythms* to the complex composite of City Rhythms as they direct and propel the pulse and life of urban spaces. In order to grasp the character, texture and demeanour of affective rhythms (in urban spaces), it is necessary to have a closer look at the concept of affect more generally. The following discussion will outline some of the main orientations that undulate and sometimes overlap in their approaches to affect. The focus will be on four different understandings of the concept: affect as a set of embodied practices; affect from a psychological standpoint; from a naturalistic viewpoint; and a Darwinian perspective. This will by no means be a fully comprehensive accounting of the manifold theories and approaches towards affect, as it is a rather "troublesome concept" which takes us into "unfamiliar ways of thinking that are not easily written up fit for academic dissemination" (Dewsbury 2009, 20). However, these approaches lay the groundwork for a better understanding of the music-maker's affective attachment to the city and allow for a richer analysis of urban sociomusical dynamics.

3.2 Affective Rhythms

In snippets of action, aura and atmosphere, we might recognize just a few of the ways that life takes place with affects in its midst; or, more radically speaking, how life is composed in the midst of affects (Lorimer 2008, 552).

The notion of affect has attracted much attention in the last decade, not only in the social sciences (Ahmed 2004a; Ahmed 2004b; Massumi 2002; Sedgwick 2003), but also in philosophy (Nussbaum 2003), psychology (Tomkins 1963), (human) geography (Davidson and Bondi 2004; Dewsbury 2009; Lorimer 2008; McCormack 2003; Thrift 2004; Thien 2005) and neurosciences (Damasio 2000). Those scholars conceptualize affect in a variety of ways, drawing on the works of dissenting philosophers such as Baruch Spinoza, Gilles Deleuze and Félix Guattari, Henri Bergson, William James as well as Alfred North Whitehead. Despite its widespread use, there is no single, generalizable approach to affect; rather there is a vast assortment of philosophical, psychological, physiological translations, which

continuously evolve, develop, blend and blur as “affect emerges out of muddy, unmediated relatedness and not in some dialectical reconciliation of cleanly oppositional elements or primary units” (Gregg and Seigworth 2010, 4). Nevertheless, various scholars have attempted to provide a tentative theorization of affect, identifying broad tendencies and lines of thought. One of the pioneering works on affect is Spinoza’s *Ethics*, where he describes the concept *affectus* as the dynamic between embodied passions and their cognitive state. He identifies three key categories: sadness (*tristitia*), joy (*laetitia*), and desire (*cupiditas*). Any other passion is based on a combination of one or more of these categories in synergy with some kind of cognitive state. Further influential translations of the concept include Deleuze and Guattari’s modern ethological reinterpretation of Spinoza as well as the work of their translator Brian Massumi who defines affect as “a pre-personal intensity corresponding to an augmentation or diminution in that body’s capacity to act” (Deleuze and Guattari 1988, xvi).

In the following discussion I will turn towards a more (human) geographical interpretation of the concept drawing on Nigel Thrift’s *Spatial Politics of Affect* as well as John-David Dewsbury’s discussion on the different modes of thinking affect. Those approaches are by no means complete but rather represent an attempt to unravel, examine and explain some of the multiple iterations of affect and explore their relation to the rhythms of everyday life in the city.

3.2.1 Approaching Affect

For the human geographer J.D. Dewsbury, the study of affect can be traced back to the cultural, practice and performative turn, which has reverberated across the field of human geography over the past fifteen years¹³. Since then, thinking with and using the concept of affect has transformed geographical research approaches, directing attention to affective affinities and providing new qualitative means and

¹³ The performative turn is a paradigmatic shift in the social sciences and humanities, which has its origins in the 1940s and 1950s, when performance was integrated into a variety of theories such as Goffman’s highly influential *The Representation of Self in Everyday Life* (1959). The main idea underlying the performance turn is the assumption that all human practices are ‘performed’ and thus a public presentation of the self. As such, the concept of performance is a means to analyze and understand human agency and the way social life is constructed. The cultural, practice and performative turn are interconnected and encompass a wide variety of disciplines. For more information see (Bachmann-Medick 2016).

strategies for investigating the everyday social worlds.

Working through the concept of affect, Dewsbury (2009) suggests four different modes of thinking: affect as a material phenomenon; a force; a theory; and a mode of expression:

The first two take affect to be a material thing, firstly understanding it as a phenomena and secondly as a force; then it can be addressed directly as a theory before finally understanding affect as a mode of expression (2009, 21).

By relating to affect through *phenomena*, this approach emphasizes the affective capacities of bodies to experience everyday life in an unconscious, unintentional manner. Dewsbury refers to McCormack's research on Dance Movement Therapy, where dance is perceived as "relations and movement that signal affect in the body's encounter with the volume of space, the proximity of touch, and the connective rhythms of life produced therein" (21). Similarly, affect as *force* emphasizes the body itself, yet uses rather different conceptual terms in order to describe affect as an intensity and sensibility, a kind of invisible force field which is felt, but intangible and not quite there at the same time (21). This distinct shift in vocabulary entails an epistemological modification from "attending to interpretations of what things 'mean' toward and experimental endeavour to find expressive space for thinking and presenting what things 'do'" (21). Both affect as material phenomenon and force field reflect and relate to the embodied experience of the world. Used as a *theory*, affect serves as a way of critiquing hegemonic strands of research, which emphasize conscious, cognitive discussions of social relations, various discourses and social modes of representation, yet neglect the affective aspects of human thought and practice. Lastly, Dewsbury refers to affect as a mode of human *expression*, emphasizing the importance of a distinction between affect and emotion:

The distinction can be grasped as a spectrum from the autonomy of affect in its open, impersonal, and unqualified form, to its capture and expression in the qualified forms pertaining to emotion (23).

Dewsbury takes a human geographical stance suggesting that each of these modes of thinking encourage researchers to consider "the very specific renditions of the material effect of affect" in order to understand that "different institutional, visceral, and ecological situations access the performative implications of affect in different ways (24). However, Dewsbury's definition and categorization of affect is rather

unsatisfactory, as it fails to clearly discuss their specific spatial qualities, theoretical distinction as well as their interconnectedness, leaving open a variety of questions regarding affective relations, interactions and their actual impact on the everyday life of individuals in the city.

Nigel Thrift's approach on affect resembles some of Dewsbury's ideas, yet provides a more detailed examination of the concept as it is employed theoretically, arguing first and foremost that each conceptualization of affect needs to be understood "as a form of thinking, often indirect and nonreflective, it is true, but thinking all the same" (Thrift 2004, 60). For Thrift, thinking through affect implies that "the world is made up of billions of happy or unhappy encounters, encounters which describe a 'mindful connected physicalism' consisting of multitudinous paths which intersect" (Thrift 1999, 302). Building on broad tendencies and lines of force, Thrift identifies four different notions of affect, which are all united by a dependency on a "sense of push in the world" (2004, 60-64).

The first definition is derived from a phenomenological perspective and conceives of affect as "a set of embodied practices that produce visible conduct" (60). This mode can be related to Dewsbury's notion of 'affect as phenomenon' as it emphasizes the body's capacities to affect and be affected. In this way, affect facilitates the expression and description of everyday-life emotions through a vast sensorium of bodily states and processes. The affective response is invisible and encountered prior to any subjective framing, yet it mostly depends on the actions of others: "it is through such re-actions that we most often see what we are doing" (60). Affect is in this way rendered as a 'nebulous force' or 'felt intensity' "which produces a kind of understanding before it can be signified and articulated" (Dewsbury 2009, 21). It focuses attention directly onto the body as a "receptacle of affective experiences" – a "surface of intensities whose regions become folded to provide depth" (21). As such affect is integral to the individual's ongoing state of becoming; in fact, it is as Dewsbury suggest "the medium through which the body relates to the materiality of the world" (21).

Thrift's second translation frames affect as a biological response to the stimuli of everyday life. This approach is associated with psychological and psychoanalytic frames and draws on works such as Silvan Tomkins' affect theory¹⁴, which perceives affect as the pre-programmed, bodily 'drive' and prime motivator for any kind of action as they intensify or amplify the initial stimulus. For Dewsbury, this uptake of the concept contributes to the distinction between affect, feeling and emotion as the biological, unqualified form of affect turns into a qualified emotion by means of interpretation and articulation¹⁵. Even though those terms are frequently used interchangeably, it is important to note that neither affect nor affection denotes a personal feeling nor an emotion, but rather a "pre-personal intensity, corresponding to the passage from one experiential state of the body to another and implying an augmentation or diminution in that body's capacity to act" (Massumi 2004, xvii). In this sense affect is the most abstract of the three concepts (affect-emotion-feeling), which can hardly be realised in language, as it is always realized prior to and/or outside of consciousness (Shouse 2005). Emotions on the other hand can be understood as "tangible manifestations of affect" for they are the "most intense capture of affect in communicable and expressive terms" (Dewsbury 2009, 23)¹⁶.

The third translation takes a naturalistic stance, locating affect in the midst of things and relations. Drawing on Spinoza's concept of Parallelism (and Deleuze's translation of his approach), this notion argues that a movement in the body always appears simultaneously with a movement in the mind which means that "knowing proceeds in parallel with the body's physical encounters, out of interaction" (61). Affect is therefore the active outcome of an encounter either as an increase or decrease in the body and mind's capacity to act. In the words of Deleuze: "A body

¹⁴ The psychologist Silvan Tomkins introduced affect theory in the two volumes of his book *Affect Imagery Consciousness* in 1962. The theory proposes nine biologically based affect categories including enjoyment, interest, fear, surprise, anger, distress, shame, contempt and disgust, which constitute a blueprint for mental health. These affects are triggered by everyday stimuli and cause certain pre-conscious facial reactions before any conscious bodily reaction takes place. Tomkins' definition of affect differs from the Freudian 'drive' however, which is rather narrowly constrained and instrumental, as it focuses on particular objects only. For Tomkins affects can focus on various objects and they "have greater freedom with respect to time [...] (an affect such as anger may last for a few seconds but equally may motivate revenge that spans decades) (N. Thrift 2004, 61).

¹⁵ The distinction between affect and emotion is most forcefully articulated by Massumi, who draws upon Deleuze's reworking of Spinoza. As Massumi notes, emotion can be defined as "a subjective content, the sociolinguistic fixing of the quality of an experience which is from that point onward defined as personal. Emotion is qualified intensity, the conventional, consensual point of insertion of intensity into semantically and semiotically formed progressions, into narrativizable action-reaction circuits, into function and meaning. It is intensity owned and recognised" (Massumi 2002, 28).

¹⁶ For more details on the discussion of affect, feeling and emotion see (Anderson and Harrison 2006; Pile 2010; Pile 2011; Shouse 2005; Thien 2005)

affects other bodies, or is affected by other bodies; it is this capacity for affecting and being affected that defines a body in its individuality” (1988, 123). For instance, when a person experiences a feeling of enjoyment and happiness this condition is reflective of the individual’s encounter with a broader, supraindividual affective force field (Conradson 2007). For Deleuze the focus lies therefore on the movement between bodily states, bodily displacement and “the map of intensities” (Thrift 2009, 83). In the words of Gregg and Seigworth (2010), affect in this sense is constant evidence of a body’s progressive engagement with the world’s obstinacies and rhythms, marking “a body’s belonging to a world of encounters or a world’s belonging to a body of encounters but also, in non-belonging, through all those far sadder (de)compositions of mutual in-compossibilities” (2). As such, affect can occur in encounters between human and nonhuman forms of life and will present itself differently to body and mind each time. For Dewsbury, theorizing affect in this way is therefore often referred to as an ethology that aims at questioning and exposing the way “we relate to each other, the world, being produced by the world in certain ways (2009, 22).

Lastly, Thrift introduces the Darwinian translation of affect, which assumes that affective processes occur independently of (cognitive) intention or meaning. Based on the analysis of facial expressions, Darwin concludes that the expression of emotions is an unlearned behaviour that has evolved in humans from animals “born out of the evolution of affective expression as a means of preparing the organism for action” (Thrift 2004, 64). As such, affect is a deep-seated physiological change, which is based on emotions that are “written involuntarily on the face” (64). For Darwin, emotions are a product of evolution and thus universal to all human and non-human beings. As a result, neither expressions nor emotions are unique to any race, civilization or culture. Rather, neo-Darwinians argue for the existence of several universal emotions such as: anger, sadness, disgust, fear and enjoyment, which are genetically hard-wired and manifested in distinct facial expressions. Hence, those facial expressions do not originate from a person’s communicative repertoire as they “lack the cognitive characteristic of the higher-order mental processes” (Leys 2011, 438). As long as facial expressions are not masked by culturally determined ‘display’ rules, which provoke a certain social behaviour, faces

express diverse affects and are therefore “authentic read-outs of the discrete internal states that constitute our basic emotions” (438)¹⁷. The Darwinian approach suggests therefore that affects are nonintentional, bodily reactions, which are free of inherent meaning or association to their triggering source as they are “located subcortically in the brain and defined in evolutionary terms as universal or pancultural categories or ‘natural kinds’” (438).

Those four different definitions illustrate the complex nature of affect and lay out some of the affective forces, intensities and rhythms at play in the (re)makings of everyday life in the city. According to Thrift, what links those disparate theoretical starting points is the fact that “affect merges two collections of analytic objects that have been conventionally kept apart – namely ‘the social’ and ‘the biological’” (2009, 81). In fact, each of these different schools of thought involves a distinct biological component, as the body acts outside social organization even though, as Thrift reminds us “in practice it is very hard to tell the difference” (84). In this sense, affect arises in the midst of “in-between-ness: in the capacities to act and be acted upon” as it occurs as a result of the encounter between two bodies (human or nonhuman) (Gregg and Seigworth 2010, 1). As Dewsbury (2009) reminds us, affect is “the surplus that is not socially constructed; it is instead the stuff of our being and not the semiotic material that enables us to understand our being” (21). It is therefore removed from ideas that specific feelings and movements of the sensible are socially framed and in this way intelligible and graspable. Rather, affect is a semiconscious, pre-personal force, a sensation which is registered, yet “not necessarily considered in that thin band of consciousness we now call cognition” (Thrift 2009, 88). As such, affect is “at once an actual phenomenon and a virtual force, a material effect and an immaterial disposition” which brings together a set of flows and shared rhythms that move through the bodies of human and non-human beings in space (Dewsbury 2009, 20).

¹⁷ Paul Ekman’s (2003) ‘neurocultural’ theory argues however, that socialization and communication plays an important role in the experience of emotion as social norms, experiences and attitudes provide certain ‘display rules’ which affect and moderate certain facial expressions.

What makes the concept of affect significant for the purpose of this project is its role in the formation of the music-maker's sense of place. Despite its elusive character as a invisible phenomenon, mobile force, intensity or mode of expression, affect manifests itself in various forms at various times in the musician's everyday life: On their way to a rehearsal, in the recording studio, during performance, downtime, illness or rumination at home; during movement in nature, interaction with friends, family, in their own bodies, sensing their desires, passions, dreams, beliefs, worries and fears. Together those sensibilities, intensities and forces form a connective tissue, which anchors the music-makers to the city as well as lends the city its ambience, and, more importantly, its affective charge. Highmore suggests that urban spaces are the most "complex exemplar of the dynamic interplay of forces" (2005, 141) in space, producing what Edensor and Holloway called "a rich rhythmic stew" which constitutes the multi-layered texture of city life (2008, 485). But how exactly does this affective, rhythmic urban stew look like and how can it be captured?

3.2.2. (Ordinary) Urban Affects

According to Thrift, affect "has always, of course, been a constant of urban experience" (2008, 172). It can be seen as "a kind of force-field of passions that associate and pulse bodies in particular ways" (2002, 57). This 'force-field of passion' constantly links human desires, dreams, fears and joys with the socio-material layout of the city. For this reason, Thrift emphasizes the need for a closer examination of affect in cities and affective cities, including the political consequences of their interaction. He points towards the increasing "use and abuse of various affective practices" as part of socio-political processes (or rhythms) which are part of the complex rhythmical composition of the city (58). For Thrift affect can serve as a progressive tool for change and transformation, yet he points out that it is often "actively engineered" and used as a "whole new means of manipulation" for the powerful in order to frame the rhythmical layout of the city (58). As a result, urban spaces are increasingly designed in order to trigger certain affective responses. Thrift refers to this process as a "form of landscape engineering" which is "gradually pulling itself into existence, producing new forms of power as it goes" (68).

As a result, Thrift argues for a notion of (urban) space that resembles “a series of interdigitated worlds touching each other. It is constructed out of a spatial swirl of affects that are often difficult to tie down but are nevertheless crucial” (Thrift 2006, 143). (Urban) space and affect are thus intertwined, creating a particular urban texture, which reflects the affective materiality of the city. Besides the ‘concrete’, physical reality of urban spaces, there is the abstract, affective materiality of the urban, which is to speak of the everyday sensibilities, rhythms and intensities – the various forms of engagement, relation and encounter that give shape and consistency to urban life.

According to Latham et al. (2009), urban materiality in its most crude sense is “the stuff of which the urban environment consists” (2009, 62). Materiality refers here literally to “the physical things, objects and structures that give urban space its shape and substance” (62). This definition gives the material a reassuring solidity, emphasizing that which is obviously visible and undeniably tangible in opposition to the immaterial, the abstract and the unreal. Yet as Latham, et al, remind us, urban materiality does not just designate brute matter. In fact, as urban geographer Yi’En argues, urban materialities are very “alive” in the constitution of urban experiences, altering individual rhythms and evoking bodily senses (Yi’En 2014, 3). For this reason, Latham and McCormack (2004) suggest to “open up and multiply the pathways along which the complex materialities of the urban might be apprehended” (703). Rather than limiting urban materiality to its physicality and tangibility, it is important to consider a notion of the material that allows the presence and importance of the immaterial, not as something which is defined in opposition to the material, “but as that which gives it an expressive life and liveliness independent of the human subject” (703). In the words of Latham and McCormack:

[...] we cannot simply rein things in and root them. It is not enough to use the ‘material’ and ‘materiality’ in such a way as to invoke a realm of reassuringly tangible or graspable objects defined against a category of events and processes that apparently lack ‘concreteness’. Rather, we only begin to properly grasp the complex realities of apparently stable objects by taking seriously the fact that these realities are always held together and animated by processes excessive of form and position (704).

Consequently, any account of the urban everyday materiality involves more than the inventory of its obvious physicality. Urban materiality in this sense is based upon “an

appreciation of the fact that affective economies are as important as political and symbolic economies” (706). This conception emphasizes the affective materiality of the urban, which considers “the relations in and through which it consists, relations that are always more than personal and are always playing out before the reflective event of thought kicks in” (706). The affective materiality of the city is therefore the imagined, “unstable, never quite concrete ‘stuff’ of the city”, which shape the experience of space without necessarily being physically tangible (Latham and McCormack 2009, 256). It takes into account pre-personal and non-conscious phenomena and processes, various kinds of representations such as images, sound and signs as well as different kinds of experience including dreams, desires, memories, moods and atmospheres.

According to Stewart (2011), atmospheres are not an inert context but an affective force field, which has “rhythms, valences, moods, sensations, tempos, and lifespans” (445). They are circulating forces, an expressivity of something coming into existence and the “live background of living in and living through things” (445). Attending to the charged atmospheres of everyday (urban) life is an important part of sensual world-making as it reveals the “little worlds that some people immerse themselves in, or dip in and out of, or make fun of, or build a light and temporary link to before they move on to something else” (452). This process of ‘sensing out’ is what Stewart refers to as atmospheric attunement – “an intimate, compositional process of dwelling in spaces that bears, gestures, gestates, worlds” (445). An atmospheric attunement approaches everyday life not as the “dead or reeling effects of distant systems but as lived affects with tempos, sensory knowledges, orientations, transmutations, habits [...]” (446). It is a “curious pause” or a “sideways step into what normally gets stepped over” asking “how things come to matter and through what qualities, rhythms, forces, relations and movements” (Stewart 2010, 4). In this sense, an atmospheric attunement is an alerted sense that something is happening followed by an “attachment to sensing out whatever it is” (4). It is an attunement of the senses to the ‘ordinary affects’ of everyday life. For Stewart (2007), the everyday is saturated with “hints of energy” creating what she refers to as affects of the ordinary:

the varied, surging capacities to affect and to be affected that give everyday life the quality of a continual motion of relations, scenes, contingencies and emergences. They're things that happen (2).

Ordinary affects are in this sense, “the peculiar materialities of things that come to matter” (2). They are “public feelings that begin and end in broad circulation” and at the same time they are “the stuff that seemingly intimate lives are made of” (2). Similar to Williams’s (1977) ‘structure of feeling’, ordinary affects are “social experiences in solution”. They “do not have to await definition, classification, or rationalization before they exert palpable pressures” (132–133). They don’t have an inherent meaning or semantic message as they “pick up density and texture as they move through bodies, dreams, dramas, and social worldings of all kinds” (Stewart 2007, 3). As such, ordinary affects are at once abstract and concrete, ephemeral and consequential drawing attention to ordinary intensities, banalities, valences, moods, sensations and rhythms that constitute the charged atmospheres of the everyday. Stewart calls for a ‘tuning in’, a ‘sensing out’ and ‘attending to’ these mundane atmospherics and the way they

[...] accrue, endure, fade or snap. How they build as a refrain, literally scoring over the labor of living out whatever’s happening. How they constitute a compositional present, pushing circulating forces into form, texture and density so that can be felt, imagined, brought to bear or just born (Stewart 2010, 2).

This attending to what is happening, accreting attachments and detachments turns into the direct materiality of people’s shared senses. It yields the creation of different worlds, flows, experiences, conditions, dreams and imaginaries. This link between worldings is sensory and affective: “here, things matter not because of how they are represented but because they have qualities, rhythms, forces, relations and movements” (Stewart 2011, 445). In this way, ordinary affects act as ‘contact zone’ linking various rhythms, routes and disjunctures, illuminating “the overdeterminations of circulations, events, conditions, technologies and flows of power” (Stewart 2007, 5). According to Stewart, urban materiality is hence based on “the dense entanglement of affect, attention, the senses, and matter” (2010, 6). It is built upon affective rhythms, intimacies and intensities that accumulate in ordinary moments of living, lending the everyday a quality of “continual motion of relations, scenes, contingencies and emergences” (2007, 1).

Building on these different trajectories of thinking, affective urban rhythms are a complex conglomerate of diverse experiential forces and material things (Dewsbury 2009). They are an affective force field, an expressivity or sensibility that proliferates in ordinary scenes of the everyday (Stewart 2011). They are non-conscious intensities, always more than personal and take place “before the reflective event of thought kicks in” (Latham and McCormack 2004, 706). In this sense, affective urban rhythms can be understood as “a kind of vague but intense atmosphere” (McCormack 2008a, 6) which has “rhythms, valences, moods, sensations, tempos and lifespans” (Stewart 2011, 445) and is always experienced in and through the body. Yet affective rhythms suggest a relationship which is “not only with the body and its immediate space but with a permeable body integrated within, and subject to, a global system: one that combines the air we breathe, the weather we feel, the pulses and waves of the electromagnetic spectrum that subtends and enables technologies, old and new, and circulates [...] in the excitable tissue of the heart” (Dyson 2009, 17). In this way, affective rhythms are neither fully subjective nor fully objective. They come about through the relations of a multiplicity of human and nonhuman entities that exist independently from the individual, yet require a subject in order to be sensed and acknowledged (Dittmer, Craine, and Adams 2014, 332). Affective rhythms exist in this way as something “familiar and seemingly knowable despite not having objective tangibility” (Dewsbury 2009, 20). They are at once intimate and impersonal “traversing the ebbs and swells of intensities that pass between “bodies” [...]” (Gregg and Seigworth 2010, 2). Those rhythms can be collective, as they are transmitted between people, yet each individual experiences them differently “depending on that singular body’s susceptibility to being affected at that given time” (Dittmer, Craine, and Adams 2014, 332). Affective rhythms are thus the less visible, intangible, ethereal rhythms of the city, which are always complemented and accompanied by the more concrete, physical everyday life and spatial rhythms permeating the musician’s everyday urban environment.

The preceding discussion of affect as a (urban) phenomenon highlights the elusiveness, complexity as well as the significance of the concept. It provides an overview of the “infinitely multiple iterations of affect and theories of affect: theories as diverse and singularly delineated as their own highly particular encounters with

bodies, affect worlds” (Gregg and Seigworth 2010, 4). Despite their diversity however, what remains striking about these theories is the peculiar absence of a methodological approach, which provides the tools for capturing, analysing and understanding the affective dimensions of everyday life. As a consequence, the engagement with those theories feels rather like a “methodological and conceptual free fall” (4). To this end, this research project wants to offer a set of research methods, which make visible, in a fruitful fashion the ways in which affective rhythms manifest themselves in the rhythmic unfolding of the city. Before discussing this methodological framework in more detail in Chapter Four, it is necessary to return to the concept of City Rhythms, which consists of affective rhythms as well as the city’s physical reality, people, nature and time. Music-making in the city is bound up in a complex array of rhythms including the music-maker’s quotidian routines, habits and schedules, rhythms of mobility and immobility as well as non-human rhythms such as affects, energies, objects, flora and fauna. In order to better understand the multiple rhythmic processes, the following sub-section will introduce a categorization of City Rhythms, which provides the opportunity to analyse and discuss the music-maker’s rhythmic urban environment effectively.

3.3 Categorizing City Rhythms

City Rhythms are location and place-specific and unique in the way they resonate with one another (Wunderlich 2013, 393). It is the concentration and superimposition of human and social activity in the city, constrained by man-made spaces, which are overlaid with the forces of nature, that makes urban environments a stimulating field for examining the wide variety of City Rhythms (Wunderlich 2008a). As such, cities are ‘loci of encounters’ as they are “meeting points, moments of conjunctures where social practices and trajectories meet up with moving and fixed materialities and form configurations that are continuously under transformation and negotiation” (Simonsen 2007, 168). Urban spaces are therefore perceived rhythmically as they resemble some kind of ‘symphony of events’: “as in music, groups of unique place-rhythms imbue spaces with a temporal structure, metrical order, and pulse” (Wunderlich 2013, 393).

In order to capture, analyse, and understand this metrical order of the urban, we need to be attuned to the city's diverse rhythms. Those regular patterns of flow are the pulse and life of urban spaces and the "coordinates through which inhabitants and visitors frame and order their urban experience" (Amin and Thrift 2002, 17). By illuminating the relations between body, city and nature as rhythms, *City Rhythms* provide important insight into the manifold, complex processes and meanings of urban spaces. They are an essential part of people's life-worlds as they are regulating the structure and dynamics of everyday social life (Zerubavel 1981, 2). They are a vibrant set of rhythmically structured events and practices, providing "a sense of pattern and rhythm, a sense of balance and resonance" (Wunderlich 2013, 393). As such, *City Rhythms* strongly characterise urban space and affect the way it is understood, experienced, felt, sensed and lived. If a place feels social and intimate, or distant and cold depends therefore on the presence, absence, intensity and dominance of certain kinds of *City Rhythms* (Wunderlich 2008a, 109). In this way, dominant *City Rhythms* catalyse particular feelings in and of a certain place and strongly impact on an individual's sense of place (109). For this reason, urban spaces should not be examined separately from their embodied patterns of everyday life rhythms, which constitute and cultivate their unique urban texture. As Wunderlich reminds us:

More than what one can find in spaces, in terms of elements or physical configurations, it is important to observe and understand what actually happens in spaces. This will allow a better understanding of how human activity patterns actually interact, engage and respond to urban spaces and how these spaces receive value and meaning through that (109).

The analysis of *City Rhythms* offers therefore a new mode of observing and understanding urban places, which is focused on "inherent dynamics as complements to static patterns of physical forms and surfaces" (109). As a way of probing the unique sociomusical experience offered by the city, it is therefore necessary to engage with the collective as well as the individual rhythms that determine the circuits or 'pathways' taken by the music-makers in their urban environment. This includes the rhythmic materiality of the city which is made up of various shops, cafes, bars, domestic- and rehearsal spaces as well as social, cultural, political, natural and affective rhythms which all impact on the way the music-makers orient themselves to specific sites and activities and in this way pull or propel them through their everyday urban environment.

Based on the works of Lefebvre, Zerubavel, Wunderlich and Stewart, I have developed a categorization of City Rhythms that suits and supports the purpose of analysing the music-makers' sense of place in Wellington and Copenhagen. In order to capture the spatial expression of City Rhythms in either of those urban spaces, they can be grouped in relation to dominant spatial attributes. From a macro social and spatial perspective there are three primary categories of City Rhythms: social, spatial and affective rhythms. These categories can be further divided into sub-groups in order to unravel their complex spatial expressions in urban space. Social rhythms are divided into socio-cultural and political rhythms; spatial rhythms into urban materiality and nature; and affective rhythms into ordinary affects and atmospheres (see figure 1) in order to identify and clarify the complex rhythmical layout of the city.

Figure 1 Categorization of City Rhythms

The sub-category *socio-cultural rhythms* consists of social as well as cultural rhythms as they relate closely to each other and are not always separately distinguishable. This category includes various social and cultural events, activities and practices, traditions and rituals that are all part of the musicians' everyday life in Wellington and Copenhagen. Whether social gatherings, jam-sessions, busking on the street, teaching school children or attending a jazz concert, socio-cultural rhythms can be individual or collective, shaping the musician's urban 'pathways' and in this way affect their personal sense of place.

Political rhythms is a sub-category that includes institutional and governmental rhythms such as the local infrastructure, regulations about commercial opening hours of pubs, clubs, cafés, bars and shops, restrictions of the serving and sale of alcohol, bus timetables, the rigour of school and business hours, the provision of financial and spatial resources including performance and rehearsal spaces as well as governmental funding and support systems.

Urban materiality is a sub-group of spatial rhythms and includes the concrete, physical reality of urban spaces – buildings, objects and static structures that give urban space its shape and substance such as public venues, cafés, shops, bars, restaurants or schools as well as private space such as the musician's home. It also includes dynamic rhythms such as the fluxes, flows and movements of people, cars, bikes and boats across the city. Rhythms of urban materiality feature therefore the musician's daily routes and routines through the city, their rehearsal space, concert venues, public hangouts and private space. This sub-group is closely related to natural rhythms, which are always part of a city's urban texture as well as affective rhythms, which is the abstract, never quite concrete 'stuff' of the city', which shape the experience of space without necessarily being physically tangible (Latham and McCormack 2009, 256).

The sub-group *nature* features climatic rhythms such as daily and seasonal weather changes, flora and fauna, which characterize the music-maker's urban environment. Natural rhythms include parks, gardens, coastlines, rivers, lakes, and hills where the musicians ponder, exercise, sleep, walk or relax, as well as the songs of birds on a sunny summer day or the whistling of the wind through the trees and the pouring rain on a long, dark winter evening.

Affective rhythms are divided in the sub-categories *ordinary affects* and *atmospheres*. Both are non-conscious intensities that are experienced in and through the body. Ordinary affects are 'hints of energy', 'public feelings' (Stewart 2007) that draw attention to ordinary sensibilities, banalities, valences, moods, sensations and rhythms that constitute the charged atmospheres of the everyday (Stewart 2010). These atmospheres are affective force fields, circulating forces that come to reside in "experiences, conditions, things, dreams, landscapes, imaginaries, and lived sensory moments" as they constitute the "live background of living in and living through things" (Stewart 2011, 445). They can be collective as they may "'radiate' from an individual to another" and therefore "envelope or surround" those people (Anderson 2009, 80). As such they appear to be impersonal "in that they belong to collective situations and yet can be felt as intensely personal" (80).

As much as this categorization distinguishes certain rhythms from each other, it also points towards the interconnection, synergy, and fusion of social, spatial and affective aspects. As such, those categories are by no means mutually exclusive, rather different City Rhythms interact and mingle in space, creating a particular urban texture which in turn shapes the music-maker's sense of place in Wellington and Copenhagen. Here I want to draw on Dewsbury's (2003) call to "stop separating the world out into meaningful representations on the one hand and ephemeral sensation on the other [...]" (1908), and instead become attentive to the complex polyrhythmic ensemble (Crang 2001) which shapes the sociomusical experience of the city and anchors the music-makers to their urban space. The categorization of City Rhythms provides therefore an analytic technique but also a mode of representation of (urban) place-rhythms which allows for a better understanding of the spatial, temporal and affective unfolding of the musician's everyday life in the city. Building on this conceptualization of City Rhythms the following chapter will introduce a methodological framework, which accounts for the diverse places, people, objects, affects and atmospheres that determine the sociomusical experience in Wellington and Copenhagen and offers concrete tools in order to better apprehend its manifold articulations.

Part II – The Rhythmanalytic Lens – A Framework for Analysis

Chapter 4 - Methodology

The previous chapter argued that City Rhythms characterize the musician's everyday life in the city and shape the way an attachment or 'sense of place' is evoked. Besides everyday life and spatial rhythms, the chapter proposed the consideration of affective rhythms, which impact on the diurnal experience of place and shape the music-maker's 'pathways' through the city without actually being visible. As such, the analysis of social, spatial and affective rhythms offers a new mode of observing and understanding the music-maker's attachment to place and allows for a more enriched study of the sociospatial aspects of music-making in the city. By outlining a set of research methods, it is possible to create a rhythmanalytical methodology for analysing artistic practice in urban spaces (musical and otherwise). Comparing two specific cases, such as Wellington and Copenhagen, allows for a deeper examination of the two examples which in turn can be linked to "the larger historical and social scenes in which lives are set" (Mills and Etzioni 1999, 12). The main concern of this chapter is to determine which methodologies would allow for a richer investigation of musical rhythms and activity in Wellington and Copenhagen. To this end, there are three principal tasks undertaken here. The first is geared towards providing an overview of existing research engaging with Lefebvre's rhythmanalysis. The second task is to introduce my own rhythmanalytical framework, which is based on a unique medley of research methods that makes possible a 'thicker' description of the polyrhythmic environments, affective affinities, and atmospheres surrounding the musicians in their everyday life in Wellington and Copenhagen. The final task will be to position the proposed methodology in relation to existing qualitative methods employed in the field of popular music studies. In this respect, this chapter will situate the project in relation to a common methodology in the study of urban music-making, namely ethnography.

4.1 Doing Rhythmanalysis

From his home in Paris, Lefebvre observes how life in the street follows rhythmical orders, patterns, and re-occurring sequences. He argues that everybody thinks they know what the notion of ‘rhythm’ means, but few actually do. He states that:

in fact, everybody senses it in a manner that falls a long way short of knowledge: rhythm enters into the lived; though that does not mean it enters into the known [...]. There is a long way to go from an observation to a definition, and even further from the grasping of some rhythm [...] to the conception that grasps the simultaneity and intertwinement of several rhythms, their unity in diversity (Lefebvre 2004, 77).

Much the same as polyrhythms in music, sequences and combinations of individual rhythms are woven together to a complex, living whole (Koch and Sand 2010). For this reason Lefebvre suggests that “an analysis is therefore necessary in order to discern and compare them” (2004, 77). In response, he introduces rhythmanalysis as an analytic lens for examining and understanding the dynamic organization of social life. While his rhythmanalytical project may be less familiar than his work on the production of space, geographers and social scientists have become increasingly interested in a range of topics both related to the ways rhythmanalysis contributes to the understanding of space-time and how it facilitates the examination and discussion of specific everyday practices (Edensor 2012; 2010; Simpson 2012; 2008). In terms of the former, certain scholars have engaged with the ways in which rhythmanalysis allows for the re-thinking of time-space as produced in practice as opposed to a container in which practices play out (Crang 2001); or how rhythmanalysis offers an alternative approach to engage with the increasing mobility in urban spaces (Highmore 2005; Simonsen 2004; Middleton 2010; Wunderlich 2008b; Vergunst 2010) or facilitates an analysis of the ways in which space organizes time in the city (Straw 2010). In terms of the latter, studies have analysed the rhythms of tourism and consumption (Edensor and Holloway 2008; Kärholm 2009; Rantala and Valtonen 2014), the choreographed rhythms of the body in (artistic) performance (McCormack 2005; 2008b; 2008a; Simpson 2008), and on a more abstract level, the usefulness of rhythmanalysis for the exploration of metaphors highlighting “the importance in the organization and vitality of urban life” (Amin and Thrift 2002).

However, one issue which has not received sufficient attention in research engaging with the analysis of rhythms is the question of how to actually *do* rhythmanalysis in

an empirical, practice-based context (Simpson 2008). Cresswell, et al. (2011), argue that Lefebvre's rhythmanalysis is "something of an unfinished project", which should be conceived as "introducing a rich but suggestive vein of temporal thinking rather than a definitive methodology or a set body of concepts" (190). As such, Lefebvre was "frustratingly elusive [...] about the tools of such a praxis" and failed to suggest any clear methods for conducting a rhythmanalytical project (Amin and Thrift 2002, 19). Simpson argues that there is in fact "substantial need to develop methods for attending to rhythm" that could provide the means of "how to actually do rhythmanalysis or what techniques could be employed in maintaining this sort of disposition" (2012, 425). However, according to Kullman and Palludan, it is precisely this incomplete and open-ended character of rhythmanalysis that makes the approach suitable for diverse fields of thinking and researching (2011, 349).

In recent years, a few notable studies have emerged that address this lack of theoretical rigour, proposing different ways of adopting and developing rhythmanalysis as an analytical method. For example, Tim Edensor's (2012) recent collection on rhythm includes a wide range of empirical engagements with Lefebvre's notion of rhythm; Simpson (2012) proposes time-lapse photography as a useful component of a rhythm-analytical methodology; Duffy et al. (2011) use sound diaries as a method for listening to place; Latham and McCormack (2009) engage with diary-photo and diary-interview approaches as tools for thinking through the rhythms of urban environments; Tiwari (2008) constructs experimental maps of urban spaces as part of a rhythmanalytical project, reflecting on time, moods and emotions of a certain place. While those studies are valuable contributions to the performance of rhythmanalysis, they fail to provide a detailed illustration of the method as a tool for analysing everyday practices including the discussion of specific challenges in the process.

Furthermore, the way in which rhythmanalysis is applied in those studies is limited to the perspective of the researcher as the rhythmanalyst. Following Lefebvre, the rhythmanalyst is in a position that recalls the nineteenth-century flâneur who observes the tumult of city life as a detached but highly attuned spectator. Just as the flâneur remains emotionally distant from public interaction, the rhythmanalyst must

be situated 'outside' the rhythmic flows as "certain exteriority enables the analytic intellect to function" (Lefebvre 2004, 26). At the same time, Lefebvre argues that in order to sense a rhythm, it is important to be 'inside': "to grasp this fleeting object, [...] it is therefore necessary to situate oneself simultaneously inside and outside" (26). It is through the window of his private apartment, which opens onto the vibrant Parisian city centre, that Lefebvre can adopt this 'inside-outside' perspective, which allows him to observe the varied everyday life and spatial rhythms:

By contrast, from the window, the noises distinguish themselves, the flows separate out, rhythms respond to one another. Towards the right, below, a traffic light. On red, cars at a standstill, the pedestrians cross, feeble murmurings, footsteps, confused voices. One does not chatter while crossing a dangerous junction under the threat of wild cats and elephants ready to charge forward, taxis, buses, lorries, various cars. Hence the relative silence in this crowd. A kind of soft murmuring, sometimes a cry, a call (2004, 28).

The window overlooking the city is therefore not merely an abstract site from which the 'mental eye' observes the tumult of the streets but it is in fact a real location "not only enabling sights but leading to insights" (Goonewardena et al. 2008, 153). As such, the window allows for the perception of the city's rhythmic spatial patterns from a distance. Yet there is no consideration of the actual 'inner' rhythms – neither in regards to the geographical 'inside' of the private space nor the physical 'inside' of the rhythm analyst. As was discussed in Chapter Two, Lefebvre acknowledges the importance of the body as a site through which everyday rhythms are grasped and centred, yet he seems to neglect the body's capacity to affect and be affected by various rhythmic sensibilities and intensities, which are a part of the "ongoing emergence of rhythmic affectual assemblages" constituting everyday life (Edensor and Holloway 2008, 485). Consequently, in order to capture the musician's 'inner' rhythms successfully, I suggest that the rhythm analytical activity has to be performed by both the researcher and the participants. In this way, the musicians contribute to capturing, examining and understanding the various rhythms that constitute their everyday life especially the less tangible, 'inner' rhythms found in the unfolding of their private homes and the affective ties that anchor them to their urban environment. This collaborative work challenges the power relationship, which often characterizes ethnography¹⁸, blurring the binaries of (research) subject/object and

¹⁸ In order to avoid the subject/object divide, feminist ethnographer Abu-Lughod suggests to work "with the assumptions of difference in sameness, of a self that participates in multiple identifications, and an other that is also partially the self, we might be moving beyond the impasse of the fixed self/other or subject/object divide that

allows the musicians to participate in the process of sensing the city and mapping the beat.

Against this backdrop, this project introduces a rhythmanalytical methodology that engages with the full complexity of musical practice and the polyrhythmicity of everyday life. By capturing and analyzing the specific everyday practices, experiences, and performances of music-makers in the two urban spaces of Wellington and Copenhagen it seeks to recognize the complex array of City Rhythms, including the music-maker's quotidian routines, habits and schedules, rhythms of mobility and immobility, as well as non-human rhythms such as atmospheres, objects, flora and fauna. This analysis of the unique rhythmic layout in Wellington and Copenhagen requires a flexible array of methodologies in order to better apprehend its manifold articulations. To this end, the following sub-section will introduce a rhythmanalytical framework, uniquely suited to each site. Building on Lefebvre's rhythmanalysis and his notion of social space as well as the concept of City Rhythms discussed earlier, this framework provides a fruitful tool for attending to the multiple rhythms ('inner' and 'outer') underlying music-making in the city.

4.2 A Rhythmanalytical Framework

We simply do not have the methodological resources and skills to undertake research that takes the sensuous, embodied, creativeness of social practice seriously (Latham 2003: 1998).

Following the previous discussion, it is evident that attention needs to be paid to the methodologies with which everyday rhythms are analyzed and the modes with which they are written. As a response to some of the aforementioned challenges, I have developed a rhythmanalytical framework that builds on the concept of City Rhythms outlined in Chapter Three. There I introduced a categorization of rhythms consisting of three main groups: social, spatial and affective rhythms. Social rhythms include various social and cultural events, activities, practices, traditions and rituals, as well as institutional and governmental dynamics. Spatial rhythms consist of the musician's urban materiality and natural environment. Affective rhythms are non-

so disturbs the new ethnographers [...] The creation of a self through opposition to an other is blocked, and therefore both the multiplicity of the self, and the multiple, overlapping, and interacting qualities of other cannot be ignored" (Abu-Lughod 1990, 25–27).

conscious intensities and atmospheres that are experienced in and through the body. It is particularly the category of affective rhythms, which has not received much attention in existing literature due to its rather elusive nature. Stewart reminds us of the complex and uncertain character of (ordinary) affects, pointing out that they are “not the kind of analytic object that can be laid out on a single, static plane of analysis” (Stewart 2007, 3). In order to grasp those intensities of the ordinary, she suggests paying “analytic attention to the charged atmospheres of everyday life” – a process she refers to as *atmospheric attunement*. Attending to atmospheric attunements requires “a clearing – a space in which to clear the opposition between representation and reality, or the mind-numbing summary evaluations of objects as essentially good or bad, or the effort to pin something to a social construction as if this were an end in itself” (2011, 452). It is a non-representational approach that emphasizes rhythms of living, the body and its intensities of feeling, indicating that the world unfolds as these embodied practices take place. Becoming attuned to the rhythms of ordinary affects requires the researcher therefore to pay “close ethnographic attention to pressure points and forms of attention and attachment” (Stewart 2007, 5).

This focus on affective rhythms and atmospheres of the ordinary has methodological consequences, as the conventional methods used within social science research such as content analysis, focus groups, in-depth interviews and the like have been criticized for capturing only a “narrow range of sensate life” (Thrift 2000, 3). Traditional research methodologies fail to register the non-verbal, non-cognitive, emotive, embodied and affective aspects of social life (Morton 2005, 663). In fact, Wood et al. argue that “musical methodologies have remained half formed, fragmentary, hidden, elusive, out of sight, beyond words” (Wood, Duffy, and Smith 2007, 867). For this reason, Alan Latham advocates a “broadminded openness to methodological experimentation and pluralism” (2003, 2012) including techniques that allow for “thinking through the multi-sensory nature of experience of urban aesthetics” (Latham and McCormack 2004, 261). Consequently, in order to “rediscover the richness of the world” research methods have to undergo creative revision (Thrift and Bingham 2000, 281).

In what follows, I want to respond to this call for creative revision and methodological experimentation. While acknowledging Lefebvre's rhythmanalysis and his concept of social space as useful starting points for thinking through the complex rhythms of urban spaces, I want to extend his approach by developing a rhythmanalytical methodology that pays attention not only to linear and cyclical rhythms but also to the ordinary affects and atmospheres surrounding the musicians in their everyday life. Complementing Lefebvre's triadic notion of social space is the '*rhythmical triad*' composed of social, spatial and affective rhythms that characterize everyday urban environments and are therefore vital for the analysis of the music-maker's sense of place. The rhythmical triad offers a socio-spatial-affective dimension which complements spatial practice, representations of space and spaces of representation by adding patterns of movement and encounters, architectural shapes and forms which mingle with social, cultural and natural cycles as well as affective forces and atmospheres. Those rhythmical elements are all part of any given spatial experience, lending the city its (sociomusical) distinctiveness and therefore shaping the musicians' sense of place in Wellington and Copenhagen. The amalgamation of those two triads into an encompassing rhythmanalytical framework is visualized in figure 2.

Figure 2 Rhythmanalytical Framework

As a way of getting attuned to, capturing, examining and understanding the polyrhythmic environments and atmospheres of Wellington and Copenhagen, this rhythmanalytical framework creatively combines four principal qualitative methods: participant observation, interviews, photo-elicitation, and mapping. Embedded in the phenomenological tradition, each ethnographic method contributes to the capturing of the musician's spatial, social and affective rhythms in a different way. While interviews are slightly better suited to gathering the musician's opinions and knowledge regarding music-making in the city, photo-elicitation offers an effective technique to access the musician's 'inner' rhythms, whereas mapping allows for the depiction of concrete 'pathways' through the city as well as the more abstract visual renderings of affects and atmospheres. However, it is the combination of those methods that enables the uncovering of the multiple narratives of place and creates an understanding of the musician's sense of place in its complexity and multiplicity.

According to Mason (2006), mixing methods encourages the researcher to 'think outside the box', generating different ways of examining and understanding the everyday social world (13). It opens up new perspectives and enables the researcher to analyse data in creative ways (Bagnoli 2009, 568). Latham argues that reframing the research process as creative, performative practice allows for "a more experimental and more flexible attitude towards both the production and interpretation of research evidence" and also suggests "new ways of engaging with how individuals and groups inhabit their worlds" (Latham and McCormack 2009, 1993). The notion of performance deflects the researcher away from "looking for depth in the sense of a single unified truth" and instead directs the analysis towards detail. This metaphor of performance can not only be applied on the research process but resonates with the practice of music-making in particular. As Philip V. Bohlman puts it: "thinking about and experiencing music are basic human practices" (1999, 33). It is for this reason that Christopher Small refers to music as the activity of *musicking* – drawing attention to the multiple materials, meanings, experiences and doings of music. In order to capture this multi-dimensionality of musical practice and experience, it is therefore necessary to "think creatively and multidimensionally about methods" (Mason 2006, 12). Mixing participant observation, interviews, photo-elicitation and mapping therefore has "enormous potential for generating new

ways of understanding the complexities and contexts of social experience, and for enhancing our capacities for social explanation and generalization (10). As such, the rhythm analytical framework presented here provides a unique medley of research methods that encourage the researcher to “think outside the box” and consequently avoid some of the shortcomings and dilemmas inherent to both ethnography and Lefebvre’s rhythm analysis, thereby allowing for more compelling depictions of musical activity in the city. The following sub-sections will give a brief interlude into the use of ethnography in popular music studies, as it constitutes a common research model for the study of (urban) music-making.

4.3 (Performing) ethnography in popular music studies

As a research practice, which was initially developed within social anthropology, ethnography has become a popular methodology across a wide variety of disciplines, including the study of popular music. Traditionally referred to as “the art of writing about people” (Grazian 2004, 197), ethnography places the participant observer centre stage in order to “gather data by participating in the daily life of the group or organization he studies” (Becker 1958, 652). Yet there remains a competing understanding of ethnographic knowing and doing, flexibly adapting and developing a broad range of qualitative methodologies from open-ended interviewing, biographical narrative to visual or digital ethnographic practices. According to Sarah Pink, ethnography extends beyond participant observation and interviews, however. Pink rejects the view of ethnography as simply a tool for data collection and suggests that it is rather a research process allowing not only for the gathering of information but gives rise to the ethnographer’s version of everyday life. Despite the wide variety of ethnographic methods, Pink argues, there are two main approaches of ethnographic knowledge creation. On the one hand, there is an increasing fragmentation of ethnographic research, which causes the privileging of certain approaches and particular types of data. On the other hand, is a growing interest in new ways of doing ethnography, “flexibly adapting and developing new methods and new technologies to new situations, yet retaining a reflexive awareness of the nature of the knowledge produced and of its limits and strengths” (Pink 2009, 125). The latter requires the ethnographer to immerse herself in a chosen social world, but instead of gathering ‘classic’ ethnographic knowledge the aim is to create “deep,

contextual and contingent understandings produced through intensive and collaborative sensory, embodied engagements” (125). In this way, ethnography becomes a corporeal practice, as the researcher learns and knows through her experiencing body. With a special focus on spatial matters, the researcher is encouraged to conceptualize fundamental aspects of how she is situated as an embodied being in the world as “it is at least in part through our own routes and pathways that we are entangled in place-making processes” (Pink 2008, 179). This embodied ethnography accounts for the situatedness of the body in its ethnographic contexts. Pink suggests to further extend this body-mind relationship by taking into account the dynamics between bodies, minds, materiality, and sensoriality of the environment: what she refers to as ‘emplaced ethnography’. The reflexive ethnographer considers therefore not only how research participants are ‘emplaced’ but also acknowledges her own emplacement and the way she affects the constitution of ethnographic places (179).

Some of the pioneering contributions to ethnographic research in music were conducted from the early 1960s by sociologists such as Howard Becker, Robert Faulkner, Stith Bennet, and others. These ethnographic studies developed out of three related paradigms which permeated sociology at that time: symbolic interactionism, the social construction of deviant behaviour, and Everett Hughes’ work on occupations (Grazian). In *Outsiders*, Becker (1963) (who was a student of Hughes) examines the formation of deviant cultures through the ethnographic study of jazz musicians in their everyday urban environment. Inspired by this, Faulkner (1971) explored the work and careers of classically trained freelance musicians who transit from live concert performance to studio recording for Hollywood films and television. Similarly to Becker, Faulkner’s study emphasizes economical as well as emotional challenges that musicians have to face in their everyday lives in an inherently unpredictable field. A student of Becker, Stith Bennett (1980) explored the everyday life of rock musicians, including different parts of their occupational roles and responsibilities such as performance techniques, set programming or instrument acquisition. In this way, ethnographic methods served as a tool for examining “how musicians develop subjectivities within a set of material constraints, commercial demands and professional expectations” (Grazian 2004, 200).

Since the 1990s, the ethnographic study of music has flourished, approaching popular music as a social practice and process (Cohen 1993). Various studies dedicated to popular music such as Bennett, (2000, 2001); Cohen (1991, 1998); Finnegan (1989); Leyshon, Matless, and Revill (1998); Shank (1994); Stokes (1994) reveal the wide-ranging use of ethnography as a valuable methodological tool for the study of musical practices. According to David Grazian, there are three main areas within popular music studies, which have been at the centre of much ethnographic research: gender, globalization and place (1997). As a result of an increasing concern with gender differences in music-making, various ethnographers turned to the examination of women as: 1) active cultural consumers (DeNora 1999) 2); adolescent music consumers (Rosenberg and Garofalo 1998; McRobbie and Garber 1993; Ehrenreich, Hess, and Jacobs 1997; Lowe 2004); and 3) music-makers (Gottlieb and Wald 1994; Reynolds and Press 1996; Schilt 2004; Bayton 1998; Clawson 1999).

In addition to gender, there has been a growing interest in the effects of globalization on local musical cultures. With the emergence of global ‘mediascapes’ (Appadurai 1990), there was a simultaneous diversification and fragmentation of music within various countries all over the globe. Due to the development of more sophisticated global communications technologies, music is now distributed beyond its origins, allowing for niches and sub-cultures to develop ‘new transcontinental sounds’. Following this development, the city took centre stage, as it consists of a “complex structure that can articulate a variety of cross boundary processes and reconstitute them as a partly urban condition” and in this way reveals the consequences and the extent of some of the effects of the ongoing global and technological developments (Sassen 2007, 102). As a result, various musical ethnographies focus on the city as a site of (global) cultural production and analyse the ways in which global processes transform local musical life (Helms and Phleps 2007; Lashua, Spracklen, and Wagg 2014; Kruse 2003; 2010; Holt and Wergin 2013; Shank 1994; Stahl 2011; 2007; Taylor 1997).¹⁹

¹⁹ Since the 1970s there is also a growing body of scholarly work on (urban) soundscapes, the ecology of sound and acoustic/sonic ecologies, examining the effects and affects of sound and noise in (urban) spaces. Including scholars such as Murray Schafer (1977) who defined the term ‘soundscape’, Steven Feld (1996) who questioned the division between ‘human’ sounds and ‘non-human’ sounds and as such broadened the idea of a soundscape,

Lastly, there has been a turn towards spatial concerns in the study of music-making during the last decade, which has encouraged researchers in the field to develop relevant ethnographic methodologies (e.g. Finnegan; Bennett, Cohen, Leyshon, Matless, and Revill; Stokes). Sara Cohen, for example, argues that an ethnographic approach to the study of popular music should focus “upon social relationships, emphasising music as social practice and process” (1993, 123). By directly observing people’s everyday activities, their social interactions, relations and discourses, an ethnographic approach is, according to Cohen, more holistic and inclusive compared to approaches which are overly concerned with textual analysis (such as musicology) or limited to the analysis of historical, economic and technological factors surrounding popular music practice. It is this kind of microsociological detailing that enables the researcher to reveal the nuances of everyday social practices while challenging preconceived notions and assumptions. In this way, Cohen suggests, “ethnography could increase our knowledge of the details of popular music processes and practices” (135).

While Cohen criticized the lack of ethnography in popular music studies ten years ago, it is now a common approach in the field. However, despite its frequent use, most studies fail to provide a profound discussion of the ethnographic method itself, its larger implications and the difficulties associated with it. Those reflections are vital in order to refine and adjust already existing methods as well as encourage the development of new, relevant research strategies, which will enrich the ongoing research on musical and social practice. Despite its valuable use for the study of popular music, ethnography comes with certain difficulties however. As a way of introducing and conceptualizing specific concepts or phenomena in a way that clearly relates them to a certain context, ethnography avoids excessive abstraction

as well as Jonathan Sterne who is interested in the history and theory of sound in the modern west and writes about *Urban Media and the Politics of Sound Space* (2005) or the sounds of shopping malls (1997), Jean-Paul Thibaud (2003) who analyses the sonic composition of the city, Susan Smith (1994, 2000) examines the spatial and temporal ordering of the urban soundscape, Ronal Atkinson (2006) writes about the aural ecology of the city and Brendon LaBelle discusses *Acoustic Territories* (2010). These are only a few examples of research focussing on the texture and qualities of sound in (urban) space, highlighting “an invisible yet highly affecting and socially relevant area of urban enquiry” (Atkinson 2006, 1905).

and theorization. On the other hand, as ethnography tends to stress the particular over the generalizable, it can cause a lack of theoretical rigour and in this way affect the verifiability of the study's results. In response, the following chapter will discuss each ethnographic method in more detail, including their theoretical efficacy, larger implications and difficulties in regards to the examination of Copenhagen and Wellington's musical rhythms. With regard to local music-making in those two cities, this is not to overstate the significance of the research methods and their results. Instead, I want to suggest that this specific research model can open up a variety of research opportunities for the study of (urban) cultural production beyond music-making.

Chapter 5 - The Four Methods

In seeking to understand the sociomusical dynamics underlying music-making in Wellington and Copenhagen, this project is concerned with the social, spatial and affective rhythms that constitute the musicians' everyday life in the city. In order to grasp, understand, and explore these rhythmic patterns and dynamics, the previous chapter introduced a rhythm analytical framework, which draws on the work of Lefebvre and the concept of City Rhythms outlined in Chapter Three. Situated in the context of emplaced ethnography, this rhythm analytical methodology is a response to Morton's critique of ethnographic methodologies, which often neglect the non-cognitive, emotive, embodied and affective aspects of social life. It complements Lefebvre's triadic notion of social space by adding the 'rhythmical triad' composed of social, spatial and affective rhythms that are all part of any given spatial experience, lending the city its sociomusical distinctiveness and therefore shaping the musician's sense of place. To this end, in what follows, I propose a flexible array of methodologies, including participant observation, mapping, photo-elicitation and interviews that allow for a fruitful examination of the complex rhythmic layout in which Wellington's and Copenhagen's music-making each enunciate their uniqueness. The following chapter discusses each research method in more detail, including the rationale behind their choice and the challenges that emerged during their enactment. As such, it will demonstrate the usefulness of the chosen methodologies, as well as how they might best complement one another to provide a thicker description of music-making in Wellington and Copenhagen.

5.1 (Participant-) observation

The diurnal pace of urban life varies within and between cities, with their hectic rush hours, quiescent mid-afternoons, vibrant early evenings and low-key nights. Superimposed upon, intersecting with and achieved through these paces and measures are the habits of individuals, their body rhythms, seasonal and 'natural' rhythms, broader institutional rhythms of media and officialdom and the continual but varied pulse of water and electricity supply. (Edensor and Holloway 2008, 484)

This multitude of rhythmical combinations and constellations constitutes the main object of analysis in Lefebvre's rhythm analytical project. In order to grasp the rhythmic mixture of urban life, Lefebvre argues "it is necessary to situate oneself

simultaneously inside and outside” (2004, 27). As we saw in Chapter Four, he creates this perspective looking out of his apartment window, which allows him to closely observe “the whole of Paris, ancient and modern, traditional and creative, active and lazy”, yet from a noticeable distance (28). From there, he can see cyclical rhythms “of large and simple intervals” in interaction with the linear, the “livelier, alternating rhythms” which “animate the street and the neighbourhood” (30). In this way, participant observation resembles a metaphorical window through which the ‘observer’ can gain an ‘outside’ perspective of the city’s urban rhythms, its materiality, mobility and sociality including social interactions between people and interactions between people and their surrounding urban environment. Unlike Lefebvre’s rhythmanalysis however, the observations conducted for this study are not limited to the linear and the cyclical but extend to the affective relations within and between those rhythms, which allows for a more extensive examination of the city including the charged atmospheres and affective intensities surrounding the musicians in those urban spaces. The ‘outside’ perspective of the field, including its multiple atmospheres and rhythms was one part of the (participant-) observation which occurred primarily as a result of an inevitable movement across the city. As I was regularly cycling and walking between various performance spaces and interview locations, between different cafés, bars and frequently the musicians’ homes, I continually explored new places around the city. Those mundane walks or bike journeys facilitated a kind of “embodied material and sociable ‘dwelling-in-motion’”, as particular rhythms of walking or cycling spur certain ways of thinking and reflecting that enfold body, place and movement (Edensor 2010, 70). This dwelling in motion allowed me to explore unfamiliar terrain, and in this way get attuned to Wellington’s and Copenhagen’s particular atmospheres and rhythms, which in turn determine the city’s unique sociomusical experience. This ‘outside’ perspective resonates with the demeanour of the nineteenth century *flâneur*, who “lets associations and memories flow through him which are stimulated by the distractions and impressions of the moment” (Featherstone 1998, 915). In this way, the rhythmanalyst resembles the *flâneur* observing and experiencing urban spaces through the detached movement across the city, which allows for “a particular experiential flow of successive moments of detachment and attachment, physical immersion and mental wandering, memory, recognition and strangeness [...]” (Edensor 2010, 70).

This movement is a bodily labour which produces a “shifting mood, tenor, colour or intensity of places and situation” in which “self and world overlap in a ductile and incessant enfolding and unfolding” (Wylie 2005, 236–240). Walking or cycling through Wellington and Copenhagen allowed me to drift in a state between self-awareness and awareness of the surroundings, gathering sensual and mental impressions that facilitated the mapping out of those two urban spaces. In this way, I could become attuned to the city’s urban rhythms, which was vital in order to understand and analyse the musicians’ sociomusical experiences of Wellington and Copenhagen.

However, this ‘outside’ perspective is not sufficient in order to fully comprehend how the particular sociomusical experience of the city is created and understood by its individual members. As Wunderlich reminds us: “notions of rhythms differ subjectively according to individuals’ personal interests, activities and expertise in their daily lives” (2008a, 93). For this reason it is vital that the rhythm analyst pays analytic attention to the subjectivity of the rhythmic unfoldings of a certain place. Instead of limiting the analysis to the rhythm analyst’s experiences and observations in the field, the researcher has to get attuned to the music-makers ‘inside’ perspective, uncovering their individual rhythms, valences, moods and atmospheres. Participant observation is the first step in order for the researcher to gain access to the ‘inside’ lives and works of the participants. This process requires the rhythm analyst to be a detached observer, on the one hand, watching activities “which unfold in front of the researcher as if she/he wasn’t there”. On the other, the researcher is required to immerse herself “into the everyday rhythms and routines of the community, a development of relationships with people who can show and tell the researcher what is ‘going on’ there and, through this, an experience of a whole range of relationships and emotional states that such a process must inevitably involve” (Crang and Cook 2007, 37).

In order to achieve the ‘outside’ as well as the ‘inside’ perspective, I conducted participant observation in Wellington’s music scene between the months of April 2013 and March 2014, followed by a fieldtrip to Copenhagen in April 2014 where I explored the sociomusical dynamics until early November 2014. Even though I spent

less time in Copenhagen than in Wellington, I used those months intensely in order to perform a productive and exhaustive rhythmanalysis.

In both places I tried not to live as a visitor but actively immersed myself in the city's urban rhythms, following the daily schedule of the city-dwellers as much as I could. Consequently, I developed my own routes and routines, which included the usual bike-ride to work in the morning, lunch at the local bakery in the afternoon and the frequent night-life exploration in the evening. This allowed me not only to gather local knowledge of the areas but made it possible for me to create a foundation from which I could understand and analyse the musician's opinions, reactions and visual material in a different way than otherwise.

Hence, in both cities I spent a considerable time observing the musicians' performances in various indoor and outdoor venues around the city. On the one hand, I took an 'inside' perspective, participating as part of the audience, mingling with the crowd, chatting with the musicians, dancing, immersing myself in the social, spatial and affective rhythms of the event. On the other hand, I acted as a detached observer, taking an 'outside' perspective as I was sitting in the back of the room, sensing the atmosphere, watching the verbal and non-verbal interactions between musicians and between musicians and their audience as well as the way both groups interacted with their material surroundings. I recorded those experiences and encounters in a research diary in order to recollect and reflect upon them at a later stage. During this process of reflection it is vital to recognise the situatedness of knowledge as "we are all caught up in a web of contexts [...] that shape our capacity to tell the story of others" (Ley and Mountz 2001, 235). It is through such reflexivity that "false neutrality and universality of so much of academic knowledge" can be avoided (Rose 1997, 306). For this reason, I aimed at producing a 'transparent self' during the research process, which "looks outward, to understand its place in the world, to chart its position in the arenas of knowledge production, to see its own place in the relations of power" (309). This transparency implied that I had to be prepared to openly discuss my position as a researcher during the (participant-) observation in the 'field' at any point in time. If someone questioned what I was doing, I gave them a verbal description of the research process and its aims, which frequently led to fruitful discussions about their

own opinions on the topic. Those conversations were partially recorded in my research diary in order to recall them at a later stage.

5.2 Interviews

In addition to participant observation, semi-structured (semi-standardised) interviews were conducted in order to gain insight into the musicians' experiences, understandings and interpretations of their everyday urban rhythms. The defining characteristic of semi-standardised interviews is their flexible and fluid structure, which allows the interviewer to guide the conversation in an effective way without being bound to a sequenced script of standardized questions to be asked in the same way during each interview. In this way, unexpected themes can emerge and the interviewees get plenty of opportunities to tell their story in their own way. This contrasts with a more standardized and structured approach which might impose the researcher's own framework of meaning onto the consequent data (Lewis-Beck, Bryman, and Liao 2003, 1020). Rather than a simple 'question-answer' procedure, semi-structured interviews generate information through the interaction between interviewer and interviewee. This allows both the interviewer and the interviewee to be active and reflexive participants in the process of knowledge creation. The information generated during those interviews is also recognized as "very personal and sensitive especially where they have emerged in a relationship of trust and close rapport between interviewer and interviewee" (Lewis-Beck, Bryman, and Liao 2003, 1020).

For the purpose of this study, semi-structured interviews were conducted in order to provide the opportunity for the musicians to verbally express their personal thoughts and opinion regarding music-making in Wellington and Copenhagen, as well as reflect upon their individual place experiences. The interviews allowed for the exploration of contextual and relational aspects, which are vital in order to understand the musicians' sense of place in those two urban spaces. It is important to note that both researcher and respondents "speak to each other not from stable and coherent standpoints, but from varied perspectives", including their historically grounded roles and hierarchies of their society as well as their gender, race and class (Warren 2001, 83). One crucial aspect in the course of the current project was my German

background. Being a foreigner in both cities allowed me on the one hand to gain an ‘outsider’ perspective which “draws our attention to the unusual and strange that over time we will neglect to see” (O’Reilly 2009, 110). On the other hand, however, it implied a language challenge in both places, as I was not able to communicate in my native tongue. All interviews were conducted in English, which meant that the Danish musicians did not speak in their native language either. Like in most parts of Scandinavia, a large majority of Danes are fluent in English, however, as it is mandatory for students to learn the language from the first grade in Folkeskole (public school). Even though each of the musicians confirmed that talking in English would not be an issue, it needs to be considered during the analysis of the interviews.

The interviews were performed in different locations around town such as cafés, bars or sometimes the musicians’ homes. They usually lasted between sixty and ninety minutes including the preceding mapping exercise. I used my mobile phone and computer to record the conversations, which allowed me to bring back the interview situation long after it had taken place. Furthermore, an interview schedule was designed providing key questions, in order to keep the momentum and common theme throughout the interview process. After asking the musicians for basic demographic details, I continued the conversation with an open-ended question about their musical ‘background’, which allowed me to break the ice and establish a rapport. We continued to talk about their experiences and thoughts on the local music scene, their favourite places in the city, their private and professional social network as well as their movement through space on a local and global scale. Most interviews developed nicely and felt like a natural exploratory conversation.

5.3 Photo-elicitation

All these different sorts of technologies and images offer views of the world: they render the world in visual terms. But this rendering, even by photographs, is never innocent. These images are never transparent windows onto the world. They interpret the world: they display it in very particular ways (Rose 2012, 2).

Visual research methods have utilized in the social sciences since for many years, providing ways of “doing research that generate and employ visual material as an integral part of the research process, whether as a form of data, a means of generating

further data, or a means of representing ‘results’” (Knowles and Sweetman 2004, 5). This interest in the visual is partly due to a shift in the “subtle shading of the intellectual micro-climates” known as the ‘reflexive turn’ in social investigation (5).²⁰ As a result of this recent movement, the main sources of social knowing, such as auto/biography, human interaction, ethnography, performance, every day life, and concern with space have been reworked creating a “renewed enchantment among social research with people and places” (2). In order to better understand and analyse people and places in particular, researchers engaged increasingly with visual strategies as a means to impart what they *see* in more than only words (2). This new openness to the visual rejects the idea that the written word is a superior medium of ethnographic research and argues for the incorporation of visual images and technologies as “an equally meaningful element of ethnographic work” (Pink 2007, 6). Both writing and picturing the social world implies an interpretation and reformulation of everyday life. In this way, “visualizing the social world [...] is just like social theory itself. Both seeing and social theory are acts of interpretation: selection, abstraction and transformation (Jenks 1995, 4,8). Both are socially constructed and culturally located” (Jenks 1995, 210 as cited in Knowles and Sweetman 2004, 2). Against this backdrop, the visual has become increasingly central in ethnography as an approach that “seeks to recognise the interwovenness of socialities, object, texts, images and technologies in people’s everyday lives and identities and as part of the wider environments in which they live, move through and sense” (Pink 2013, 17–18). Thus, while images should not replace words as the main research method, they may complement one another as “different types of ethnographic knowledge that may be experienced and represented in a range of different textual, visual and other sensory ways” (Pink 2007, 6).

In order to understand how images and the processes through which they are created are used to produce ethnographic knowledge, it is vital to expose the theoretical underpinnings of visual research methods. As Rose (2012) reminds us in the introductory quote: “images are never transparent windows onto the world” (2). They

²⁰ The reflexive turn refers to a movement that began in the early 1980s and lead to a change of perspective affecting many social sciences, especially social anthropology and its main method, ethnography. Reflexive ethnographies aimed at translating cultural differences by representing their effects on the researcher. They questioned if it was possible to create an objective study of a culture when their own epistemologies and biases were inherently involved.

are always embedded in a social context and therefore only comprehensible when this embedding is taken into account. According to Knowles and Sweetman (2004) there are three key theoretical approaches to visual images within social research: the realist paradigm, the poststructuralist perspective and semiotics (5-6). Under the *realist paradigm* images are regarded as ‘second-hand observation’ which raises the problematic assumption that “reality is visible, observable and recordable in video or photography” (Pink 2007, 31). However, Pink reminds us that “just because something appears to be visible, this does not necessarily mean it is true” (32). Moreover, visual images will be interpreted differently as different people apply their own subjective knowledge. Rather than being a passive observer, the spectator is actively involved in the process of constructing photographic meaning, participating in a dynamic interaction between the photographer, the image and the viewer. This process illustrates the “polysemic” nature of the photograph which, as Roland Barthes (1977) argues, allows for multiple meanings to arise during the viewing process. By this token, Pink points out “just as reality is not solely visible or observable, images have no fixed or single meanings and are not capable of capturing an objective reality” (2007, 36). Realist uses of the visual in ethnography should therefore be qualified by a reflexive awareness, questioning the motive behind such uses including their limitations regarding the representation of truth (33).

The realist approach was critiqued by the *poststructuralist stance*, which argues that images actually help to construct reality: “they operate as part of a regime of truth, while performing a central role in the surveillance and management of individuals and populations” (Knowles and Sweetman 2004, 5). Images as such are not understood as having a static identity or an inherent meaning as they are entirely dependent on the context and discourse within which they are located. Nevertheless, they bear some relationship to ‘reality’ as their meaning is constructed through individual subjectivity and interpretation. The English critic John Tagg advocates this perspective in his writing about photography:

Photography as such has no identity. Its status as a technology varies with the power relations which invest it. Its nature as a practice depends on the institutions and agents which define it and set it to work. Its function as a mode of cultural production is tied to definite conditions of existence, and its products are meaningful and legible only within the particular currencies they have. Its history has no unity. It is a flickering across a field of institutional spaces. It is this field we must study, not photography as such (1988, 63).

From this point of view, photographs have no single true meaning but are indistinguishable from the discourses and institutions that make use of it. The value and meaning of any photograph is therefore largely determined by its relationship to other, more powerful social practices (Batchen 1997, 6).

The third key paradigm, *semiotics* (an approach that draws on the works of Roland Barthes, Ferdinand de Saussure, Charles Sanders Pierce, Claude Lévi-Strauss i.a.) provides a “highly refined set of concepts that produce detailed accounts of the exact ways the meanings of an image are produced through that image” (Rose 2012, 106). This approach is very influential across a whole range of disciplines interested in the study of visual culture. It regards already-existing images as texts, which can be read in order to expose their wider social effects of meaning, including ideological messages and meanings. A central concern of semiotics is therefore the construction of social difference through images – or systems of signs more generally. As an approach concerned with ‘the study of signs’ it offers in this way a wide variety of analytical tools and a rich vocabulary for understanding how images relate to and produce cultural meaning.

This brief sketch of different theoretical approaches to the interpretation of images illustrates the complex nature of visuals in ethnographic research and forms the backdrop against which the following part of this chapter is set. The main argument here is that visual imagery is never innocent – it is always constructed through various knowledges, technologies and practices (Rose 2012, 17). My own approach does not fit neatly into any one of these theoretical frameworks, as it is not so much the status of the image that is of concern but the analytic and conceptual possibilities in regards to the present research process. In this way, the focus here lies not so much on the theoretical status of the image but the individual comments of the research subjects regarding the meaning of their own photographs: “it is what they *make* of the images that counts” (Knowles and Sweetman 2004, 6).

A photograph never captures neutrally, “as it is made at the same time it is constructed” (Cele 2006, 152). Consequently, the image reveals details about the relationship between the photographer and the subject or place being photographed.

Even though the image reproduces an objective physical reality, it is never free from the photographer's eye and subjectivity (151). The musician's way of looking at the world is therefore reflected in their choice of motif and perspective, which shifts the focus of attention from the image itself to the subjectivity of the photographer. Why did he/she choose that motif in a certain angle at a certain time? The photograph holds many questions. Perhaps the choice of motif is solely based on artistic decisions? As Cele reminds us: "the answer is probably somewhere in the middle" (152). Therefore, the image is neither a window to the world, nor is it a romantic aesthetic expression of the photographer. It constitutes "a trace, but how that trace is visually presented is the result of many subjective and often aesthetic decisions" (152). In this way, photographs bring to light complex subjective processes in an extraordinarily objective form (Grady 2004, 18).

As a solution to the problematic relationship between photographer and subject, John Collier introduced *photo-elicitation*, a visual research methodology "based on the simple idea of inserting a photograph into a research interview" (Harper 2002, 13). In this process, respondents are asked to take photographs of their everyday life which are later discussed together with the researcher in order to explore the subjective meanings behind those images (Croghan et al. 2008, 346). As the participants elaborate on the content and meaning of the photographs, "a dialogue is created in which the typical research roles are reversed. The researcher becomes a listener and one who encourages the dialogue to continue" (Harper and Prosser 1998, 35). In this way, the polysemic quality of the image is acknowledged, allowing for "different observers to interpret their contents according to their identity of views, native knowledge and ethos, and to actively discuss and exchange the personal values and meanings that these subjects might have for them" (Collier and Collier 1986, 103–108).

Harper argues that photographs allow the individual to access different parts of their consciousness, areas, that words do not (2002, 13). They can "reveal what is hidden in the inner mechanisms of the ordinary and the taken for granted" (Knowles and Sweetman 2004, 7). Taking photographs of their everyday life prompts the participants therefore to reflect on their daily activities in an unusual way: "it gives

them a distance from what they are usually immersed in and allows them to articulate thoughts and feelings that usually remain implicit” (Rose 2014, 28). As those participant-generated photographs are discussed during the elicitation interview, respondents are “jolt(ed) into a new awareness of their social existence” which is particularly helpful in re-framing their taken-for-granted experiences (Harper 2002, 21). In this way, interviews with images might lead the conversation in a rather different direction: “more emotional, more affective, more ‘ineffable’” (Bagnoli 2009, 548).

It is this ability of photographs to elicit the emotive, embodied and affective intensities beyond talk that is particularly valuable for the purpose of this research. Here I want to draw on Henri Bergson's (1988) claim that an image has a “certain existence which is more than that which the idealist calls a representation, but less than that which the realist calls a thing” (9). In this way, images are not only matter but they are perceptions at the same time.²¹ Yet they are never just a “representational snapshot” nor are they a “material thing reducible to brute object-ness”. Rather, images can be understood as “resonant blocks of space-time: they have duration, even if they appear still [...]. They are blocks of sensation with an affective intensity and make sense not just because we take time to figure out what they signify, but also because their pre-signifying affective materiality is felt in bodies” (Latham and McCormack 2009, 253).

By the same token, Latham and McCormack argue that if an image is a certain existence somewhere between a representation and a thing, so also is a rhythm (260). The relation between image and rhythm is therefore not one involving a relation between object and representation. Consequently, those participant-generated photographs may be useful in displaying valences, moods, sensations and tempos of the “affective force fields” surrounding the musicians in their urban space (Stewart 2011). Instead of providing quantitative content for tables, charts or diagrams, such images can ‘capture or expose’ the dynamism of embodied movement and the ‘affective tonalities’ present in certain moments and places. In this way, photographs

²¹ For Bergson, matter refers to “an aggregate of images” external to the body, while perceptions (of matter) are “these same images referred to the eventual action of one particular image, my body” (22). Perception is therefore a process that involves the relation between the image system of matter and the image system of the body.

can not only convey “the feel of urban places, spaces and landscapes” but capture “something of the sensory richness and human inhabitation of urban environments” (Rose 2012, 298). Even though the use of images as part of the present rhythmanalytical methodology might not “necessarily fully capture or evoke such rhythms and their qualities” (Simpson 2012, 425), they will certainly provide techniques for thinking through the complex and multi-faceted array of everyday life rhythms and atmospheres in the two urban spaces of Wellington and Copenhagen (Latham and McCormack 2009, 256). Participant-generated photographs will therefore facilitate the development of another way of looking, a means of “unfixing and altering the perspective” and so provide insight into the musician’s sense of place (Simpson 2012, 431).

Numerous social scientists have used photo-elicitation since it was introduced by anthropologist John Collier in 1967. Douglas Harper published a valuable review and history of the method in 2002, in which he presents three main uses of the photographs produced during photo-elicitation. First, photographs are used as “visual inventories, of objects, people and artefacts” (2002, 13). Second, images depict “events that are a part of collective or institutional pasts” such as “photos of work, schools or other institutional experiences, or images depicting events that occurred earlier in the lifetimes of the subjects” (13). Lastly, he suggests that photographs “portray the intimate dimension of the social – family or the intimate social group, or one’s own body” (13). Harper further discusses practical considerations involving the method and concludes that photo-elicitation “enlarges the possibilities of conventional empirical research” (13).

In her study on inner-city childhood in Los Angeles, Clark-Ibanez (2004) used photo-elicitation as supplement to ethnography and as a stand-alone methodology. The children’s photographs offered a “rich perspective of ‘growing up poor’ from the kids’ own visual and verbal expression” and in this way revealed “more intimate and reflexive aspects of what we consider a middle-class childhood” (1519). Clark-Ibanez concludes therefore that photo-elicitation illuminates “dynamics and insights not otherwise found through other methodological approaches” (1524).

The majority of studies use photo-elicitation in combination with other research methodologies, such as Sofia Cele (2006) who used photo-elicitation, walks, drawings and interviews in order to explore children's experiences of places in Sweden and England. Cele argues that the children's place-experiences are multi-dimensional, consisting of 'concrete' and 'abstract' processes, places and objects. Concrete aspects refer to the physical appearance of a place including present people, objects, sounds or smells. Abstract aspects refer to the inner processes a place recalls within an individual such as memories, dreams, imaginations and feelings. Photography as a "place-interactive and creative method" allowed the children to provide rich evidence of those abstract and concrete experiences of place (2006, 171).

A further example is provided by Alan Latham (2003), who uses both written and photographic research diaries in order to examine the ways in which urban places "become through the sensuous interweaving of the lives and daily projects of the thousands of individuals who daily dwell in them" (2001). By means of photography, Latham aims at drawing "more directly on people's visual imaginations" in order to capture the embodied, non-cognitive routines that constitute the individual's everyday urban experiences (2003). Consequently, Latham calls for a broadminded openness to methodological experimentation and pluralism in order to allow for a more dynamic and more empirically engaging style of research. In a later study Latham and McCormack discuss the participation of photographs in the "thinking-spaces of urban fieldwork" (2009, 252). After providing their students with digital cameras, they were advised to explore the urban everyday life, including those elements that "give the city its distinctive atmosphere and feel" (253). In this way, the students could experience the ways in which images "afford opportunities for attending to everyday ecologies of materials and things; for thinking through the rhythms of urban environments; and for producing affective archives" (253).

So what might photo-elicitation bring to research on urban music-making? The original motivation for the use of photo-elicitation as a visual research methodology in the course of this project arose from the first preliminary interviews with music-makers in Wellington. During the conversation I asked the participants about inspiring places in the city and their feelings towards these locations. However, the

question appeared to be too complex or simply overwhelming, as the musicians struggled with their responses. Asking about certain ‘places of inspiration’ triggered the musician’s non-cognitive, emotive and affective relation to place, which is difficult to grasp and put into words (especially in the process of a face-to-face interview). As Anderson reminds us:

The development of an explicit vocabulary of affect and emotion begins from the assertion that the more-than or less-than rational cannot be reduced to a range of discreet, internally coherent, emotions which are self-identical with the mind of an individual (2006, 735).

For this reason, I decided to give the musicians disposable cameras, which facilitated the capturing of any moment, atmosphere or ambience in a snapshot without the need to fully understand and articulate the particular affects at play. The photographs allowed the musicians therefore to get attuned to and record the complex rhythmical pattern constituting music-making in Wellington and Copenhagen.

Conducting photo-elicitation with musicians from Wellington and Copenhagen was a rather time consuming endeavour as it involved a first meeting with all participants for an initial briefing, a second meeting to collect the camera, the development of the photos, another interview to discuss each participant’s photographs, the chasing up of those musicians who did not return their camera, and the transcription of the interviews as well as the following analysis of both interviews and photographs. Furthermore there was the organization and purchase of forty single-use cameras with a maximum of twenty-four photographs each. The reason for the use of disposable cameras is, on the one hand, their simple handling and relatively low purchase costs (in case they got lost or damaged they could be replaced). On the other hand, the unique qualities ascribed to analogue images differ considerably from the nature of digital photographs. The process of creating analogue images requires a “one-to-one-correspondence to what they are recording,” which involves a direct, physical relationship of the image to a continuous pattern of light generated by the actual object (Rose 2012, 5). Digital images on the other hand do not have this one-to-one correspondence with the object they record. During the process of releasing the shutter, the light reflected by the object is converted into a binary digital code by the camera’s software. This computer code can then be used to produce various outcomes. As Sean Cubitt remarks:

From the standpoint of the computer, any input will always appear as mathematical, and any data can be output in any format. Effectively, an audio input can be output as a video image, as text, as a 3D model, as an instruction set for a manufacturing process, or another digital format that can be attached to the computer (2006, 250).

The digital code is therefore more susceptible to manipulation, which implies that once a photograph is in digital form, its components can be modified, rearranged, deleted and extended before it is printed. Hence, what can be seen as 'creative freedom' on the one hand might appear as 'manipulation' or 'framing' of everyday life in the process of social science research on the other. Against this backdrop, I chose to use analogue cameras for the purpose of this study. In this way, the process of 'taking a photograph' would be limited to the basic functionality of the disposable camera (releasing the shutter and/or using the flash) without the possibility of framing or modifying the image by applying filters or cropping it, which would radically alter the perspective of a certain photographic event. This allowed the participants to focus on the present moment, which could readily be captured by simply pressing the shutter release button. The focus of the image lies therefore on the photographic event and the pre-signifying affective materiality of the situation instead of its aesthetic representation. Furthermore the disposable cameras were limited to twenty-four images each, which encouraged the musicians to reflect on the motif before taking the photograph (as opposed to having the possibility to take endless amounts of images which can easily be deleted in the case of digital cameras). On the other hand, twenty-four images is a reasonable number to provide the necessary leeway for the musicians to compose a comprehensive 'photographic insight' into their musical environment.

Yet analogue photography does not come without its difficulties. One of the key issues I had to face during the research process was the loss of photographs which was either caused by a technical defect of the camera or difficulties during the photographic process (poor lighting condition, too much movement). Hence it appeared that during the photo-elicitation interview some musicians noticed that photographs were missing or they had difficulties to identify certain photographic events, as the image was too dark or blurred. The major issue on the part of the musicians was however, to remember taking the disposable camera along, as it was an additional object, which was usually not part of their daily routes and routines. Several musicians admitted that they frequently forgot to bring the camera to certain

events and places which they thought were of importance. Yet they could mostly remember those ‘missing moments’ rather clearly during the elicitation interview, which provided some additional details and topics of conversation.

It was this ‘moveable’ nature of the disposable camera, however, that allowed for the capturing of the multiple urban rhythms, which constitute the musicians’ everyday life across Wellington and Copenhagen. The produced images show different people, places, objects, events, interactions, atmospheres, fluxes and flows around the city. Moreover, those participant generated photographs elicit the non-verbal, non-cognitive, emotive, embodied and affective rhythms of the musician’s everyday life that usually remain implicit. In this way, photo-elicitation facilitated the uncovering of key atmospheres and rhythms, indicating their quality, intensity and combination in a way which might have not been possible in a talk-only interview. Consequently, photo-elicitation proves to be a fruitful technique allowing the musicians to get attuned to their rhythmical environment and encourage them to reflect on their individual relationship to music-making in the city.

5.4 Mapping

At every instant, there is more than the eye can see, more than the ear can hear, a setting or a view waiting to be explored. Nothing is experienced by itself, but always in relation to its surroundings, the sequences of events leading up to it, the memory of past experiences. Washington Street set in a farmer’s field might look like the shopping street in the heart of Boston, and yet it would seem utterly different. Every citizen has had long associations with some part of his city, and his image is soaked in memories and meanings (Lynch 1960, 2).

Originally, maps are used and thought of as a directional tool and a graphic means of representing (urban) spaces that are tied to specific conventions of scale, scope, symbol, and legend. Since the early 1960s, maps have been used in a collection of spatial research, expanding their purpose as an orientation device into an powerful mode of visual research that offers a means for representing “social, personal and psychological connections to place; social connections among people and places, and even connections among ideas” (Powell 2010, 1). In his pioneering book *The Image of the City* (1960), Kevin Lynch introduced *mental mapping* as a methodological tool to analyse the relationship of people to places. Lynch outlines in detail the function of

cognitive geography, as it emphasizes the intersection of geographical settings with human action and in this way provides a means to understand the way people perceive, inhabit and move around in the urban landscape. According to Lynch, mental maps are (mental) images of the exterior physical world, which individuals create in the process of orientation and way-finding. They are “the product both of immediate sensation and of the memory of past experience, and [they are] used to interpret information and to guide action” (1960, 4). In this way, mental maps provide individuals with a framework for communication and conceptual organization, allowing for a sense of emotional security to develop which plays an important role in forming an individual’s sense of place. Every person includes different urban experiences, appreciations and values in their personal mental map, which creates an individual connection to that person’s life or lifestyle (Sulsters 2005, 2). In addition to the personal experiences, mental maps are informed by the geographical outline of the area in general. Lynch identified five general “building blocks” around which his respondents drew their personal image of the city: paths, edges, districts, nodes and landmarks. The most significant of these five elements are paths, as they organize the movement of people through urban spaces.

Lynch’s work has been subjected to many criticisms and modifications including a rejoinder offered by Fredric Jameson (1991) who criticizes the absence “of any conception of political agency or historical process” in Lynch’s study (414). Even though Jameson draws upon the concept of mental mapping, he considers the maps not as a representation of the individual’s relation to an urban space but as their relation to an entire social system, meaning the “social and global totality we all carry around in our heads in variously garbled forms” (414). Jameson adds to Lynch’s model an Althusserian understanding of ideology as “the representation of the subject’s imaginary relationship to his or her real conditions of existence”, which allows him to connect the mapping function to the social experience of place (Althusser 2001, 109).

A mental map’s function is therefore “to enable a situational representation on the part of the individual subject to that vaster and properly unrepresentable totality which is the ensemble of society’s structure as a whole” (Jameson 1991, 50). In that

sense, Jameson expands Lynch's city model to a more global terrain, adding the notion that subjectivity is formed in relation to a spatialized conception of ideology. Therefore, just as one constructs a mental map of an urban space in order to have a sense of direction and agency, one requires a mental map of social space to develop a sense of 'direction' and agency in the world more generally. However, in their way of using mental maps as a tool for understanding either the built or the social environment, both scholars fail to account for the individual's affective connection to place. That is

we develop our sense of our environments through purposive activity in the world, and we always bring with us a range of intentions, beliefs, desire, moods, and affective attachments to this activity. Hence our spatial environments are inevitably imbued with the feelings we have about the places we are going, the things that happen to us along the way, and the people we meet, and these emotional valences, of course, affect how we create itineraries (Flatley 2008, 77).

It is for this reason that John-David Dewsbury calls for an "attending to difference" – a recording of "those imperceptible, sometimes minor, and yet gathering, differences that script the world in academically less familiar but in no less real ways" (2003, 1907). In other words, he refers to the "folded mix of our emotions, desires, and intuitions within the aura of places, the communication of things and spaces, and the spirit of events" (1907). Those sensibilities and forces move beyond the visible and graspable texture of social spaces as they leave traces of presence "that map out a world that we come to know without thinking" (1907). The act of creating a mental map can draw attention to the entangled relationship between social, visual, material and affective experiences of place as the participants "delve below surface responses to obtain true feelings, meanings or motivations" (McDaniel and Gates 1995, 152).

In this way, mapping can be a means of 'disentangling', structuring, or interpreting those complex sets of information allowing for new perspectives to arise. According to Powell (2010), mental maps have the ability "to evoke the senses", and in this way "highlight the involuted relationships between self and place and the ways in which self and place are mutually constitute and relational" (15). The content of mental maps can therefore consist of various elements which are not recalled for their physical presence per se but because they are "used, valued or in some way meaningful" (Pocock 1979, 284). Besides the obviously visible, structural elements, mental maps can therefore include the intangible and affective responses

corresponding with the individual experiences of the respondents in their everyday urban environment. In this way, mental maps have the potential of portraying the way we sense and make sense of the world and therefore facilitate the (re)presentation of multisensory, lived experiences of urban places in a non-linear way (284). For this reason, Tuan (1977) suggests that mapping a social space might be more valuable than describing it verbally:

One can [...] try to describe the route and the nature of the terrain verbally, but this is always difficult for language is better suited to the narration of events than to the depiction of simultaneous spatial relations (77).

By the same token Thrift (2000) argues that the (over)use of words as primary form of representation underplays emotions and expressions that are deeply ingrained in a more non-rational and non-conceptual form of communication. Our everyday experiences are comprised of a multiplicity of dimension, including the sensory and the visual which are “worthy of investigation but cannot always be easily expressed in words, since not all knowledge is reducible to language” (Eisner 2008 quoted in Bagnoli 2009, 547). For this reason, it is beneficial to include a non-linguistic dimension in this research project, which provides access to the multiple narratives of place and allows for a profound understanding of the diverse sociospatial experiences of music-making in Wellington and Copenhagen.

In order to get some sense of how music-making is conceived of spatially, in non-narrative form, the musicians were asked to draw a map of ‘their personal Wellington’ or ‘their personal Copenhagen’. The instructions were kept as broad as possible in order to give the respondents the utmost freedom of choice and expression. The possibility to express themselves creatively is one of the greatest strength of mental mapping (Trell and van Hoven 2010, 95). Even though there is no direct interaction between the places, objects, events and the participants, mental mapping “allows for more creativity and freedom to express oneself with less influence from the researcher” (95). This creative freedom on the side of the music-makers allowed me to collect a variety of rhythmical patterns and perspectives, which provided insight into the musicians’ unique sociospatial relation to music-making in Wellington and Copenhagen. The variety of visual expressions provided by those individual drawings resonates with the complex array of everyday life rhythms including the music-maker’s quotidian routines habits and schedules, rhythms of

mobility and immobility as well as non-human rhythms such as affect, energies, flora and fauna which are all part of the polyrhythmic ensembles underlying the musician's unique sense of place. In the course of analysing those rhythmical drawings, Pocock suggests to consider mental maps rather as "suggestions" than "statements" as they are "the creation of artists rather than the construction of scientists" (1979, 284). The content of the maps should therefore not be interpreted with "an over-precise, humourless exactitude" (284). As Pocock elaborates:

Perhaps a more appropriate analogy is to compare mental mappers with cartoonists, for whom truth - the essence of the depicted - is encapsulated in a few, exaggerated strokes of the pen. Being individual creations the strokes of the mapper pen are also a continual reminder that the image is a function of the interaction between environment and the individual (1979, 285–284).

Those graphic representations of the musician's urban surroundings must therefore be 'read' as incomplete renderings. As Halseth and Doddridge remind us: "just as the 'real world' cannot possibly be reproduced on the map sheet, so too the complexity of images and senses stored in our memories cannot possibly all be rendered onto paper for the external observer to 'read'" (2000, 568). Even though there are limitations in such renderings the activity of drawing allows the participants to reflect on the issue being explored providing access to different kinds of knowledge including the multisensory and embodied experience of place. Mental maps are therefore not only orientation techniques for the music-makers through which they organize their image of the city both spatially and temporally. They are also indicators of subjective experiences, affects, and sensations, "uncovering realities previously unseen or unimagined, even across seemingly exhausted grounds" (Corner 2011, 213). In this way, mental maps allow the exploration of individual experiences that might otherwise have not been consciously noticed. This uncovering of the unconscious adds another dimension to the research process and identifies mapping as a powerful mode of visual research. As Deleuze and Guattari note:

The map does not reproduce an unconscious closed in upon itself; it constructs the unconscious. It fosters connections between fields, the removal of blockages on bodies without organs, the maximum opening of bodies without organs onto a plane of consistency (1988, 12).

In order to fully grasp the conscious and unconscious dimension of mental mapping it is vital for the (visual) analyst to be attentive to the participants' different responses during the mapping process and during a detailed post-mapping discussion, in which

each individual can review the important dimensions of experience from their own perspective. Especially if a participant felt self-conscious about their drawing abilities or insecure in the way they should approach the mapping task, it was essential to take time to guide them through the process, reassuring them that their drawing skills would not affect the result and that there is ‘no right or wrong’ way of drawing the map. This pre-mapping conversation was vital in order for the musicians to freely express themselves and engage in the process of visualizing their personal place experiences in Wellington/Copenhagen. The crafting of maps as well as the analysis of the music-maker’s individual drawings should therefore not be allowed to rest solely upon the process of mental mapping – the accompanying verbal exchange is perhaps their most telling feature.

As part of an interactive conversation, the musicians’ mental maps provide idiosyncratic outlines of their sociomusical experiences in each city, illuminating its soft infrastructure, which comprises personal rhythms, social relations and atmospheres as well as the city’s hard infrastructure including various sites such as domestic spaces, rehearsal spaces and performance spaces. The selective content and the information about the meaning of those details on the map are entirely based upon the musicians’ views of the relative importance of those elements in their everyday life. In this way, mental mapping “can trigger spontaneous discussions about daily places, activities, and people with whom the respondents spend time” (Trell and van Hoven 2010, 95).

The use of mental mapping for the purpose of this study was motivated by the desire to sense out the multiple rhythms, valences, moods and affects constituting the music-makers’ sense of place. It served as a tool in order to mediate the awkwardness of talking to ‘strangers’ about personal opinions, feelings and experiences and allowed to elicit responses that cannot easily be put into words. It was a means to access the multiple narratives of place including conscious and subconscious aspects, materialities, sensorialities, imaginaries and atmospheres, which are all fundamental factors shaping the musicians’ place experience in Wellington and Copenhagen.

However, an important aspect of the mapping exercise was the fact that it took place indoors. Hence there was no direct contact between the musicians and the (outdoor) city spaces they were drawing. The information revealed on the maps is therefore only based on the respondent's memories and imaginations of the places without audible, visual, olfactory or tactile stimuli. For this reason, photo-elicitation was added to the methodological mix. As a participatory research method conducted 'in the field', it allowed the participants to capture specific rhythmic moments, atmospheres and places which could later be recollected and discussed. The combination of mental mapping and photo-elicitation allowed for a more holistic understanding of the rhythms, atmospheres, and affects surrounding the music-makers in their urban environment, as those two visual methods were complementary and mutually reinforcing.

Sometimes certain photographs depicted specific places, objects or moments, which were also outlined on the maps, yet adding further details on the 'inside' lives and works of the participants including affective intensities and atmospheres underlying a particular situation or moment. On the other hand the maps could frequently add important spatial information, which the photographs themselves were lacking (the image of someone's bedroom was complemented by the map illustrating the geographic location of that person's home). This layering of different image types allows therefore for a "purposeful and constant process of steering towards validity, and negotiating the reefs of misinterpretation" (Spencer 2010, 140). Using both photography and mapping generates different forms of data, which provide visual evidence in places as a complement to other forms of knowledge in order to develop a more trustworthy understanding of the complex interwoven rhythmical dimensions that affect music-making in urban spaces.

In addition to those ethnographic images, semi-structured interviews and participant observation strengthen the narrative, as they create a link to broader contextual cues. As a set of experimental methodologies, I suggest this weaving together of different types of knowledge makes possible a thicker description of the polyrhythmic environments, energies, affective affinities, and atmospheres surrounding the musicians in their everyday life in the city. This particular combination of visual and

verbal methods allows the researcher to analyse the rhythmic mixture of urban life from an ‘inside’ as well as an ‘outside’ perspective and as such, account for some of the ways in which the personal is articulated to the social, the spatial, the material, and the symbolic as part of a matrix of forces and feelings that give shape to a meaningful sort of urban choreography, which deepens the sociomusical experience of the city. Building on this detailed consideration of each individual method, the discussion which follows will turn to more concrete examples of how social, spatial and affective rhythms create a unique urban texture, which shapes the musicians’ sense of place in Wellington and Copenhagen.

5.5 Rhythmanalysis in the Field

The fieldwork was, as has been mentioned, carried out in Wellington, New Zealand’s capital city and Copenhagen, the capital of Denmark. The reason for the choice of those two urban spaces will be discussed in more detail in Chapter Six (*Two Cities*). The research was completed in the course of three years between 2013 and 2016 with a limited period of data collection from April 2013 until October 2014. A total of forty participants took part in the research between the age of twenty-four and fifty-seven, twenty males and twenty females. The pool of respondents was restricted to independent musicians who were active in the local music scene at that time and viewed themselves as professional musicians. Such subjective self-evaluation does not necessarily mean that they were working as musician full time or that they got a satisfactory financial reward for their music. However, all of the participants had at least partly, figured out a way to have a career as a musician, be it through grants, secondary occupations or the commitment to various bands. They were all aiming to work full-time in creating original, independent music. I did not want to concentrate on one specific musical tradition but tried to consider the wide variety of musical genres to be found in both localities. Consequently, the study includes jazz, folk, pop and rock musicians, punk, brass and experimental music-makers as well as singer-songwriters from both cities²².

²² Most participants were white, middle class musicians, born and raised in Denmark or New Zealand (with some exceptions from Iceland, Germany and Taiwan who were born overseas but lived and worked as independent musicians in Copenhagen or Wellington for many years). Even though this does not reflect the cities’ ethnic diversity, those music-makers were strongly immersed in the local rhythms of the city and had therefore a similar understanding and knowledge of their urban environment.

Whilst this is a relatively small sample, the aim of this study is to explore the ways in which an (affective) attachment to place is created, felt and articulated in specific contexts, rather than to produce a large database of empirical data. Although some may suggest that this limits the extent to which findings of this thesis can be generalised, I would not have been able to explore the social, spatial and affective rhythms of music-makers in Wellington and Copenhagen in such detail with a larger sample. In any case, whether analysis is based on a small or large sample, there are always problems involved in representing the experiences of others (Ramazanoglu and Holland 2002).

Each musician drew one personal map and took between ten to twenty-four photos. As I was a stranger to both cities, I had no pre-established contacts to draw upon. Yet as I started exploring the local music scene, attending performances around the city, there were soon some potential interviewees identified. This random sample grew rather quickly, as each subject recruited future respondents from among their established connections (“snowball sample”)²³. A first meeting would take place either directly after the musician’s performance in a venue around town or, in case of prior e-mail, Facebook or phone contact, in a pre-arranged location such as a café, a bar, or sometimes in the musician’s private homes. I asked the musicians to choose a location to meet, hoping that their own choice of place would make them feel most comfortable and reduce any hesitation to commit to the project. This strategy was beneficial for both the musicians as they were able to pick a comfortable and convenient location for themselves, and for me, since I was encouraged and able to explore new parts of the city that I might have not discovered on my own.

Prior to the first interview I asked the musicians to draw a map of ‘their personal Wellington’ or ‘their personal Copenhagen’²⁴. This task was unexpected for most

²³ Snowball sampling can be defined as “a technique for finding research subjects. One subject gives the researcher the name of another subject, who in turn provides the name of a third, and so on” (Vogt 2005, 301).

²⁴ The research complies with the Victoria University’s ethical guidelines and it has been approved by the Ethics Committee. The importance of ethical consideration for this project is based on the very nature of the research interest underlying this project, which is to investigate individuals’ personal habits, routes and routines. Studying such personal elements makes the subject vulnerable to a very high degree. Hence, all participants had the opportunity to openly discuss the nature and development of the research project including the use of their visual material. In order to seek individual consent, I provided each participant with information sheets that explained the nature and scope of my research prior to interacting with them. I received consent from each individual I

respondents, as I did not mention it before the first meeting in order to avoid any cognitive engagement with their urban environment prior to the mapping exercise. Instead, I aimed at stimulating an ‘atmospheric attunement’ (Stewart 2011) that would bring attention to the charged atmospheres of everyday life and in this way allow the musicians to sense out and consider more fully the multiple rhythms, valences, moods and affects constituting their musical environment in Wellington or Copenhagen. For the same reason, the mapping instructions were deliberately left vague, as I tried to limit any kind of ‘framing’ in order for the creative process to flourish on the side of the respondents themselves. Following the mapping, I conducted semi-structured interviews with each participant, which took between sixty and ninety minutes. After the interview the musicians were given a disposable camera and the task to take photos of their ‘musical environment’. Again, the instructions were purposely left ‘open’ in order to avoid setting up the everyday as an object of analysis, which then had to be ‘represented’. In a period that unfolded three to five weeks after the first meeting, I collected the disposable cameras, developed the film and arranged a second interview meeting with each musician in order to examine the photographs together, discussing their content and meaning.

Not unexpectedly, the organization of those meetings according to deadlines and schedules (especially the disposable camera pick-up) proved to be rather cumbersome at times. Sending the musicians’ reminders and requests to finish up the film was a delicate task, as I had to remain persistent without being obtrusive or forceful. This organizational difficulty was however compensated for in many different ways. The musicians’ openness and complaisance allowed me to observe and experience a multitude of personal and collective rhythms in a very limited period of time. In this way, much of the following research is heavily indebted to the musicians’ contributions, which extend from the pictorial insight into bedrooms, kitchens and rehearsal spaces to the sharing of personal anecdotes and drawings to coffees and bike rides through the city, all of which contributed to the creation of a much more complex portrait of music-making in Wellington and Copenhagen. Before discussing

interviewed in order to record the interview and potentially use the verbal as well as the visual material (i.e their photographs and maps) for research and educational purposes. While looking through the visuals the participants could decide which photographs or mental maps they did not want to be published. Furthermore, everyone I worked with was assured that they did not have to participate in this research and that they could stop participating in the project at any point

those pictorial and verbal insights into bedrooms, kitchens and rehearsal spaces in more detail, Chapter Six will provide an overview of Wellington's and Copenhagen's geographical as well as sociocultural specificity, which lays the groundwork for the remaining chapters.

Part III – From South to North and back again – Analysing City Rhythms

Chapter 6 - Two Cities

In the course of this project, music-making is described as made up of an inter-related set of actors, affects, materialities, and social relations that come together in the complex unfolding of the city. Urban spaces are in an ongoing process of becoming, (re)produced through “multiple networked mobilities of capital, persons, objects, signs and information” (Sheller and Urry 2004, 6), which are intertwined and connected, creating a “particular, but ever-changing, complex mix of heterogeneous social interactions, materialities, mobilities, imaginaries and social effects” (Edensor 2012, 3). This compound of temporal matter and events are the concrete forms of City Rhythms that shape, influence and characterise everyday life in the city. As such, there is never just one singular rhythm that describes or defines a city’s urban texture; rather, urban spaces are ‘loci of encounters’, meeting points where social, spatial and affective rhythms coexist, intersect and challenge each other. The way those rhythms resonate, mix and mingle with each other is location and place-specific, lending the city its unique ambience, texture and atmosphere. This chapter will provide a brief sketch of just some of the geographic, economic, demographic and sociocultural factors that shape the distinctive rhythmical layout of Wellington and Copenhagen. It will be a cursory overview instead of an exhaustive elaboration, which will help to contextualize how some of these rhythms impact on the sociomusical experience of the city and shape the way local music-makers move through, sense out and make sense of their everyday urban environment.

6.1 Wellington’s Rhythms

With its population of about 450,000, the Wellington region is the third most populous urban area in New Zealand (‘Wellington City Council’ 2015a). The city is built along a “natural amphitheatre of hills” enclosing the vast natural harbour at the

south-western tip of New Zealand's North Island ('WellingtonNZ' 2015a). With a moderate oceanic climate, Wellington enjoys around 2000 sunshine hours a year with temperatures rarely above 25°C or below 4 °C. The region has a diverse range of landscapes, including 50,000 hectares of regional parks and forests as well as 497 kilometres of coastline ('WellingtonNZ' 2015b). The first European settlers arrived in Wellington in 1839 and constructed their first homes in the suburb of Petone, the northern shore of the Wellington Harbour ('Wellington City Council' 2015b). Since Wellington is relatively young, several of the original features, including architecture and street patterns, remained and are still characteristic features of the cityscape. Even though the city's architecture varies, there is still a great number of traditional Victorian detached and semi-detached town houses to be found.

Wellington is not only the world's southernmost capital city but was recently nominated New Zealand's "cultural capital" by the Wellington City Council. This notion of 'urban branding' rests upon the entrepreneurial imperatives of neoliberalism, which has dominated New Zealand's cultural policy, economy and its social institutions during the last two decades (Stahl 2011). A side effect of this particular ideology has been the dissolution of 'the social' and the disavowal of community, as the individual is regarded as self-motivated entrepreneur and problem solver despite existing social networks or communities. This turn towards the entrepreneurial has encouraged Wellington to make use of culture as another mode of revenue generation in a way that aligns itself to the generic template of the 'creative city' (Stahl 2011). With its primary goal to transform Wellington into a "reinvigorated space of cultural consumption", the Wellington City Council has put policies into practice that frame "what kind of culture best suits the city and how this might be properly nurtured" (Stahl 2011, 154). Part of the 'creative city' framework are Wellington's high art institutions such as the Royal New Zealand Ballet, the New Zealand Symphony Orchestra, the Museum of New Zealand Te Papa Tongarewa, as well as the training institutions such as the New Zealand School of Dance and Te Kura Toi Whakaari o Aotearoa: New Zealand Drama School as well as the New Zealand School of Music at Victoria University of Wellington (NZSM). The NZSM constitutes a significant point of contact in the local music scene's infrastructure as it facilitates networking and collaboration among musicians in the city. In the early 2000s, former students of the New Zealand School of Music formed the Village Jazz

Quartet which was later transformed into various dub, rock, reggae and soul groups such as Fat Freddy's Drop, Trinity Roots, the Black Seeds, Fly My Pretties or Little Bushman who form the nucleus of Wellington's dub-reggae scene (Mitchell 2009).

Besides its institutional infrastructure, Wellington claims to have more cafés, bars and restaurants per capita than New York City ('WellingtonNZ' 2015a). Particularly the 'Cuba quarter', Wellington's "discrete zone of hip, alternative stores", representing an eclectic blend of cafés, bars, restaurants, music venues, op shops, ateliers, music retailers and tattoo parlours, reinforces the city's status as a vibrant and creative destination (Brunt 2011, 163). Once a year Cuba Street is transformed into a vibrant street festival called Cuba Dupa, featuring a variety of music and dance performances, food, arts and craft stalls. The festival has been shaped by various communities of Wellington showing an "explicit sense of collaboration, collective action and pooling of resources that lay at the heart of creative life in Cuba Street" (Brunt 2011, 165). Community-based cultural and artistic events such as the Cuba Dupa, the Diwali Festival of Lights, The International Film Festival, the biennial Festival of the Arts and various music events such as The Wellington Jazz Festival, Homegrown or Camp A Low Hum – a three-day indie music festival held just outside the city – have played a significant role in creating a distinct place-identity for the city as they "can be viewed not only as a means for Wellington's social and cultural groups to negotiate individual and collective identities, but also as playing a role in the creation of a distinct sense of place for the city of Wellington" (2011, 170).

The collective spirit is also prevalent in Wellington's music scenes. Many musicians living and working in Wellington moved to the city from elsewhere, bringing different musical backgrounds and experiences with them, which allows for the creation of eclectic collaborations and multilayered musical networks. One such musical collaboration is the local roots/reggae/rock nexus including bands such as Trinity Roots, The Black Seeds and Fat Freddy's Drop which are all bound together in their own "tightly knit, well-entrenched scene" (Stahl 2011, 148). Those bands produce a combination of dub, reggae and soul music which saturated Wellington's cafés and bars for several years, yielding something that has been referred to as the "Wellington sound" (152). Fat Freddy's Drop have helped the 'Wellington Sound' to gain global recognition as 20,000 listeners voted for their independently produced

album *Based on a True Story* to be the “Worldwide Album of the Year” at the Radio One Gilles Peterson Worldwide Music Awards in 2005 (‘New Zealand History’ 2015). However, despite their international success, Fat Freddy’s Drop continue to “epitomise the closeness of their city’s music scene” (‘NZMusician’ 2015).

Irritated by the prevalence of Wellington’s dub and reggae scene, ‘indie’ musicians distance themselves from the generic ‘Wellington Sound’, regarding it as “clichéd, fatigued and no longer relevant” (Keam and Mitchell 2011, xix). Instead of following the footsteps of the Pacific Roots pioneers, indie musicians represent the emergence of another kind of sociomusical experience which is characterised by a musical eclecticism (Stahl 2011, 148). Yet the indie or dub and reggae scene are just two of many found in Wellington. There is a thriving jazz scene, a drum’n’ bass scene, as well as a country and garage rock scene, constituting the city’s vibrant cultural spaces. Stahl reminds us however, that despite its musical eclecticism, there is a common “urban ethos” underlying the sociomusical experience of the city (148). Manifested in the relationship of people, places and musical practices, Wellington’s urban ethos is guided by two sets of practices: lo-fi entrepreneurialism (DIY) and social networking (DIT) (148). The lo-fi do-it-yourself approach reflects a longstanding New Zealand attitude, “one of jumping in with what you have and making do” which was originally based on the geographical isolation of the country and its lack of equipment on the one hand and the ‘pioneering spirit’ on the other (Meehan 2009, 104). The ‘do-it-together’ ethic manifests itself in the sharing of resources such as rehearsal space, expertise and stories, as well as profound social relationships which are “explicitly cooperative and collaborative” and permeated by a collective will “to make the city matter as a cultural space” (Stahl 2011, 151–152).

A recent example of how the DIY/DIT practices unfold within Wellington’s music scene is the Eyegum Music Collective, which was founded in October 2014 by “a bunch of musicians, artists, fans and a lawyer who’ve got together with the aim of putting on awesome events” (‘Eyegum.co.nz’ 2015). Based on the dedication and commitment of various volunteers, the collective hosts house parties in various locales across the city. The creation of alternative performance spaces in Wellington such as the Eyegum events, is mainly based upon the lack of infrastructure which “breeds a feeling of community geared towards solutions to local problems” (Stahl

2011, 150). In this way, the collective reflects the tension between communal and entrepreneurial impulses that determine Wellington's music scene. As much as Eyegum engages collectively in order to transcend the shortcomings of the city, they remain "ineluctably caught up in the spectre of neoliberalism that shades cultural and social life in Wellington" (2011, 158). Against this backdrop, the Eyegum music events can be seen as a sort of 'constructive engagement' (Vermeulen and Van den Akker 2015, 55) that allows the musicians to manifest their involvement within society without political actions 'against' the state or 'against society' but by way of "Doing Things Yourself, or "Doing Things Together" in a small-scale setting.

The development of governmental support for the arts in New Zealand can be traced back to the 1940s with the establishment of the New Zealand Literary Fund and the national symphony orchestra. Over the following half-century, further initiatives were founded, including the Queen Elizabeth II Arts Council in 1963, which was restructured in 1994 as the Arts Council of New Zealand Toi Aotearoa, trading as Creative New Zealand ('Ministry for Culture and Heritage' 2014). With the design of its public policy structure, New Zealand followed other English-speaking commonwealth countries by adopting the "arm's length model", which "allows the sector to develop without undue government interference, and therefore serves to protect freedom of expression" ('Ministry for Culture and Heritage' 2014). Due to major political changes and economic reforms in the 1980s, the role of the government in subsidising production in most sectors decreased drastically²⁵. It was during the 2000s that the Labour government introduced the Cultural Recovery Package, which injected 80 million dollars of funding into the arts, culture and heritage sector with ongoing funding of 20 million dollar for each of the following three years. The National-led government continued to emphasize the importance of "increasing the visibility and accessibility of culture and heritage though funding of well-governed, efficient and sustainable cultural organisations" ('Ministry for Culture

²⁵ Due to an oil crisis in the 1970s, high inflation, rising levels of unemployment and an increasing trade deficit severe international and domestic pressures were manifest in New Zealand. The Third National Government under Robert Muldoon (1975-1984) attempted to stabilize the domestic economy by combining subsidies to key export sectors and overseas borrowing. This highly interventionist approach resulted in raising taxes as well as a wage-, price and rent freeze in 1982. In this context of crisis, David Lange's Fourth Labour Government (1984 – 1990) loosened subsidies, privatized state-owned enterprises and introduced a new course of welfare reform based on individual choice and self-sufficiency. This shift from Keynesian welfarism towards a "competition state" which emphasizes the promotion of enterprise, innovation and profitability in the private and public sectors, is also known as the "New Zealand experiment" or "an extreme example of neoliberalism and economic restructuring" (Larner 1997, p. 7).

and Heritage' 2014).

The primary unit to advise the government on issues and policies regarding culture and the arts is the Ministry for Culture and Heritage (MCH). The Ministry manages the Arts Council (Creative New Zealand), which is responsible for the distribution of arts grants to individual artists, galleries, community-groups and arts organizations. A further agency funded by the Ministry is the New Zealand Music Commission, which is administered by a self-appointed board of music industry representatives with the aim to “support the growth of the music industry in New Zealand, both culturally and economically, at home and abroad” (‘New Zealand Music Commission’ 2015). Furthermore, there are independent funding agencies such as New Zealand On Air, an autonomous crown entity, which fully funds public broadcaster Radio New Zealand, and other television, radio and new media platforms. Lastly, there is funding from the New Zealand Music Foundation, which was founded in 2012 by New Zealand songwriter Neil Finn.

The willingness of the government to support New Zealand music has contributed to the development of both the mainstream commercial and the indie sector, yet its concern today is rather focused on “a more pragmatic concern for the economic value of the industry” (Shuker 2008, 282). This calls into question the actual accessibility of governmental funding for the local (indie) musicians in Wellington and other parts of the country. Michael Scott (2012) argues that “gaining funding is a highly competitive process with approximately 1000 applications for 20 annual grants” (310).

As the present discussion illustrates, the rhythmical layout of Wellington’s music scene is diverse and multilayered. It includes the rather static rhythms imposed by diverse governmental authorities as well as wider economic and political forces. Yet there are also the more flexible everyday life rhythms, including social activities, practices and dynamics from walking down the busy streets, relaxing in the park, sitting in a bus, preparing a meal at home, meeting friends to play music or going out for a drink. All of these activities, habits and routines are superimposed by the rhythmic materiality of the city, including Wellington’s steep hills and windy roads, the Victorian architecture, the busy CBD, the alternative Cuba quarter or the spacious waterfront which are exposed to the natural rhythms of the city – the gusty wind, the

fast moving clouds, the warm sunlight or the fresh, cold sea breeze. Those social, spatial and affective rhythms create a particular urban texture, energy and ambience, which shape Wellington's sociomusical experience. How those dynamics interact and mingle in the urban space of Copenhagen will be discussed in the following section.

6.2 Copenhagen's Rhythms

Originally founded in the tenth century as a Viking fishing village, København (Copenhagen) has grown into the second largest city in Scandinavia with a population of about 559,000 in Københavns Kommune (Copenhagen Municipality)²⁶ and 1.2 million in the greater Copenhagen area (denstoredanske.dk). Copenhagen experiences a moderate climate with an average daytime high of 22°C in summer and 1,9 °C in winter. There are about 1,600 hours of sunshine per year, yet the number of daylight hours between summer and winter varies considerably due to the city's northern latitude. Whereas the longest day of the year has about seventeen hours of daylight, the shortest day has only seven ('Copenhagen.climatemps', n.d.). Copenhagen's cityscape is characterized by a wide variety of architectural styles with a number of important landmarks going back to the sixteenth century. Most of the city's remaining pieces of Renaissance architecture can be attributed to the personal effort of king Christian IV – also referred to as 'The Builder King' – who initiated and financed various projects during his reign from 1588 to 1648.

The city of Copenhagen is situated partly on the eastern coast of Sjælland (Zealand), Denmark's largest island, and the much smaller island of Amager, both being part of the Øresund region. Since the year 2000 Copenhagen is connected to the Swedish city of Malmö by the eight kilometre long Øresund Bridge, creating stronger commercial ties and reinforcing cultural exchange between the two cities (Øresundsbro Konsortiet 2008). Due to major infrastructural investments such as the Øresund Bridge, the development of urban quarter Ørestad, a new metro line and the expansion of the international airport, Copenhagen is increasingly referred to as the nation's "growth

²⁶ Københavns Kommune is the largest of all sixteen municipalities constituting the central part of the actual city together with the two municipalities of Fredriksberg and Gentofte. The municipality of Copenhagen is divided in 10 districts including Indre By, Østerbro, Amager Øst, Amager Vest, Valby, Vanløse, Bispebjerg, Nørrebro, Vesterbro/Kongens Enghave and Brønshøj-Husum. The enclave of Fredriksberg is an independent municipality. See Københavns Kommune: 'Københavns bydele' (www.kk.dk).

locomotive” and as a “node in the European urban system” (Lund Hansen, Andersen, and Clark 2001, 82).²⁷

Apart from being the nation’s capital and growth locomotive, Copenhagen serves also as a leading creative hub in Northern Europe (Jurup 2015). The city is home to a wide array of museums, galleries, theatres, film and music venues such as the Statens Museum for Kunst (National Gallery), The Royal Danish Theatre, The Royal Danish Ballet, the Danish National Symphony Orchestra, The Copenhagen Opera House as well as the world’s second oldest amusement park named Tivoli. Numerous festivals are held during the year including the Copenhagen Jazz festival, the International Documentary Film Festival, the electronic music festival Strøm, the street and nightlife festival Distortion and the Copenhagen World Music festival. Moreover, several universities such as the University of Copenhagen (UC), Roskilde University (RUC), Copenhagen Business School (CBS), The Royal Danish Academy of Music (RDAM) or the Rhythmic Music Conservatory (RMC)²⁸ provide an institutional and social setting that allows for the development of a extensive social network and a broader context for cultural activity beyond the larger economic and political forces at work in the city. Particularly the RMC and RDM are common stepping-stones for upcoming musicians, attracting hundreds of new students each year with their promise to provide “performance training at the highest level” (Jannziu 2015). With approximately 400 students, the RDM is not only the largest but also the oldest professional institution for musical education in Denmark, promoting themselves as a “vibrant artistic educational institution with a strong international profile that is part of Copenhagen’s musical and cultural scene” (Jannziu 2015). Besides the educational cornerstone, there are several (governmental) support mechanisms for musicians living and working in Copenhagen. Granting financial support to individual artists has a long history in Scandinavia and can be considered as “one of the characteristic features of the Nordic model for supporting the arts” (Heikkinen 2003). While public support has initially been related to the traditions and practices of the royal courts in

²⁷Copenhagen’s airport had one of the highest passenger growth rates in Europe during 2014 with 25 Million travellers per year securing greater interconnectedness of the city on a global scale (Copenhagen Airports A/S 2014).

²⁸ “The term “Rytmsk music” cannot be translated to, or is not in use in, other languages. It does not make sense to talk about rhythmic music, musique rythmique, rhythmische Musik. It can only be translated more indirectly, for instance as referring to more ‘serious’ or more ‘authentic’ parts of popular music, for which other languages have no specific term except genre labels such as rock, jazz, world music etc.” (Pedersen, n.d.).

Denmark, it has later expanded as part of the emergence and development of the welfare state (Heikkinen 2003). According to Duelund et al. (2012) cultural policy in Denmark is

designed to serve democratic objectives, training in democracy being considered an important social goal in itself, to guarantee artistic freedom by subsidising the arts and to promote equal access for all by funding centralised and decentralised cultural institutions. The state builds the house, but leaves it up to the tenants to decorate the rooms (6).

Denmark's cultural policy is therefore characterized by democratic values, decentralized funding, program responsibility and various art institutions. The underlying administrative structure of the policy is referred to as the "arm's length" principle (also implemented in New Zealand) which ensures that neither politicians nor civil servants but independent peer groups grant money to the arts with the aim to "support but not to direct" (as the then Minister of Culture Julius Bomholt phrased it as he presented the Bill on the Danish Arts Foundation to the Parliament in 1963 (Heikkinen 2003, 16)).

Nevertheless, the political responsibility for public cultural policy is placed with the Danish Parliament (Folketinget), the government and the Ministry of Culture. The Danish Ministry for Cultural Affairs (Ministeriet for Kulturelle Anliggender) was established in 1961 in order to provide a framework for the country's cultural development including financial and subsidy arrangements. Yet the actual policy implementation has been increasingly delegated to different cultural agencies, councils, committees and other "arm's length" bodies within the different agencies. The administrative body responsible for granting state support to artists is composed of the Danish Arts Council (Kunstrådet) and the Danish Arts Foundation (Statens Kunstfond), which allocate funding through various independent expert committees. The Danish Arts Foundation provides various grants such as a three-year working grants for individual composers, travel bursaries, working bursaries, prizes and commission honoraria (Heikkinen 2003, 25). In order to legally guarantee governmental subsidies in the field of music, Denmark introduced an appropriate legislation in 1976²⁹.

²⁹ "Denmark became the first country in the world to adopt definitive legislation in the field of music. Subsidies in the field of music are granted pursuant to the Music Act, which was passed in 1976 (Law No 306 of 10 June 1976 on music passed by the Parliament 26 May 1976). The main purpose was to support the permanent symphony

The financial condition of musicians in Denmark depends therefore primarily on public sector funding and only to a lesser extent on private foundations, commercial conditions in form of ticket sales, donations or sponsorship. However, in recent years there has been a clear shift from the welfare-based corporatist cultural policy to a more market-based, decentralized, depoliticized, and technocratic strategy which reinforces the individual autonomy of the artist from the state and represents therefore a rather individualist/neoliberal standpoint (Lindsköld 2015, 9).

In 2007 the German news website *Spiegel Online* published an article referring to the Danish capital as “cool, cultural and creative” (Ertel 2007). The municipality of Copenhagen has directed much effort into the development of the city from “a relatively traditional industrial area into a true ‘creative hub’” (Hospers 2003, 158) which is reinforced by the City Plan Strategy that sets its focus upon “technology, creativity and tolerance as the driving force behind the city’s economic growth and development” (Bayliss 2007, 898). The Municipality of Copenhagen follows this strategy while emphasizing their intention to attract artists from all over the world in order to create a profile as “a cultural, dynamic and tolerant metropolis” (Bayliss 2007, 900).

According to the global affairs magazine *Monocle*, this strategy has brought results to the extent that Copenhagen was named the “world’s most liveable city” in 2013 as well as the following year (‘Most Liveable City: Copenhagen’ 2015). The variety of restaurants, cafes and bars – claimed to be one of the highest per capita in the world, speaks of the kinds of culinary and cultural consumption found in Copenhagen. Moreover, the city’s nightlife is diverse and enduring hosting a wide variety of music in mainstream discos, glamorous cocktail bars, rock clubs, smoky pubs, bars and underground venues. Besides a thriving nightlife culture, the city breeds a strong entrepreneurial spirit advocating the foundation of new businesses and start-ups: “From clean tech to clothing to coffee, new businesses are sprouting up to revitalise

orchestras, the development of Danish art and music and other initiatives such as development of regional institutions of music. The Act has subsequently been amended on many occasions. In 2000, a new law concerning state support to local music venues for rock, jazz and folk music (Law No 341) was passed by the Parliament on 11 May 2000. In 2006, a departmental order regarding state support to music schools and courses organised by the Municipalities (Law No 723) was put into force on 22 June. Most recently, a comprehensive new Law on Music (Law No 184 of January 2008) was declared. The law includes all the different revisions, changes and amendments since the first Music Act was passed by the Parliament in 1976” (Council of Europe 2015).

before neglected areas” (Reeves 2015). In co-working spaces such as the Founders House hundreds of young entrepreneurs work in close proximity, sharing their resources and skills. The entrepreneurial spirit also affects the local music scene, which results in an increasing number of (outdoor) music events each year such as Søndagsvenner, a non-commercial electronic music event, which takes place at a former industrial site in the harbour of Copenhagen. The event is organized by a non-profit organization including numerous volunteers with the purpose of “transforming forgotten space into cultural villages, heaving with creative people” and “tighten the interactivity between the artists and the public and to be social breeding-ground for a creative environment” (‘2GOcopenhagen’ 2015).

Another factor contributing to Copenhagen’s high level of life quality is the city’s extensive and well-distributed green areas including gardens, parks and cemeteries as well as ‘the three lakes³⁰’ and about 92 kilometres of coastline, which mostly serve as recreational area. One way of exploring those green areas is by bicycle. There is an extensive network of green cycle routes through city parks and other green areas that allows for a safe and comfortable movement through the city. These routes are a supplementary opportunity to the approximately 350 kilometres of curb segregated cycle tracks and 23 kilometres of on-street cycle lanes across the city (City of Copenhagen 2011, 7). By downsizing car traffic, removing parking spaces and driving lanes, an extensive and well-designed system of cycle tracks has gradually been established (Gehl 2015) which is used effectively by 50% of the city’s residents who cycle to work or educational institution every day (City of Copenhagen 2011, 6). In this way, cycling in Copenhagen is not only a “sport and test of survival” but a “practical way to get around town” for people of all ages including children, young people and senior citizens (Gehl 2015). However, the bicycle is not only an important means of transportation but constitutes a dominant feature in Copenhagen’s cityscape.

Opposing strategic urban planning, cultural policy and the branding of Copenhagen as “cool, cultural and creative” or “most liveable city”, is the Freetown of Christiania, a self-governed, autonomous neighbourhood which proclaims to be “the losers’ Paradise, for the creative and recreational values” as well as a “driving force in art,

³⁰ The three man-made lakes Sortedams Sø, Peblinge Sø and Skt. Jørgens Sø are located on the northwest side of the inner city. They were established in 1500 to provide drinking water for the inhabitants of Copenhagen and were also a means to improve the outside fortification of the city (‘Copenhagenet.dk’ 2015).

culture, architecture and innovation” (Jacobi 2005) constituting the “heart of Bohemian living” in Copenhagen (Metwaly 2013). Located on the island of Amager in central Copenhagen, the Freetown is a mix of DIY (do-it-yourself) homes, organic eateries, art galleries, workshops and music venues, that make it an attractive neighbourhood for diverse groups of people, from vagabonds and outcasts to students, artists, musicians, intellectuals and tourists. In fact, Christiania is one of the main tourist attractions and a “well-known brand” for the supposedly “progressive and liberated Danish lifestyle” (Jacobi 2005). Originally, the Freetown was founded in 1971 by a group of hippies and squatters who occupied the former military barracks of Bårdsmandsstræde (Bårdsmandsstrædes Kaserne), which were abandoned during 1967. Today, almost 1000 people live in the community, countering the government’s plans for normalisation of the relations between Christiania and the authorities. Despite the fact that the Freetown generates a substantial amount of revenues for the Danish economy, the negotiations and discussions around the future of the enclave are incessant, involving “a complicated net of social, economical and political elements infused with a multitude of ideologies and relations” (Metwaly 2013). Christiania regularly hosts musical events including a wide variety of genres from amateur rock to folklore and traditional jazz. Their main music venues Lødden and Jazzklubben (The Jazz Club) are popular locales attracting local as well as international artists and audiences.

The previous paragraphs set out to outline the distinctive characteristics of Copenhagen according to its ‘polyrhythmic ensemble’ – the particular but ever changing complex mix of social, spatial and affective rhythms which shape the city’s atmosphere and texture. Those rhythms constitute the ongoing pulse of cyclists, cars, pedestrians, students, artists and tourists as their movements are framed, limited and defined by the rhythmic materiality of the city, the extensive network of bicycle routes, wide green spaces, open city squares, narrow side-streets and the horizontal skyline broken only occasionally by some church tower or spires. Interlinked with the social and material regularities are the rhythmic elements of nature such as grey winter days, summer sunshine, rain and snow lending the city some of its ambience and atmosphere that indelibly shapes the music-maker’s sense of place.

Copenhagen and Wellington are two urban spaces that, geographically speaking could hardly be more different. While Copenhagen sits in close proximity to a number of other major urban centres, Wellington is situated on the remote North Island of New Zealand. So why are those cities part of this rhythm analytical project?

The main reason is that despite Copenhagen and Wellington's disparate geographical locations the rhythmical layout of those two urban spaces shows some clear similarities. They are both coastal cities with a moderate oceanic climate and similar number of inhabitants. Both are surrounded by water and are graced with numerous parks and green spaces. They are global capital cities with vibrant music scenes and a thriving cultural industry. Yet it is not the "robust sense of similarity" which constitutes the comparison of those two urban spaces but the way "a city can be said to show in practice a reflexive relation to similarity and difference regardless of how similar or different it is to another city" (Blum 2007, 18). This perspective allows for the conception of the city not as fixed, but as a dynamic place, continually (re)constituted through a multiplicity of flows that emanate from, pass through and centre upon it, "bringing together ephemeral, contingent and relatively stable arrangements of people, energy and matter" (Cresswell and Merriman 2011, 190). In this sense, it is Wellington's and Copenhagen's respective polyrhythmic ensembles including energies, affective affinities and atmospheres, which provide exciting and promising 'rhythmic fields' of experience and experiment that allow for a profound investigation of rhythmical differences and similarities giving shape to a meaningful sort of urban choreography which deepens the sociomusical experience of the city.

Instead of being limited to one particular urban space – and therefore to the analysis of one specific rhythmical layout, the comparison of two cities allows for a more diverse and detailed examination of social, spatial and affective rhythms which increases validity and reliability of the research. As Agnew et al. state:

Hasty generalization based on a single context may close off further examination, or confine it to the same context. Premature closure and wilful short-sightedness are less likely with the comparativist's approach (1984, 281).

Comparing two unique musical environments in Wellington and Copenhagen will therefore not only shed light on the particular rhythms at play in each urban space, but it also allows for the uncovering of unsuspected rhythmical variations which might

spur the creation of new questions regarding the underlying rhythmical dynamics of music-making in the city.

Comparative research has been a common approach in the social sciences, as a way of “describing, explaining and developing theories about sociocultural phenomena as they occur in and across social units (cities, groups, regions, nations, societies, tribes)” (Ward 2010, 473). From a rhythm analytical examination of embodied experiences in New York, Stockholm and Tokyo (Johansson 2013) to the analysis of children’s relation to place in Stockholm and Bournemouth (Cele 2006) or the dynamics of the music industry in Kingston, Jamaica and Stockholm, Sweden (Power and Hallencreutz 2002) – the notion of comparison has been a popular method for studying a wide variety of substantive issues. Particularly in the field of urban studies, the comparative approach is a common research strategy bringing together diverse aspects across a number of social science disciplines. However, despite its widespread use, there has been a lack of “thinking through seriously the methodological and theoretical consequences of performing comparative studies” (Ward 2010, 483). Kevin Ward (2010) criticizes the traditional ways of comparing cities and advocates an approach “that seeks to move beyond the rather fixed and static theorization of place, space and scale” (473) that characterizes much of the recent comparative urban studies literature. He draws on geographer Gillian Hart who argues that:

instead of taking as given pre-existing objects, events, places and identities, I start with the question of how they are formed in relation to one another and to a larger whole (2002, 14).

Rather than considering cities as self-enclosed and analytically separate objects where “all social relations are organized within self-enclosed, discretely bounded territorial containers” (Brenner 2001, 38), Ward argues for a more open, embedded and relational conceptualization of cities. This relational comparative approach regards the city as “both a place (a site or territory) and a series of unbounded, relatively disconnected and dispersed, perhaps sprawling activities, made in and through many different kinds of networks stretching far beyond the physical extent of the city” (Robinson 2005, 763). In this way, the comparison of two cities is not used in order to argue for uniqueness and difference. In fact, the relational concept of comparison “refuses to measure ‘cases’ against a universal yardstick” (Hart 2002, 14). In this conception, objects, events, places and identities are not pre-given but they are formed

in relation to one another and “it is through clarifying how these relations are produced and changed in practice that close study of a particular part can illuminate the whole” (Hart 2002, 14).

Using a relational comparative approach to the rhythmanalytical examination of Wellington and Copenhagen will be particularly useful in the sense that it allows for the elicitation and analysis of the complex web of social, spatial and affective rhythms, including the rhythmical patterns of sociability, interaction and belonging, materiality, mobility and circulation that constitute music-making in those two urban spaces. It will shed light on the music-maker’s mundane rhythmical pathways and in this way facilitate the identification of essential rhythmical dimensions underlying the individual’s sense of place in Wellington and in Copenhagen. A relational comparison will not only illuminate the peculiarities of each case in particular, but it will provide a holistic insight into the interconnected trajectories of music-making in the city on a global scale.

Described throughout the remaining chapters are therefore rhythms of sociability, interaction, mobility and belonging that give shape to a meaningful sort of urban choreography which guides the music-makers through their everyday life in Wellington and Copenhagen. The use of cartographic and photographic methods facilitates exploring the links between social, spatial and affective rhythms and allows us to consider aspects of music-making that are frequently overlooked, in part because they are often deemed “un-representable.” The following chapter will discuss the usefulness of mental maps in examining the musician’s sense of place in Wellington and Copenhagen, as they illuminate some of the social, spatial and particularly the affective dimensions associated with music-making in those two cities.

Chapter 7 - Mapping Rhythms

7.1 General procedure

The first meeting with the musicians usually took place in a public space around the city such as a café or bar. Shortly after I introduced myself I asked the participants to draw a map of their musical environment. I provided coloured pencils and an A3 sized sketchbook, set up the audio recorder and waited for them to start their drawing.

Most musicians were hesitant at first, declaring their ‘limited drawing skills’ before getting immersed into the mapping exercise. Here, the pre-mapping conversation was of great importance, as it guided the musicians through the process and emphasized that their drawing skills wouldn’t affect the result of the study, which allowed the participants to freely express themselves. Eventually, everyone fully engaged in the task, considering how best to visualize their everyday urban environment at their own pace and style. The map-drawing activity was supported by a verbal backup in order to avoid one of the main limitations of visual methods: the interpretation of the visual material by the researcher alone (den Besten 2010). In this way the musicians could comment on their drawing during the exercise or they were asked to describe their visualizations afterwards. Verbal explanation proved rather useful to interpret and understand the purpose and meaning of the diverse objects pictured on the musicians’ maps. Even though some places or objects have no deeper meaning, they are subjectively chosen by the musicians to be part of their map and therefore contribute to their sense of place.

The majority of the musicians drew colourful maps, depicting the city as a living space comprised of material objects such as roads, pathways and buildings, as well as natural elements including the ocean, lakes, trees, parks and bush, and sometimes other human beings or animals. Many maps were drawn from an aerial or semi-aerial perspective, yet most drawings were out of scale as distances were erased and multiple locations, buildings and places compressed into a rather small visual space. Some of the musicians chose to label streets and buildings or use symbols such as arrows, musical notes, instruments and hearts to express or intensify a certain meaning. The variety of expressions, symbols and details on the maps varied greatly.

There were complex drawings loaded with meaning and message and simple ones, which only featured little details and information. Some musicians did not draw any typical urban features such as roads, buildings, squares or natural spaces but chose to include symbols, situations and atmospheres instead. Those drawings tended to look more like post-cards, posters or abstract renderings than conventional maps. This may be due to the fact that the respondents were not restricted to any visual style or technique, which allowed them to express their relation to the city freely and creatively. In this way, the musicians' maps are no accurate mirror of reality but subjective visualizations which reveal valuable insight into the individual's sense of place.

During the analysis of the maps, it became apparent that certain visual details clearly related to social, spatial and affective rhythms, the three different dimensions of City Rhythms outlined in Chapter Three. Symbols such as love hearts, musical notes and coffee cups constitute manifestations of social and affective rhythms at play, whereas roads, buildings, flowers, trees and other material elements are expressions of the city's spatial rhythms. The following discussion will elaborate on each rhythmical dimension in more detail, discussing their similarities and differences in either city in order to create an understanding of the musician's sense of place in its complexity and multiplicity. The categorization of City Rhythms is therefore the basis for a profound rhythmanalysis of the musicians' mental maps, as it facilitates the identification, unravelling and understanding of the multiple rhythms in which music-making is intimately bound up. It is important to note however, that those categories are by no means mutually exclusive, as the musician's everyday life is a complex composite of diverse rhythms and atmospheres, which interact, mix and mingle in space. In order to fully grasp and analyse the ways in which a sense of place is created, it is therefore necessary to investigate each rhythmic category in close detail, while simultaneously allowing those rhythms to coexist, intersect and challenge each other.

7.2 Drawing Rhythms

7.2.1 *Spatial Rhythms*

Spatial rhythms are a conglomerate of the city's materiality and nature. They consist of the concrete, physical reality of urban spaces – buildings, objects and static structures that lend the city its shape and substance, including the more dynamic rhythms such as the movements of people, cars, bikes and boats. Complementing the city's physical texture are natural rhythms such as daily and seasonal weather changes as well as flora and fauna, which characterize space and shape the music-makers' experiences of their urban environment.

Most of the maps featured various spatial rhythms illustrating the physical and natural environment including important public spaces such as concert venues, cafés, bars and clubs, theatres, churches or universities; private spaces such as the musicians' rehearsal rooms or their homes as well as parks and natural spaces. Even though spatial rhythms were a crucial element on maps from either city, there were some important differences regarding their visual appearance, frequency and connection. One noticeable detail was that there were fewer buildings on the Wellington maps. In fact, some drawings did not show any architecture or street patterns at all. The Copenhagen drawings on the contrary featured a variety of buildings, including churches, detached houses as well as apartment buildings, which were frequently drawn in a complex, sometimes three-dimensional style.

The visualization of urban materiality in Wellington was mostly limited to the simple drawings of little square houses representing important venues, cafés and bars across the city. Some maps also featured a group of tall, grey buildings on the fringe of the map, which represented the Central Business District (CBD). As the colours and comments indicated, the musicians clearly distanced themselves from the busy and commercial atmosphere of the CBD.

I really kind of ignored that part of town which is the commercial and bureaucratic, parliamentary side of things. Most of my life in Wellington is centred around Courtenay Place and the Cuba Street area (Gerard).

I guess the area that I never really go to is the CBD. It's an area that I don't go to. It's just very 'suity' and very serious. I never go there unless I really have to (Nikita).

This mode of place experience clearly relates to what Relph (1976) refers to as existential *outsideness*, a situation in which a person experiences a feeling of separation or alienation from a certain environment. The experiential opposite of that is existential *insideness*, which is the degree to which an individual or a group identifies with a place. The dialectic relationship of insideness/outsideness demonstrates the dynamic nature of place and reminds us that “any exploration of place as a phenomenon of direct experience must be concerned with the entire range of experiences through which we all know and make places” (Relph 1976, 6). The musicians’ clear distinction from the city’s business district is therefore also an important statement of identity and belonging towards ‘the other’ part of the city, which is not the CBD.

In contrast to the sparse appearance of urban materiality on the Wellington drawings, the maps depicted a vast natural environment, dominated by the great natural harbour, the coastline, the hills and the surrounding native bush, which form some kind of natural amphitheatre in which the sociomusical experience of the city unfolds. The most frequently drawn object on the Wellington maps was the natural harbour, which often took up half of the entire map.

Figure 3 Map capturing Wellington's dominant natural rhythms

Figure 4 Gerard's map of Wellington

The dominant appearance of natural rhythms on the mental maps illustrates the significance of Wellington's urban nature for local music-makers. According to Wunderlich (2008a), an individual's sense of place is affected by "more or less intense/or dominant urban rhythms" as they catalyse particular feelings in that place (108). Following the musicians' individual comments during the mapping exercise, it becomes clear how the natural is closely linked with the affective as those rhythms nurture feelings of creativity, security and well-being:

There's the harbour and there's the cool, rugged coast. And here is the Town Belt. It's my favourite place in Wellington because I haven't been to any other city where I can walk for ten minutes and be in the bush and not feel like I'm in the city, although I'm in the middle of the city (Ed).

When I think of Wellington I'm always telling people that we are very lucky that we are surrounded by bush and five minutes from anywhere in town you can feel like you are not in a city, that is the main reason why I live here. I couldn't live in Auckland, I couldn't live in Melbourne because they have parks, but they are parks. They are very well maintained (Nikita).

For Wellington's musicians, natural rhythms contribute greatly to what Yi Fu Tuan terms 'sense of spaciousness' - a feeling of freedom, which implies the availability of space in order to have "the power and enough room in which to act" (1977, 52). Tuan argues:

To city sophisticates nature, whatever its character, signifies openness and freedom (61).

As such Wellington's natural surrounding offers a space to avoid the 'crowding' of everyday urban life. It provides a shelter from the pulsating rhythms of the city and allows the musicians to relax and rejuvenate. Furthermore, Wellington's amphitheatre effect, which is caused by the natural harbour and the surrounding hills, emphasizes the impression of a sheltered, enclosed space. As such, the city's geographical layout emanates a feeling of security on the one hand but creates a sense of isolation and solitude on the other— as Gerard's comment illustrates:

In that map I drew, we are at the end. It is this island that falls into the sea and you get the feeling that you're right on the edge of something rather than in the middle. You're on the edge and you're surrounded by this hugeness of the ocean.

Gerard's map (figure 4) resembles a postcard of Wellington rather than a map, as he portrays the vastness and beauty of the city's natural layout paying little attention to its urban dynamics and infrastructure. This 'lack' of concrete urban rhythms is

however compensated for by the rich affective texture of the drawing, which uncovers the less visible, intangible aspects of the city's polyrhythmic layout. Even though the musicians' affective ties to their urban environment are difficult to visualize on the maps, they became apparent in various ways during the (mapping) conversations. Gerard for instance explained his drawing emphasizing the affective impact of Wellington's natural layout as it creates a sense of freedom and spurs creativity:

One thing I like about Wellington is that on this side of the hill you look across and it's a wilderness over there, and there are no houses or anything. That's why I like looking over towards the east or the Wairarapa because you can still imagine this wilderness, and that kind of perfects my creativity personally. For me, that's the thing I love most. For me, that's linked to be so close to nature, closer than maybe in other cities around the world.

As such, Gerard's map and comments demonstrate not only the importance of natural rhythms, but illustrate the interconnectedness of the various affective, natural and social dynamics in a sense, that they are all part of a complex matrix of forces and feelings that shape the sociomusical experience of the city.

The interrelation of natural and cultural rhythms became apparent on Tom's map (figure 5), as he relates Wellington's natural distinctiveness to Māori mythology. Tom's drawing is reduced to the simple outlines of the North Island and parts of the South Island. During the mapping exercise Tom describes the Māori legend of Wellington's origin in which the North Island is a giant fish, caught by the demi-god Maui from inside his waka (canoe), which is the South Island. Wellington is referred to as the head of Maui's fish, with the natural harbour being its big mouth³¹.

³¹ The full legend can be found online under <http://eng.mataurangamaori.tki.org.nz/Support-materials/Te-Reo-Maori/Maori-Myths-Legends-and-Contemporary-Stories/Ngake-and-Whataitai-the-taniwha-of-Wellington-harbour>

Figure 5 Tom's map of Wellington based on Māori mythology

Tom gives a precise description of Wellington's geographical layout, which, for him, is closely related to the Māori legend:

So it's a mythical fish and the South Island is the canoe. The reason why I tell this is because Wellington is often called Te Upoko o te Ika a Maui, the head of the fish, – so that's a good way to kind of get your bearings on where it is. Thinking of it as a head you also think of a mouth, and the mouth is the harbour, which is here. I'm starting with those names to sort of explain the geography of Wellington. So all of that tells you all you want to know about Wellington: geologically active, mountains, or at least, hilly, and really based around a lot of coastline.

For Tom, Wellington's main features are based upon its natural layout, which he affiliates with and explains through Māori mythology. Similar to Gerard's map, the concrete, physical rhythms of the city are absent, which emphasizes in turn the presence and importance of the natural (as well as cultural) elements for his personal experience of place. Those maps illustrate how (urban) rhythms differ subjectively according to individual values, beliefs and interests (Wunderlich 2008a). Following Tom's drawing, natural and cultural rhythms are closely connected, creating a sense of place, which is clearly embedded in Māori mythology and traditions. Gerard's map

on the other hand emphasizes dominant natural rhythms as they create a sense of spaciousness, which in turn affect his creativity and personal well-being.

Due to Wellington's distinct geographical location, its hilly topography and close proximity to Cook Strait, the city has a changeable, moderately sunny, rather wet and windy climate. Even though climatic rhythms are hard to visualize, several musicians tried to capture Wellington's weather on their mental maps by drawing clouds, rain or the sun. Frequently they commented on other climatic conditions such as the wind, which has a strong presence in Wellington:

I wanted to include the old, colonial townhouses, the modern city and every bits of climate, the crazy sea, the crazy hills, sunshine, and the wind, because there is a lot of wind (Andy).

When I came back from being in Australia, in Sydney, which is a very different kind of place physically, one thing that struck me was hearing the sound of the wind and the trees. That takes me right back to my memories when I was four years old, and the sound is just the same as it was [...] I find something like the sound of the wind so powerful (Gerard).

Apart from the 'visible', natural elements such as the ocean, hills and trees, the musicians' mental maps brought to the fore the 'invisible', natural aspects of the everyday such as the experience of heat, cold or the wind which clearly affects their sensuous perception of place. The diverse appearance of natural rhythms on the Wellington drawings illustrates the multi-sensual nature of geographical experience (Rodaway 2011) and emphasizes its importance for the development of the musicians' sense of place, which is always a sensory and affective process of world-making (5).

Even though the city of Copenhagen has distinct natural rhythms as well, including seasonal changes such as long, dark winters, short summers and a great number of natural features, such as the three lakes, various parks, canals and the ocean, those details took up a rather small part of the maps. The most common natural features on the Copenhagen drawings were its three lakes, which were frequently the starting point of the mapping exercise, and located in the very centre of the map. From there, the drawing spread out in various directions, creating a fluid, open space, which stands in stark contrast to the naturally enclosed, amphitheatre-like topography of Wellington. This openness of Copenhagen's cityscape on the musicians' maps is

reinforced by the frequent depiction of roads, streets, bridges or cycle lanes crisscrossing the city, connecting different buildings and places, and highlighting the musicians' mundane pathways through their urban space.

Figure 6 Map illustrating roads and pathways in Copenhagen

Following from Finnegan (1989) it can be said that those pathways “constitute the structure and rituals through which people live out their lives” (326). As such, those routes and routines map out patterns of musical development and belonging, providing lines of continuity but also illustrating the multiple rhythms associated with music-making in the city. Some of those pathways on the musicians’ maps cross the local border, indicating the ‘bridge to Sweden’ or a ‘highway out of the city’, which expands the confined cityscape and illustrates a curious outlook towards global rhythms. Reinforcing this dynamic atmosphere is the fact that many maps depicted various means of transportation such as bicycles, boats and trains, which indicates clearly the importance of local and global connectedness for Copenhagen’s music-makers.

Figure 7 Map illustrating the musician's pathways through Copenhagen

Copenhagen is known for its well-developed bicycle infrastructure which connects residential areas to commercial zones, schools, universities and other key destinations and is used by most citizens on their daily pathways through the city (Babin 2014). For local musicians, cycling is not only an inexpensive means of transportation but a tool that allows them to pursue their everyday activities in an independent, flexible manner. As Tuan reminds us, “a bicycle enlarges the human sense of space” as it constitutes a “direct extension of his corporeal powers” (1977, 53). Moreover, cycling affects the musician’s embodied experience of the city, as it facilitates a kinaesthetic sensing of the texture of the road and the natural environment through muscles, joints and tendons while moving through space (Haldrup and Larsen 2006). In this way, bicycling enables an “extended touch” of the urban surrounding, creating an “intense, interactive relationship” between the body and its environment, which many musicians described as a positive, inspiring experience during the elicitation interview (Van Duppen and Spierings 2013, 235).

Besides the bicycle, musicians in Copenhagen frequently depicted airplanes or the airport on their mental maps, which reinforces a dynamic atmosphere and illustrates

their desire for international connectivity. For Maria, the airport is an important link to the outside world and basically her ‘second home’:

The airport, of course. I'm going there a lot. I'm playing a lot outside of Copenhagen. This is kind of another home, the Copenhagen airport. So it's really nice to live in Amager, it only takes me twenty minutes to get there.

Those rhythms of mobility and movement allow the musicians to smoothly navigate and communicate across space, developing an extensive social network on a local and a global scale. According to Massey (1994), the increasing degree of mobility and the geographical stretching-out of social relations constitutes a sense of place, which is ‘extroverted’, as it “includes a consciousness of its links with the wider world” (155). It is a progressive sense of place, which is not static or fixed but actively constructed by the movement of people, commodities, and ideas (155).

Contrasting this extroverted sense of place is the fact that the most commonly drawn object on the Copenhagen maps was the musician’s private home. Little square houses, circles, hearts or other kinds of symbolic representation of the home featured frequently as the starting point or centre of the map, from where the musicians continued illustrating their musical pathways through the city. As such, the home appears to take centre stage for many music-makers, providing a basis and gateway to the pulsating rhythms of city life.

In Wellington, on the other hand, the music-makers rarely drew their private homes. Instead, Wellington’s urban materiality as it is visualized on the maps is dominated by natural rhythms leaving little space for buildings of any kind. However, besides a few important bars and venues that enliven the local music scene, some musicians drew particular private spaces, which are well known in the local music scene as they serve as community centres and creative hubs. The Moorings, Moxham Avenue, Garret Street or Patterson Street – those private spaces are shared flats, mostly occupied by local musicians who regularly host lo-fi concerts and public events. Even though none of the participants was a resident in those community houses, they knew the spaces through different public events or rehearsals. Those community houses are an integral part of Wellington’s musical infrastructure and therefore featured on several maps as well. On his drawing of Wellington, Mike describes the history of ‘the Moorings’:

Up there in Thorndon is the Moorings. Originally it was a homestead on the waterfront because the waterfront has actually been receded following a really big earthquake about a hundred years ago, so it was really close to the waterfront. The owner of the homestead created an environment for like, it was kind of like a gentlemen's club, but not like as we know it today. He would invite the captains up to drink whiskey and share news and talk about current events in the world and that sort of thing. So it's got this really nautical thing going on, even today. You can see that at one point it was really beautiful and had a lot of care and attention put into the building. You go in there today and you can see this beautiful, heavily ornamented wallpaper, which is peeling off everywhere. Decoration is everywhere, and all the windows are portholes, from ships, it's kind of kooky but it is really unique. It's a really uniquely Wellington building. So that's where it gets its name, the Mooring was where the captains go to visit and spend time with the landowner and feel important. The family that took ownership of it is pretty much the residents. The youngest of that family is Francis and he is still a resident right now. He has a big crew of flatmates. It might be similar to the artist expats in Germany or in London; they open up their house for events quite regularly.

The Moorings is therefore not only a large inner city residence with architectural and historical significance, but also a rehearsal and performance space, which enjoys a certain status in the local music scene. This combination of private and public space allows for the development of a particular atmosphere, which is highly valued among local musicians. Mike continues:

It's a really unique venue, because it is not just a venue but it is a home and you really get a sense of being hosted. The normal rules of behaviour don't apply because you've been invited into somebody's house. There have been some wild parties in there but I've also been to this really quiet, reverential, like everyone is listening intently - type of events, its really intimate and respectful. So there is this huge emotional pallet to draw from at the Moorings.

Those community houses are therefore not merely physical nodes in the city's material infrastructure but affective sites, which resonate with the musicians as they provide the emotional charge that confirms their commitment to both music-making and the city (Stahl 2007). Apart from these private flats used for community purposes, the participants rarely depicted their own, private homes on the mental maps. As such, Wellington's music-makers appeared rather disconnected from their domestic space, focussing on sociality and community spaces instead³². In Copenhagen in contrast, domestic space provides a starting point and central locus from where the individual's musical environment evolves.

³² An observation, which is based on the analysis of the maps only, yet will be rethought and reformulated in Chapter Eight after the analysis of the musicians' photographs.

The visualization of spatial rhythms on the mental maps provides useful insights into the unique composition of the musicians' physical and natural environment in each city, including significant buildings, locations and sites as well as natural elements and cycles. Those rhythms indicate a certain dynamic, emphasizing the importance of local as well as global movement, connections, and interactions. However, a comprehensive understanding of urban rhythms requires an account of the complex array of social rhythms, as they are always entangled with the spatial. Social activities, relations and traditions are an important part of the musician's everyday life and will therefore be discussed in more detail in the following paragraphs.

7.2.2. Social Rhythms

Everyday social life in the city is comprised of a complex interweaving of people, space and time. The urban turmoil is stabilized by regular patterns of flow such as the daily working hours, socializing and consumption habits, which create a distinct rhythmic "beat" that lends the everyday a certain structuredness (Zerubavel 1981). Those schedules, routes and routines are part of the musicians' social rhythms that guide them through the pulsating city life, and ground them in their urban environment.

During the analysis of the musicians' maps it became apparent that capturing social rhythms visually is challenging. This is partly due to the fact that social rhythms are a dynamic set of concrete abstractions. They attain 'real' existence "by virtue of networks and pathways, by virtue of bunches or clusters of relationships" between people, objects and energies (Lefebvre 1991, 86). Those relations are an integral part of the musician's everyday life, yet they are difficult to visualize on a drawing. Moreover, the initial purpose of the map is to provide spatial information, which directs the musicians' focus primarily on their concrete, physical environment. However, as the music-makers were allowed to express themselves freely and creatively during the mapping exercise, they frequently visualized particular social rhythms at play.

A common way to depict the social was through the use of symbols. In Copenhagen, several drawings included bottles, coffee cups or mugs which indicate social meeting

points where individual pathways congregate, “providing geographies of communality and continuity within which social activities are co-coordinated and synchronised” (Edensor 2010, 70). Such habituated activities allow the musicians to establish routines and connections, which in turn nurture their sense of familiarity, security and well-being in their urban environment.

Frequently, those symbols were related to a specific bar or venue which was often connected to a road, street or pathway, emphasizing how social rhythms are nestled in the everyday routines of the musicians.

Figure 8 Symbols of social rhythms in Copenhagen

Besides diverse objects, some musicians drew other human beings that were in some way part of their musical environment. In the case of Copenhagen, those people were mostly friends, partners or other meaningful people, such as the local baker Alis on Mikkel’s map whom he meets every Monday when he buys his favourite bread. In Wellington however, the visualized characters on the map rarely stand for a certain person but represent the local (musical) community (figure 9).

Figure 9 Visualization of people on the Wellington maps

The importance of community for musicians in Wellington was also illustrated during the previous discussion of spatial rhythms, as many respondents drew community houses instead of their own, private homes. In Copenhagen on the other hand, the music-makers value privacy and individuality, which is expressed through the illustration of their private homes, personal pathways across the city and the depiction of single individuals that in some way contribute to the development and experience of their unique sense of place.

Besides people, bottles and coffee cups, several musicians in Copenhagen visualized symbols such as the comedy and tragedy masks, which stand for the theatre, a cross and an angel illustrating the local cemetery, as well as buildings of churches and castles, which are all clearly manifestations of socio-cultural rhythms. Regardless of their individual faith or observance, several musicians were members of the National Church or Folkekirken (The People's Church), even though only very few stated to be active participants. In Denmark the church is financially supported by the state and was for many years the central provider of social programmes and welfare. Several musicians enjoyed musical education through the local church during their childhood such as singing in the church choir or learning to play church organ. As such, the church serves more as a public service organisation, providing musical education and space for concerts, which explains its frequent appearance on the musicians' maps.

Both drawings from Copenhagen and Wellington rarely featured political rhythms, which consist of institutional and governmental conditions, dynamics and regulations and are therefore difficult to visualize. Despite their complex nature, some musicians addressed political matters during the mapping exercise. Even though they only seemed to scratch the surface of the issue, they none the less provided valuable topics and ideas for the subsequent semi-structured interviews. Political rhythms that were touched upon during the mapping task usually addressed housing issues, social struggles, cultural diversity and inequality. Rebecca for instance drew her local neighbourhood and described its social diversity:

Where I live, that's where all the prostitutes are and drug addicts so that's kind of a place of silence. I know what it looks like but to draw it is hard. I like that you kind of have both sides of life, you know. You can see both, the very rich people and the very, very poor people. It's inspiring but you get to a point where you can't give any more money to the poor people because there are so many. So it's kind of hard that

you have to look at all that stuff and you can't really do anything. But there are a lot of happy people too. And there is a police station right there.

On the one side Rebecca values the city's ability to accommodate diversity and difference as it spurs creativity and inspiration, yet this social diversity is inflected by numerous tensions, which directly and indirectly impact on her personal experience of place. As such, the stark contrasts found in certain neighbourhoods create a distinctive urban atmosphere and connect or disconnect the music-makers to their environment.

Several musicians focused their drawing on the city's (affective) atmosphere instead of capturing urban materiality and infrastructure. In her mental map of Copenhagen, Halla drew a variety of symbols which each represent a part of a particular urban atmosphere at play. Natural elements such as the sun, water and green spaces signify the importance of urban nature for a pleasant atmosphere and a positive, eurhythmic experience of place. Dancing people and people in love communicate a sense of safety, familiarity and happiness. Yet Halla also captured certain tensions, which distort or adjust the 'sunny' atmosphere of the city. 'Rich' people on a boat, as well as a beggar, a dog and a prostitute in the bottom left corner of the map symbolize dissenting social rhythms, which indicate inequalities, poverty and marginalization.

Figure 10 Halla's symbolic map of Copenhagen

During the mapping exercise Halla comments on her drawing:

I started with the water because I think its a big part of the city, and there is a lot of trees. People are very open about kissing on the street and everyone is in the park in summer, cuddling and chilling. I thought of the bridge in Nørrebro where they hang out and I think that's really nice that people just find their place outside. And there are bikes, because it's a bike city [...]. But I also see a lot of division. There are poor people and there are rich people and fancy food. I guess it's quite crazy there is a really good health care system but at the same time you can see it very clearly, the division, the poor and the rich. That's what I see, I think.

Halla's symbols visualize her personal experience of Copenhagen, including sunshine and 'happy people' as well as the less 'bright' sides of everyday life in the city, which are marked by social inequality and power dynamics. According to Edensor, the rhythmic lineaments of everyday life are weighted with power. Many of those rhythms "have emerged and are emerging from an every-shifting capitalism" which, through the maintenance of normative rules and conventions, imposes a certain rhythmic conformity and spatio-temporal consistency on the everyday life of an individual (Edensor 2012, 11). Frequently those rhythms are deeply engrained in daily routines and habits and become familiar to the extent that they appear invisible. If an individual 'gets out of step' and cannot keep up with the 'rhythmic beat' that

dominates a certain group or society, they will experience what Lefebvre termed 'arrhythmia'. This state of rhythmical 'dissonance' is based on the inability to harmonise with dominant (urban) rhythms and pushes individuals to the margins of society – such as Halla's characterization of the beggar and the prostitute. Those individuals mirror the less visible, less harmonious rhythms of society, which are none the less significant aspects of (musical) life in the city.

Even though social rhythms (including cultural and political rhythms) were rarely expressed during the mapping exercise, those details are of great importance as they provide reference points for further discussion during the subsequent interviews. Furthermore, those findings will enrich the analysis of the musicians' photographs as they capture a variety of social dynamics and interactions (see Chapter Nine *Picturing Rhythms*). Most importantly however, the mental maps revealed the complex entanglement of social, spatial and affective rhythms, which also demonstrates the need for a closer investigation of the more abstract, affective rhythms associated with music-making in the city.

7.2.3 Affective Rhythms

Affective rhythms are a complex conglomerate of diverse, experiential forces and material things (Dewsbury 2009), which come about through the relations of a multiplicity of human and nonhuman entities. Those rhythms become apparent on the musicians' mental maps in mainly three different forms: as symbols, as colours, and as text.

As mentioned during the previous discussion of social rhythms, several drawings from Copenhagen featured a variety of symbols such as hearts, flowers, instruments, notes, bikes, planes, theatre masks, coffee mugs, bottles and others. Sometimes they referred directly to a certain activity such as playing music, drinking coffee or riding a bicycle. Other times they signified feelings, emotions or atmospheres such as the symbol of the sun, which signifies light and warmth or love hearts emphasizing the affective relation towards certain people and places.

Figure 11 Rikke's symbolic map of Copenhagen

In her mental map, Rikke drew people from different age groups and professional backgrounds in order to illustrate Copenhagen's diversity: elderly people, a person from the business world and an artist, all living 'under the same sky', sharing natural and physical resources. While drawing the map, she explains her idea of sharing the blue sky in more detail:

The first thing I actually think of is the blue sky. There your mind can be free. And it can be anywhere. You go to your apartment and you go to that, kind of, yeah, feeling of seeing a blue sky. So basically you can be anywhere. The blue sky is here in Copenhagen but it is also in other countries. I like the idea that we all share the blue sky and the sunshine.

The sky is in this way a symbol of inspiration and freedom yet it also connects people in the city and all over the world. This notion of connectedness is reinforced by the drawing of different coloured hands holding each other; they are "a symbol for sharing – that we all share the passion" (Rikke). Despite sharing the sky, the passion and the sun, however, the four individuals on the map seem to stand rather far apart and disconnected from each other. This dichotomy of sharing/community spirit and individualism becomes more apparent through the symbol of a globe in the top right corner of the map and a semi-circle surrounding a television and a computer in the

bottom left corner. As Rikke explains during the mapping exercise, the semi-circle symbolizes the limited possibilities for musicians in Denmark to develop their career and get their music published:

It's a lot about being in the right crowd, knowing the right people and Denmark is a bit small – it can be a bit limited sometimes. If we don't hang around in that 'hip-art-circle' it can be a bit difficult to convince or to really take the next step – to get your music out more. How can I draw that? It's difficult. Maybe I put the television here, and the laptop. I put some media here and I draw some hearts over there, where the inspiration is. If you want to enter there, if you want to walk that way to crack the bubble, it can be a bit difficult. But it's possible.

Entering the local 'hip-art-circle' and establishing a social network seem therefore hard work and rather tiresome but necessary in order to 'crack the bubble' and be a successful musician. Even though the individuals appear to move freely under the blue sky, accompanied by love hearts illustrating their inspiration, and passion, they seem to be under pressure to 'mediate' their way into the successful art scene. Opposing the enclosed, local 'art-circle' are the global rhythms and dynamics, which are visualized through the symbol of the globe. As Rikke explains:

Let me draw one last thing, the globe. Just Copenhagen is not enough. You have to think more. Also with your music, like I told you, you have to think that it can be used all over the world.

Similar to the 'highway out of the city' or the bridge to Sweden, as visualized on other drawings from Copenhagen, the globe on Rikke's map illustrates the musicians' increasing mobility and aspiration towards global rhythms which lends the map a certain atmosphere and points towards an progressive or extroverted sense of place (Massey 1994). Hence, the diverse symbols on Rikke's map illustrate not only certain objects and activities but capture particular affects, sensibilities and intensities at play, which are all part of the charged atmospheres of the everyday (Stewart 2011).

Comparing the drawings from Wellington and Copenhagen it became apparent that the use of symbols was more frequent on the Copenhagen maps. This can be due to language barriers, which prompted the Danish respondents to visualize their thoughts more often. As a way of highlighting and clarifying the symbol's affective dimension, most musicians used various colours during the mapping exercise. Red, yellow blue and green were generally used in relation to positive emotions and atmospheres such as love, affection, warmth, inspiration, action, activity or fun. Black, brown and grey

however were rather used to illustrate the less exciting objects and places in the musician's urban environment.

In his map of Wellington, Nick coloured different streets, buildings and places depending on their 'feel' and use. 'Music stuff' is coloured blue, 'fun stuff' red, 'negative/boring stuff' orange and 'food' yellow.

Figure 12 Nick's colourful map of Wellington

In some places such as Cuba Street or Courtenay Place those colours blend into each other, creating an opaque mix of activities and atmospheres which signal the complexity of Wellington's rhythmical makeup. For Nick, each street holds a certain affective charge – a compound of various feelings, affects and atmospheres which mix and mingle in space and gain intensity the closer one gets. He explains his approach during the mapping exercise in more detail:

You can see it in two ways. You can see it this way, as a map, but then, as walking through it, and visualizing it, every street has a feeling. Like, Cuba Street has a collection of feelings all the way down, depending on what bar you are walking past or who is there. Taranaki Street is really sterile - my old school is here, that always has some sort of feeling to it. But then you can drill deeper and deeper and deeper like zooming in Google Maps and you see different memories every time you go in [...]. I just see it as a whole collection of different little worlds and every world is located on a bigger world – they all relate to each other [...]. Yeah, that is kind of

how I see it, like every place is kind of a mixture of stuff, and it is feelings as much as landmarks or memories.

Nick's map demonstrates the dynamic process of peoples' relationship to place, whereby different "worlds are drawn together in a lasting way" (Seamon 1993, 219). In his comment he refers to the complex layering of urban rhythms, the particular ways in which changing rhythmic processes interweave "to afford places a mixity of temporal events of varying regularity" including present feelings and past memories which all contribute to the city's 'polyrhythmic ensemble' (Edensor 2012, 3). In this way, Nick's drawing reminds us that one's sense of place consists of "various (and uneven) networks of time stretching in different and divergent directions across an uneven social field" (May and Thrift 2001, 5). Feelings of time as suggested through urban rhythms are a vital part of one's sense of identity and a matter of deep emotional importance (Wunderlich 2008a). However, as the various colours and labels (fun/boring) on Nick's map illustrate, urban rhythms are not merely traces of time in space but they take the form of memories, feelings and affective ways of engaging with the urban environment.

The musician's mental map serves in this way as a tool for capturing the concrete and physical layout of the city as well as its less visible, intangible (affective) rhythms, which are hard to grasp and challenging to articulate. This ability to capture the affective rhythms and atmospheres of urban spaces was clearly demonstrated in Richard's map of Wellington. Instead of drawing buildings, streets and natural spaces he illustrated creative currents and affective intensities in a colourful, experimental way.

Figure 13 Richard's experimental and affective map of Wellington

Through the combination of straight and circular lines, visualized in various colours, Richard creates a rendering of Wellington, which is largely confined to the city's cultural experiences and affective intensities. Without sketching explicit buildings, objects and places he draws a mental map which is laden with context and meaning yet difficult to 'read' without his personal comments:

This is just some general rendering. So that's the harbour, that's the CBD and this is some sort of Cuba Street. This goes down to Newtown. What I'm kind of going for is a kind of affective thing in terms of cultural experiences in space and an affective intensity in terms of urban cultural creative experiences and also the velocity or activity of urban spaces as well. The red and orange represent some expression of a kind of cultural affect that circulates in that urban space. These lines represent another dimension – a kind of architectural print or structure. The green things are kind of like some abstract rendering of the green spaces in Wellington and there is a rendering of the harbour and some sort of expression of the Hutt.

Richard's map is a dynamic visualization of the city's urban texture, which captures affective rhythms and atmospheres in the form of "descriptive detours," a way to account for some of the more elusive aspects of the sociomusical experience of music-makers in the city (Stewart 2011, 445). Through the use of colours such as red, yellow and orange, Richard depicts a "speculative topography of the everyday sensibilities" which presents his 'musical environment' not as "the dead or reeling

effect of distant systems but as lived affects with tempos, sensory knowledges, orientations, transmutations, habits [and] rogue force fields” (446). Richard’s map reminds us therefore of the body’s capacity to affect and to be affected which shapes the myriad encounters taking place between individual bodies and other finite things in the city. As such, affect becomes part of a “reflexive loop which allows more and more sophisticated interventions in various registers of urban life” (Thrift 2004, 58).

Besides colours and symbols however, musicians from Wellington frequently used written text – not only for the labelling of certain streets and buildings but to provide further details in regards to cityscape and nature:

South Coast rocky and cool

Lambton Quay, no point going down here. Busy. Crazy fast.

City stuff if you are into that

Intercultural, creative stuff

Live music and cool events

Those words provide additional information to the city’s urban texture and facilitate the creation of a certain ‘feel’, texture or ambience of place – such as the ‘crazy, busy’ atmosphere of the business district or the ‘rocky, cool’ appeal of Wellington’s South Coast. Some musicians used the text to express explicit feelings towards a certain place or scenery:

Beautiful sunrise here

The beautiful hills of green

Newtown - awesome place!

Eastborne - Beautiful in the evening

The musicians’ words clearly illustrate their affective bond towards the city, which in some cases encouraged them to write short tips and recommendations for the ‘viewer’ of the map, which seems similar to the advice of a tourist guidebook:

Swim here

Town Belt: do stuff here (mountain bike, walk)

Waterfront: stroll, escape, admire

Those phrases are articulations of the musicians' 'love of place' or topophilia (Tuan 1974). They are manifestations of their affective bond to Wellington, based on positive experiences and memories that inhabit, permeate and create their unique sense of place. However, as Anne Buttimer reminds us "most of this experience is not consciously processed [...] that is why words are so hard to find – for this place allows head and heart, body and spirit, imagination and will to become harmonized and creative" (Buttimer 1980, 172–173). In this sense, the mental map provides a 'creative surface' that allows the music-makers to express any feelings, opinions and affects toward their everyday urban environment in a visual as well as in a verbal manner.

However, there was a significant difference between verbal expressions in Wellington and Copenhagen. While musicians in Wellington used words and phrases quite regularly, verbal expressions were rather rare on the Copenhagen maps. Here the respondents expressed their affective bond through various symbols instead. This difference of visual and verbal expressions can be related to the musicians' language barrier in Copenhagen. Instead of using explicit words to explain certain feelings or atmospheres, the musicians drew colourful symbols, which are less likely 'lost in translation' as their meaning is usually understood universally. Generally, in both cities, colours, words and symbols were used in order to express various affective rhythms, which in turn reveal a certain urban atmosphere. As Stewart suggests, (urban) atmospheres are an affective force field comprised of rhythms, valences, moods, sensations, tempos, and lifespans (2011, 445). Attending to the charged atmospheres of the everyday is what Stewart refers to as 'atmospheric attunements' – "an intimate, compositional process of dwelling in spaces that bears, gestures, gestates, worlds" (445). The maps are therefore not only visualizations of the musician's concrete urban environment, but they are descriptive detours that allow for an atmospheric attunement – an affective alignment of the senses to the charged atmospheres of everyday (urban) life (445). They reveal affective rhythms, intimacies

and intensities that accumulate in ordinary moments of living. They yield the creation of different worlds, flows, experiences, conditions, dreams and imaginaries and create a link between the spatial, social and the affective: “here, things matter not because of how they are represented but because they have qualities, rhythms, forces, relations and movements” (445). In this way, the musicians’ maps are tools for attending to the charged atmospheres of the everyday. They provide some kind of ‘haptic description’ that allows for the attunement of the senses to the multiple rhythms that shape the music-makers’ experience and interaction within their urban environment (445).

During the description of her personal map of Copenhagen, Maria refers to the Danish concept of *‘hygge/hyggeilig’*, which is commonly used in order to express a certain atmospheric perception of space and can be approximated through English words such as cosiness, relaxedness or down-to-earth-ness (Linnet 2011, 3):

I was thinking about the streets, especially in the city centre – the cobbled streets. There is also a lot of water around the city. I love the water. Copenhagen has both, nature and old culture old houses with small, fine details. It's all about the things that are between the houses also. There are just so many things in the city. There are the green parks where people hang out and stuff and there's the little streets in-between the houses and then there is a lot of water, the canals and the ocean. There have always been a lot of people coming to the city from outside by boats and stuff. All that is kind of a part of that *hyggeligness* – of that word (Maria).

Copenhagen’s *hyggeligness*, or “cosiness,” for Maria is therefore expressed through various social, spatial and affective rhythms such as the cobbled streets, the canals, the ocean, people from ‘outside’ and the ‘things’ between the houses – which could either refer to the more intimate and private forms of socialization or different materialities “pressing into the expressivity of something coming into existence” (Stewart 2011, 446). The mapping exercise allows the musicians therefore to reflect upon their relation to the city and express those thoughts, intensities and feelings freely and creatively. In this way, mental maps are not only orientation techniques for the music-makers through which they organize their image of the city both spatially and temporally but they provide access to different kinds of knowledge including the multisensory, embodied and affective experience of place. As such, the musicians’ mental maps are indicators of highlighting subjective experiences, affects, and sensations, “uncovering realities previously unseen or unimagined, even across seemingly exhausted grounds” (Corner 2011, 89). This uncovering of the unconscious

adds another dimension to the research process and identifies mapping as a powerful mode of visual research.

7.3 Summary: Mapping atmospheric attunements

The use of mental mapping for the purpose of this study was motivated by the desire to explore the diverse rhythms, affects and atmospheres constituting the music-makers' sense of place in Wellington and Copenhagen. It was a fruitful technique of experience and experiment that allowed me to access the multiple narratives of place including visible and tangible aspects such as material and natural rhythms which constitute the musicians' physical (urban) environment as well as other less tangible, less readily apparent but no less significant elements such as social and affective rhythms, all of which are fundamental factors that anchor the music-makers to the city. Hence, besides providing specific details and information about each city, the mapping exercise allowed me to register different valences, moods, sensations and tempos that create a certain (urban) atmosphere. As such, the maps facilitated an atmospheric attunement in the form of 'descriptive detours', a way to account for some of the more elusive aspects that shape the music-makers' sociomusical experience in Wellington and Copenhagen (Stewart 2011, 445). This cartographic representation of the city concretizes therefore in many ways what might otherwise be a more abstract depiction revealed through interviews.

Besides affective aspects, the analysis of the maps has brought to the fore similarities and differences of the musicians' socio-spatial relationships to music-making in Wellington and Copenhagen. The drawings uncovered the importance of local and global connectedness in Copenhagen's music scene, which points towards an extroverted sense of place. In Wellington on the other hand, the maps revealed the centrality of community for the local scene's development, vitality and atmosphere suggesting a sense of place, which is socially and geographically rather introverted. Those aspects will be explored in more detail in the following chapters during the analysis of the photographs and interviews in order to provide a holistic rhythmanalytical examination of the musicians' sense of place in Wellington and Copenhagen.

Mental mapping has proven to be an effective technique to capture the rhythmical dimensions of music-making in the city, as it makes visible the interwovenness of socialities, atmospheres, object, texts and images in people's everyday lives and in this way affords opportunities for attending to the affective charge of certain places, and capture some of the diverse spatial, social and affective rhythms shaping music-making in the city. As such, the maps make possible a thicker description of the polyrhythmic environments, energies, affective affinities, and atmospheres underlying musical activity in the city.

However, an important detail about the mapping exercise is the fact that it took place indoors; hence there was no direct contact between the musicians and the city spaces they were drawing. The information revealed on the maps is therefore only based on the respondent's memories and imaginations of the places without audible, visual, olfactory or tactile stimuli. For this reason, photo-elicitation was added to the methodological mix. As a participatory research method conducted 'in the field', it prompted participants to capture specific rhythmic moments, atmospheres and places in a snapshot without the need to fully understand and articulate the particular affects at play. The usefulness and effectiveness of those snapshots will be discussed in the following chapter.

Chapter 8 - Picturing Rhythms

8.1 General procedure

Each music-maker was given a 35mm single-use camera with 24 exposures and the task to take photos of their ‘musical environment’ within a period of three to five weeks. During that time we stayed in touch in case any questions or problems would arise. Whenever the respondents were ready, I collected the cameras, developed the film and arranged a second interview meeting in order to examine the photographs together with the musicians. Most participants used the entire film to capture their everyday rhythms and routines, yet some musicians returned the camera before the film was fully used up. Everyone seemed positive towards the method and was excited to examine the pictures after they had been developed. Since taking photographs is a common activity among young adults, everyone seemed to understand and appreciate the task rather quickly. The fact that the camera was analogue sparked the interest of the musicians as it offers an alternative to the omnipresent digital picture-taking with smartphones, tablets and cameras. According to Schrey (2014), this greater interest in analogue technology is due to a distinct sense of nostalgia for the “allegedly ‘dead media’ that in fact, continue to haunt a popular culture obsessed with its own past” (27). Furthermore, having a camera in order to portray their everyday lives allowed the musicians to exercise power as they could choose who and what to photograph and in this way capture their personal worlds from their own point of view. As such, the camera allowed the participants for instance to portray personal spaces without the researcher intruding on their private sphere. The exercising of power and the joy of taking photographs in general were valuable factors, which contributed to the successful capturing of the musicians’ everyday urban rhythms.

During the photo-elicitation interview the participants were engaged and talkative, browsing through their photographs, explaining its motif and content. It is important to note that the content of the photos is polyrhythmic. Just as the musicians’ mental maps are visualizations of the multiple (urban) rhythms at play, so are the photographs snapshots of diverse rhythmical dimensions permeating the music-maker’s everyday life in the city. In this sense, most images are not merely an

objective documentation of a certain rhythm, moment or place but capture a multitude of (urban) rhythms, affects and atmospheres which shape the music-makers' sense of place in Wellington and Copenhagen. In general, most photographs pictured diverse public spaces such as venues, cafés or schools; private, domestic space; natural spaces including parks, lakes and the ocean and diverse objects such as bikes, instruments and media devices. Frequently the photos encouraged the musicians to describe and tell stories about things or events that were outside the image's frame. Those details contributed to the musician's sociomusical experience of the city and were thus an underlying reason for taking the photograph. After the photo-elicitation interviews, the content of the images had to be studied in more detail. Hence, I arranged, organized, analysed, re-arranged, and re-organized the photographs multiple times before I could identify certain rhythms, patterns or themes. This process of intensive content analysis allowed me finally to establish certain overarching categories in which images from either city could be assigned.

- Home and Away
- Nature meets Culture
- Objects and Objectives
- People and Places

These categories are based on dominant rhythms constituting the photograph's motif and content. *Home and Away* is based on the prevalence of domestic (spatial) and global rhythms. *Nature meets Culture* captures dominant natural and cultural rhythms, *Objects and Objectives* includes spatial rhythms, rhythms of communication and individualization and *People and Places* features social, cultural and spatial rhythms. As mentioned earlier, it is important to remember that the photograph is polyrhythmic and therefore comprises a complex compound of various rhythms, which interact, mix and mingle in space. In order to fully grasp and analyse the musician's sense of place as it is captured on the photographs, it is therefore necessary to allow those rhythms to interact and unfold as they uncover different people, places, objects, events, interactions, atmospheres, fluxes, and flows around the city.

8.2 Home and Away

The photos in this category capture the musicians' domestic environment as well as their relation to global rhythms and atmospheres. As the previous mapping analysis revealed, domestic space constitutes a central locus in Copenhagen's music scene. It frequently served as a starting point of the mapping exercise from where the musicians continued to illustrate their musical pathways through the city. In Wellington however, the participants rarely drew their private homes, but local community spaces instead.

In the beginning of the photo-elicitation process, I was curious to see if this observation was reflected in the photographs as well. An initial analysis of the images revealed that in contrast to the rather rare appearance of the musician's home on the Wellington maps, domestic space was a common motif on the photographs. Various images depict the musician's home in its multiple modes of use – as rehearsal space, meeting place, space for socializing, mingling, relaxing and entertaining. Hence, most images include a diverse range of people, movement and activities besides the domestic environment.

Figure 14 Photographs of the musicians' use of domestic space in Wellington

The photographs illustrate that musicians in Wellington usually live in shared flats, many of which are detached or semi-detached houses with some kind of patio or garden area. During the elicitation interview, some participants described their homes as “creative households”, “social spaces where a lot of people gather” and “a lot of music happens”. This indicates that the home is not only a space for rest and relaxation but for creative work and socializing at the same time. In fact, several musicians emphasized that their homes are regularly used for band rehearsals or teaching purposes. Moreover, private flats are frequently opened up for public events in order to provide a space for the musical community to gather and socialize. As such, the home constitutes a multi-faceted space where private and public rhythms continually mix and mingle. In this sense, it is not a fixed or static location but an ever-changing lived space which is based on the “ongoing and mediated interaction between self, others and place” (Gorman-Murray and Dowling 2007, 5). Scott took a photo of his flat and explained its social as well as its affective significance during the elicitation interview:

Figure 15 Picture of Scott's flat

This is where I lived for two years. It's just a really cool flat and I did lots of writing there and playing there. And, I don't know, I just always thought it's kind of a cool house sitting on the edge just there. So I thought I'd take a photo of a place where I used to live and a lot of stuff happened. It's where I lived for a while and it's actually

been a real awesome house; Just a real social house where everyone kind of gathered because it's so central. Everyone jammed there, partied there and just crashed there for a couple of nights (Scott).

For Scott, his flat is a social, creative and affective site where he writes, plays and listens to music, socializes and relaxes. As such, the home is a polyrhythmic field where spatial, social and affective rhythms mix and mingle, creating a 'spatial imaginary' which is based on the "fusion of the imaginative and affective – what we envision and desire home to be – intertwined with the material and physical – an actual location which can embody and realise our need for belonging, affirmation and sustenance" (Gorman-Murray and Dowling 2007, 2). The notion of home reaches therefore far beyond its physical form as it is always embodied with the emotional and affective. In Wellington, musicians emphasize the social aspect of the home as it provides a space for collaboration and inspiration that draws the musical community together – as Jessie's comment underpins:

Our house was just full of music as well; just so many musicians lived there or travelled through there. It was just a lot of different combinations of bands and people living together.

Apart from their own private spaces, several musicians took photographs of diverse community houses around the city such as Moxham Avenue or Garrett Street, which frequently featured on the maps as well, emphasizing their role as 'creative hubs' and key feature in the local scene's infrastructure.

Figure 16 Garrett Street, a famous Wellington flat

That's Garret Street. It's just a very creative household. It's this mix of private and public. It's a private home but they open it up for gigs – that's pretty special. It shows how integrated homes are to Wellington's music scene. People really open up their homes for music. It's just this kind of blur of what's public and what people do to open up to music (Lillian).

Even though the home has “traditionally been constructed as a ‘private’ space away from the demands of ‘public’ life” (Morrison 2010, 33) there is no clear distinction between those realms within the domestic sphere for Wellington's musicians. The conception of home clearly extends beyond the boundaries of the private allowing for a ‘creative household’ to develop which is always ‘open’ for musical friends and family.

In Copenhagen, on the other hand, the photographic depiction of domestic space gives a rather different impression. Instead of images with band rehearsals and social gatherings several photographs illustrate the musician's home as a functional ‘office space’, equipped with personal computers and instruments. Those images depict usually no other individuals but sometimes the musicians themselves.

Figure 17 Photos of the musicians' domestic space in Copenhagen

Here, the functional character of the home seems to come to the fore, constituting a space which is used effectively in order to “regulate the ebb and flow of one’s activities, providing a key spatial reference from which all other perspectives on worldly contact might draw” (LaBelle 2010, 49). In this way, the home is a stable site where the musicians prepare themselves for the rhythmic challenges of everyday life: they practice or create music, relax and recharge their batteries and in this way organize their careers from ‘behind the scene’ – as their comments illustrate:

This is my office, which I moved into this place (the kitchen). This is where I sit and do endless amounts of emailing and basically setting up concerts for the next year to come (Mikkel).

This is me in my office. There are really some periods where I’m in the office for ten hours a day, doing all kinds of boring stuff. I don’t have a rehearsal space, so this is my rehearsal space as well. Everything is in this apartment. Most of the time I would play at daytime, when everybody is at work (Terkel).

This is my home, this is my corner. I have a cello and a guitar and a piano, that’s the instruments where I make music on. You can see some of the apartment here, I love it. It has a little balcony here, you can sit in the mornings and have a coffee, it’s so nice. It’s also a place where I spend a lot of time when I’m not busy (Maria).

Maria refers to the home as ‘her corner’ which resembles what Gaston Bachelard in his *Poetics of Space* points out “for our house is our corner of the world [...] it is our first universe, a real cosmos in every sense of the word” (1994, 4). The sphere of domestic space is in this way a ‘a corner’ or key geographic point from which the multiple (urban) rhythms are guided and controlled. As such, it is a singularly fixed spaced which is in stark contrast to the rhythmic movements and energies of everyday life in the city. As LaBelle suggests: “the home is a fixed yet potent concept against which all other spaces are balanced and experienced” (LaBelle 2010, 48). In this way, domestic space serves also as a safe space where the musicians can withdraw from the busy everyday life:

What happened for me is, that my life is very much divided into mainly two ways. There is the super busy on-tour time where everything is happening, right now, moving between countries, flying between countries, playing lots of concerts and there is this place at home – which is an inspirational place where I can relax and just let ideas flow (Mikkel).

Mikkel’s comment implies, that the home is not only a functional office space but also a space of relaxation, recreation and privacy that allows one to unwind, gather new energy and inspiration. This observation became increasingly evident during the elicitation interviews as several musicians expressed their affective relation towards their homes. Nanna for instance took a selfie from inside her living-room to illustrate the importance of ‘coming home’ after an exhausting day of work.

Figure 18 Nanna captures the home as a safe haven and space for relaxation

I was out performing, writing songs, being there; I use a lot of energy when I am out playing music. So when I'm coming home, it's not that I'm dead but it's almost nothing in me. Let me be and let me relax. I use so much energy in my job that I have to use just as much time to recharge at home, shutting everybody out. So I recharge at home. So this is it. No make-up, no smiles (Nanna).

Nanna's comment illustrates how the home can be "appreciated as a counter-balance to the dynamics of exposure" which are inevitable in the musician's everyday life. The experience of coming home gives her comfort and allows her to "reprieve from the demands of the exterior world" (LaBelle 2010, 48). This relation of the interior/domestic and exterior/urban space became more apparent on diverse photographs that capture the view from inside the music-maker's apartment onto their urban surroundings.

Figure 19 Photos depicting the view from the musicians' apartments in Copenhagen

This 'inside-out' perspective reminds us of Lefebvre's chapter 'Seen from the Window'. Here, Lefebvre uses the 'framework' of a window (or the window as a framework) from where he observes the rhythms of everyday life in Paris: "the intermittent flows and breaks in the movement of people and automobiles, the bodies occupying the streets and public squares, the festive agglomeration of difference"

(Moore 2013, 74). However, Lefebvre emphasizes that the window offers more than the mere view onto the city:

The window on the street is not a mental place from which the interior gaze would be following abstract perspectives. A practical site, private and concrete, the window offers views that are more than spectacles. Perspectives, which are mentally prolonged so that the implication of this spectacle carries its explanation. Familiarity preserves it as it disappears and is reborn, with the everyday life of inside and out (1996a, 224).

As such the window serves as a framework from which the musicians can observe the hectic city life. It creates an ‘inside-out’ perspective which portrays the home as a secluded space away from people and the urban turmoil which emphasizes the significance of the domestic as a safe haven that allows the musicians to withdraw and observe the world from behind the scene. During the elicitation-interview the respondents explained those photographs, emphasizing the importance of intimacy, privacy and safety within their domestic sphere.

That’s the view from my kitchen window. It’s just a very, very personal place for me, and a very important place for me. I’ve been living in my apartment for nine years (Rikke).

That’s the view from my living room where I usually write my songs. It’s a nice place because in the daytime the sun is shining and in the nighttime people are partying. I like that. So I open the window and I hear laughter and cars and just the city somehow in the background (Louise).

So this is the view from my flat. It’s just the building on the opposite side. I took a picture because this is what I see when I look outside – and I love rain, and snow and it was a rainy day, so I like that. I’m at the fifth floor. I just like looking at the sky, what’s happening in the sky. You have this environment in your home and suddenly something unexpected turns up (Anna).

I guess I took that photo because it’s been a place that I felt safe the past year (Sofie).

Following those experiences, the home can be characterized as what LaBelle termed ‘soft space’ - a safe haven sheltered from the rhythmical tumult of the city, which allows for intimacy, privacy and relaxing comfort to occur (LaBelle 2010, 48). This definition stands in stark contrast to the way domestic space is experienced and celebrated in Wellington’s music scene. Here the home is a social space; a place where private and public rhythms coalesce facilitating social interaction and creative exchange between artists, friends and families.

Besides those local, domestic rhythms the musicians in Copenhagen captured various global rhythms in their photographs. Figure twenty-one illustrates a series of images that directly and indirectly point towards the ‘outside world’. Those pictures emphasize what has already been revealed during the mapping exercise when the respondents drew certain symbols including bridges, airplanes or a globe. Similar to the drawings, the photographs indicate an increasing degree of mobility and desire for global connectedness, which, in this way, is itself part of what constitutes the musician’s sense of place (Massey 1994).

Figure 20 Photos illustrating the link to global rhythms in Copenhagen

During the elicitation interview Paula explained her intention behind the photograph of the globe:

This is a globe that we have standing at home – I point on a random spot there, I think it just stands for the fact that I still want to see so much of the world.

The motif of those photographs points towards the less tangible, affective rhythms of the everyday, which are significant aspects of the musician’s urban environment. Instead of picturing an existing place or person, those images symbolize an aspiration and desire to expand the local musical environment and reach out towards global rhythms and dynamics. Those symbols can therefore be understood as

“nonrepresentational participants” in the musician’s process and practices of making sense of their (urban) place (Latham and McCormack 2009, 253). In order to understand the way in which Wellington’s and Copenhagen’s music-making each enunciate their uniqueness, it is therefore necessary to acknowledge that places are a product of a rhythmic layering which includes “different sets of linkages both local and to the wider world” (Massey 1994, 68).

This rhythmic layering becomes also apparent on Anna’s photo of a pinboard in her apartment, which displays a collection of souvenirs from all over the world.

Figure 21 Anna's pinboard with collected items from all over the world

These are things that I collected. It’s not like a scrapbook but it’s just little things that I collect from festivals or many of the things here are from travels all over, like, South America, Asia, Jordan, Israel, the States, funny things that I just like to keep. It’s probably things that have inspired me in one-way or another.

Anna consciously holds on to souvenirs from different countries and assembles them like trophies across her pin board, which clearly illustrates the affective impact of global rhythms. Those material objects serve as an *aide-mémoire* as they preserve the memory of significant place experiences, which in turn affect the way Anna perceives her everyday urban environment. Her photograph pictures therefore quite literally the layering of the various (urban) rhythms, pointing towards a sense of place which is

extroverted, which includes “a consciousness of its links with the wider world, which integrates in a positive way the global and the local” (Massey 1994, 28).

The category *Home and Away* consists of photographs capturing spatial, social and affective rhythms, providing valuable insights into the musician’s (affective) relation to their domestic environment as well as to the ‘wider world’. Photographs of the airport, a globe or a world-map illustrate the significance of global mobility and connectedness in Copenhagen, which supports Massey’s idea of a progressive, or global sense of place. On the other hand, the photos depict the musician’s domestic space, which, in Copenhagen, constitutes a counter balance to global movement, rhythms and atmospheres. Here, the home is a safe haven and space for relaxation and recovery. In Wellington, in contrast, the photographs illuminate the fusing of social, spatial and affective rhythms in the musician’s private space, which turns the home into a ‘creative hub’ for collaboration and inspiration that draws the musical community together.

8.3 Nature meets Culture

This category includes photographs that picture the musician’s natural environment as well as the encounter of natural and socio-cultural rhythms including various events, activities and practices, traditions and rituals that are all part of the musicians’ everyday life in Wellington and Copenhagen. In this sense, *Nature meets Culture* aims at capturing human as well as non-human rhythms, as they exist separately, mix and adjust to each other. Edensor reminds us that the non-human dimensions of place have too often be considered a “passive backdrop upon which human activity unfolds” (Edensor 2012, 7). Yet places are “always becoming, and a human, whether stationary or travelling, is one element in a seething space pulsing with intersecting trajectories and temporalities” (7). Consequently, the following paragraphs will acknowledge the rhythms of nature as they are a substantial part of the musicians’ urban environment and deeply impact on their sense of place in Wellington and Copenhagen.

The previous mapping exercise revealed the dominance of natural rhythms in Wellington as most drawings depicted the musician’s vast natural surroundings. In

Copenhagen on the other hand, those details took up a rather small part of the maps. After completing the mapping exercise, I was curious to examine the ways natural rhythms appear on the musicians' photographs.

A first review of the images revealed that natural rhythms played an important role for participants from either city. Several images depicted natural spaces such as parks, cemeteries, bush or beaches as well natural elements in the private realm including pot plants or pets. The idea that urban green spaces are important for people's health and well-being has been advocated for many years by a variety of (urban) researchers. Carey Knecht (2004) who reviewed a broad range of empirical research on nature's effects on physical, psychological and spiritual well-being, emphasizes the power of natural rhythms to restore the spirit of urban dwellers:

Urban green space may reduce physiological stress levels, restore mental abilities, and foster neighbourhood social ties. Wilderness experiences may provide the stress-reducing and attention restoring benefits of everyday nature in a longer-lasting way. They are also associated with a variety of spiritual/transcendent experiences that provide benefits such as greater self-confidence, a sense of belonging to something greater than oneself, and renewed clarity on "what really matters (82).

These benefits of everyday urban nature were frequently part of the photo-elicitation conversation, as the musicians explained the intention and meaning behind particular images detailing their natural urban surrounding. Even though some of the musicians' comments were rather sparse, they nevertheless brought to the fore the image's distinctive affective charge. Together words and photos allowed for the capturing of the charged atmospheres of the everyday (Stewart 2011) as they revealed the musicians' mundane experiences of natural rhythms in both cities in their multiple manifestations.

Figure 22 Picturing natural rhythms in Copenhagen

This is by the sea. Sometimes I take my bike to Amager Strandpark. I grew up near the sea so it's important to me. I didn't go swimming, I just watched. I love the way it just looks the same – the sky, the sea – it's one. It's very beautiful (Louise).

Figure 23 Picturing natural rhythms in Wellington

I rode my bike up there, awesome. All the way through the bush. I really like being in the bush. I like the trees and the expansive feeling, I get satisfaction. I love being surrounded by trees, the colours and the sound is cool too. I really like that and in the end you get to a view when you look out (Ed).

Whether Copenhagen or Wellington, the music-makers articulated their affective relation towards urban nature, using words such as “expansive”, “cool”, “beautiful” and “important” which underline nature’s power and significance. Consequently, those photos communicate more than the obvious and the symbolic but also illustrate the strong affective rhythms at play. As Latham and McCormack remind us, an image is never just a representational snapshot. Rather, photographs can be understood as resonant blocks of sensation with an affective intensity: “they make sense not just because we take time to figure out what they signify, but also because their pre-signifying affective materiality is felt in bodies” (Thrift quoted in Latham and McCormack 253). For this reason, the musicians’ photographs provide an understanding of the temporal, spatial and, more importantly, affective dimensions shaping the music-makers’ sense of place in Wellington and Copenhagen.

As mentioned earlier, a striking difference in the appearance of natural rhythms on the photographs is the way they mix and mingle with socio-cultural rhythms. In this way, urban nature offers not only an important setting for recreation and relaxation but “opens a wide field of human interactions” (Priego, Breuste, and Rojas 2008, 2). In Wellington, several images featured social gatherings in diverse natural settings such as summery outdoor festivals or casual hangouts at the beach.

Figure 24 Fusing natural and socio-cultural rhythms in Wellington

Figure 25 Outdoor festivals illustrating the fusion of socio-cultural and natural rhythms in Wellington

As such, natural and socio-cultural rhythms seem to be closely knit together as urban green spaces offer possibilities for more creative engagement and collaboration, which strengthen the sense of solidarity and community among local musicians. This amalgamation of the natural and the social creates spaces of possibility and dynamic sites of activity, which nurture the local musical community, as Lillian's comment illustrates:

One of the things I love about New Zealand music, is all the outdoor festivals. It's just nice. It's a place where you bump into people. People that I know, that are playing in bands there, just have a dance or catch up. This is a really nice place to hang out. Yeah, and something about outdoors, sunshine, which is very special. It must happen all over the world but for me it just feels like a New Zealand summer thing.

Outdoor events allow the musicians to actively engage with their (natural) urban space and the local musical community, which further deepens their affective attachment to the city. As Malpas reminds us "it is through our engagement with place that our own human being is made real, but it is also through our engagement that place takes on a sense and a significance of its own" (2009, 23). The participation and organisation of outdoor events is therefore an integral part of the musician's sociomusical experience of the city and affects their quality of life and well-being, for the "richness" of one's life is "directly tied to the way in which the lived relation to place comes to be articulated and expressed" (Malpas 2001, 232). The fusion of natural and social rhythms is for this reason fundamental in the determination of the music-maker's experience and sense of place in Wellington.

Figure 26 Fusion of natural and cultural rhythms in Copenhagen

In Copenhagen on the other hand, the musicians' photographs suggest that the combination of natural and cultural rhythms is of great significance. Several musicians decided to take photos of urban outdoor spaces with a distinct cultural 'feel', such as Halla who took a photo of a park in the suburb of Nørrebro, which she refers to as 'cultural place':

Just one or two years ago this park was totally shitty and now it's really nice. They've been trying to get it to be like a cultural place in this area. I went there and met my friend. We were just sitting there for a few hours in the sun, talking. It's really nice there.

The architecture and street art in the background clearly indicate traces and manifestations of cultural dynamics, which lend the photograph a particular 'feel' and atmosphere. Halla points out that 'they've been trying to get it to be like a cultural place' which implies the active participation of diverse actors (urban planners, artists, activists) in the transformation of the urban space, which contributes to the creation of a positive image and a sense of attachment. This process of collective spatial appropriation is based on the fusion of natural and socio-cultural rhythms, which allows individuals to 'conquer' certain spaces, make them part of their everyday urban environment and in this way develop patterns of beliefs, feelings, and expectations towards that urban area (Proshansky 1978, 167). Debra Lattanzi Shutika (2011) states that it is the types and quality of relationships people build and maintain with their urban environment that shapes their attachment and sense of that place. Consequently, Shutika argues, following Setha Low that "place is space made

culturally meaningful” (Low 1994, 66) it is the “lived context for all human activity and cultural processes” (Shutika 2011, 10).

Another common motif demonstrating the process of transforming (public) space into place through the attachment of cultural meaning is Copenhagen’s Assistens Kirkegård (Assistens Cemetery). Several musicians expressed their attachment to the cemetery, as it is not only a burial site of various Danish writers and thinkers, but an important greenspace for repose and relaxation.

Figure 27 The Assistens Cemetery in Copenhagen

During the elicitation interview Anna describes her fascination with the cemetery, which is primarily based on the weaving together of culture and nature:

I think this is maybe my favourite place. I think it’s such a nice mixture of culture and nature. It’s like a culture-nature mix with these names of people, and words and crosses, but it’s also lots of different kind of trees. So many different kinds of trees and bushes, so, I love taking walks there, thinking about whatever. Big thoughts, music, sometimes I’m going there to write a little bit. I love the little paths where you feel like you can get lost even though I know it quite well now. It seems bizarre but it’s just the quietness and the stories. It starts your imagination.

For Anna it is mainly the mixture of natural elements (trees, bushes, little paths) with cultural details (gravestones, inscriptions) but also the tranquillity and stillness of the cemetery, which allows for an “emplaced engagement with the material, sensory, social and cultural context in which we dwell” (Pink 2007, 62). In this way, Anna’s

photograph demonstrates that the meaningfulness of place is based on “some mix of memory, sensual experience and interpretation” which for her come together in the rhythmical layout of the cemetery (Hague and Jenkins 2005, 4).

Another motif that demonstrates the link between natural and cultural rhythms in Copenhagen is the church. As the analysis of the musicians’ mental maps has already indicated, the church is a rather significant landmark in Copenhagen’s music scene. This observation was reinforced by the fact that several musicians took photographs of diverse churches around the city, such as Rikke who captured a church in her neighbourhood. During the interview she explained the significance of its cultural as well as natural aspects:

This is the church in my neighbourhood. I took the photo mostly to show the cultural base we have here. We are surrounded by that, and it’s part of the Danish culture and history. But it’s not just that. The green space around it is like a park. It’s so nice to just hang out, go for a walk or relax.

Figure 28 Photograph of a church in Copenhagen

Even though the church is a profoundly social place where a group of people gather, share similar values, beliefs and sentiments, this purpose appears to be secondary for

music-makers in Copenhagen. Besides its contribution to the musicians' professional development, the church also provides the 'green space around it', which is frequently used for relaxing, socializing or dwelling. In this way the natural component seems to outweigh the traditional role of the church as the spatial experience expands from the physical building into its natural surroundings.

The category *Nature meets Culture* illustrates the significance of natural rhythms for musicians in both cities as nature is experienced as energizing, relaxing and inspiring. Moreover, the photographs reveal how urban nature provides a space for a variety of social activities to develop. As such, the category reveals differences in the way natural rhythms are interlinked with (socio-) cultural dynamics in Wellington and Copenhagen. In Copenhagen, urban nature is clearly interwoven with the city's cultural rhythms. Graveyards and churchyards provide places to dwell, relax and gather inspiration. The musicians participate in the transformation of parks and green spaces into 'cultural places', which shapes their attachment and 'feel' for that place. In Wellington, by contrast, urban nature provides the stage for public events and festivals, which promote and support a sense of local connectivity and community. As such, the links between natural and sociocultural rhythms are clearly visible in both cities, yet they manifest themselves in rather different ways contributing to Wellington's and Copenhagen's sociomusical uniqueness.

8.4 Objects and Objectives

Similar to *Nature meets Culture*, the category *Objects and Objectives* focuses on the interrelation of human and non-human rhythms as they appear in the musicians' photographs. It captures the existence and interaction of diverse material objects (or 'things') such as musical instruments, mobile phones, computers, bikes, boxes and suitcases, however it ignores urban materiality in terms of buildings and architecture as this is discussed under 8.5 People and Places and 8.2 Home and Away. The objects examined here are mainly personal items that are frequently used by the music-makers in their everyday life.

However, the materials and materiality as it is discussed in the following paragraphs do not only refer to physical things and objects as that which is obviously visible and

undeniably tangible in opposition to the immaterial, the abstract and the unreal. I want to follow Latham and McCormack's suggestion for a notion of the material that "admits from the very start the presence and importance of the immaterial, not as something that is defined in opposition to the material but as that which gives it an expressive life and liveliness [...]" (2004, 703). Hence, besides the obvious physicality of those objects, I want to foreground their affective materiality, which is to speak of the intensity of the various forms of engagement, relations and encounters that shape the musicians' experience of space without necessarily being physically tangible.

Consequently, it is not enough to use the 'material' and 'materiality' in such a way as "to invoke a realm of reassuringly tangible or graspable objects defined against a category of events and processes that apparently lack 'concreteness'" (704-705). Rather, I want to argue that the complex realities of apparently stable objects can only be fully understood by taking seriously the fact that these realities "are always held together and animated by processes excessive of form and position" (705).

As mentioned earlier, the musicians' photographs depicted several objects, many of which were part of their everyday working environment such as diverse instruments, computers and mobile phones. Whereas musical instruments occurred equally often on images from either city, there was a notable difference in the appearance of media devices. Mobile phones and laptops were a common motif on the Copenhagen photographs, implying their regular usage and significance for the music-makers, which they confirmed during the elicitation interviews.

Figure 29 Mobile devices on Copenhagen's photographs

I use the phone a lot to compose. When I walk, or bike, I get a lot of ideas when I bike and I can easily turn it on, I know it's not legal, but when you ride it's so easy to just go to the recorder and sing along. I compose a lot like that. Even if you don't have much time, maybe only a five-minute bike ride, then something comes up (Rikke).

It's a picture of my phone; I use it all the time. So I think it should be on one of those photos (Maria)

These are my tools. My phone and my computer, they are my daily most used tools. I use them all the time. This [computer] is my dearest thing, I write songs with it all the time. I have an English dictionary with synonyms and sayings and wordbooks on it so this is really the key to my song writing. All my lyrics are on there. It's my life. As long as I got this, I can be anywhere (Nanna).

Obviously I'm working on that computer every day, that's why I took the photo, because I'm doing lots of stuff on the computer. I'm using it probably eight hours a day. That's in the library actually but sometimes I sit in a café or in my studio. That's what I like about it. It's very portable (Anna).

Following the photographs and comments it becomes clear that “the media has become part of the flow and rhythm of the everyday” (Edensor 2012, 10). Computer and phone provide a mobile workstation, which allows for the organization of everyday (urban) rhythms from various locations. As such the photos emphasize the importance of technologies in affording rhythmic synchronicity of rituals and habits such as daily activities, meetings or rehearsals. The musician’s everyday social life is marked by synchronization as “most of us spend much of each day orchestrating continual movement in relation to others. Whether this involves long journeys or local interaction, knowledge of where, when and how activities and relations are to be conducted is essential” (Jarvis 2005, 137). Furthermore, media devices facilitate social interaction and communication and thus spur the development and maintenance of an extensive social network. As already revealed on the mental maps, the geographical stretching-out of social relations is rather important for music-makers in Copenhagen. The use of media devices allows the musicians in this sense to “extend rhythmic synchronisation on a local and a global scale” (Edensor 2012, 10), which reinforces a feeling of stability, security and freedom: “as long as I got this (laptop), I can be anywhere” (Nanna).

Besides phones and computers the musicians in Copenhagen took photos of diverse bags and boxes indicating frequent movement across (local and global) spaces.

Figure 30 Suitcases, bags, and boxes in Copenhagen

Similar to photographs of a globe, world map or the airport, the images of boxes and luggage illustrate the significance of local and global movement for Copenhagen’s

music-makers³³. Yet as the musicians' comments highlight, rhythms of mobility and movement are not always experienced in a positive way. The 'burden' of frequent movement across space was captured by Maria who took a picture of her equipment (figure 30/1), emphasizing its vast size and heavy weight as she has to move it through the city.

This is what I'm usually carrying around. I was going to record music for a film. I was a bit stressed. I was carrying my violin, my cello, pedal bag and my computer bag. It maybe doesn't look like it, but it's actually really heavy. I took the bus from Amager and brought all that stuff out to Nordvest to get to the studio to record for that new band and then I was waiting there for like half an hour (Maria).

As such, the photograph depicts not only a couple of bags but illustrates the struggle, stress and effort the musicians have to face in order to manoeuvre their equipment through the city. It makes visible the affective charge of certain objects and situations which "is always more than personal and is always playing out before the reflective event of thought kicks in" (Latham and McCormack 2004, 706).

Similarly to Maria, Halla took a photo of various bags and boxes which, apart from its concrete materiality, holds a less tangible, affective charge. The photograph portrays a pile of boxes containing Halla's belongings which she had to store in a friend's apartment before going on tour (figure 30/3). Discussing the photo during the elicitation interview reveals a more complex situation however:

This was when I moved out. I was going to Iceland for my tour and I was gonna be homeless for some weeks and I didn't know where I was gonna move next, so I put all my things in boxes and stored them at a collective. I had been cleaning, taking way too long, really stressing out, and that moment was just, everything is clean, everything is gone. And I was feeling just really - I had no clue what's going on (Halla).

Rather than advocating global mobility and connectedness, Halla expresses unease, confusion and worry towards moving and touring, as she has to give up her home and thus her safe haven. As such, formerly reliable fixtures and rhythms are suddenly absent, which creates a feeling of alienation or a loss of belonging (Edensor 2012, 9). Halla's situation demonstrates that despite their frequent local and global movement (or because of it), musicians in Copenhagen highly value their homes as a space of belonging. Hence, what was indicated during the mapping analysis has been

³³ Those images are not in the category 'home and away' because their meaning points rather towards the burden of moving (bags, luggage and boxes); either because of the physical 'heaviness' of the object or the feeling of 'homelessness' or other difficulties instead of symbolizing wanderlust and a desire for global movement.

confirmed by visual evidence gathered during the photo-elicitation: musicians in Copenhagen experience a strong affective attachment towards their home as it provides a shelter from the rhythmical tumult of the city and allows for intimacy, privacy and relaxing comfort to occur.

In Wellington, none of the photographs depicted bags, suitcases or boxes, yet computers and mobile phones appeared on several images as well. However, those media devices were never the main motif, but integrated in the visual context of the photograph.

Figure 31 Media devices appear accidentally on photographs in Wellington

The first image in figure 31 portrays a “business meeting” (Richard), among local musicians, which focuses on musical collaboration and socializing, yet it also depicts a mobile phone (among various other objects) as part of the social assemblage. The second photograph (figure 31/2) captures a moment after a band rehearsal when “everyone’s stuff just hangs out in the lounge” (Scott). The image is an assemblage of various objects, primarily musical instruments, yet it also demonstrates a sense of creativity and collaboration in the domestic realm. By taking a closer look it becomes apparent that there is a laptop in the centre of the coffee table, which is part of the musical equipment, as Scott’s comment confirms: “all that went on tour with us”. What those two images exemplify is the fact that the appearance of media devices was mostly unintentional on the Wellington photographs. Even though computer and phones are common devices among musicians, they only featured in the background of the images. In Copenhagen however, laptops and mobile phones were clearly an intentional motif, symbolizing the musicians’ strong desire for local and global connectedness, mobility and individuality. As such, the same object (phone/computer)

appears to have different objectives for musicians in Wellington and Copenhagen.

The category *Objects and Objectives* comprises photographs that depict more than just the physical nature of things. Instead, those images capture the object's affective charge, which includes various sensibilities, desires, imaginaries, and encounters that impinge on the musicians' experience of place without necessarily being physically tangible. As such, the depiction of suitcases, bags and boxes on the Copenhagen photos illustrates not only the musicians' frequent movement across space, but implies either positive, eurhythmic experiences such as mobility and freedom, or conflicting, arrhythmic feelings such as instability, unease and alienation. Further significant objects featuring in the Copenhagen images were the musicians' laptops and mobile phones, which illustrate the importance of (mobile) technologies, as they facilitate the synchronization of local and global rhythms, routes and routines and as such afford a feeling of mobility, connectivity and individuality. The relative absence of both luggage and media devices on the Wellington photographs suggests that those objects have a rather different affective impact on the everyday life of musicians. Instead of reaching out towards global rhythms, musicians in Wellington engage in the local community, which was made explicit by the great number of photographs depicting social rhythms and dynamics as discussed in the following section: *People and Places*.

8.5 People and Places

Tom Mels argues that individuals “repeatedly couple and uncouple their paths with other people's paths, institutions, technologies and physical surroundings” adding to the complex rhythmical layout of the city (2004, 16). The category *People and Places* aims therefore at capturing and analysing the ‘coupling’ and ‘uncoupling’ of the musician's mundane pathways through their (urban) environment as it is depicted in their photographs. It will document public places such as venues, studios, schools, bars and cafes as they constitute meeting points at which the musician's pathways congregate, “providing geographies of communality and continuity within which social activities are co-coordinated and synchronised” (Edensor 2010, 70). It will further identify the musician's movement between those places and in this way uncover the particular entanglements of spatial, social and affective rhythms, as they

constitute synchronic patterns through which the musician's orchestrate their everyday life in the city.

A first observation of the images reveals that venues, rehearsal rooms and studios are the most common public spaces depicted on the music-makers' photographs. Here, spatial, social and affective rhythms intersect, collide and "configure the hour, the day, the week, the month, the season, the *time-for* the mundane unfolding" of creativity, musical practice, socialization and relaxation (Nansen et al. 2009, 182). Those places provide therefore an important constituent of the musician's experience and organisation of social time and are of great significance to their unique sense of place in Wellington or Copenhagen. Those locales are familiar places that become the "unquestioned settings for daily tasks, pleasures and rhythmically apprehended routines" which facilitates a feeling of predictability and safety and ground the music-makers in their city (Edensor 2012, 8).

Even though those places appeared on photographs from Wellington and Copenhagen equally, there was a distinct difference in the way the musicians pictured their movement between these locations. On the Wellington photos, there was little or no evidence of how the music-makers navigate through urban space. The appearance of bicycles, cars or buses on the photographs was mostly unintentional and thus revealed rather little about the musicians' daily means of transport. In Copenhagen on the other hand the bicycle was one of the most common objects on the photos. Frequently, the respondents took more than one picture of their bike, which they only realized during the elicitation-interview, such as Rebecca:

Figure 32 Multiple photos of bicycling in Copenhagen taken by the same participant

As the images appeared in fifth, ninth and fifteenth place, Rebecca was obviously surprised and did not remember that she took several photos of her bike, which illustrates how integrated bicycles are in the musicians' everyday life in Copenhagen:

This one is, because I realized that in Copenhagen we're doing a lot of bicycling. All these long rides, that's where I gather my thoughts, I think. Sometimes I come up with new ideas when I head home or something. [...] That's the bike again [laughs]. [...] Oh, there is another bike photo. I guess, every time I was on the bike I just thought 'well that's an important moment' [laughs]. I didn't remember that I was taking so many (Rebecca).

Cycling in Copenhagen is an everyday practice. It is a necessary act that is routinely performed, as the bike is the main means of transportation for most musicians. As such, it is an "unquestioned form of movement through the city" and thus "often unnoticed and not regarded in itself as being a particularly singular or insightful experience" (Wunderlich 2008a, 126). Yet cycling enables an unparalleled contact with the urban environment creating an intense multi-sensory experience. According to Tuan, experience is a "cover-all term for the various modes through which a person knows and constructs reality" (Tuan 1977, 8). In order to understand different spaces and places, it is thus necessary to account for the different modes of experience

(sensorimotor, tactile, visual, conceptual), as the “five senses constantly reinforce each other to provide the intricately ordered and emotion-charged world in which we live” (11). Moreover, movement is a basic attribute to the awareness of space as “space is experienced directly as having room in which to move” (12). Thus, kinaesthetic experiences “greatly enrich our apprehension of the world’s spatial and geometrical character” and allow for a “strong feeling for space and spatial qualities (12). As such, cycling through (urban) space allows for a distinct embodied material and sociable ‘dwelling-in-motion’ (Sheller and Urry 2006) to emerge, as the city is experienced as “the predictable passing of familiar fixtures under the same and different conditions” (Edensor 2010, 70).

Hence, while the musicians cycle through Copenhagen, the interactive relationship between body and urban environment is rather intense, engaging all their senses as they encounter traffic rules and lights, people, cars and other cyclists as well as various odours, smells and noises which are all part of an on-going field of interacting urban rhythms. It is an affective rhythmic mix which “really inspires” (Rikke), and facilitates the “gathering of thoughts” and “new ideas” (Rebecca). As such, cycling challenges the affective capacity of its participants, producing a rich “sensescape” at the boundary between body and world (Jones 2012, 655).

Figure 33 Different photos of bicycles/bicycling in Copenhagen

Most musicians took a photograph while actively riding their bike, which emphasizes the significance of cycling as a ‘sensory discipline’ that facilitates the fluent movement from one place to another while it also impacts on the musicians’ everyday experience of the city (Jones 2012, 647). As the musicians’ comments reveal, cycling through the city also fosters the creative process:

I was trying to take a picture while I was biking, because that’s a thing that I do a lot. Almost everybody living in Copenhagen, and I think actually sometimes, while I’m biking, if I’m writing a song and I’m not actively like sitting on the piano or in a space where I actually write but I’m just doing something else because I have to go somewhere – so while biking, maybe it’s about movement – sometimes ideas just occur. I don’t really find myself purposely going for a ride with my bike if I’m stuck or so. It just seems that if I have to go somewhere in the evening or afternoon, then ideas just come up (Anna).

As such, cycling is a purposeful activity and a creative spatial practice offering a unique embodied experience of the city. Similar to the everyday practice of walking it strengthens the musician’s relationship with their urban environment, as they are actively interwoven in the urban landscape. The sensory impressions derived from the everyday cycling practice nurtures a sense of belonging, familiarity and emotional attachment (Wunderlich 2008b, 136). Thus while cycling and interacting with mobile rhythms, the music-makers develop what Edensor refers to as ‘mobile sense of place’ (Edensor 2010, 70).

Besides photos of bikes (or people biking), the music-makers captured different streets across the city, which further emphasized the significance of local movement and connectivity. Some of those streets are part of their daily cycle route; others are ‘streets in their neighbourhood’ or just “really inspiring to walk along” (Louise). Those streets are part of the affective infrastructure of the city as they hamper or

support the musicians' navigation through their urban environment and in this way contribute to the practical and affective 'feel' of the city.

Figure 34 Photos of various streets in Copenhagen

Roads, streets and cycle lanes were an integral part of the musicians' maps as well, connecting different buildings and places and illustrating the individual pathways taken by musicians as part of their mundane sociomusical experience. As Finnegan (1989) might suggest, those pathways anchor the musicians to the city, mainly by mediating their experience of place. Moreover, they signal the importance of local as well as global movement, connections and interactions and indicate a certain (urban) dynamic. The dynamic atmosphere is reinforced by the appearance of bikes and streets on the photographs. Together maps and photos allow for a weaving together of different types of knowledge, offering a thicker description of the complex rhythmical pattern underlying the music-maker's sense of place in Wellington and Copenhagen.

In the course of the photo analysis it became apparent that besides bikes, roads, buildings and parks there are only few people on the Copenhagen pictures. Those individuals are usually band members or close friends. In Wellington, by contrast, there is a great number of people in the mix – friends and 'friends of friends', as well

as family members including children and grandparents. They all seem to belong to the same musical community, with the consequence that certain people appear repeatedly on different photographs from different musicians. Sometimes those recurring people were other musicians who were also part of the research project, which suggests that many music-makers in Wellington know each other and have in some way or the other collaborated with each other. As such, the photographs uncover a dense network of cooperative links between local musicians, which foster community and collaboration and determine the sociomusical experience of the city. The desire for community was particularly noticeable on certain photographs, which resemble a family portrait:

Figure 35 Family portraits picturing Wellington's musical community

The arranged photographs illustrate strong solidarity and a degree of healthy pride towards the local musical community. Those people are friends, colleagues or family members, sharing habitual routines and rhythms, which strengthen affective and cognitive links and reinforce a sense of safety and belonging (Edensor 2012). As Frykman and Löfgren remind us “cultural community is often established by people together tackling the world around them with familiar manoeuvres” (Frykman and

Löfgren 1996, 10–11). Even though the photographs in figure 35 were taken by different musician, they portray some of the same people.

During the elicitation interview certain recurring individuals were identified as ‘pillar figures’ as they are particularly active and supportive of the local community. Those people were frequently photographed in a close up portrait format, which positioned the person centre frame, illustrating their status and significance for the musical community.

Figure 36 Photo of a pillar figure in Wellington

This is a picture of James. I took it because he is a central figure. He is just an absolute pillar – getting people involved in things and he plays in about one million different bands. He is a real contributor and instigator (Jessie).

This picture format was Wellington-specific, yet in Copenhagen a common photo format was the self-portrait, also known as ‘selfie’. Even though there were only very few people on the musicians’ photographs, the self-image was rather popular. In the last decade the selfie has become a powerful means of self-expression among young adults, offering “an effective outlet of self definition” (Murray 2015, 490). As a social media form the selfie is usually taken with a digital media device, such as a smart phone, tablet, laptop or computer in order to share the image on a social media platform including Facebook, Twitter, Instagram, Tumblr and the like. Murray argues that in the digital era, personal cameras have become so ubiquitous that “self-imaging is engendering a new consumer-based language in the visual realm” (491).

Figure 37 Musicians taking selfies in Copenhagen

Following Murray, it can be argued that the musicians have been spurred by the increasing urge to compulsively self-image, yet this trend seems to be distinctly Copenhagen specific. Thus, instead of interpreting the musicians’ self-portraits as an “expression of mere narcissism” (491), I want to argue that those selfies are another way of expressing a desire for individualism and solitude, which have previously been identified as significant aspects for music-makers in Copenhagen. This argument is reinforced by the fact that the musicians’ selfies were taken with an analogue camera

with the consequence that the photo could not be modified, rearranged, deleted, shared or even reviewed before the film was developed. As a result, the selfie could not be used as an immediate medium for self-representation. Rather, those images allow the music-makers to identify and position themselves in the research process as the ‘main actors’ of their (photographic) film.

The desire for individualism and (involving) solitude was further emphasized during the elicitation interview when some musicians reflected on the fact that there were only very few people on their photographs:

I have very few pictures with people on them. I guess it is because music-wise, of course I play with a lot of people but also, being a solo artist, writing music, it's usually that I am alone (Rikke).

There is nobody on any of the pictures. It's a pretty good picture of, when you work as I do, as a musician, you spend so much time with yourself. You're alone all day. Doing everything by yourself. That's also where the ideas get time to grow. Because you're not in a situation where somebody's asking you to do something and you're distracted all the time. I guess it's a bit like being a writer. You're just really on your own, in your own little bubble (Mikkel).

These comments illustrate that solitude is part of the musician's everyday life in Copenhagen and is in fact experienced as pleasant and inspiring. It constitutes a refreshing balance to the tumultuous rhythms of the city, which are fast, fluid and dynamic with an “always immanent potential for disruption and destruction” (Edensor 2012, 3). Isolation and solitude allow the music-makers to put their own ‘beat’ in space and align their bodies with a self-defined choreography that generates “links, stoppages, bolts and rivets to the existing architecture of time and space” (Labelle 2008, 190).

The category *People and Places* reveals the ‘coupling’ and ‘uncoupling’ of the musician's mundane pathways with other people's routes and routines. Photographs in family portrait style as well as portraits of important ‘pillar figures’ illustrate once more the significance of social rhythms in Wellington's music scene. In Copenhagen on the other hand, self-portraits, street and bicycle photos emphasize the music-maker's mobility, independence and solitude.

8.6 Summary: Picturing the everyday - inside and out

As a way of getting attuned to, capturing, and understanding the polyrhythmic urban spaces of Wellington and Copenhagen photo-elicitation has proven to be a fruitful technique allowing the musicians to get attuned to their rhythmical environment and encouraging them to reflect on their individual relationship to music-making in the city. Taking photographs was a highly creative process, which allowed the participants to actively engage with the places they expressed through the camera, which facilitated a multi-sensual experience and understanding of their everyday urban environment.

The participant generated photographs captured different people, objects, places, events, interactions, fluxes and flows around the city. Besides the concrete and visible, the images elicit the non-verbal, non-cognitive, affective rhythms, which are particularly valuable for the purpose of this research. As such, photo-elicitation facilitates the uncovering of the musicians' 'inner' rhythms, both in form of the geographical 'inside' of private spaces, as well as the physical 'inside' including different moods, sensations and affects, which anchor the musicians to their urban environment. In this way, the photographs enabled a consideration of social, spatial and affective rhythms, indicating their quality, intensity and combination in a way that might have not been possible in talk-only interviews.

The analysis of the photographs has brought to the fore four overarching categories capturing 1) the musician's relationship to their local and domestic environment as well as to global rhythms and atmospheres; 2) the significance of natural and socio-cultural rhythms as well as 3) the relation towards diverse objects, and 4) people and places, which are all central aspects of the music-makers' everyday lives as they frame, shape and create their particular sense of place in Wellington and Copenhagen.

The photos reveal that domestic space in Wellington is used for a variety of social activities including rehearsals, gatherings and meetings, extending the boundaries of the private towards a creative household, which always welcomes musical friends and family. In Copenhagen, by contrast, the home is a safe haven sheltered from the tumult of the city, which allows the musicians to unwind, gather new energy and

inspiration. Besides domestic rhythms, music-makers in Copenhagen captured global rhythms and dynamics in form of world maps, a globe or the airport, which illustrates the desire for global connectedness and mobility. The category *nature meets culture* illustrates the significance of urban nature for musicians from either city. Whereas in Wellington, music-makers frequently use outdoor spaces for diverse social activities, in Copenhagen it is rather the tranquility, solitude and recreational aspect of natural spaces, which is most valued. Contrasting this desire for stillness and disengagement is the appearance of various media devices, which illustrates the importance of local and global connectivity among Copenhagen's musicians. Connectivity and mobility were further emphasized through the depiction of bicycles, roads, streets and cycle lanes on the Copenhagen photographs. In Wellington on the other hand, 'family portraits' of the musical community demonstrate solidarity and strong social ties among local music-makers.

As such, the music-makers photographed many aspects of their daily lives, providing documentary detail that captured not only moments of movement and stasis, but also images that evoked feelings of comfort and familiarity. The results give us a glimpse into what Clive Scott, in a longer discussion on street photography, suggests is the power of the photograph to render a rich "temporal complexity":

the time of the indexical (the instant, instantaneousness), the time of the iconic (iterative, durative); time of the symbolic (atemporal), time of the looking (gaze, glance), the time of the viewer (intertext, involuntary memory, the imaginary), the interactions of clock-time and Bergsonian duration, the times of the eye-frame and the support-frame, the ways in which the instant can reach into past and future (2007, 201).

The participants' snapshots exemplify many of these temporal relationships, offering a pictorial insight into the musician's personal experiences, understandings, and interpretations of their everyday urban rhythms, which were clearly beyond the scope of mental maps. They involved a larger number of different places, revealed a higher degree of private spaces, objects and moments, identified important people and illustrated movement and mobility. Yet it is through the combination of representation and discussion of urban rhythms that the synergies between photographic and cartographic methodologies gain more purchase, allowing for a more holistic understanding of the sociomusical experiences of each city to arise.

For this reason, I conducted semi-structured interviews with each participant, which provided the opportunity to further explore contextual and relational aspects and allowed the musicians to verbally express their personal thoughts and opinion regarding music-making in Wellington and Copenhagen.

Chapter 9 - Talking Rhythms

9.1 General procedure

The interviews usually took place either directly after the musician's performance in a venue around town or, in case of prior e-mail, Facebook or phone contact, in a pre-arranged location such as a café, a bar or sometimes in the musician's private home. The preliminary mapping exercise had allowed me to break the ice and establish an informal atmosphere during the course of the subsequent interviews. Even though I designed an interview schedule in order to keep the momentum, my goal was to engage the music-makers in an open, flexible conversation rather than asking them specific questions. In this way, the power relationship between the musicians and me was equalized as much as possible and they had the opportunity to tell their story in their own particular way.

As a German scholar that had not lived in Wellington or Copenhagen for more than a few months, I adopted the positionality of an 'unknown outsider' which is usually advised for conducting interviews in order to elicit more detailed information (Silverman 2013). However, my identity as an academic with clear research interests and goals implied that I had not only accumulated certain knowledge in order to access the field but was also influenced by the conventions and interests of academia. In addition, my identity as an academic was highlighted by the tape recorder, camera and notebook I had with me during the fieldwork.

Consequently, it is important to notice that my presence, whether as participant or strictly as detached observer, inherently influenced the activities and people involved in the research. This might have been the case during the process of mental mapping, where my presence could have affected the musicians in the way they expressed themselves and engaged in the process of visualizing their personal place experiences or during the interviews. However, the fact that I openly revealed my lack of knowledge in regards to certain places and spaces around the city proved to be inspiring and empowering for the participants, as they were encouraged to provide a detailed explanation of their own place experience. The ability to take on the role as an unknown outsider was further aided by my class, race, age, gender and appearance.

As a middle-class white female in her thirties I was at an advantage because I was viewed as non-threatening and was therefore more likely to be asked into participants' homes.

Each interview lasted between sixty and ninety minutes and provided the opportunity to talk about the musicians' experiences and thoughts regarding the local music scene, their favourite places in the city, their private and professional social network as well as their movement through space on a local and global scale. In most cases, the previous mapping exercise provided a useful starting point from which the musicians continued to explain their everyday urban rhythms.

In contrast to mental mapping and photo elicitation, interviews lack creative and place interactive elements (Cele 2006), yet they emphasize the musicians' reasoning about their everyday urban environment, which allowed for detailed discussions about concrete matters of the city's infrastructure for music-making, as well as the additional layers of social, cultural and political rhythms that affect the musician's everyday life in the city. Furthermore, the interviews allowed for an in-depth analysis of rhythmical dissonance, disruption and disturbances, which Lefebvre refers to as *arrhythmia*: "in arrhythmia rhythms break apart, alter and bypass synchronization (the usual term for designating this phenomenon)" (2004, 67). Those moments of disharmony are an inevitable part of the complex polyrhythmic unfolding of the city and as such clearly impact on the music-makers' sense of place in both Wellington and Copenhagen.

One of the main fields in which arrhythmia manifests itself in the musicians' everyday lives, is the socio-cultural realm. Various institutions and operations of power produce or limit the musician's personal rhythms in order to achieve rhythmic conformity and regularise certain behaviours (Edensor 2012, 11). However, Hoogstad and Pedersen suggest that arrhythmia does not necessarily mean 'antirhythmia' for arrhythmic experiences can lead to an enhanced sense of awareness and reflexivity of previous unquestioned aspects of social space, as they allow for the "emergence, transformation and continuation of rhythms" (2013, 188). Consequently it is necessary to consider both, the musicians' harmonious (eurhythmic) as well as their

disharmonious (arrhythmic) urban experiences as they equally shape their unique sense of place.

As touched upon earlier, socio-cultural and political rhythms are difficult to capture in a cartographic or photographic manner, yet those aspects were often the cause of arrhythmic experiences and thus addressed during the interviews. The following paragraphs will explore various arrhythmic (and eurhythmic) experiences and discuss the ways in which they contribute to Wellington's and Copenhagen's sociomusical uniqueness. It remains important, however, to remember that social rhythms do not stand by themselves; instead, they always mix and mingle with the spatial and affective, creating a complex, polyrhythmic urban space.

9.2 The Tall Poppy Community

During the first interviews in Wellington several musicians expressed their unease with a social phenomenon prevalent in the local music scene that had been unknown to me until then, named "Tall Poppy Syndrome". According to the New Zealand Oxford dictionary the Tall Poppy Syndrome (hereafter TPS) is "the New Zealand habit of denigrating or 'cutting down' those who are successful or who are high achievers" (Deverson 2006, 833). A 'Tall Poppy' is therefore a person whose success elevates them above their peers, which causes resentment or envy. This attitude of levelling high achievers to group norms is considered to be culturally specific to Australasia and might be seen as a by-product of New Zealand's long pursuit of egalitarian ideals (Dediu 2015).³⁴ During interviews, several musicians addressed the phenomenon, some clearly criticizing New Zealand's 'unwillingness' to acknowledge people's talents and achievements:

Because New Zealand is so isolated, people feel like they always need validation from overseas. If Canada says, this New Zealand band is amazing then New Zealand says, yes, yes, yes, they are amazing. But they don't have it in them to say 'I think they are amazing'! It's called the Tall Poppy Syndrome. So we always need validation (Nikita).

I still feel like I'm showing off all the time from that whole Tall Poppy Syndrome thing that we have going on. No one brags about how good they are here. No one will tell you I'm an amazing musician, you should come and watch me. No one. Whereas in the States you get that everywhere. Everyone will be backing themselves which I

³⁴ For more research on the TPS in New Zealand see (Dediu 2015; Kirkwood 2007; Feather 1989; Feather 1991).

think is great. We think it's disgusting here in New Zealand but I think it's awesome. If you are awesome and you've worked your whole life to be great, talk about it, go crazy, be honest. I don't think it's bragging but I feel that's what we get put on us as New Zealanders from a very young age (Katie).

I think it's good to know what you're good at and not be afraid and go like 'yes, I am good at it, I spent my whole life pretty much working on it – and I am good at it now, yes!' Be stoked with it, you know. I don't think it's very healthy. I think it holds people back from being as good as they could be. They don't wanna stand out too much. They don't wanna put everything into something just in case like someone goes like 'what you're good or something' that's fucking stupid. I hate it (Ed).

It's a form of modesty, a form of humbleness, I guess. But often it is imposed on people from outside, so, like, for instance music critics might criticize an artist for no other reason but the fact that they are popular, you know [...]. It's because we live on a small island and that is how we avoid conflict and confrontation, I guess. It is to keep everyone at an even level (Mike).

For Mike, the TPS is linked to New Zealand's geographical isolation, its small population as well as the desire to avoid conflict and confrontation. Through the imposition of specific rhythms 'on people from the outside', certain behaviour is considered to be right or wrong. Acknowledging talent and achievement is therefore regarded as "showing off" or "bragging" (Katie). The feeling of pride is considered as boosting one's self-esteem in a way that elevates one's status above their peers. However, going overseas seems to 'legitimate' talent and success as confirmation and praise is awarded from the 'outside', as Nick's comment emphasizes:

The perception is that to be worth more as a musician and for your music to be worth more you should go overseas. It is that we value things from overseas more than things from here. So it follows that if you go overseas and get that experience that you are more valuable as a musician.

Hence, the TPS clearly affects Wellington's socio-rhythmical layout, creating moments of arrhythmia and as such determines the city's sociomusical experience in an individual as well as a collective way. Even though the participants seemed reflective and critical about keeping "everyone at an even level" (Mike), the TPS is a form of "cultural heritage" (Meehan 2009, 106), deeply ingrained in New Zealand culture, and their people's habitus. Besides critical engagement with the social phenomenon, some of the musicians' comments inadvertently pointed towards a subliminal 'Tall Poppy attitude', emphasizing humbleness and modesty associated with the social phenomenon. Against this backdrop Nick describes himself as being "lucky" during his career having had "these kind of opportunities" that have helped him to get where he is today. Instead of taking credit for his achievement, Nick is

very humble about his abilities, dismissing his success as being lucky. Similarly Vanessa explains how New Zealanders are “quite humble people” and her family makes sure that she keeps being “grounded” during the development of her career: “I could have written that song that’s in the film score or be in the film and Dad would go ‘that’s choice love, dishes!’” (Vanessa). In this sense, the TPS clearly regularises behaviour in accordance with particular social rhythms, which in turn affects the music-makers private and professional life.

Scott describes the way he advertises concerts and events for his bands: “for us it is kind of light hearted. It is kind of like, you put it up on Facebook and you tell people. But more often than not people make posters and that kind of thing” (Scott). It seems to be too much of a ‘Tall Poppy move’ to advertise the band’s concerts extensively as it could attract too much attention and ‘stick out’ of the crowd. As such, the friendly community atmosphere permeating Wellington’s music scene does not only create a communal spirit but emphasizes the equality of each individual belonging to the group. The scene is described as one “happy family” where “everyone is kind of cool with what everyone else is doing and everyone accepts (...) what everyone else is doing” (Nick), which suggests the levelling or conforming to group norms in order not to ‘stick out’ too much.

As Ed mentioned earlier, the Tall Poppy attitude can thus have significant effects on the musician’s creativity and productivity as it “holds people back from being as good as they could be” (Ed). According to Kirkwood (2007), it is the desire to ‘fit in’ and avoid negative attention that prompts high achievers not to share their opinion publicly, and avoid telling others the reason for their success. This behaviour pervades wider New Zealand society, causing a loss of knowledge and economic value (377).

Nikita recognizes this flipside of the TPS, as she clearly emphasizes the need for advertisement and self-promotion even though this behaviour is not always appreciated in the local music scene:

You know even some of my friends, if I am promoting on Facebook or something, they are like ‘I am so over it seeing it on Facebook’, you know, and I am just like, ‘I need to promote it, you know’. And then they complain that their band isn’t getting enough attention. Well, you need to put yourself out there.

Nikita's comment illustrates that her resistance towards the regulatory rhythmic conventions inscribed by the TPS causes disharmony, and as such, an arrhythmic situation in her musical community. However, it is through the conscious engagement with those rhythms, that normative conventions can be side-stepped, resisted and supplemented by other dimensions of everyday experience, as Nikita illustrates. For this reason, Edensor reminds us that it is important "to avoid assumptions that managed normative rhythms possess an overarching force that compels individuals to march their beat" (Edensor 2012, 15). Instead, people are apt to create their own temporal structurings and rhythmical pathways, which allows them to put their own 'beat' in space.

A further consequence of the Tall Poppy rhythms can be seen in the absence of competitive behaviour between Wellington's music-makers. As mentioned earlier, most participants enjoy the 'happy family atmosphere', which encourages collaboration and commitment to the local musical community.

It is not competitive. We are all supportive. If someone gets a new gig, everyone is happy for them. We would all maybe want to be on the gig but it's ok, we all understand that if you pick that person, you are not snubbing me. They are great, you know, I possibly would have picked them too. So there is no bad feelings or anything like that. We don't feel angry with somebody for picking that other bass player or whatever (Nick).

There are more and more players around, so, there is a lot of competition, but, I mean, it is more a friendly community attitude (Scott).

Instead of promoting oneself and competing for an opportunity to perform, the musicians value their position in the local community. As Scott and Nick's comments suggest, Wellington's sociomusical experience is strongly influenced by the development and maintenance of its social rhythms as they create a distinct form of solidarity and collaboration. This 'do-it-together' ethic is part of Wellington's 'urban ethos' (Stahl 2011, 151) and manifests itself in the sharing of resources such as rehearsal space, expertise and stories, as well as profound social relationships which are "explicitly cooperative and collaborative" and permeated by a collective will "to make the city matter as a cultural space" (151). As such, nobody wants to cut down a Tall Poppy but nobody really wants to be a Tall Poppy either. Everyone cooperates and is "part of a big organism or machine" (Nick) – a Poppies Community.

During my fieldwork in Copenhagen, I have learned that there exists a similar social phenomenon in Scandinavia called *Janteloven* (Jante Law or the Law of Jante) which states that “one should never try to be more, try to be different, or consider oneself as more valuable than others” (Bromgard, Trafimow, and Linn 2014, 375). The ‘Jante Law’ is derived from Axel Sandemose’s satirical novel *En flygtning krydser sit spor* (A Fugitive Crosses His Tracks), which was first published in Norwegian in 1933. Sandemose’s novel portrays the “introversion and tyranny of small-town society” and proposes ten principles in order to ensure harmony and social stability in the village which can basically be summed up as “do not get too big for your boots [...] if you do we will cut you down size” (Jenkins 2012, 186). The concept has still considerable currency in modern Denmark and appeared to be a recognisable rhythm during the interviews with the musicians from Copenhagen, which suggests that the notion still “touches a very real, and raw, collective nerve” (186).

This ‘collective nerve’ was addressed during the interview with Mads who explained the ‘friendly spirit’ in Copenhagen’s music scene(s): “I think it is more a family than individualized [...] you are not being looked down upon by people, we are all on the same level, we are all the same” (Mads). Yet he questions this attitude at a later stage:

The negative side of it is maybe that we are not very good in admitting when we compete with each other. Everything has to be very friendly on the surface and sometimes we make it sound like we are all friends, but we are not.

Without specifically referring to the Law of Jante, Mads clearly describes the arrhythmic experiences inherent to those normative and egalitarian rhythms, which insists that ‘no one should stand out’, call attention or discourage community formation. Those normative social rhythms were further addressed during the interview with Mikkel who described the inability of local musicians to acknowledge their own or other people’s talent:

There is one specific thing about musicians in Copenhagen, they don't compete much on the actual ability on playing an instrument, which is a big thing in the Jazz scene in New York. If there is someone around that can do something incredible with music, than they would get credit for that. In Copenhagen we really have the tendency to look down on people with tons of flashy abilities.

Similar to the rhythmical experiences of the TPS in Wellington, the rhythmic qualities of Jante Law are frequently criticized and challenged by Copenhagen’s music-makers,

such as by Klemme, who experiences Jante Law as a barrier which ‘really hurts the (creative) process’:

There is this kind of barrier that you are not allowed to enter and you are not allowed to say “I can do this, I’m good”. It’s a very fine line. It’s really hurting the process. It’s not good if you want to create something.

Likewise, Mikkel who described the process of ‘looking down on people with flashy abilities’, concludes that “this also means that people are not so good at it. I mean the technical level is generally very high but there are lots of people that have great abilities and are great players, but they don’t stick out like the tough guy in New York does. That’s a shame sometimes” (Mikkel).

It would be misleading to portray the Jante Law or the TPS as applying to all music-makers in Copenhagen and Wellington. However, their rhythms/arrhythmias clearly featured in several interviews. Both Jante Law and the TPS can be seen as “real enough background principle of everyday life to many people” providing “convenient, locally understood vocabulary of interpersonal critique” (Jenkins 2012, 187). The interviews revealed that the normative rhythms imposed by the social phenomenon frequently cause arrhythmic experiences among local musicians, as they constitute a “kind of barrier” (Klemme) that “holds people back from being as good as they could be” (Ed). Yet those rhythms also encourage different levels of engagement such as collaboration and friendliness instead of strong competition, which sets up rhythmical horizons of possibility that are geared towards solutions to local problems.

9.3 Creating Space – Creating Rhythms

Whether or not we recognize the rhythmicity of the world, and whatever theoretical conclusions we draw from its complexity, human beings have always been rhythm-makers as much as place makers (Mels 2004, 3).

A common issue that arose during the interviews in Wellington and Copenhagen was the cities’ lack of performance and rehearsal space and limited possibilities for professional development. Even though Copenhagen has a population of about one million, almost twice the size of Wellington, several musicians expressed their discontent about the rather limited space of creative possibilities:

Sometimes Copenhagen feels a bit small, a bit tiny, and that reflects the country as well. We are so small that an artist can only go till a certain level, the market is not so big in Denmark, so you can only go to a certain level and then you have a hard time living from it (Nanna).

Copenhagen is very small. Denmark is very small. Sometimes you can play only if you already have a radio hit and that's very limited. It's also only a limited number of people deciding who is actually going to play in the radio (Anna).

Copenhagen was too small at that point. It's hard to make a living only by playing concerts in Copenhagen – and Denmark is this funny little head on top of Europe, you know. So there is a lot of connections you miss out on here in Denmark because everyone is skipping Denmark and staying on mainland Europe when they're touring (Toke).

The lack of resources and creative possibilities encourages musicians to expand their local musical environment and reach out towards global rhythms and dynamics. They travel to “Norway, Sweden, Iceland” (Benjamin), play concerts in “Finland, Germany, Spain and the Balkan” (Jon), “London, Belgium and Texas” (Anna). “It has been little bit everywhere. A little bit in France, Holland, Belgium, Norway, Sweden eastern Europe, Brazil, China (Mikkel) or “Berlin, I love Berlin” (Nanna). “Actually a lot of bands go to Germany because the German audience is much better” (Sofie). “In Germany they buy CDs and support the musicians” (Benjamin). “In Denmark it's like 1500 people will like your music, in Germany maybe 150.000 will like it” (Klemme). “If we go to Germany there is not many Danish acts, and the ones who are there, are really popular” (Rikke). “In Germany you can be a star for years. Here, this is like a small country” (Anna). “I think in Germany I might have a shot by only playing my own concerts and writing my own stuff but I don't know, it's only just a fantasy” (Nanna).

Nanna's comment illustrates that the desire and demand to extend her musical environment is partly motivated by the lack of creative possibilities as well as her 'fantasy' that prompts her to envision a musical career in Germany. This imaginative sensitivity towards an 'elsewhere' is also referred to as 'geographical imagination' and was clearly noticeable during several interviews. It allows the musicians to “recognize the role of space and place in [their] own biographies [...] to judge the relevance of events in other places [...] to fashion and use space creatively and to

appreciate the meaning of the spatial forms created by others” (Harvey 1973, 24)³⁵. As such, Nanna’s vision of Germany and its relation to Copenhagen can be seen as a creative attempt to ‘make sense’ of her musical environment “in terms that are not limited to cognition and consciousness” (Gregory 2009, 285).

However, Copenhagen’s geographical location as “this funny little head on top of Europe” (Toke) facilitates in fact the creation and maintenance of global rhythms. The increasing influx of international musicians to Copenhagen as well as the high degree of movement and communication ‘outwards’ transforms the city in an ‘hybrid meeting place’ (Massey 1999, 22). Copenhagen’s musicians thus actively engage in the stretching out of social rhythms “all over the planet at very different level, from the household to the local area to the international” (Massey 1994, 155). It is around these rhythms that Copenhagen’s music-makers attempt to expand their space of creative possibilities, generating various discourses and practices in response to the rhythmical movement of people, places, objects and ideas. In the *Production of Space* Lefebvre reminds us of the complex intersection, entanglement and development of local and global rhythms in (urban) space:

No space disappears in the course of growth and development: the worldwide does not abolish the local. This is not a consequence of the law of uneven development, but a law in its own right. The intertwinement of social spaces is also a law. Considered in isolation, such spaces are mere abstractions. As concrete abstractions, however, they attain “real” existence by virtue of networks and pathways, by virtue of bunches or clusters of relationships (Lefebvre 1991, 86).

These regional, national and international networks, pathways and relationships come together in a complex rhythmical fashion and concretize themselves in the musician’s urban environment. As such, the lack of creative infrastructure and possibilities spurs music-makers in Copenhagen to develop a wider network of (urban) rhythms on a local as well as a global scale which underpins Mel’s statement that “human beings have always been rhythms-makers as much as place makers” (2004, 3).

³⁵ Geographical imagination is “a way of thinking about the world and considering the relative importance of places and the relationships between “our” places and “other” places. The term encompasses a variety of meanings, including individual mental images and socially produced discourses about cultures, spaces, and differences” (Warf 2010, 1221). The concept is developed from C. Wright Mills (1959) “sociological imagination,” a conceptual tool which allows to compare individuals’ personal biographies to larger social structures within their specific historical era. As such, geographical imagination is not the exclusive preserve of (human) geography but a “persistent and universal instinct of [humankind]” (Prince 1961, 25).

Similarly, in Wellington music-makers expressed specific dissonances or arrhythmic experiences based on to the city's limited space of creative possibilities. However, here the lack of infrastructure in terms of recording and rehearsal space breeds a feeling of community oriented towards solving those problems:

There is lots of scarcity here. I think that is a really important factor about Wellington that shapes how things happen here. And that's a good thing in a way as well. It encourages people to share. It makes people collaborate and work together a lot more and share their rehearsal spaces and their resources and network, and support each other. So, it's bad and good in about equal measure (Mike).

As Mike suggests, the gap or scarcity of performance and rehearsal space creates an arrhythmic experience, which sets up horizons of possibility at the same time. It facilitates the sharing of resources (rehearsal space, instruments, skills and expertise) and as such propels the development of social, spatial and affective rhythms among local musicians.

This collaborative effort came into sharper focus when I interviewed Richard and Georgina, two experimental music-makers and the founders of *Home Economics*, a semi-regular, event that combines home craft, video art, sonic arts and music ranging from gamelan to acoustic folk, experimental and noise, transforming the home into an underground performance space.

Traditionally the home is understood as a place of intimacy, privacy and family dwelling – a 'private' space of safety and familiarity away from the demands of 'public' life. This romanticized conception of home originates in the Bourgeois Age where the house was an essential aspect of the identity and self-definition of the middle-class (Welter 1966). However, as Blunt and Dowling remind us, domestic space is not separated from public, political worlds but is constituted through them (2006, 27). It is a multiscalar spatial imaginary saturated with the experiences, memories and emotions of everyday life:

[H]ome does not simply exist, but is made. Home is a process of creating and understanding forms of dwelling and belonging. This process has both material and imaginative elements. Thus people create home through social and emotional relationships. Home is also materially created – new structures formed, objects used and placed (23).

In this context, Home Economics creates performance space resonating with the traditional confines of domestic space, such as intimacy, familiarity or stability yet detached from the bourgeois conceptions of home and economic forces. It provides a space of creative freedom, which neglects practical and economic constraints imposed by the cultural policy of local venues or galleries and serves therefore as a medium for artistic creation and self-realization.

The non-profit event is based on the entrepreneurial spirit and collaboration of the organizers, the owners or inhabitants of the respective domestic space as well as the artists (musicians and visual artists). As such, Home Economics relies on alternative exchanges other than financial exchanges, creating a money-free environment and a space detached from modern commodity and economic principles:

We wanted to put on an event that happened outside of the run of the usual venues in Wellington and we're interested in using kind of spaces that we had at hand such as domestic space and I guess we are interested in other kinds of exchanges other than financial exchanges that happen in kind of the usual show formats and bars (Georgina).

According to Stahl (2011), independent musicians in Wellington strive to emancipate their music from the institutional and commercial pressure of the art world by celebrating a low level “lo-fi” do-it-yourself (DIY) ethic, which has long been part of the city's sociomusical experience (152).³⁶ Born out of geographical isolation, creative desire and lack of resources the lo-fi entrepreneurialism constitutes a definitive aspect of Wellington's urban identity and underpins an allegiance to local music-making in the city (153). Spurred by a neoliberal, entrepreneurial discourse within New Zealand's imagery, Home Economics creates alternative performance spaces detached from modern commodity and economic principles. The DIY-event is therefore a form of what Vermeulen and Van den Akker term “constructive engagement” (Vermeulen and Van den Akker 2015, 55) – a way by which Wellington's music-makers, unblinded by ideological dogmas, try to manifest their engagement within society, without political actions against the state or against

³⁶ The DIY-approach is a deep-seated concept within New Zealand's imagery and is constantly reiterated through the nationally ingrained myth of no.8 wire as an expression of “Kiwi ingenuity”. The ‘number 8 wire mentality’ is named after a type of fencing wire which farmers often inventively and practically used not only for strapping or tie-downs, but for hooks, ties, aerals, and various applications other than fencing, for which a bendable piece of metal thread might be useful. This “Kiwi ingenuity” is hence a “find a way to get it done-approach” which provides motivational fuel for aspiring entrepreneurs who hope that the country's isolation, small population and relative lack of resources won't restrain them too much in relation to the more mature markets in the United States or Europe.

society but with “Doing Things Yourself”, or “Doing Things Together”, in a small-scale setting: the city, the neighbourhood or the home (Poecke 2016).

In addition to Home Economics, the Eyegum Music Collective – a collaboration of diverse musicians and artists, regularly organizes ‘living room concerts’ or house parties in different locales across the city. Those events are not bound to the nightlife district or a certain neighbourhood but can take place anywhere in town including someone’s private home. During the events parts of the domestic environment are converted into a stage and dance floor providing creative space outside the commercial setting imbued with a cosy and intimate ambience. In this way the idea of the home as an alternative performance space seems to correspond with the normative rhythms imposed by the Tall Poppy phenomenon, which suggests that artists and audience are on an even level (stage and dance floor are the same), avoiding any particular kind of promotion or advertisement and emphasizing the communal spirit instead of celebrating an individual’s performance.

Whether Home Economics or Eyegum Music Collective, house parties and living room concerts are deeply entrenched in Wellington’s performance culture as they frequently provide a ‘playground’ for local musicians:

We did a ton of house parties. We played at number 10 Wilson Street so many times in their lounge. Yeah, we played at house parties all over Wellington. And the idea was always to try something different. Try not to have it in a standard bar or venue, so that we could get around that problem that we would be running into which is that bars have this very narrow conception of what a band should be doing and it is really about fulfilling their commercial needs, you know, they basically need bands to draw a crowd so they could sell alcohol to them (Mike).

So in a house you can charge a door charge but you’re not paying for the venue. You can have it at your house and you can invite people along. I think it’s quite cool. More spaces around Wellington are opening up for gigs in a home environment and I think that’s really great. Because it’s just like a venue but it’s more intimate (Anj).

There were two house parties this weekend. One I played at and the other one I just went to. They had the same thing going on where they had music set up and everyone is just jamming (Scott).

These comments illustrate the desire of local musicians to create an open space “where you can do whatever you want as supposed to a venue that is intended for music and profit” (Scott). A musical space, liberated from political and economic forces, which allows for the sharing of intimate experiences in order to pursue the

music-makers' need to be 'private in public' (Blum 2003). The home provides therefore a space for collective intimacy in which "sharing and being shared can be seen and oriented to as its own specific form of creativity" (179). The sharing of privacy and intimacy lends music events in the domestic realm a strong affective charge, which is highly valued among local music-makers:

Playing in people's homes has a different atmosphere – more intimate, and it's a very supportive crowd. In people's homes, people are stoked to be there and I think both, the audience and the players feel like it's kind of a privilege to have that atmosphere (Lillian).

People can bring their own drinks and stuff. It's amazing if you can go somewhere and relax like it's your own place (Hanna).

I think the vibe in someone else's house is so cool. It's just so different. It's not like you go in there and yeah, you might pay to get in but you can take some beers or whatever and everyone seems to have respect for the place and it's just a cool vibe (Ed).

As such, the home provides an alternative performance space for the local musical community, saturated with a complex interweaving of various (urban) rhythms. The fusion of spatial, social and affective rhythms in the home facilitates the emergence of what Maffesoli calls 'fellow-feeling' or 'communal ambience', which implies a particular atmosphere of security and freedom, tradition and creation, privacy and publicity through which a homogenous group of people becomes unified (Maffesoli 1996). This atmosphere invites visitors and inhabitants of the home to be active participants and creators of (urban) rhythms and (urban) space.

Even though performance and rehearsal space in Copenhagen is rather sparse as well, the home is usually not opened up for public gatherings or events. Rather, it remains a private space for family members and close friends to meet, socialize and relax. The experience of comfort, familiarity and safety in a certain place (especially one's home) is referred to as *hygge/hygge* in Denmark. I came across this concept at various moments during my fieldwork (see mapping analysis), which confirms the "widespread, habitual, and often ritualistic use of the term" (Linnet 2011, 23). Hygge receives a specific cultural emphasis as it is firmly rooted within "central aspects of Scandinavian culture and everyday life such as egalitarianism, home-centeredness, middle-class life, romantic and religious ideas, and concerns for 'inner spaces'" (21). The phenomenon resonates with concepts such as 'coziness' 'homeliness' and

togetherness, implying a sense of intimacy and closeness, which is often based on the sharing of food and drinks. As such *hygge* signifies a “low-key, intimate form of socialization” which is most commonly experienced in the home (23). For this reason domestic space is rarely used as an alternative performance space in Copenhagen. However, the ‘homely’, ‘cosy’ atmosphere is often transferred into public spaces such as cafés, bars or restaurants in order to “provide a sense of a relaxed atmosphere that has elements of the home-like” (Linnet 2012, 407). However, the ‘home-like’ ambience is based on a “spectrum of intensely interiority-creating mechanisms” such as the singularity of the personal, the use of natural materials such as wood for interior decoration, as well as homemade food in order to maintain a distance from “the market system of mass produced goods with impersonal origins” (407). The emphasis here lies therefore on “the rather down-to-earth means”, simplicity, affordability and an “whatever-is-at-hand” –attitude, which is reminiscent of Wellington’s DIY-ethos and entrepreneurial impulses which actively shape the sociomusical experience of (both) urban place(s) (407).

9.4 Synchronizing Rhythms – The Visual and the Verbal

Besides disharmonious, arrhythmic urban experiences, the interviews revealed aspects of the musician’s everyday life, which have partly been uncovered and discussed during the previous photo-elicitation and/or the mapping exercise. The interviews encouraged the music-makers to elaborate on everyday routines and habits such as their movement through the city, interaction with friends, colleagues and family as well as their experiences with the city’s natural environment, which have all been documented visually on the photos and/or maps as well. Those synchronicities are important however, as they increase the credibility and validity of the information. Croghan et al. note that “visual and linguistic data appear to enrich one another and [...] elicit more elaborate verbal accounts [...] as the visual will act as a trigger to an oral response or the visual and the verbal will somehow strengthen one another” (2008, 346). The following discussion will illustrate some of those rhythmic synchronicities in order to demonstrate their significance for the music-makers everyday life in the city. What might seem as repetitive narrative gears in fact toward a holistic examination and understanding of the musician’s complex polyrhythmic

urban environment, which is the breeding ground of the city's unique sociomusical experience.

A recurring topic during the interviews in Copenhagen was the daily rhythms of movement and mobility. Here, the bicycle was a common subject of conversation, as it constitutes a vital tool for the musicians in order to successfully establish, organize and maintain their musical network and career. Yet it was not only the bike's practical advantages such as cheap and flexible mobility, which are of importance. Rather, the interviews emphasized the affective value of cycling, as it affects the musician's sensory and embodied experience of the city, and as such spurs creativity and inspiration.

I try to go or bike to different places twice a week or something so I don't go directly the same way. I try to look up and see new things. That's really an inspiration for me because I think the city is so vibrant and alive – and so is the nature. It's a different kind of feeling alive (Louise).

I use my bike a lot. They have these nice, wide bike paths here. So I use the bike when I go shopping or to the rehearsal space, which is really close to home, or the other rehearsal space, which is somehow connected to Nørrebro and the grocery shop – the cycle trip means a lot to me (Rikke).

I can bike to Nørrebro in twenty minutes. In Copenhagen you have actually quite little space but a lot of people and lot of musicians. It's easy to cycle between venues and see each other play and be inspired by each other (Jacob).

You are on your bike, outside, fresh wind and somehow it's an environment that spreads ideas for me (Mikkel).

As suggested during the mapping analysis, cycling enables an “extended touch” of the urban surrounding, creating an “intense, interactive relationship” between the body and its environment (Van Duppen and Spierings 2013, 235). The cyclist sees, hears, smells, tastes and feels the city and as such experiences its multiple “intensities of everyday affective landscapes” (Jones 2012, 645). In this way, cycling offers a “unique embodied experience of urban travelspace (‘or ‘views from the saddle’),” that allows the musicians to experience their urban environment in an eurhythmic, positive and inspiring way (Jungnickel and Aldred 2014, 238). Furthermore, the bicycle constitutes an individual form of transportation, which offers the musicians the freedom to navigate through the city in their own time, speed and direction.

Besides rhythms of movement and mobility, the interviews complemented the rather limited visual representation of natural rhythms in Copenhagen as the musicians clearly expressed their affective relation towards green spaces, parks, canals, lakes and the ocean:

One of the reasons why I am still in Copenhagen after fifteen years is that it's so easy to get out in the green; especially where I live now. You have the water here, and if I go for a walk from home, in five minutes I'm in Christiania. This whole area you can't really hear noise from cars or anything. It's very green out here; I really enjoy that. I can go for a run near the water and can go for a swim; I really enjoy that (Mikkel).

I love the little lakes and the canals. I definitely would like the city less if it wasn't for all the water; and there is a lot of trees. It's quite green, especially in the summer (Halla).

Copenhagen is very green. There are a lot of nice areas, parks, green spaces. To compose it's a lot about being relaxed – creating space and silence for yourself. When you have periods where you're stressed, it's not good. You have to really learn how to relax your mind; and I can relax in nature (Rikke).

The synchronization of visual and verbal appearances of natural rhythms in Copenhagen sheds light on the less visible, affective dimensions of the natural and as such contributes to a richer understanding of the musician's experience of their urban environment. Even though the maps and photographs depicted certain parks, lakes or the ocean at times, natural rhythms in Copenhagen were visualized in a less dominant manner than in Wellington. Considering the musician's verbal narrative however, it becomes clear that natural rhythms are of utmost importance for Copenhagen's music-makers as they spur relaxation, creativity and regeneration. One of the ways natural rhythms strongly impact on the musician's sense of place is through the sensory experience of bicycling as it allows them to have unparalleled contact with the urban environment which produces “both richer and more diverse sensory landscapes” (Barnfield and Plyushteva 2015, 6).

Besides the impact of natural rhythms, Wellington's musicians are strongly affected by the expressions and manifestations of social rhythms. This was demonstrated not only by the large number of photos depicting groups of friends, family members or colleagues, gathering, socializing and interacting but also through the verbal narrative. The interviews emphasized the connectivity among local musicians and affirm their sense of community and solidarity:

It's a community. It's actually one community. I feel like even though parts of the community don't know each other, we are all linked. There is only two degrees of separation or whatever between any two musicians in Wellington. Everyone knows everyone and there is a lot of supportiveness (Nick).

It's all extremely connected and the longer you stay here, the more entrenched you get and the more your connections grow. There is only ever a couple of steps between each person and each band. It is sort of like a spider web of interconnecting groups that each support each other (Jessie).

While the photographs illustrate an explicit sense of collaboration, collective action and active social exchange among local artists, friends and family, the interviews uncover the density of those social ties, which are interwoven "like a spider web of interconnecting groups" (Jessie). As discussed earlier, the feeling of community and solidarity is on the one hand propelled by the lack of space and professional development; on the other hand, the interviews reveal that emotional closeness among the musicians is facilitated by the city's geographical limitations:

I think musicians in Wellington are very supportive. I made really good friends. Relationships become very strong very quickly through music. I don't think I could have had the same experience in Sydney because Wellington has this closeness, this physical closeness (Gerard).

There are quite a few healthy scenes here; and bands are a great way to sort of find your niche. Those scenes are quite nurturing. Then you know that you will bump into people. It's good to catch up with them. And what I really like too, you don't just bump into people at gigs; so you don't just see people being out, drunk and dancing. You see those same people at conferences, protests, cafes, at work. All sorts of community events, day time events, and I think that that's really important for fostering a scene (Tom).

Without planning or organizing a meeting, people coincidentally 'bump into each other' on the street, the supermarket or during public events, which facilitates the maturation of weak ties into stronger relationships and networks. During the interviews most musicians addressed the nurturing effect of Wellington's strong social rhythms, which constitute a form of 'spider web' that provides some kind of 'safety net' on the one hand but bears the risk of getting caught up at the same time:

I was in London for seven months: that's where I got banjo lessons. That was probably my biggest experience. It was really exciting just to do something people weren't used to and share that with others. But I was lacking a musical community and found it quite tough. I enjoyed experiencing the culture of London but in terms of music I knew more musicians here. I kind of knew that if I'd come back I had more opportunities and it turned out that way (Rose).

A lot of people leave Wellington and say, it's too small. But I really strongly feel it will always stay small unless you stay here and make it big, you know what I mean?

So I really believe staying in Wellington with all those other people, keep making it bigger, bigger, bigger, bigger so people want to come here for the music (Nikita).

As such, what might be missing in terms of industrial infrastructure in Wellington is compensated for by a dense network of social rhythms and atmospheres, which encourage an affective relationship to the city, and further entrench musicians in their local musical community. The verbal narrative exposes therefore the structure of Wellington's musical network(s) of cooperative links by highlighting frequency, density and interconnectivity of the various institutions, members and rhythms, and emphasizes the musician's entrenchment in their local community.

The combination of the musicians' visual and verbal narratives brings about certain rhythmic synchronicities, which extend and complement previous observations and as such provide a holistic, polyrhythmic insight into what constitutes music-making in Wellington and Copenhagen.

9.5 Summary: Talking (Ar-)Rhythmias

Rhythms in all their multiplicity interpenetrate one another. In the body and around it, as on the surface of a body of water, or within the mass of a liquid, rhythms are forever crossing and recrossing, superimposing themselves upon each other, always bound to space [...]. If we attempt to specify them, we find that some rhythms are easy to identify: breathing, the heartbeat, thirst, hunger, and the need for sleep are cases in point. Others, however, such as those of sexuality, fertility, social life, or thought, are relatively obscure. Some operate on the surface, so to speak, whereas others spring from hidden depths (Lefebvre 1991, 205).

City life, including the multiple social, spatial and affective rhythms, activities and events comes with a range of "multisensory bombardment" (Butler 2006, 890). It was my aim to provide the musicians with appropriate 'tools' in order capture, understand and express the varied sensory experiences they encounter in their polyrhythmic urban environment. Besides photographs and maps, language served as a medium to both articulate and analyse the musicians' multi-sensory experiences in Wellington and Copenhagen. As such, the interviews facilitated the uncovering of the 'easily identifiable' as well as the more 'obscure' rhythms shaping music-making in the city. A rather obscure rhythmic phenomenon is the dissonance and disruption of certain rhythmic experiences, which Lefebvre identified as arrhythmia. Those moments of

disharmony are an inevitable part of the musician's everyday life in the city and were brought to light during the interviews.

The arrhythmic habit of denigrating or 'cutting down' people who are successful is known as Tall Poppy Syndrome in New Zealand and *Janteloven* in Denmark and clearly affects music-making in both parts of the world. Modesty and humbleness associated with the social phenomenon appear as a barrier for achieving musicians that holds them back from professional development and success. This attitude of levelling and conforming to group norms results in the absence of competitive behaviour among local musicians, which breeds a feeling of community and 'do-it-together-ness' that nurtures the local Poppies Community.

The lack of creative infrastructure and possibilities stimulates the musicians' geographical imagination in Copenhagen, which results in the active development of a wider network of (urban) rhythms on a local as well as a global scale. In Wellington the scarcity of performance and rehearsal space facilitates the sharing of resources and spurs the creation of alternative performance spaces such as in the domestic realm. The combination of social, spatial and affective rhythms transforms the home into a musical space liberated from political and economic forces, which allows for the sharing of resources and intimate experiences.

As such, arrhythmic experiences always extend the rhythmical horizon of possibilities and encourage the musicians to engage in the creative solution of local problems. Consequently it is necessary to consider the musician's harmonious (eurhythmic) as well as their disharmonious (arrhythmic) experiences as they equally shape their unique sense of place.

Besides arrhythmic urban experiences, the interviews revealed aspects of the musician's everyday life, which have partly been uncovered and discussed during photo-elicitation or the mapping exercise. Those synchronicities allowed for a more holistic insight into the everyday (urban) rhythms of the musicians and increased credibility and validity of the data collected during the rhythm analytical exploration of Wellington and Copenhagen's music-making.

Conclusion

In this thesis I set myself the task of examining musicians' (affective) relationship to the (urban) space they live, work and move-in. I chose Wellington and Copenhagen as examples, which would elicit the ways in which the musicians' 'sense of place' is evoked through a complex array of changing rhythmic processes that characterise everyday life in the city.

To do this, I introduced a rhythm analytical framework, which adds to Lefebvre's triadic notion of social space the 'rhythmical triad' composed of social, spatial and affective rhythms, offering an analytic technique for examining and understanding the musicians' polyrhythmic environments. This framework was used to demonstrate how music-making simultaneously facilitates and frames particular experiences of place, including the less readily apparent but no less significant aspects of the social, spatial and, more importantly, affective dimensions associated with music-making in the city. This focus on the less tangible, affective rhythms and atmospheres brought in its wake methodological consequences, as the conventional methods used within social science research have been criticized for capturing only a "narrow range of sensate life" (Thrift 2000, 3). In order to provide a more holistic analysis of the multiple rhythms underlying the musicians' sense of place in Wellington and Copenhagen, I proposed a unique medley of research methods including participant observation, mapping, photo-elicitation and interviews. Embedded in the phenomenological tradition, each ethnographic method contributed to the capturing of social, spatial and affective rhythms in a specific way.

Participant observation provided an opportunity to gain an 'outside' perspective of the city's complex rhythmical layout including its materiality, mobility and sociality, which was necessary in order to successfully analyse and understand the musicians' place experiences, opinions, reactions and visual expressions. It also enabled an 'inside' perspective, which shed light on the participants' individual rhythms, moods and pathways through the city. Both perspectives were vital in order to conduct a fruitful rhythm analysis of music-making in Wellington and Copenhagen.

Semi-structured interviews were used to explore the participants' reasoning about their everyday urban environment, revealing concrete matters of the city's infrastructure for music-making as well as diverse aspects regarding social, cultural and political rhythms determining the musician's specific experience of the city. As such, verbal narratives uncovered harmonious, eurhythmic place experiences as well as disharmonious, arrhythmic urban experiences, which are both part of the complex polyrhythmic unfolding of the city and shape the way a sense of place is evoked.

The rhythmanalytical activity was however not limited to the perspective of the researcher as the rhythmanalyst. Rather, this study involved the music-makers as active participants in the process of capturing, examining and understanding the multiple rhythms constituting their everyday life, especially the less tangible, 'inner' rhythms either in regards to the geographical inside of their homes or the physical inside of their personal moods, affects, desires and dreams.

Thus, in order to get some sense of how music-making is conceived of spatially, in non-narrative form, the musicians were asked to draw a map of 'their personal Wellington' or 'their personal Copenhagen'. Those individual maps provided scenic details including material and natural rhythms, which constitute the musician's physical urban environment as well as other less tangible elements such as affective rhythms and atmospheres. As such, the maps facilitated an atmospheric attunement, a 'sensing out' or 'attending to what's happening', which enabled a consideration of the concrete as well as the more elusive aspects that constitute the sociomusical experience of musicians in each city (Stewart 2011).

Lastly, photo-elicitation was used as a technique that enabled the musicians to actively engage with the city spaces they live, dwell and work in, which facilitated a multi-sensual experience and understanding of their everyday urban environment. In addition to the maps, the photographs provided further details on the 'inside' lives and works of the musicians, including spatial insights into bedrooms, kitchens and rehearsal spaces as well as insights into the less tangible facets of the everyday, such as sensations, moods, affective intensities and atmospheres underlying a particular situation or moment. In this way, photo-elicitation enabled a consideration of social,

spatial and affective rhythms, indicating their quality, intensity and combination in a way that would have not been possible through mapping or in talk-only interviews.

As such, the combination of these ethnographic methods enabled a thicker description of the multiple rhythms, atmospheres, and affects surrounding the music-makers in their everyday life. This weaving together of visual and verbal narratives provided access to different kinds of knowledge, including the multisensory, embodied and affective experiences of place, which yields an understanding of the musicians' sense of place in its complexity and multiplicity.

The analysis of photographs, maps and interviews revealed different people, places, objects, events, interactions, atmospheres, fluxes and flows – a complex range of multi-scalar temporalities that make up a concatenation of social, spatial and affective City Rhythms, which in their varied ratios, serve to bind the music-makers to their urban space. Social rhythms consist of various social events, activities, practices and traditions as well as institutional and governmental dynamics; spatial rhythms encompass the concrete, physical reality of the city including urban nature, seasonal and annual cycles, whereas affective rhythms are composed of ordinary affects and atmospheres.

Besides this differentiation of rhythms according to dominant spatial attributes, the analysis has revealed that City Rhythms can be distinguished by their *intensity* and their *direction*. Those characteristics are an essential part of what Lefebvre refers to as 'measure'. He states that "everywhere where there is rhythm, there is measure, which is to say law, calculated and expected obligation, a project" (2004, 8). This implies that even though rhythms are perceived naturally and spontaneously, they have an identifiable measure, a certain set of rules or guidelines, which facilitates their identification in everyday urban life. A rhythm's *intensity* and *direction*, is therefore an indication of its relative force or weight in the process of affective place making. Visual techniques such as photo elicitation and mapmaking are valuable tools for capturing those rhythmic characteristics as they make visible the music-makers' concrete, physical reality as well as less visible, intangible, ethereal rhythms constituting everyday life in the city. *Intensity* can thus be determined by the dominance of particular rhythms on the musicians' maps and photographs, such as the

strong appearance of natural rhythms on various drawings from Wellington. Here, the most frequently drawn object was the natural harbour including the vast coastline, the hills and the surrounding native bush, which often took up half of the entire map.

Even though the city of Copenhagen is graced with numerous lakes, parks, canals and the ocean as well, natural rhythms were far less dominant and took up a rather small part of the maps. Instead, the musicians drew roads, streets, bridges or cycle lanes that permeated the city, connecting different buildings, objects and places. Some of those roads crossed the local border, indicating the ‘bridge to Sweden’ or a ‘highway out of the city’, which expands the confined cityscape and points towards a global drive and direction. This ‘global direction’ is part of the rhythms measure and was reinforced by the frequent depiction of airplanes or the airport on the Copenhagen drawings, as well as the appearance of a globe, a world map, the airport or mobile media devices on the musicians’ photographs, which illustrates their desire for movement and connectivity on a global scale. Following Massey (1994) the increasing degree of mobility and the geographical stretching-out of social relations constitutes a sense of place which “includes a consciousness of its links with the wider world” (155). For this reason, I want to argue that this ‘outward’ direction of City Rhythms points towards an ‘extroverted’ sense of place. In contrast, the main direction of City Rhythms for Wellington’s music-makers is directed ‘inwards’, towards the local musical community. This is illustrated by the depiction of community houses on the drawings and photographs, as well as the frequent appearance of people, social gatherings and events, which highlights the dense network of cooperative links between local musicians and demonstrates the significance of community and collaboration. The centrality of community for Wellington’s music-makers suggests a sense of place, which is rather ‘introverted’. As such, the direction of City Rhythms indicates if a sense of place is introverted or extroverted. However, those directions are not mutually exclusive; rather, an individual’s sense of place always includes ‘inward’ as well as ‘outward’ looking rhythms. As Massey points out: “there are relations with real content – economic, political, cultural – between any local place and the wider world in which it is set” (157). However, I would suggest that there can be differences in the degree of ‘inwardness’ and ‘outwardness’ of a sense of place, which in turn affects the way cultural practices and activities such as music-making develop and manifest themselves in urban spaces. For instance, the lack of creative infrastructure

and possibilities was an issue for music-makers in both cities, yet the way they approached the problem differed greatly. In Wellington, the shortage of performance and rehearsal space prompts the music-makers to reach ‘inwards’ towards the local musical community in order to “develop a collaborative effort oriented towards solving problems” (Stahl 2011, 150). Through the sharing of resources and the creation of alternative performance space local musicians express their collective will to overcome the constraints imposed by the cultural policy of the city. In Copenhagen on the other hand, the city’s limited space of creative possibilities fosters the musicians’ desire to reach ‘outwards’ by extending local networks, pathways and relationships and develop a wider network of (urban) rhythms on a local as well as a global scale.

Approaching music-making through a comparative rhythm analysis of Wellington and Copenhagen has provided opportunities for identifying the *specificity*, *intensity* and *direction* of the multiple rhythms, which affect the diurnal, weekly and annual experience of place and impact on the music-makers’ affective attachment to the city. The comparison of two urban spaces facilitated a clear differentiation between social, spatial and affective rhythms, illuminated their varying intensities and highlighted their degree of inwardness or outwardness. Using visual based methods provided an opportunity to write theory through “descriptive detours”, a way to account for some of the more elusive aspects shaping the sociomusical experience of music-makers in each city (Stewart 2011, 445). The combination of cartographic and photographic methods enabled us to better attend to an affective register that is often overlooked in studies of music-making. As such, making visible the everyday lives of music-makers, as they themselves document and reflect upon them, provoked a deeper analysis of those social, spatial and affective movements and moments, the fixity and flow which orchestrates musical activity in the city.

This study proposes an alternative approach to urban music-making, which complements existing ethnographic research in the field, as it often relies too heavily on storytelling, neglecting broader rhythms, forces and contextual variations, which shape the individual’s place experience. The rhythm analytical methodology proposed here requires both researcher and participants to actively engage in the process of data collection and interpretation. Photography as a place-interactive and creative method

prompted the music-makers to provide rich evidence of the concrete, physical reality of their urban environment from public spaces to private bedrooms, as well as the more abstract, ineffable, affective moments and ‘inner’ rhythms of their everyday life. Photographs and mental maps offered an opportunity to capture ‘inner’ processes and affective intensities, atmospheres, memories, moods, dreams, imaginations and feelings a place recalls within an individual and as such provided insight beyond the scope of conventional interviews. Those visual methods encouraged the music-makers to access different parts of their consciousness and “reveal what is hidden in the inner mechanisms of the ordinary and the taken for granted” (Knowles and Sweetman 2004, 7). The combination of cartographic and photographic methods enabled us to better attend to an affective register that is frequently overlooked in studies of music-making, in part because those ‘inner’ rhythms are often deemed “unrepresentable.” As such, making visible the everyday lives of music-makers, as they themselves document and reflect upon them, provoked a deeper analysis of those social, spatial and affective movements and moments, the fixity and flow which orchestrates musical activity in the city.

From the standpoint of the researcher as rhythm analyst it can be noted that besides the intimate insight into the music-makers ‘inner’ spaces and places of the ordinary, performing a rhythm analysis as a way of assessing, exploring, interpreting and understanding cultural activity in the city, reinforced the awareness of my own body in the process of conducting fieldwork. From daily walks or cycle tours between my home, the university, cafés, bars and rehearsal spaces where I could smell a gentle sea breeze and feel the warm sunshine on my skin or be slowed down by heavy wind gusts and pouring rain from every direction; to the experience of cosy dinner parties, flea-markets and political protests and demonstrations. All of those multi-sensual place experiences affected the way I ‘sensed out’ and ‘made sense of’ the urban environment I (and my respondents) worked and lived in. In this way, approaching my fieldwork through a rhythm analysis made me aware that “bodily experiences are equally important as intellectual ones” (Johansson 2013, 356). It made me understand that fieldwork is not merely a process of ‘data gathering’ but an attentive ‘listening’ to the interplay of social, spatial and affective rhythms. Like listening to a symphony or an opera, rhythm analysis requires an attuning of the senses, a high alertness and curiosity for the composition, assemblage, harmony and disharmony of the various

elements. It provided me with a tool to write theory through “descriptive detours” (Stewart 2010), as it allowed me to “pull academic attunements into tricky alignment with the amazing, sometimes eventful, sometimes buoyant, sometimes endured, sometimes so sad, always commonplace labor of becoming sentient to a world’s work, bodies, rhythms and ways of being in noise and light” (Stewart 2011, 445). Rhythmanalysis has showed me the proximity and interplay of aspects that conventional analysis often keeps separate: time and space, the private and the public, the concrete and the affective, the scientific and the poetic.

However, this research is not a definitive examination by any means, rather it remains an attempt to document, through a unique medley of research methods, the way in which music-making serves as a vehicle for the social production of place and the creation of an affective attachment to that place both individual and collective.

There is nothing to suggest however, that this rhythmanalytical framework’s usefulness is restricted solely to independent music-making in Wellington and Copenhagen. It can be applied equally to the study of reggae, hip-hop, jazz, punk, drum and bass, techno, salsa or any musical genre found in any city worldwide. It can be extended to consider as well beer brewing, backgammon playing, slacklining or surfing. Each in their own way contributes to the city’s polyrhythmical layout and reveals something about the individual’s distinctive relationship to their (urban) environment. As such, this rhythmanalytical approach can be utilized to examine the particular place experience of any subculture or social group found in the city, which opens up various areas for future research. Let me elaborate on one specific example.

During the last year, the influx of refugees has confronted many European cities with a unique set of challenges: language barriers, food, clothing, and housing shortage, medical care, education and eventual integration. Refugees and displaced people are faced to establish a sense of place in an environment with a very different rhythmical layout to what they were used to. The rhythmanalytical framework can be used in order to make visible the eurhythmic and arrhythmic experiences of asylum seekers in the city, which allows for a more nuanced understanding of their everyday struggles and challenges. Participant generated photographs and maps can be used to support the documenting of everyday place experiences despite language barriers. As such,

those methods afford opportunities for ‘sensing the city and mapping the beat’, in a way that provides valuable insights into the thoughts, feelings, needs and wants of refugees, which in turn facilitates resettlement and integration.

By contrast, a rhythmanalysis of music-making in the city poses a rather different approach towards ‘sensing the city and mapping the beat’. Music-making can offer us a distinctive set of practices through which a number of place-related issues reveal themselves. As such, music-making provokes compelling depictions of the ways place attachment is created as it serves as a binding agent, connecting diverse practices, ideas, affects, images and institutions, which all affect the organization of social and cultural life in the city. Music-making in this capacity organizes rhythms, relations and practices in such a way that they help to cultivate an (affective) attachment to place. In fact, it can be understood as one of the primary vehicles through which a sense of place is felt and articulated. In a more general sense, the set of cultural practices associated with music-making afford participants the opportunity to immerse themselves in the social spatial and affective rhythms offered by the city. As Finnegan reminds us:

Music and musicians are [...] recognized as having the special role of creating a space in social life and framing events as “rituals”— a responsibility of deep and essential significance for our society. But there is also more to be said. For music does more than just frame this space: it also fills it (1989, 336).

Finnegan’s point describes the social production of a cultural space, which allows for a form of civic engagement centred on music. This highlights music’s role as a social medium, one which provides forms of connectivity to a place through the occupation of rehearsal, performance and studio spaces, but also by providing the context for an ethical engagement with the city in and through those extra-musical spaces such as bars, cafés, etc., where social ties are continually renewed. As such, music-making is also about movement through the city, about cycling, walking or driving from house to rehearsal space, to club, bar or café. It revolves around the city’s distinctive ‘rhythmic beat’, which directs, integrates and coordinates people, space and time and as such gives shape to a meaningful urban choreography, the kind of which deepens the sociomusical experience of the city for many. I have chosen music-making as one cultural practice which raises intriguing questions regarding affective attachment and sociality in the city, as music-making is made up of a complex array of social, spatial

and affective dimensions, all of which lend the city its ambience, its textures, its atmospheres, and, more importantly, its affective charge.

The study of music-making in the city introduces a number of compelling issues to media and communication scholars including the activity of establishing and maintaining social relations, networks and structures, the complex processes of localization and globalization, movement and stasis, the interplay of power relations, identity, sensory knowledges, attachments and detachments. As such, this study offers an important contribution to the field of media and communication studies, as it offers a variety of research methods and concepts in order to bring together notions of the urban, materiality, sensoriality, affects and atmospheres, cultural practice, mediation and communication in an innovative and fruitful way.

Bibliography

- ‘2GOcopenhagen’. 2015. *Søndagsvenner 2015 Outdoor Party in Refshaølen*.
<http://www.2gocopenhagen.com/event/sondagsvenner-2015/>. Accessed
 November 2, 2015.
- Aboutorabi, Mohsen, and Andreas Wesener. 2010. *Urban Design Research: Method
 and Application ; Proceedings of the International Conference Held at
 Birmingham City University, 3 - 4 December 2009 ;[conference Papers*.
 Birmingham: Birmingham City University.
- Abu-Lughod, Lila. 1990. ‘Can There Be A Feminist Ethnography?’ *Women &
 Performance: A Journal of Feminist Theory* 5 (1): 7–27.
- Agnew, John A., John Mercer, and David Edward Sopher. 1984. *The City in Cultural
 Context*. Boston: Allen & Unwin.
- Ahmed, Sara. 2004a. ‘Affective Economies’. *Social Text* 22 (2): 117–39.
 ———. 2004b. *The Cultural Politics of Emotion*. New York and London: Routledge.
- Aldskogius, Hans. 1993. ‘Festivals and Meets: The Place of Music in “Summer
 Sweden”’. *Geografiska Annaler. Series B, Human Geography* 75 (2): 55–72.
- Allen, John. 1999. ‘Worlds within Cities’. In *City Worlds*, edited by Doreen Massey,
 Steve Pile, and John Allen, 54–97. London: Routledge.
- Althusser, Louis. 2001. *Lenin and Philosophy, and Other Essays*. New York:
 Monthly Review Press.
- Amin, Ash, and Nigel Thrift. 2002. *Cities: Re-Imagining the Urban*. Oxford: Polity.
- Anderson, Ben. 2006. ‘Becoming and Being Hopeful: Towards a Theory of Affect’.
Environment and Planning D: Society and Space 24 (5): 733–52.
 ———. 2009. ‘Affective Atmospheres’. *Emotion, Space and Society* 2 (2): 77–81.
- Anderson, Ben, and Paul Harrison. 2006. ‘Questioning Affect and Emotion’. *Area* 38
 (3): 333–35.
- Appadurai, Arjun. 1990. ‘Disjuncture and Difference in the Global Cultural
 Economy’. *Theory, Culture & Society* 7 (2): 295–310.
- Atkinson, Rowland. 2006. ‘Aural Ecology of the City: Sound, Noise and Exclusion In
 the City. Occasional Paper No. 5’. *Housing and Community Research Unit,
 University of Tasmania*.

- Babin, Tom. 2014. *Frostbike: The Joy, Pain and Numbness of Winter Cycling*. Toronto, Canada: Rocky Mountain Books Ltd.
- Bachelard, Gaston. 1994. *The Poetics of Space*. Boston: Beacon Press.
- Bachmann-Medick, Doris. 2016. *Cultural Turns: New Orientations in the Study of Culture*. Berlin, Boston: Walter de Gruyter GmbH & Co KG.
- Bagnoli, Anna. 2009. 'Beyond the Standard Interview: The Use of Graphic Elicitation and Arts-Based Methods'. *Qualitative Research* 9 (5): 547–70.
- Barnfield, Andrew, and Anna Plyushteva. 2015. 'Cycling in the Post-Socialist City: On Travelling by Bicycle in Sofia, Bulgaria'. *Urban Studies*, 1–14.
- Barthes, Roland. 1977. 'Rhetoric of the Image'. In *Image/Music/Text*, 33–37. New York: Hill and Wang.
- Batchen, Geoffrey. 1997. *Burning with Desire: The Conception of Photography*. Cambridge, Mass: MIT Press.
- Bayliss, Darrin. 2007. 'The Rise of the Creative City: Culture and Creativity in Copenhagen'. *European Planning Studies* 15 (7): 889–903.
- Bayton, Mavis. 1998. *Frock Rock: Women Performing Popular Music*. 1st edition. Oxford ; New York: Oxford University Press.
- Becker, Howard S. 1958. 'Problems of Inference and Proof in Participant Observation'. *American Sociological Review* 23 (6): 652–60.
- . 1963. *Outsiders; Studies in the Sociology of Deviance*. London, Free Press of Glencoe.
- Bell, Thomas. 1998. 'Why Seattle? An Examination of an Alternative Rock Culture Hearth'. *Journal of Cultural Geography* 18 (1): 35–47.
- Bennett, Andy. 2000. *Popular Music and Youth Culture: Music, Identity and Place*. Basingstoke, UK: Palgrave Macmillan.
- . 2001. *Cultures of Popular Music*. Buckingham; Philadelphia: Open University Press.
- . 2002. 'Music, Media and Urban Mythscapes: A Study of the "Canterbury Sound"'. *Media, Culture & Society* 24 (1): 87–100.
- . 2009. "'Heritage Rock': Rock Music, Representation and Heritage Discourse'. *Poetics* 37 (5): 474–89.
- Bennett, H. Stith. 1980. *On Becoming a Rock Musician*. Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press.

- Bergson, Henry. 1988. *Matter and Memory*. New York: Zone Books.
- Blum, Alan. 2003. *The Imaginative Structure of the City*. Culture of Cities. Montréal Québec ; Ithaca NY: McGill-Queen's University Press.
- . 2007. 'Comparing Cities: On the Mutual Honouring of Peculiarities'. In *Urban Enigmas. Montreal, Toront, and the Problem of Comparing Cities*, edited by Johanne Sloan, 15–51. Canada: McGill-Queens University Press.
- Blunt, Alison, and Robyn M. Dowling. 2006. *Home*. London; New York: Routledge.
- Bohlman, Philip V., Nicholas Cook, and Mark Everist. 1999. 'Ontologies of Muisic'. In *Rethinking Music*, edited by Nicholas Cook and Mark Everist. 17–34. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Bourdieu, Pierre. 1986. 'The Forms of Capital'. In *Handbook of Theory and Research for the Sociology of Education*, edited by J.G. Richardson, 241–58. New York/Westport/London.
- Boyd, Candice, and Michelle Duffy. 2012. 'Sonic Geographies of Shifting Bodies'. *Interference: A Journal of Audio Culture* 1 (2): 1–7.
- Brenner, Neil. 2001. 'The Limits to Scale? Methodological Reflections on Scalar Structuration'. *Progress in Human Geography* 25 (4): 591–614.
- Bridge, Gary, and Sophie Watson, eds. 2010. *The Blackwell City Reader*. 2nd ed. Chichester: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Bromgard, Gregg, David Trafimow, and Christopher Linn. 2014. 'Janteloven and the Expression of Pride in Norway and the United States'. *The Journal of Social Psychology* 154 (5): 375–78.
- Brunt, Shelley. 2011. 'Performing Identity and Place in Wellington's Cuba Street Carnival'. In *Home, Land and Sea. Situating Music in Aotearoa New Zealand*, edited by Glenda Keam and Tony Mitchell. 161-73. Auckland: Pearson Education.
- Butler, Toby. 2006. 'A Walk of Art: The Potential of the Sound Walk as Practice in Cultural Geography'. *Social & Cultural Geography* 7 (6): 889–908.
- Buttimer, Anne. 1980. 'Home, Reach, and Sense of Place'. In *The Human Experience of Space and Place*, edited by Anne Buttimer and David Seamon. 173–85. London: Croom Helm.
- Carney, George O. 1974. 'Bluegrass Grows All around: The Spatial Dimensions of Country Music Style'. *Journal of Geography*, no. 73: 34–55.

- Cele, Sofia. 2006. *Communicating Place: Methods for Understanding Children's Experience of Place*. Acta Universitatis Stockholmiensis Stockholm Studies in Human Geography 16. Stockholm: Stockholm University.
- Certeau, Michel de. 1988. *The Practice Of Everyday Life*. Translated by Steven Rendall. Berkeley, Los Angeles, London: University of California Press.
- Cighi, Catalin. 2008. 'Senses of Place'. *Masters Theses*, January.
<http://scholarworks.umass.edu/theses/116>. Accessed April 2014, 2015.
- City of Copenhagen. 2011. 'Copenhagen City of Cyclists. Bicycle Account 2010.' City of Copenhagen - The Technical and Environmental Administration - Traffic Department. <http://www.cycling-embassy.dk/wp-content/uploads/2011/05/Bicycle-account-2010-Copenhagen.pdf>. Accessed November 21, 2015.
- Clark-Ibáñez, Marisol. 2004. 'Framing the Social World With Photo-Elicitation Interviews'. *American Behavioral Scientist* 47 (12): 1507–27.
- Clawson, Mary Ann. 1999. 'When Women Play the Bass: Instrument Specialization and Gender Interpretation in Alternative Rock Music'. *Gender and Society* 13 (2): 193–210.
- Cloke, Paul, and Owain Jones. 2001. 'Dwelling, Place, and Landscape: An Orchard in Somerset'. *Environment and Planning A* 33 (4): 649–66.
- Cohen, Sara. 1991. *Rock Culture in Liverpool: Popular Music in the Making*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- . 1993. 'Ethnography and Popular Music Studies'. *Popular Music* 12 (02): 123–38.
- . 1995. 'Sounding out the City: Music and the Sensuous Production of Place'. *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers* 20 (4): 434–46.
- . 1998. 'Sounding Out the City: Music and the Sensuous Production of Place'. In *The Place of Music*, edited by Andrew Leyshon, David Matless, and George Revill, 269–90. Guilford Press.
- . 2007a. *Decline, Renewal and the City in Popular Music Culture: Beyond the Beatles*. Ashgate Popular and Folk Music Series. Burlington, VT: Ashgate.
- . 2007b. "'Rock Landmark at Risk": Popular Music, Urban Regeneration, and the Built Urban Environment'. *Journal of Popular Music Studies* 19 (1): 3–25.
- . 2012. 'Live Music and Urban Landscape: Mapping the Beat in Liverpool'. *Social Semiotics* 22 (5): 587–603.

- Cohen, Sara, Brett Lashua, and John Schofield. 2010. 'Popular Music, Mapping, and the Characterization of Liverpool'. *Popular Music History* 4 (2): 126–44.
- Collier, John, and Malcolm Collier. 1986. *Visual Anthropology: Photography as a Research Method*. Albuquerque: New Mexico University Press.
- Connell, John, and Chris Gibson. 2003. *Sound Tracks: Popular Music, Identity, and Place*. Critical Geographies. London: Routledge.
- Conradson, David. 2007. 'Freedom, Space and Perspective: Moving Encounters with Other Ecologies'. In *Emotional Geographies*, edited by Joyce Davidson, Liz Bondi, and Mick Smith. 103–16. Aldershot: Ashgate Publishing, Ltd.
- Cook, Daniel Thomas. 2001. 'Review: Music in Everyday Life by Tia DeNora'. *Journal of Sociology* 106 (5): 1484–86.
- Cook, Nicholas. 1998. *Music: A Very Short Introduction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Copenhagen Airports A/S. 2014. 'Group Annual Report 2014'. CVR no. 14 70 72 04. Copenhagen. https://www.cph.dk/globalassets/om-cph/investor/publikationer/arsrapporter_uk/cph_uk_ar_report_2015_03_18_final.pdf. Accessed June 23, 2015.
- 'Copenhagen.climatemps'. n.d. *Sunshine and Daylight Hours in Copenhagen, Denmark*. <http://www.copenhagen.climatemps.com/sunlight.php>.
- 'Copenhagenet.dk'. 2015. *Lakes around Copenhagen*. Accessed October 28, 2015. <http://www.copenhagenet.dk/cph-map/cph-lakes.asp>. Accessed October 28, 2015.
- Corner, James. 2011. 'The Agency of Mapping: Speculation, Critique and Invention'. In *The Map Reader*, edited by Martin Dodge, Rob Kitchin, and Chris Perkins, 89–101. John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.
- Council of Europe, EriCarts. 2015. 'Culturalpolicies.net'. *Denmark : 5.3 Sector Specific Legislation : 5.3.2 Performing Arts and Music*. <http://www.culturalpolicies.net/web/denmark.php?aid=532>. Accessed November 12, 2015.
- Crang, Mike. 1998. *Cultural Geography*. London: Routledge.
- . 2001. 'Rhythms of the City. Temporalised Space and Motion.' In *Timespace: Geographies of Temporality*, edited by Nigel Thrift and Jon May. 187–207. London: Routledge.

- Crang, Mike, and Ian Cook. 2007. 'Participant Observation'. In *Doing Ethnographies*, edited by Mike Crang and Ian Cook, 36–60. London: Sage Publications.
- Cresswell, Tim. 2009. 'Place'. *International Encyclopedia of Human Geography*, edited by Nigel Thrift and Rob Kitchen. Vol. 8, 169–177. Oxford: Elsevier.
- Cresswell, Tim, and Peter Merriman. 2011. *Geographies of Mobilities Practices, Spaces, Subjects*. Farnham, Surrey; Burlington, VT: Ashgate.
- Croghan, Rosaleen, Christine Griffin, Janine Hunter, and Ann Phoenix. 2008. 'Young People's Constructions of Self: Notes on the Use and Analysis of the Photo-Elicitation Methods'. *International Journal of Social Research Methodology* 11 (4): 345–56.
- Cubitt, Sean. 2006. 'Analogue and Digital'. *Theory, Culture and Society* 23 (2-3): 250–51.
- Curtis, James R., and Richard F. Rose. 1987. 'The Miami Sound: A Contemporary Latin Form of Place-Specific Music'. In *The Sounds of People and Places - Readings in the Geography of American Folk and Popular Music*, edited by George O. Carney, 285–300. Lanham, NY, London: University Press of America.
- Damasio, Antonio R. 2000. *The Feeling of What Happens: Body, Emotion and the Making of Consciousness*. London: Vintage.
- Datel, Robin. E., and Dennis. J. Dingemans. 1984. 'Environmental Perception, Historic Preservation and Sense of Place'. In *Environmental Perception and Behavior: An Inventory and Prospect*, edited by Thomas. F. Saarinen, David Seamon, and James. L. Sell, 131–44. Chicago: University of Chicago.
- Davidson, Joyce, and Liz Bondi. 2004. 'Spatialising Affect; Affecting Space: An Introduction'. *Gender, Place & Culture* 11 (3): 373–74.
- Dediu, Igorevna. 2015. 'Tall Poppy Syndrome and Its Effect on Work Performance'. Unpublished Master Thesis, Christchurch: University of Canterbury. <http://ir.canterbury.ac.nz:80/handle/10092/10261>. Accessed October 5, 2015.
- Deleuze, Gilles, and Felix Guattari. 1988. *A Thousand Plateaus : Capitalism and Schizophrenia*. London: Athlone Press.
- den Besten, Olga. 2010. 'Local Belonging and "Geographies of Emotions": Immigrant Children's Experience of Their Neighbourhoods in Paris and Berlin'. *Childhood* 17 (2): 181–95.
- DeNora, Tia. 1999. 'Music as a Technology of the Self'. *Poetics* 27 (1): 31–56.

- . 2000. *Music in Everyday Life*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Deverson, Tony, ed. 2006. 'The New Zealand Oxford Paperback Dictionary'. Auckland: Oxford University Press.
- Dewsbury, John-David. 2003. 'Witnessing Space: "Knowledge without Contemplation"'. *Environment and Planning A* 35 (11): 1907–32.
- . 2009. 'Affect'. *International Encyclopedia of Human Geography*, edited by Nigel Thrift and Rob Kitchen. Vol. 8, 20-24. Oxford: Elsevier.
- Diprose, Rosalyn, and Jack Reynolds. 2008. *Merleau-Ponty : Key Concepts*. Stocksfield: Acumen.
- Dittmer, Dr Jason, Craine, Dr Jim, and Adams, Dr Paul C. 2014. *The Ashgate Research Companion to Media Geography*. Williston, VT: Ashgate Publishing, Ltd.
- Duelund, Peter, Bjarki Valtýsson, and Laerke Bohlbro. 2012. 'Compendium of Cultural Policies and Trends in Europe'. Council of Europe/ERICarts. www.culturalpolicies.net/down/denmark_032012.pdf. Accessed September 17, 2015.
- Duffy, Michelle. 2005. 'Performing Identity within a Multicultural Framework'. *Social & Cultural Geography* 6 (5): 677–92.
- Duffy, Michelle, and Candice Boyd. 2012. 'Sonic Geographies of Shifting Bodies'. *Interference/A Journal of Audio Culture*. <http://www.interferencejournal.com/articles/a-sonic-geography/sonic-geographies-of-shifting-bodies>. Accessed June 6, 2015.
- Duffy, Michelle, Gordon Waitt, Andrew Gorman-Murray, and Chris Gibson. 2011. 'Bodily Rhythms: Corporeal Capacities to Engage with Festival Spaces'. *Emotion, Space and Society* 4 (1): 17–24.
- Dyson, Frances. 2009. *Sounding New Media: Immersion and Embodiment in the Arts and Culture*. Berkeley, Los Angeles, London: University of California Press.
- Edensor, Tim. 2010. 'Walking in Rhythms: Place, Regulation, Style and the Flow of Experience'. *Visual Studies* 25 (1): 69–79.
- . 2012. *Geographies of Rhythm: Nature, Place, Mobilities and Bodies*. Burlington, VT: Ashgate Publishing, Ltd.
- Edensor, Tim, and Julian Holloway. 2008. 'Rhythmanalysing the Coach Tour: The Ring of Kerry, Ireland'. *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers* 33 (4): 483–501.

- Ehrenreich, Barbara, Elizabeth Hess, and Gloria Jacobs. 1997. 'Beatlemania: A Sexually Defiant Consumer Subculture'. In *The Subcultures Reader*, edited by Sarah Thornton and Ken Gelder, 523–37. London: Routledge.
- Ekman, Paul. 2003. *Emotions Revealed. Understanding Faces and Feelings*. London: Weidenfeld & Nicolson.
- Elden, Stuart. 2004. 'Rhythmanalysis: An Introduction (b)'. In *Rhythmanalysis: Space, Time and Everyday Life*, by Henri Lefebvre, vii – xv. London, UK: Continuum.
- . 2004. *Understanding Henri Lefebvre (a)*. London: Continuum.
- Ertel, Manfred. 2007. 'Europe's Coolest Cities: Copenhagen - Cool, Cultural and Creative'. *Spiegel Online*, <http://www.spiegel.de/international/europe/europe-s-coolest-cities-copenhagen-cool-cultural-and-creative-a-502512.html>. Accessed August 20, 2015.
- 'Eyegum.co.nz'. 2015. *About*. <http://eyegum.co.nz/about/>. Accessed November 2, 2015.
- Faulkner, Robert R. 1971. *Hollywood Studio Musicians, Their Work and Careers in the Recording Industry*. Chicago: Aldine-Atherton.
- Feather, Norman T. 1989. 'Attitudes towards the High Achiever: The Fall of the Tall Poppy'. *Australian Journal of Psychology* 41 (3): 239–67.
- . 1991. 'Attitudes towards the High Achiever: Effects of Perceiver's Own Level of Competence'. *Australian Journal of Psychology* 43 (3): 121–24.
- Featherstone, Mike. 1998. 'The Flaneur, the City and Virtual Public Life'. *Urban Studies* 35 (5–6): 909–25.
- Feld, Stephen. 1996. 'Waterfalls of Song and Acoustemology of Place Resounding in Bosavi, Papua New Guinea'. In *Senses of Place*, edited by Stephen Feld and Keith Basso, 91–135. Santa Fe: School of American Research Press.
- Finnegan, Ruth. 1989. *The Hidden Musicians: Music-Making in an English Town*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Flatley, Jonathan. 2008. *Affective Mapping: Melancholia and the Politics of Modernism*. Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press.
- Fleming, Douglas K. 1975. 'Review'. *Annals of the Association of American Geographers* 65 (2): 315–16.
- Ford, Larry. 1971. 'Geographic Factors in the Origin, Evolution and Diffusion of Rock and Roll Music'. *Journal of Geography*, no. 70: 455–64.

- Foucault, Michel. 1993 [1974]. 'Övervakning och Straff, fängelsets födelse'.
Lund: First published as *Surveiller et punir*.
- Frith, Simon. 1996. 'Music and Identity'. In *Questions of Cultural Identity*, edited by Steward Hall and Paul Du Gay, 108–28. London, New Delhi: Sage Publications.
- . 2002. 'Music and Everyday Life'. *Critical Quarterly* 44 (1): 35–48.
- Frykman, Jonas, and Orvar Lofgren. 1996. 'Introduction'. In *Forces of Habit: Exploring Everyday Culture*, edited by Jonas Frykman and Orvar Lofgren. Lund: Lund University Press.
- Frykman, Jonas, and Orvar Löfgren. 1996. 'Introduction'. In *Forces of Habit: Exploring Everyday Culture*, 5–19. Lund: Lund University Press.
- Gardiner, Michael E. 2000. *Critique of Everyday Life*. London: Routledge.
- Gehl, Jan. 2015. 'Streetsblog SF'. *Danish Architect Jan Gehl on Good Cities for Bicycling / Streetsblog San Francisco*.
<http://sf.streetsblog.org/2011/06/16/danish-architect-jan-gehl-on-good-cities-for-bicycling/>. Accessed October 21, 2015.
- Gibson, Chris. 2005. 'Recording Studios: Relational Spaces of Creativity in the City'. *Built Environment* 31 (3): 192–207.
- . 2009. 'Place and Music: Performing "the Region" on the New South Wales Far North Coast'. *Transforming Cultures eJournal* 4 (1): 60–81.
- Gill, Warren. 1993. 'Region, Agency, and Popular Music: The Northwest Sound, 1958–1966'. *Canadian Geographer/Le Géographe Canadien* 37 (2): 120–31.
- Goonewardena, Kanishka, Stefan Kipfer, Richard Milgrom, and Christian Schmid, eds. 2008. *Space, Difference, Everyday Life : Reading Henri Lefebvre*. New York: Routledge.
- Gorman-Murray, Andrew, and Robyn Dowling. 2007. 'Home'. *M/C Journal* 10 (4).
<http://journal.media-culture.org.au/0708/01-editorial.php>. Accessed, December 15, 2014.
- Gottlieb, Joanne, and Gayle Wald. 1994. 'Smells like Teen Spirit: Riot Grrrls, Revolution and Women in Independent Rock'. In *Microphone Fiends: Youth Music and Youth Culture*, edited by Tricia Rose, 250–74. New York: Routledge.
- Grady, John. 2004. 'Working with Visible Evidence. An Invitation and Some Practical Advice'. In *Picturing the Social Landscape: Visual Methods and the*

- Sociological Imagination*, edited by Paul Sweetman and Caroline Knowles. London: Routledge.
- Grazian, David. 2004. 'Opportunities for Ethnography in the Sociology of Music'. *Poetics* 32 (3-4): 197–210.
- Gregg, Melissa, and Gregory J. Seigworth. 2010. *The Affect Theory Reader*. Durham NC: Duke University Press.
- Gregory, Derek. 2009. *The Dictionary of Human Geography*. 5th ed.. Chichester: John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.
- Hague, Cliff, and Paul Jenkins. 2005. *Place Identity, Participation and Planning*. London; New York: Psychology Press.
- Haldrup, Michael, and Jonas Larsen. 2006. 'Material Cultures of Tourism'. *Leisure Studies* 25 (3): 275–89.
- Halseth, Greg, and Joanne Doddridge. 2000. 'Children's Cognitive Mapping: A Potential Tool for Neighbourhood Planning'. *Environment and Planning B* 27 (4): 565–82.
- Hargreaves, David J., Raymond A. R. MacDonald, and Dorothy Miell, eds. 2002. *Musical Identities*. Oxford; New York: Oxford University Press.
- Harper, Douglas. 2002. 'Talking about Pictures: A Case for Photo Elicitation'. *Visual Studies* 17 (1): 13–26.
- Harper, Douglas, and Jon Prosser. 1998. 'An Argument for Visual Sociology'. In *Image-Based Research: A Sourcebook for Qualitative Researchers*, edited by Jon Prosser. 24–41. London: Falmer Press.
- Hart, Gillian. 2002. *Disabling Globalization: Places of Power in Post-Apartheid South Africa*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Harvey, David. 1973. *Social Justice and the City*. London, Edward Arnold.
- Hayden, Dolores. 1997. 'Urban Landscape History: The Sense of Place and the Politics of Space'. In *Understanding Ordinary Landscapes*, edited by Paul Groth and Todd Bressi W., 111–33. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Heidegger, Martin. 1971. *Poetry, Language, Thought*. New York: Harper.
- Heikkinen, Merja. 2003. 'Research Reports Of The Arts Council Of Finland'. 26. Helsinki: Arts Council of Finland.
- www.taike.fi/documents/10921/0/Heikkinen+26+03.pdf. Accessed November 27, 2015.

- Helms, Dietrich, and Thomas Phleps. 2007. *Sound and the City*. Bielefeld: Transcript Bielefeld.
- Henderson, Floyd M. 1974. 'The Image of New York City in American Popular Music: 1890-1970'. *New York Folklore Quarterly* 30: 267–79.
- Hesmondhalgh, David. 2013. *Why Music Matters*. Chichester, West Sussex, UK: Wiley Blackwell.
- Hicks, Felicity M. 1992. 'The Power of Music'. *Nursing Times*, no. 88: 72–74.
- Highmore, Ben. 2005. *Cityscapes: Cultural Readings in the Material and Symbolic City*. Basingstoke, UK: Palgrave.
- Holt, Fabian, and Carsten Wergin. 2013. *Musical Performance and the Changing City: Post-Industrial Contexts in Europe and the United States*. Routledge Research in Music. New York: Routledge.
- Homan, Shane. 2003. *The Mayor's a Square: Live Music and Law and Order in Sydney*. Sydney: Local Consumption Publications.
- Hoogstad, Jan Hein, and Birgitte Stougaard Pedersen. 2013. *Off Beat: Pluralizing Rhythm*. Amsterdam, New York: Rodopi.
- Hospers, Gert-Jan. 2003. 'Creative Cities: Breeding Places in the Knowledge Economy'. *Knowledge, Technology, and Policy* 16 (3): 143–62.
- Ingham, J., M. Purvis, and D. B. Clarke. 1999. 'Hearing Places, Making Spaces: Sonorous Geographies, Ephemeral Rhythms, and the Blackburn Warehouse Parties'. *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 17 (3): 283–305.
- Jacobi, Susanne, trans. 2005. 'Christiania Guide English'. Lassen Offset. <http://www.christiania.org/wp-content/uploads/2013/02/Guideeng2.pdf>. Accessed May 12, 2015.
- Jameson, Fredric. 1991. *Postmodernism, Or, The Cultural Logic of Late Capitalism*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Jannziu. 2015. 'The Royal Danish Academy of Music, Copenhagen —'. CiriusArticle. <http://studyindenmark.dk/study-options/danish-higher-education-institutions/university-level-institutions-of-fine-and-performing-arts-design-and-architecture/the-royal-danish-academy-of-music/the-royal-danish-academy-of-music>. Accessed October 30, 2015.
- Jarvis, Helen. 2005. 'Moving to London Time Household Co-Ordination and the Infrastructure of Everyday Life'. *Time & Society* 14 (1): 133–54.

- Jenkins, Richard. 2012. *Being Danish: Paradoxes of Identity in Everyday Life*. 2nd ed. Copenhagen: Museum Tusculanum.
- Jenks, Chris. 1995. *Visual Culture*. London; New York: Routledge.
- Johansson, Sara. 2013. 'Rytmen bor i mina steg. En rytmanalytisk studie om kropp, stad och kunskap (The rhythm lives in my steps. A rhythm-analytical study of body, city and knowledge)'. Uppsala: Uppsala University.
- Jones, Phil. 2012. 'Sensory Indiscipline and Affect: A Study of Commuter Cycling'. *Social & Cultural Geography* 13 (6): 645–58.
- Jungnickel, Katrina, and Rachel Aldred. 2014. 'Cycling's Sensory Strategies: How Cyclists Mediate Their Exposure to the Urban Environment'. *Mobilities* 9 (2): 238–55.
- Jurup. 2015. 'Copenhagen Creative Task Force'. *Centre for Cities and Creativity*. <http://www.cities-creativity.org/wordpress/2012/09/copenhagen-creative-task-force/>. Accessed October 19, 2015.
- Kaltenborn, Bjørn P. 1998. 'Effects of Sense of Place on Responses to Environmental Impacts: A Study among Residents in Svalbard in the Norwegian High Arctic'. *Applied Geography* 18 (2): 169–89.
- Kärrholm, Mattias. 2009. 'To the Rhythm of Shopping—on Synchronisation in Urban Landscapes of Consumption'. *Social & Cultural Geography* 10 (4): 421–40.
- Keam, Glenda, and Tony Mitchell. 2011. 'New Zealand Music and a Poetics of Place'. In *Home, Land and Sea. Situating Music in Aotearoa New Zealand*, edited by Glenda Keam and Tony Mitchell, x – xxv. Auckland: Pearson Education.
- Kirkwood, Jodyanne. 2007. 'Tall Poppy Syndrome: Implications for Entrepreneurship in New Zealand'. *Journal of Management and Organization* 13 (4): 366–82.
- Kloosterman, Robert C. 2005. 'Come Together: An Introduction to Music and the City'. *Built Environment* 31 (3): 181–91.
- Knecht, Carey. 2004. 'Urban Nature and Well-Being: Some Empirical Support and Design Implications'. <http://www.escholarship.org/uc/item/39c3w69p>. Accessed September 12, 2015.
- Knowles, Caroline, and Paul Sweetman. 2004. *Picturing the Social Landscape : Visual Methods and the Sociological Imagination*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Koch, Daniel, and Monica Sand. 2010. 'Rhythmanalysis – Rhythm as Mode, Methods and Theory for Analysing Urban Complexity'. In *Urban Design Research:*

- Method and Application - Proceedings of the International Conference Held at Birmingham City University*, edited by Mohsen Aboutorabi and Andreas Wesener. Birmingham: Birmingham City University.
- Kong, Lily. 1995. 'Popular Music in Geographical Analyses'. *Progress in Human Geography* 19 (2): 183–98.
- Krims, Adam. 2000. *Rap Music and the Poetics of Identity*. New Perspectives in Music History and Criticism. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- . 2007. *Music and Urban Geography*. New York: Routledge.
- Kruse, Holly. 2003. *Site and Sound: Understanding Independent Music Scenes*. New York: Peter Lang International Academic Publishers.
- . 2010. 'Local Identity and Independent Music Scenes, Online and Off'. *Popular Music and Society* 33 (5): 625–39.
- Kullman, Kim, and Charlotte Palludan. 2011. 'Rhythmanalytical Sketches: Agencies, School Journeys, Temporalities'. *Children's Geographies* 9 (3-4): 347–59.
- LaBelle, Brandon. 2008. 'Pump up the Bass - Rhythm, Cars, and Auditory Scaffolding.' *The Senses & Society* 3 (2): 187–203.
- . 2010. *Acoustic Territories : Sound Culture and Everyday Life*. New York: Continuum.
- Lashua, Brett, Karl Spracklen, and Stephen Wagg. 2014. *Sounds and the City : Popular Music, Place and Globalization*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Latham, Alan. 2003. 'Research, Performance, and Doing Human Geography: Some Reflections on the Diary-Photograph, Diary-Interview Method'. *Environment and Planning A* 35 (11): 1993–2017.
- Latham, Alan, and Derek P. McCormack. 2004. 'Moving Cities: Rethinking the Materialities of Urban Geographies'. *Progress in Human Geography* 28 (6): 701–24.
- . 2009. 'Thinking with Images in Non-Representational Cities: Vignettes from Berlin'. *Area* 41 (3): 252–62.
- Latham, Alan, Derek P McCormack, Kim McNamara, and Donald McNeill. 2009. *Key Concepts in Urban Geography*. Key Concepts in Human Geography. Los Angeles; London: SAGE.
- Lefebvre, Henri. 1947. *Critique of Everyday Life*. London; New York: Verso.
- . 1991. *The Production of Space*. Oxford, U.K: Blackwell.
- . 1996a. 'Seen from the Window'. In *Writings on Cities*. Oxford: Blackwell.

- . 1996b. *Writings on Cities*. Translated by Eleonore Kofman and Elizabeth Lebas. 1 edition. Cambridge, Mass, USA: Wiley-Blackwell.
- . 2004. *Rhythmanalysis: Space, Time and Everyday Life*. Translated by Gerald Moore and Stuart Elden. 1 edition. London ; New York: Bloomsbury Academic.
- Lehr, John C. 1983. 'Texas (when I Die): National Identity and Images of Place in Canadian Country Music Broadcasts'. *The Canadian Geographer* 27: 361–79.
- Lewis-Beck, Michael S., Alan Bryman, and Tim Futing Liao. 2003. *The SAGE Encyclopedia of Social Science Research Methods*. Thousand Oaks, Calif; London: SAGE.
- Ley, David, and Alison Mountz. 2001. 'Interpretation, Representation, Positionality: Issues in Field Research in Human Geography'. In *Qualitative Methodologies for Geographers: Issues and Debates*, edited by Melanie Limb and Claire Dwyer, 234–47. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Leyshon, Andrew. 2004. 'Reviewed Work: Sound Tracks: Popular Music, Identity and Place by John Connell, Chris Gibson'. *Annals of the Association of American Geographers* 94 (1): 230–32.
- Leyshon, Andrew, David Matless, and George Revill, eds. 1998. *The Place of Music*. New York and London: Guilford Press.
- Leys, Ruth. 2011. 'The Turn to Affect: A Critique'. *Critical Inquiry* 37 (3): 434–72.
- Lindsköld, Linnéa. 2015. 'Contradicting Cultural Policy: - A Comparative Study of the Cultural Policy of the Scandinavian Radical Right'. *Nordisk Kulturpolitisk Tidsskrift* 18 (01): 8–26.
- Linnet, Jeppe Trolle. 2011. 'Money Can't Buy Me Hygge: Danish Middle-Class Consumption, Egalitarianism, and the Sanctity of Inner Space'. *Social Analysis* 55 (2): 21–44.
- . 2012. 'The Social-Material Performance of Cozy Interiority'. In *Ambiances in action/Ambiances En Acte(s) - International Congress on Ambiances*. Canadian Centre for Architecture, Montreal.
- Liu, Shengli. 2009. 'Merleau-Ponty's Phenomenology of Space Preliminary Reflection on an Archaeology of Primordial Spatiality'. In, The 3rd BESETO Conference of Philosophy. 131–40.

- Lomax, Alan, and Edwin E. Erickson. 1971. 'The World Song Style Map'. In *Folk Song Style and Culture*, edited by Alan Lomax, 75–110. Washington DC: American Association for the Advancement of Science.
- Longhurst, Robyn. 1997. '(Dis)embodied Geographies'. *Progress in Human Geography* 21 (4): 486–501.
- Lorimer, H. 2008. 'Cultural Geography: Non-Representational Conditions and Concerns'. *Progress in Human Geography* 32 (4): 551–59.
- Lornell, Christopher, and Theodore W. Meador. 1983. 'Traditions and Research Opportunities in Folk Geography'. *The Professional Geographer* 35 (1): 51–56.
- Lowe, Melanie. 2004. "'Tween" Scene: Resistance within the Mainstream'. In *Music Scenes: Local, Translocal and Virtual*, edited by Andy Bennett and Richard A Peterson, 80–95. Nashville: Vanderbilt University Press.
- Lowenthal, David. 1976. 'Turning into the Past: Can We Recapture the Soundscapes of Bygone Days?' *UNESCO Courier*, no. 29: 15–21.
- Low, Setha, M. 1994. 'Place Attachment in Cultural Anthropology'. In *The Spirit & Power of Place: Human Environment and Sacrality, Essays Dedicated to Yi Fu Tuan*, edited by Yi-Fu Tuan and Rana P. B Singh, 47–61. Varanasi, India: National Geographical Society of India.
- Lull, James. 1987. *Popular Music and Communication*. Newbury Park: Sage.
- Lund Hansen, Anders, Hans Thor Andersen, and Eric Clark. 2001. 'Creative Copenhagen: Globalization, Urban Governance and Social Change'. *European Planning Studies* 9 (7): 851–69.
- Lynch, Kevin. 1960. *The Image of the City*. Cambridge, Massachusetts and London: MIT Press.
- Maffesoli, Michel. 1996. *The Time of the Tribes: The Decline of Individualism in Mass Society*. London: Sage Publications.
- Malpas, Jeff. 2001. 'Comparing Topographies: Across Paths/around Place: A Reply to Casey'. *Philosophy & Geography* 4 (2): 231–38.
- . 2009. 'Place and Human Being'. *Environmental and Architectural Phenomenology* 20 (3): 19–23.
- Manzo, Lynne C. 2003. 'Beyond House and Haven: Toward a Revisioning of Emotional Relationships with Places'. *Journal of Environmental Psychology* 23 (1): 47–61.

- Mason, Jennifer. 2006. 'Mixing Methods in a Qualitatively Driven Way'. *Qualitative Research* 6 (1): 9–25.
- Massey, Doreen. 1994. *A Global Sense of Place*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- . 1999. *Power-Geometries and the Politics of Space-Time: Hettner-Lecture 1998*. Heidelberg: Heidelberg University.
- Massumi, Brian. 2002. *Parables for the Virtual: Movement, Affect, Sensation*. London: Duke University Press.
- . 2004. 'Notes on the Translation and Acknowledgements'. In *A Thousand Plateaus: Capitalism and Schizophrenia*, by Gilles Deleuze and Felix Guattari. London: Continuum.
- May, Jon, and Nigel Thrift, eds. 2001. *Timespace: Geographies of Temporality*. 1 edition. London; New York: Routledge.
- McCormack, Derek P. 2003. 'An Event of Geographical Ethics in Spaces of Affect'. *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers* 28 (4): 488–507.
- . 2005. 'Diagramming Practice and Performance'. *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 23 (1): 119–47.
- . 2008a. 'Geographies for Moving Bodies: Thinking, Dancing, Spaces'. *Geography Compass* 2 (6): 1822–36.
- . 2008b. 'Thinking-Spaces for Research-Creation'. *Inflections* 1: 1–16.
- McDaniel, Carl, and Roger Gates. 1995. *Contemporary Marketing Research*. 3rd edition. Minneapolis/St. Paul: West Group.
- McRobbie, Angela, and Jenny Garber. 1993. 'Girls and Subcultures'. In *Resistance Through Rituals: Youth Subcultures in Post-War Britain*, edited by Stuart Hall and Jefferson, First Edition, 177–89. London: Routledge.
- Meehan, Norman. 2009. 'Mike Nock on New Zealand and Jazz'. In *Jazz in Aotearoa*, edited by Richard Hardie and Allan Thomas, 56–68. Wellington: Steele Roberts.
- . 2011. 'Sounds like Home': TrinityRoots and Jazz-Dub-Reggae in Wellington'. In *Home, Land and Sea. Situating Music in Aotearoa New Zealand*, edited by Glenda Keam and Tony Mitchell. 134–145. Auckland: Pearson Education.
- Mels, Tom. 2004a. 'Lineages of a Geography of Rhythm'. In *Reanimating Places: A Geography of Rhythms*, 3–42. Aldershot: Ashgate Publishing, Ltd.

- . 2004b. *Reanimating Places : A Geography of Rhythms*, edited by Tom Mels, Aldershot, Hants, England; Burlington, Vt: Ashgate Publishing, Ltd.
- Merleau-Ponty, Maurice. 1962. *Phenomenology of Perception*. International Library of Philosophy and Scientific Method. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul.
- Merrifield, Andy. 2000. 'Henry Lefebvre. A Socialist in Space'. In *Thinking Space*, edited by Mike Crang and Nigel Thrift, 167–82. London: Routledge.
- Metwaly, Ati. 2013. 'Ahramonline'. *Redefining Freedom: Copenhagen's Freetown Christiania*. <http://english.ahram.org.eg/NewsContent/5/35/81365/Arts--Culture/Stage--Street/Redefining-freedom-Copenhagens-Freetown-Christiani.aspx>. Accessed August 17, 2015.
- Meyer, Douglas K. 1976. 'Country Music and Geographical Themes' *Mississippi Geographer*, no. 4: 65–74.
- Middleton, Jennie. 2010. 'Sense and the City: Exploring the Embodied Geographies of Urban Walking'. *Social & Cultural Geography* 11 (6): 575–96.
- Mills, Charles Wright. 1959. *The Sociological Imagination*. New York, Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Mills, Charles Wright, and Amitai Etzioni. 1999. *Sociological Imagination*. New Edition. New York, Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- 'Ministry for Culture and Heritage'. 2014. *General Directions of Cultural Policy*. <http://www.mch.govt.nz/what-we-do/cultural-sector-overviews/cultural-policy-new-zealand/1-general-directions-cultural-polic>. Accessed October 12, 2014.
- Mitchell, Tony. 1996. *Popular Music and Local Identity: Rock, Pop, and Rap in Europe and Oceania*. New York: Leicester University Press.
- . 1997. 'Flat City Sounds: A Cartography of the Christchurch Music Scene'. *Popular Music and Society* 21 (3): 83–105.
- . 2009. 'Sonic Psychogeography: A Poetics of Place in Popular Music in Aotearoa/New Zealand'. *Perfect Beat* 10 (2): 145–75.
- . 2013. 'New Zealand Glimpsed through Iceland: Music, Place and Psychogeography'. *Musicology Australia* 35 (1): 41–66.
- Moore, Ryan M. 2013. 'The Beat of the City: Lefebvre and Rhythmanalysis'. *Situations: Project of the Radical Imagination* 5 (1): 61–77.
- Morrison, Carey-Ann. 2010. "'Home Is Where the Heart Is": Everyday Geographies of Young Heterosexual Couples' Love in and of Homes'. PhD Thesis,

- University of Waikato.
<http://researchcommons.waikato.ac.nz/handle/10289/4797>. Accessed July 2014, 2014.
- Morton, Frances. 2005. 'Performing Ethnography: Irish Traditional Music Sessions and New Methodological Spaces'. *Social & Cultural Geography* 6 (5): 661–76.
- 'Most Liveable City: Copenhagen'. 2015. *Monocle*.
<http://monocle.com/film/affairs/most-liveable-city-copenhagen/>. Accessed November 25, 2015.
- Murray, Derek Conrad. 2015. 'Notes to Self: The Visual Culture of Selfies in the Age of Social Media'. *Consumption Markets & Culture* 18 (6): 490–516.
- Nansen, Bjorn, Michael Arnold, Martin Gibbs, and Hilary Davis. 2009. 'Domestic Orchestration: Rhythms in the Mediated Home'. *Time & Society* 18 (2/3): 181–207.
- Nash, Peter. 1968. 'Music Regions and Regional Music'. *Deccan Geographer* 6 (2): 1–24.
- 'New Zealand History'. 2015. *Fat Freddy's Drop*.
<http://www.nzhistory.net.nz/media/video/fat-freddys-drop>. Accessed October 19, 2015.
- 'New Zealand Music Commission'. 2015. *About the New Zealand Music Commission*. <http://nzmusic.org.nz/about/>. Accessed October 25, 2015.
- Nussbaum, Martha C. 2003. *Upheavals of Thought: The Intelligence of Emotions*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- 'NZMusician'. 2015. *Fat Freddy's Drop - Dropping In On Fat Freddy's Drop*.
http://www.nzmusician.co.nz/index.php/pi_pageid/8/pi_articleid/679/pi_page/1. Accessed October 19, 2015.
- O'Reilly, Karen. 2009. *Key Concepts in Ethnography*. London: Sage Publications.
- Øresundsbro Konsortiet. 2008. 'Facts Worth Knowing About The Øresund Bridge'. Øresundsbro Konsortiet. uk.oresundsbron.com/download/120.
- Paterson, John L. 1991. 'Putting Pop in Its Place: Using Popular Music in the Teaching of Geography'. *New Zealand Journal of Geography* 92 (1): 18–19.
- Pedersen, Peder, Kaj. n.d. "'Rhythmic Music" in Danish Music Education'. unpublished. <http://ir.lib.uwo.ca/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1022&context=lme>. Accessed July 23, 2015.

- Pile, Steve. 2010. 'Emotions and Affect in Recent Human Geography'. *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers* 35 (1): 5–20.
- . 2011. 'For a Geographical Understanding of Affect and Emotions'. *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers* 36 (4): 603–6.
- Pink, Sarah. 2007. *Doing Visual Ethnography*. Sage Publications.
- . 2008. 'An Urban Tour: The Sensory Sociality of Ethnographic Place-Making'. *Ethnography* 9 (2): 175–96.
- . 2009. *Doing Sensory Ethnography*. Los Angeles; London: Sage Publications.
- . 2013. *Doing Visual Ethnography*. Third Edition edition. Los Angeles: Sage Publications.
- Pocock, Douglas, Charles, D. 1979. 'The Contribution of Mental Maps in Perception Studies'. *Geography* 64 (4): 279–87.
- Poecke, Niels van. 2016. 'Beyond Postmodern Narcolepsy'. *Notes on Metamodernism*. <http://www.metamodernism.com/2014/06/04/beyond-postmodern-narcolepsy/>. Accessed March 14.
- Powell, Kimberly. 2010. 'Making Sense of Place: Mapping as a Multisensory Research Method'. *Qualitative Inquiry* 16 (7): 539–55.
- Power, Dominic, and Daniel Hallencreutz. 2002. 'Profiting from Creativity? The Music Industry in Stockholm, Sweden and Kingston, Jamaica'. *Environment and Planning A* 34 (10): 1833–54.
- Priego, C., J.-H. Breuste, and J. Rojas. 2008. 'Perception and Value of Nature in Urban Landscapes: A Comparative Analysis of Cities in Germany, Chile and Spain'. *Landscape Online* 7 (1): 1–22.
- Prince, H.C. 1961. 'The Geographical Imagination'. *Landscape* 11 (2): 22–25.
- Proshansky, Harold M. 1978. 'The City and Self-Identity'. *Environment and Behavior* 10 (2): 147–69.
- Ramazanoglu, Caroline, and Janet Holland. 2002. *Feminist Methodology Challenges and Choices*. London: Sage Publications.
- Rantala, Outi, and Anu Valtonen. 2014. 'A Rhythmanalysis of Touristic Sleep in Nature'. *Annals of Tourism Research* 47: 18–30.
- Reeves, Chris. 2015. 'Copenhagen: Most Liveable City'. *International Federation for Housing and Planning*. <http://www.ifhp.org/ifhp-blog/copenhagen-most-liveable-city>. Accessed October 21, 2015.
- Relph, Edward. 1976. *Place and Placelessness*. London: Pion.

- Revill, George. 2004. 'Performing French Folk Music: Dance, Authenticity and Nonrepresentational Theory: [1]'. *Cultural Geographies* 11 (2): 199–209.
- Reynolds, Simon, and Joy Press. 1996. *The Sex Revolts: Gender, Rebellion, and Rock'N'Roll*. Reprint edition. Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press.
- Robinson, Jennifer. 2005. 'Urban Geography: World Cities, or a World of Cities'. *Progress in Human Geography* 29 (6): 757–65.
- Rodaway, Paul. 2011. *Sensuous Geographies : Body, Sense, and Place*. London: Routledge.
- Rose, Gillian. 1997. 'Situating Knowledges: Positionality, Reflexivities and Other Tactics'. *Progress in Human Geography* 21 (3): 305–20.
- . 2012. *Visual Methodologies: An Introduction to Researching with Visual Materials*. 3rd ed.. London ; Thousand Oaks, California: Sage Publications.
- . 2014. 'On the relation between "visual research methods" and contemporary visual culture'. *The Sociological Review* 62 (1): 24–46.
- Rosenberg, Jessica, and Gitana Garofalo. 1998. 'Riot Grrrl: Revolutions from within'. *Signs* 23 (3): 809–41.
- Said, Edward. 1991. *Musical Elaborations*. London: Chatto and Windus.
- Saldanha, Arun. 2005. 'Trance and Visibility at Dawn: Racial Dynamics in Goa's Rave Scene'. *Social & Cultural Geography* 6 (5): 707–21.
- Sassen, Saskia. 2007. *Sociology of Globalization*. 1st ed.. Contemporary Societies. New York: W.W Norton & Company.
- Schafer, Raymond Murray. 1977. *European Sound Diary*. Vancouver: A.R.C. Publications.
- Schilt, Kristen. 2004. 'Riot Grrrl Is. . .': Contestation over Meaning in a Music Scene'. In *Music Scenes: Local, Trans-Local, and Virtual*, edited by Andy Bennett and Richard Peterson A., 115–31. Nashville: Vanderbilt University Press.
- Schippers, Huib, and Catherine Grant. 2016. *Sustainable Futures for Music Cultures: An Ecological Perspective*. Oxford University Press.
- Schmid, Christian. 2008. 'Henri Lefebvre's Theory of the Production of Space: Towards a Three-Dimensional Dialectic'. In *Space, Difference, Everyday Life: Reading Henri Lefebvre*, edited by Kanishka Goonewardena, Stefan Kipfer, and Richard Milgrom, 27–45. New York: Routledge.

- Schrey, Dominik. 2014. 'Analogue Nostalgia and the Aesthetics of Digital Remediation'. In *Media and Nostalgia*, edited by Katharina Niemeyer, 27–38. Palgrave Macmillan Memory Studies. Palgrave Macmillan UK.
- Scott, Clive. 2007. *Street Photography: From Atget to Cartier-Bresson*. London; New York: I.B Tauris.
- Scott, M. 2012. 'Popular Music as Social Policy: Hybrid-Hierarchies and Social Inclusion through New Zealand's Pop Renaissance'. *Journal of Sociology* 48 (3): 304–22.
- Seamon, David. 1980. 'Body-Subject, Time-Space Routines, and Place-Ballets'. In *The Human Experience of Space and Place*, edited by Anne Buttimer and David Seamon, 148–65. London: Croom Helm Ltd.
- . 1993. 'Different Worlds Coming Together: A Phenomenology of Relationship as Portrayed in Doris Lessing's Diaries of Jane Somers.' In *Dwelling, Seeing and Designing: Toward a Phenomenological Ecology*, edited by David Seamon, 219–46. New York: State University of New York Press.
- . 2015. 'Merleau-Ponty, Perception, and Environmental Embodiment: Implications for Architectural and Environmental Studies'. In *Merleau-Ponty - Space, Place, Architecture*, edited by Patricia Locke M. and Rachel McCann. Ohio: Ohio University Press.
- . 2016. 'Humanistic Geography'. Edited by Douglas Richardson. *International Encyclopedia of Geography: People, the Earth, Environment, and Technology*. New York: Wiley Blackwell.
- Sedgwick, Eve Kosofsky. 2003. *Touching Feeling: Affect, Pedagogy, Performativity*. Durham and London: Duke University Press.
- Shamai, Shmuel. 1991. 'Sense of Place: An Empirical Measurement.' *Geoforum* 22 (3): 347–58.
- Shank, Barry. 1994. *Dissonant Identities: The Rock'n'Roll Scene in Austin, Texas*. Middletown, CT: Wesleyan University Press.
- Sheller, Mimi, and John Urry. 2004. *Tourism Mobilities: Places to Play, Places in Play*. London: Routledge.
- . 2006. 'The New Mobilities Paradigm'. *Environment and Planning A* 38 (2): 207–26.

- Shields, Rob. 1999. *Lefebvre, Love and Struggle: Spatial Dialectics*. London: Routledge.
- Shouse, Eric. 2005. 'Feeling, Emotion, Affect'. *A Journal of Media and Culture* 8 (6). <http://journal.media-culture.org.au/0512/03-shouse.php>. Accessed March 20, 2015.
- Shuker, Roy. 2008. 'New Zealand Popular Music, Government Policy, and Cultural Identity'. *Popular Music* 27 (02): 271–81.
- Shutika, Debra Lattanzi. 2011. *Beyond the Borderlands: Migration and Belonging in the United States and Mexico*. Berkeley, Los Angeles, London: University of California Press.
- Silverman, David. 2013. *Doing Qualitative Research*. Fourth edition. London; Thousand Oaks, California; New Delhi; Singapore: Sage Publications.
- Simonsen, Kirsten. 2004. 'Space Odysseys: Spatiality and Social Relations in the 21st Century'. In *Spatiality, Temporality and the Construction of the City*, edited by Jørgen Ole Bærenholdt and Kirsten Simonsen, 43–63. Aldershot: Ashgate.
- . 2005. 'Bodies, Sensations, Space and Time: The Contribution from Henri Lefebvre'. *Geografiska Annaler. Series B. Human Geography*, 1–14.
- . 2007. 'Practice, Spatiality and Embodied Emotions: An Outline of a Geography of Practice'. *Human Affairs* 17 (2): 168–81.
- Simpson, Paul. 2008. 'Chronic Everyday Life: Rhythmanalysing Street Performance'. *Social & Cultural Geography* 9 (7): 807–29.
- . 2012. 'Apprehending Everyday Rhythms: Rhythmanalysis, Time-Lapse Photography, and the Space-Times of Street Performance'. *Cultural Geographies* 19 (4): 423–45.
- Small, Christopher. 1998. *Musicking: The Meanings of Performing and Listening*. 1st edition. Hanover: Wesleyan.
- Smith, Susan. 1994. 'Soundscape'. *Area* 26 (3): 232–40.
- . 1997. 'Beyond Geography's Visible Worlds: A Cultural Politics of Music'. *Progress in Human Geography* 21 (4): 502–29.
- . 2000. 'Performing the (Sound)World'. *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 18 (5): 615–37.
- Spencer, Stephen. 2010. *Visual Research Methods in the Social Sciences: Awakening Visions*. London and New York: Routledge.

- Spittles, Brian. 2005. 'Making Sense of a Sense of Place.' Unpublished Honours paper, Perth, Western Australia: Murdoch University.
- Stahl, Geoff. 2003. 'Crisis? What Crisis?: Anglophone Musicmaking in Montreal'. Unpublished PhD Thesis, Montreal: McGill University.
- . 2004. 'It's like Canada Reduced': Setting the Scene in Montreal'. In *After Subcultures: Critical Studies of Subcultural Theory*, edited by Andy Bennett and Kahn-Harris. 51–64. London: Palgrave.
- . 2007. 'Musicmaking and the City: Making Sense of the Montreal Scene'. In *Beiträge Zur Populärmusikforschung: Sound and the City - Populäre Musik Im Urbanen Kontext*, edited by Dietrich Helms and Thomas Phleps, 141–61. Bielefeld: Transcript Verlag.
- . 2011. 'DIY or DIT!' Tales of Making Music in a Creative Capital'. In *Situating Music in Aotearoa-New Zealand*, edited by Glenda Keam and Tony Mitchell, 145–60. Auckland: Pearson Education.
- Sterne, Jonathan. 1997. 'Sounds like the Mall of America: Programmed Music and the Architectonics of Commercial Space'. *Ethnomusicology* 41 (1): 22–50.
- Stewart, Kathleen. 2007. *Ordinary Affects*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.
- . 2010. 'Atmospheric Attunements'. *Rubric*, no. 1: 1–14.
- . 2011. 'Atmospheric Attunements'. *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 29 (3): 445–53.
- Stokes, Martin. 1994. *Ethnicity, Identity and Music*. Oxford: Berg.
- Straw, Will. 1991. 'Systems of Articulation, Logics of Change: Communities and Scenes in Popular Music'. *Cultural Studies* 5 (3): 368–88.
- . 2004. 'Cultural Scenes'. *Loisir et Société/Society and Leisure* 27 (2): 411–22.
- . 2010. 'Spectacles of Waste'. In *Circulation and the City: Essays on Urban Culture*, edited by Alexandra Boutros and Will Straw, 193–214. Montreal; Ithaca NY: McGill-Queen's Press.
- Sulsters, Willem A. 2005. 'Mental Mapping, Viewing the Urban Landscapes of the Mind'. International Conference "Doing, Thinking, Feeling Home: The Mental Geography of Residential Environment", at the OTB Research Institute for the Built Environment, Delft, Netherlands.
- Tagg, John. 1988. 'Evidence, Truth and Order: Photographic Records and the Growth of the State'. In *The Burden of Representation: Essays on Photographies and Histories*, edited by John Tagg, 63. London: McMillan Education.

- Taylor, Timothy Dean. 1997. *Global Pop: World Music, World Markets*. New York and London: Psychology Press.
- Thibaud, Jean-Paul. 2003. 'The Sonic Composition of the City'. In *The Auditory Culture Reader*, edited by Michael Bull and Les Back, 329–42. London: Berg.
- Thien, Deborah. 2005. 'After or beyond Feeling? A Consideration of Affect and Emotion in Geography'. *Area* 37 (4): 450–54.
- Thrift, Nigel. 1996. 'Strange Country': Meaning, Use and Style in Non-Representational Theories.' In *Spatial Formations*, 1–50, Theory, Culture & Society. London: Sage Publications.
- . 1999. 'Steps to an Ecology of Place'. In *Human Geography Today*, edited by Doreen Massey, John Allen, and Phil Sarre. 295–321. Cambridge: Polity.
- . 2000a. 'Afterwords'. *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 18 (2): 213–55.
- . 2000b. 'Dead or Alive?' In *Cultural Turns/geographical Turns*, edited by Ian Cook, David Crouch, Simon Naylor, and James, R. Ryan, 1–6. Harlow: Prentice Hall.
- . 2004. 'Intensities of Feeling: Towards a Spatial Politics of Affect'. *Geografiska Annaler. Series B. Human Geography*, 57–78.
- . 2006. 'Space'. *Theory, Culture & Society* 23 (2-3): 139–46.
- . 2008. *Non-Representational Theory: Space, Politics, Affect*. London ; New York: Routledge.
- . 2009. 'Understanding the Affective Spaces of Political Performance'. In *Emotion, Place and Culture*, edited by Mick Smith, Joyce Davidson, Laura Cameron, and Liz Bondi, 79–96. Aldershot: Ashgate Publishing Ltd.
- Thrift, Nigel, and N Bingham. 2000. 'New Directions for Travellers: The Geography of Michel Serres and Bruno Latour'. In *Thinking Space*, edited by Mike Crang and Nigel Thrift, 281–301. London and New York: Routledge.
- Tiwari, Reena. 2008. 'Being a Rhythm Analyst in the City of Varanasi'. *Urban Forum* 19 (3): 289–306.
- Tomkins. 1962. *Affect Imagery Consciousness: Volume II: The Negative Affects*. New York and London: Springer Publishing Company.
- Toynbee, Jason. 2000. *Making Popular Music: Musicians, Creativity and Institutions*. London: Arnold.

- Trell, Elen-Maarja, and Bettina van Hoven. 2010. 'Making Sense of Place: Exploring Creative and (inter) Active Research Methods with Young People'. *Fennia-International Journal of Geography* 188 (1): 91–104.
- Tuan, Yi-Fu. 1961. 'Topophilia: Or, Sudden Encounter with the Landscape'. *Landscape* 11: 28–37.
- . 1974. *Topophilia: A Study of Environmental Perception, Attitudes, and Values*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ, Prentice-Hall.
- . 1977. *Space and Place: The Perspective of Experience*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- . 1979. 'Space and Place: Humanistic Perspective'. In *Philosophy in Geography*, edited by Stephen Gale and Gunnar Olsson, 387–427. Theory and Decision Library 20. Springer Netherlands.
- . 2004. 'Sense of Place: Its Relationship to Self and Time'. In *Reanimating Places: A Geography of Rhythms*, edited by Tom Mels, 45–55. Burlington, England: Ashgate Publishing.
- Van Duppen, Jan, and Bas Spierings. 2013. 'Retracing Trajectories: The Embodied Experience of Cycling, Urban Sensespaces and the Commute between "Neighbourhood" and "City" in Utrecht, NL'. *Journal of Transport Geography* 30: 234–243.
- Vergunst, Jo. 2010. 'Rhythms of Walking: History and Presence in a City Street'. *Space and Culture* 13 (4): 376–88.
- Vermeulen, Timotheus, and Robin Van den Akker. 2015. 'Utopia, Sort of: A Case Study in Metamodernism'. *Studia Neophilologica* 87 (sup1): 55–67.
- Vogt, W. Paul, and Burke, R. Johnson. 2005. *Dictionary of Statistics and Methodology: A Nontechnical Guide for the Social Sciences (3rd Edition)*. Thousand Oaks, CA, USA: Sage Publications.
- Ward, K. 2010. 'Towards a Relational Comparative Approach to the Study of Cities'. *Progress in Human Geography* 34 (4): 471–87.
- Warf, Barney. 2010. *Encyclopedia of Geography*. Kansas: Sage Publications.
- Warren, Carol. 2001. 'Qualitative Interviewing'. In *Handbook of Interview Research*, edited by Jaber F. Gubrium and James A. Holstein, 83–103. Thousand Oaks, California: Sage Publications.
- Waterman, Stanley. 1998. 'Carnivals for Elites? The Cultural Politics of Arts Festivals'. *Progress in Human Geography* 22 (1): 54–74.

- Watkins, Ceri. 2005. 'Representations of Space, Spatial Practices and Spaces of Representation: An Application of Lefebvre's Spatial Triad'. *Culture and Organization* 11 (3): 209–20.
- Watson, Allan, Michael Hoyler, and Christoph Mager. 2009. 'Spaces and Networks of Musical Creativity in the City'. *Geography Compass* 3 (2): 856–78.
- 'Wellington City Council'. 2015a. *About Wellington*. <http://wellington.govt.nz/>. Accessed October 19, 2015.
- . 2015b. *Pre-European Settlement - 1865*. <http://wellington.govt.nz/about-wellington/history/history-of-wellington/pre-european-settlement-1865>. Accessed November 5, 2015.
- 'WellingtonNZ'. 2015a. *Life in Wellington*. <http://www.wellingtonnz.com/discover/life-in-wellington/>. Accessed October 18, 2015.
- . 2015b. *Wellington Facts & Figures*. <http://www.wellingtonnz.com/discover/life-in-wellington/facts-and-figures/>. Accessed October 19, 2015.
- Welter, Barbara. 1966. 'The Cult of True Womanhood: 1820-1860'. *American Quarterly* 18 (2): 151–74.
- Williams, Raymond. 1977. *Marxism and Literature*. Marxist Introductions. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Wood, Nichola, Michelle Duffy, and Susan Smith. 2007. 'The Art of Doing (geographies Of) Music'. *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 25 (5): 867–89.
- Woods, Louis A., and Charles F. Gritzner. 1990. 'A Million Miles to the City': Country Music's Sacred and Profane Images of Place'. In *Place Images in Media: Portrayal, Experience, an Meaning*, edited by Leo Zonn, 231–54. Maryland: MD: Rowman & Littlefield.
- Wunderlich, Filipa Matos. 2008a. 'Symphonies of Urban Places: Urban Rhythms as Traces of Time in Space. A Study of "Urban Rhythms"'. *Studies in Environmental Aesthetics and Semiotics VI*, 6: 91–111.
- . 2008b. 'Walking and Rhythmicity: Sensing Urban Space'. *Journal of Urban Design* 13 (1): 125–39.

- . 2013. 'Place-Temporality and Urban Place-Rhythms in Urban Analysis and Design: An Aesthetic Akin to Music'. *Journal of Urban Design* 18 (3): 383–408.
- Wylie, John. 2005. 'A Single Day's Walking: Narrating Self and Landscape on the South West Coast Path'. *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers* 30 (2): 234-247.
- Yi'En, C. 2014. 'Telling Stories of the City: Walking Ethnography, Affective Materialities, and Mobile Encounters'. *Space and Culture* 17 (3): 211–23.
- Zayani, Mohamed. 1999. 'Introduction to Rhythmanalysis'. *Rethinking Marxism* 11 (1): 1–4.
- Zerubavel, Eviatar. 1981. *Hidden Rhythms : Schedules and Calendars in Social Life*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.